Post 2015 Development Agenda- National Dialogue on Strengthening Capacities and Institutions

Pakistan Consultation Report (Draft)
December 2014
Table of Contents:

Executive Summary

Part I: overview:
1. Background and Overview of the dialogue
2. Situating the consultation process
3. Outreach and process

Part II: Substantive Dialogues
1. FGDs
2. National consultation Meeting billions

Part III: Synthesis of the Online Survey on Citizen's Feedback on Public Service Delivery
Executive Summary

At the United Nations Millennium Summit, in September 2000, Pakistan among the other world leaders adopted the Millennium Declaration, including a vision for development and the eradication of poverty, the Millennium Development Goals. The MDG Framework will be completing its tenure in December 2015.

Pakistan performance on MDGs remained less satisfactory as compared to other countries in the Region. According to the National MDG 2013, Pakistan is off-track on 24 targets out of the total 33 indicators. Pakistan has been facing multifaceted issues related to political stability, security and natural disaster that have adversely hampered the development efforts. This includes the earthquakes in 2005 and 2013, floods in 2007, 2010, 2011, 2012 and in 2014, the energy crisis and security crisis from internal and external sources.

Besides the constraints arising from the country security situation, issues related to governance and weak institutions have played a major role in the non-achievement of MDGs. Investment in statistical machineries to collect and make available timely data on the status of MDGs should have been given priority. The unavailability of data has been a major constraint in measuring progress towards MDGs and making informed decisions.

For the new set of the development agenda to replace MDGs after 2015, the UN launched global consultative process on post 2015 development agenda which will replace the MDGs Framework. Pakistan was selected one of the 100 countries for the national consultations, starting in December 2012. Inputs and feedback was gathered including representatives from Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), farmers, laborers, employers and workers associations, religious, ethnic and sexual minorities, students, parliamentarians, academia, development partners including donors and national staff of UN agencies, disabled persons, government officials at the federal and provincial levels, media, private sector, internally displaced people, women organizations etc. The key area that come up as priority from Pakistan consultation included peace, Justice and human Security, Governance, Energy, environment and Disaster Mitigation, inclusive economic growth and social development and Gender Equality.

The second round of Post 2015 consultations focuses on the ‘means of implementation’ (MoI) critical for the achievement of the post 2015 development agenda and takes into account; ownership, participation, capacities, partnership, monitoring and accountability. Pakistan has been allotted the theme of “strengthening capacities and building institutions” required for the implementation of the post 2015 development agenda. The Dialogue on capacities and institutions underpins the importance of national-level actors, signaling that a transformative agenda requires transformed institutions.

Six themes of MoI have been identified: 1) Localising the post-2015 development agenda; 2) Helping to strengthen capacities and institutions; 3) Participatory monitoring, existing and new forms of accountability; 4) Partnerships with civil society and other actors; 5) Partnerships with the private
sector; 6) Culture and development. Pakistan is one the eight countries chosen to undertake the national dialogue on *Helping to strengthen capacities and institutions*.

This report compiles the finding of the consultations undertaken at the national level that will feed in to Global Report on the “strengthening capacities and building institutions” for the post 2015 agenda. These findings will also be taken up for further discussion at the Ministerial level meeting on the same theme that will take place in February 2015 in Chisinau, Moldova.

Following the key finding emerging from the national dialogue process:

Post 2015 development agenda will be different from the era when the MDGs were designed because of the context. SDGs are being formulated in an era when the world economy is recovering from the financial crises, there is less fiscal space from the donor available with a context of conflict and natural disasters. Need to realize and identify what capabilities are needed for data management as SDGs have more than 600 hundred indicators to monitor and report as compared to MDGs with only 48 indicators.

**Strategic planning, monitoring and reporting** are of extreme importance. The MDGs in Pakistan didn’t get adequate attention in terms of converting the MDG Framework into concrete plans and strategies especially at the sub-national level. Planning should be done by establishing short and medium term goals rather than only having end-point targets. Government of Pakistan has launched the **Vision 2025** as long-term development strategy aligning its seven pillars with the proposed sustainable goals. The plan build on development of human and social capital through education and skill enhancement added with indigenous sustainable growth, institutional reforms, energy, water, food security and nutrition.

**New role of Planning Commission** in post 18 Amendment scenario as an institution of federation. Representation of all provinces in the national level committee for smooth approval and execution of social sector development plans

**Localization** of SDGs to local context is also one of the priority areas of the post 2015 discussions. In Pakistan, such localization efforts should go beyond the national level. In the post 18th Constitutional Amendment situation, localization has become the most critical element of an effective implementation mechanism for SDGs. In the current devolved governance structure, Pakistan would need to develop coordination mechanisms through which national and provincial plans and actions could be synthesized and experience and best practices shared.

An organized plan of action is need to undertake the **governance/ civil service reforms** starting from the smaller but important initiatives. The Ministry of Planning Development and Reforms, is committed to reforms for the good governance and will be holding **Pakistan Governance Forum** inviting experts from different areas to relook and reexamine the governance agenda to transforming institution into high performance institutions.

National capacities on **data and statistics** needs to be strengthened. Survey tools and procedures to collect data on key variables should be aligned at federal, provincial and regional statistic departments.

**Use of dashboard and KPIs** for monitoring progress and results at national and sub-national level
Broad range of mechanisms is available to the citizens for social accountability in the country’s legal framework. There is a strong need to raise awareness among the citizens to exercise the right for creating demand for delivery of efficient public service as well as to hold the state accountable.

Fiscal decentralizations/ financial allocations

Transfer of expertise and knowledge from the progressing countries on how to build better and effective institutions

Part I: Overview

Background and Overview of the Dialogue

The first phase of the consultations in 2012 focused on the potential issues and areas to be included in a post-2015 development agenda. UNDP, on behalf of the UN Resident Coordinator in Pakistan, led the 2014 second round of consultations on the post 2015 development agenda. In line with growing demand from the member states for pragmatic proposals on how to make the agenda work, the national level discussion focused on the so-called ‘means of implementation’ (MoI) have surfaced throughout the process and have become increasingly central to the debate going forward.

The Dialogue on “Strengthening Capacities and Institutions” reinforced the importance of national-level actors, emphasizing the need of responsive and accountable institutions and greater capacities of governments to effectively implement the new inter-dependent, transformative and universally applicable development goals.

Situating the consultation process

The UN Resident Coordinator initiated the consultative process by establishing a UN wide Advisory Committee/ UNCT to steer the consultation process. The Resident Coordinator also invited the government, the Ministry of Planning Development and Reform to work closely with the UNDP, designated to lead this exercise on behalf of the UN System.

The Parliamentary Task Force on MDGs Pakistan, having representation of elected representatives from national and provincial level, was also taken on board on the process to ensure their participation and ownership.

Beside the UN System and government, other key stakeholders were also part of the inclusive discussion including civil society, academia, UN, bi-lateral and multi-lateral donors

Outreach and process

The stakeholders of the entire process will include federal and provincial governments, civil society, academia, UN, bi-lateral and multi-lateral donors, youth, women groups etc. UNDP in partnership with the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), the research-based think tank, to conduct the consultative process composed of the following streams:

- Desk review was conducted to do the important ground work to review and analyze the effectiveness of the present institutional structures and mechanisms, with a view to distill the lessons learned, and inform the implementation of the Post 2015 development agenda in Pakistan.
An online survey, targeting 1500 respondents, was conducted on the citizen's feedback on public service delivery. The survey gave an opportunity to hear from the general public being the ultimate beneficiaries of the public services regarding their experience in dealing with and availing of services from the public sector institutions. The findings of this survey will inform interventions to strengthen capacities and build effective institutions for the provision of services for post 2015 development agenda.

To ensure inclusion, community based focus group discussion with women group, youth group and IDPs among the vulnerable groups. The focused group discussion to gather inputs for improving capacities and institutional effectiveness.

A national consultations meeting was held to gather feedback from diverse stakeholders including government representatives from national and sub-national level, experts, civil society members and policy makers on the issues hampering the ability of the national institutions in the public sector, identify priorities, gaps and recommendations for institutional and capacity development initiatives.

Setting the Context - Findings of the Desk Review:

Pakistan’s GDP growth accelerated to 4.14 per cent in 2013-14. This is the country’s highest growth in six years. Simultaneously the unemployment rate has increased from 5.6 percent in 2009-10 to 6.2 percent in 2012-13. Pakistan’s progress towards MDGs is not impressive. The country has reported progress on 34 indicators and out of these it is on track on only 10 indicators. Data on adopted indicators has serious validity and credibility issues. This foretells that challenges lie ahead for Post 2015 Development Agenda in Pakistan.

Right at the outset, it is significant to indicate that Pakistan is a country that is experiencing and undergoing complete governance overhauling in form of devolution or decentralization of public structures and mechanisms (ref: 18th Amendment). Such an extensive remodeling is being achieved resiliently in an environment of floods, earthquakes, monsoon rainstorms, droughts, crime/

Compelling story- Upgrading institutions for better public finance management:

The SAP-based Financial Accounting and Budgeting System (FABS) has been implemented at federal, provincial and district levels at more than 500 sites. The nation-wide integrated financial reporting and accounting system thus developed enables:

- Transparency and real-time reporting of expenditures of all tiers of government against allocated budgets
- Expenditure tracking of public money and analysis of expenditure data across various dimensions including reporting and analysis in terms of items of expenditure(e.g. pay, purchase of assets, repair & maintenance etc.), economic functions against which expenditure was made(e.g. education, health, social protection etc.), and departments or ministries or development projects under which the expenditure was made
- Improved Public sector Financial Management and planning through Development of dashboards for decision-making by stakeholders at different levels of the government thereby aiding in efficient resource management and monitoring of development schemes under PSDP etc.
- Timely, efficient and transparent processing of payroll of more than 2.2 million public sector employees across the country which lends capacity to prevent menace of ghost employees in public sector institutions etc.
- Improved public sector pension management by capturing pension data on the system
- The system will develop linkages with Federal Board of Revenue to Capturing and reporting of government’s revenue data.
- Reporting of government’s external as well as internal debts thereby aiding in efficient debt management through linkage with Economic Affairs Division and Central Directorate of National Savings
- Improved internal controls due to integrated ERP system with built-in checks on preventing unauthorized and beyond budget expenditures, leading to enhanced capacity for preventing wasteful public sector expenditure.
terror/ and politically violent networks, corruption, lack of tech-savvy and skilled human resource and shortage of finances. The task at hand is to make Pakistan’s institutions deliver through capacity development and by strengthening their effectiveness. This can be achieved if institutions are: decentralized; uphold highest standards of accountability and transparency; capacitated to monitor interventions, coordinate and foster partnerships; and are cognizant of issues around inclusivity and particularly gender.

An overview of Pakistan’s institutional landscape makes one conclude that (i) political will and commitment is present vis-à-vis global development agenda/s (ii) over the past few years there has been a mushroom growth of policies and laws in the country that also brings Pakistan closer to meeting its development and social protection related commitments at the global level (iii) public institutions are taking the ownership of their ineffectiveness (such as failure in tax collection and consequently troubled national savings) Notwithstanding, these institutions are geared towards improvement mainly by conceptualizing ‘reforms’ and acquiring relevant trainings and skill up-gradation (iv) the combination of sector-wise or institution specific reforms and a partially devolved governance framework presents itself as a challenge (v) Pakistan’s institutional ineffectiveness is not only a result of transitional uncertainty, functional deficiency but also tragedy of man-made and natural disasters.

**MDGs: Structures, Mechanisms and Lessons**

Ministry of Planning Development and Reforms (MoPDR) has been documenting Pakistan’s progress on MDGs. The MDG Report 2013 is the fifth of its kind and is an outcome of participatory process involving MoPDR, Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, provincial governments and that of AJK, Gilgit Baltistan and FATA, civil society and development partners.

Pakistan has been monitoring only 18 MDG indicators spread over six MDGs (with the exception of Goal 6 and 8) through purpose built surveys that are conducted periodically and mostly through national and subnational level household surveys such as Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey. Accordingly to the NMDG Report 2013, Pakistan missed out on MDG targets due to internal and external economic and non-economic challenges including “natural disasters and conflicts; institutional, administration and political changes; weak commitment to economic reforms; lack of awareness; fading commitment of development partners due to global economic recession of 2008; and belated or delayed ownership of MDG agenda at the sub national level.” (MDGR 2013)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Latest National Value</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 1: Eradicke Extreme Poverty and Hunger</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of population below the calorie based food plus non-food poverty line</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevalence of underweight children under 5 years of age</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>&lt;20</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net primary enrolment ratio (percent)</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completion/survival rate Grade 1 to 5 (percent)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy rate (percent)</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 3: Promote Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFI Primary Education</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFI Secondary Education</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Literacy GFI</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share of Women in Wage Employment</td>
<td>10.45</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Seats held by Women in National Assembly</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 4: Reduce Child Mortality</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 5 Mortality Rate (Deaths per 1000 Live Births)</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infant Mortality Rate (Deaths per 1000 Live Births)</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Fully Immunized Children 12-23 Months</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>&gt;90</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of under 1 year children immunized against measles</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>&gt;90</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Children Under 5 Who Suffered from Diarrhea in the Last 30 Days (percent)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lady Health Worker's Coverage (percent of target population)</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 5: Improve Maternal Health</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal Mortality Ratio</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of births attended by Skilled Birth Attendants</td>
<td>52.1</td>
<td>&gt;90</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contraceptive Prevalence Rate</td>
<td>35.4</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Fertility Rate</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of women 15-49 who had given birth during last 3 years and made at least one antenatal consultation</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 5: Improve Maternal Health</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal Mortality Ratio</td>
<td>2.79</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of births attended by Skilled Birth Attendants</td>
<td>52.1</td>
<td>&gt;90</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contraceptive Prevalence Rate</td>
<td>35.4</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Fertility Rate</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of women 15-49 who had given birth during last 3 years and made at least one antenatal consultation</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV prevalence among 15-49 year old pregnant women</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td>On Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV prevalence among vulnerable groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective prevention and treatment measures</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of TB/100,000</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB cases detected and cured under DOTS</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 7: Ensuring Environmental Sustainability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forest Cover (percent)</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Area Protected for Conservation of Wildlif (percent)</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>On Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP (in 1980-81 Rs.) per ton of oil equivalent (energy efficiency)</td>
<td>26,543</td>
<td>28,000</td>
<td>On Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sulphur Content in High Speed Diesel</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.4-0.25</td>
<td>On Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Population with Access to Improved Water Sources</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Population with Access to Sanitation</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Kachhi Abadies Regularated</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>Off Track</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: UNDP MDG Report 2013*
Pakistan has introduced a range of relevant policies, national programs, strategies and laws. Yet the national performance was not satisfactory. Challenges exist but as noted in MDGR 2013 it is “one common thread of weakness in many of these policies and programs. Most of them lacked inbuilt robust frameworks for timely monitoring and evaluation during implementation – vital to meet time bound MDGs” (p. 14).

Pakistan’s Institutional and Contextual Constraints- Mostly policies and frameworks, such as, Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs), Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF), Medium Term Budgetary Framework (MTBF), Vision 2025, Public Sector Development Program (PSDP), Annual Plans are cognizant of MDGs and incorporate them. For example, PRSP focuses on poverty that is also MDG 1. Pakistan formed its National HIV/AIDS Policy in 2007 and introduced HIV/AIDS Prevention and Treatment Act in 2007 and Reproductive Healthcare and Rights Act 2013. Point being that Pakistan’s policies, strategies, and the resulting social safety nets and development projects formulate a promising interface with MDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7. The requirement now is the successful implementation of policy commitments and development strategies. Few institutional and contextual constraints that have an impact on institutional effectiveness are explained in detail below:

Good Governance- Launched in 2014, Pakistan Vision 2025 upholds governance, institutional reforms, and modernization of public sector. The document aims to have an efficient and transparent government that operates under rule of law and provides security to the people and for this importance is provided to civil services reforms; accountability for performance at all three tiers of the government; restructuring and or privatization of selected public sector entities; strengthening of e-governance, & police and judicial reforms.

The Annual Plan 2014-15 of the Government of Pakistan emphasizes on “better governance”. Aiming to introduce regional equality among provinces, it raises the importance of capacity enhancement at provincial level. The government aims to establish a performance management delivery system for effective monitoring of performance of public sector institutions. Under public sector management, the government places emphasis on “enhancing the quality and coverage of data and statistics.” The Annual Plan 2014-15 of the government also emphasizes on strengthening ‘regulatory frameworks’ and increasing legal and judicial efficiency. The plan is geared towards economic reforms; public –private partnerships and with civil society; implementation effectiveness; capacity development of parliamentarians, and reducing corruption by introducing transparency, open and accountable financial and administrative mechanisms in all fields. (p. 250). Other areas indicated are: streamlining revenue administration, strengthening public financial administration, implementing e-governance; professionalism, skill up-gradation and training of civil servants under civil services reforms, procedural reforms to simplify government processes – making them comprehensible to general public and creating space for policy research.
Under economic reforms the federal government plans to focus on privatization of some public sector enterprises; ensuring inclusive growth; price stability; jobs for youth; economic infrastructure; increasing exports and most importantly generating tax revenue. Savings bring out more investment, employment generation, stable prices, and higher growth in economy.

Fiscal decentralization is one of the pillars of a devolved governance framework. It is about delegating fiscal powers and responsibilities to provincial governments. Provincial autonomy is upheld and provinces are not only expected to do expenditure management but also increase revenue generation; plan projects and manage other public functions. The 7th National Finance Commission Award is currently operative and it is considered to be a major step towards fiscal decentralization in Pakistan. In comparison to 2012-13, the year 2013-14 witnessed an increase of 20 per cent net transfers to provinces. Financial Commission Award to the provinces increased their share of the divisible pool and for the first time introduced multidimensional criteria, including poverty and backwardness for determining inter provincial shares. While the allocable amount is in theory at the discretion of local governments, and is non-lapsable, most of these resources are spent on personnel costs, with wages de facto set by the federal government. An effective fiscal transfer system should be predictable and formula-driven, consisting of a good balance between unconditional grants, to provide local governments' expenditure discretion, and conditional grants, to enable the centre to directly specify some accountability for service delivery. In the long run devolution is expected to produce good results on development agendas, be it MDG or Post 2015 development agenda.

In retrospect, the process of devolution created severe MDGs ownership related issues in Pakistan. The prevalence of transitional confusion and lack of technical and functional capacity beyond federal level posed challenges. Pre 18th Amendment arrangements were such that federal government was fully committed to MDGs. However the devolution process could not immediately smooth out the way for provinces to own MDGs. In fact post 2005 MDGs Summit, the provinces started getting involved. Coordination between three tiers of government created further issues. MDGs were reflected as national targets -and provinces perceived them as too ambitious. At present Pakistan has prioritized MDG 2 on Universal Primary Education for MDG Acceleration Framework (MAF) aiming to achieve enrolment of 5.1 million out of school children (76 per cent of the total number) retention and completion of primary education along with provision of

Compelling stories: Access to institutions: Empowerment for more resilient communities: In 2013, the office of Federal Ombudsman undergone major institutional reforms resulted in high efficiency by clearing huge backlog of complaints of several years. It is now recognized as the most easily accessible, effective and free of cost forum for the redress of grievances of the citizens against the misuse of powers by the state institutions.

As per the amended law these issues need to be resolved in 02 months’ time to ensure speedy disposal of justice without paying any fee.

Through extraordinary steps taken by this Office and its officials, 68,243 cases were finalized and disposed of during the year 2013, a record for the last 30 years since the establishment of this Office when an average of 16,583 cases were disposed of annually. Out of 38,191 pending cases 20,463 have also since been processed and draft findings are under appraisal for approval. Thus, cases approved or finalized for approval during 2013 stand at 88,706, which is a record for the Office.
quality education. At present provinces are taking this as a test case for their performance on MDGs and are now working on “MDG Acceleration Framework Action Plans”.

**Terrorism** - The 2012 round of Post 2015 National Consultations confirm that Pakistanis rate peace and personal security as their most important need and aspiration for 2015. The reality is that the Global Terrorism Index places Pakistan in the list of countries that have suffered from highest impact of terrorism. Pakistan in this connection is placed at number 2 in 159 countries. The tense situation in Pakistan has caused mass-scale population movement. IDPs have been arriving from North Waziristan and South Waziristan. Kurram, Orakzai, Bajaur, Mahmood, and Khyber are the main ‘origin’ locations. Eighty six percent IDPs are living off-camp sites i.e the government is not tracking them. The economic loss of billions is other than the fatalities and injuries that have become a routine for Pakistan. Political decision of developed countries may bring peace to them, but thoroughly jeopardize human security of ordinary citizens in developing countries – Pakistan included.

Pakistan suffered direct and indirect loss of US $ 68 billion during 2001-11 as opposed to US$10 billion that it received. The direct impact of security situation in Pakistan has been that militancy and insurgency became more important for the country than education and health. Gradually ‘development’ started appearing ambitious when the struggle at hand became that of ‘mere survival’. The militants directly attacked and destroyed government infrastructure in Pakistan, including schools. Firstly, among lower classes (mainly in poorly governed areas including tribal and its adjourned areas, South Punjab and interior Sindh), the drivers of radicalization and terrorism are: poverty, inequality and loose administrative structures. Among middle classes (mainly in urban- or semi-urban areas, includes central and North Punjab, Karachi, Hyderabad in Sindh, settled areas in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Kashmir), the drivers are political i.e. influence of internal and external political developments and radical narrative that radical groups promote.

**Disasters** - the German Watch Climate Risk Index ranks countries according to relative and absolute number of human victims and economic damages due to weather-related extreme events (storms, floods, heat waves etc.). It analyses to what extent countries have been affected by their impacts. As per this Global Climate Risk Index 2014 Pakistan is on third number – immediately after Haiti and Philippines. Pakistan is most vulnerable to natural hazards and floods are the most recurrent ones.

Economic growth stands affected due to floods and over the past six decades the country has suffered “a cumulative financial loss of more than US$ 37.5541 billion” with 11,572 people dead and “a total area of 603,942 sq km” flood affected. Floods have impacted new areas of eastern Balochistan and northern Sindh in 2010, 2011 and 2012 increasing vulnerabilities. Populations have encroached river flood plains and that increases risks and vulnerabilities.

**Gender** - In 1973 Constitution, provide for equal access to public places and equality of employment in the public and private sector. Article 32 makes special provisions for the representation of women in local Government. Also, Pakistan has accessed and ratified number of conventions on women rights and gender equality. In 1990/1991 the total number of women parliamentarians was two i.e. 0.9 per cent of the total strength. Senate at the time had one woman on 87 seats. The situation in the parliament changed and aim was to increase women and minority representation in the parliament. As a result 60 seats were reserved for women and in 2004/05 women held 21 per cent seats in National Assembly and 17/100 in Senate i.e. 17 per cent. In the following election women’s share rose to 22.2 percent in NA and remained unaltered in the Senate. AJK and KP have had the lowest representation of women. Women parliamentarians have been instrumental in introducing several women protection oriented legislation.
To **conclude** the above, Pakistan needs to preserve its political commitment to global development agenda whilst simultaneously making concerted efforts to implement development goals and vocabulary it has so generously incorporated in most of its policies, laws, plans and strategies. Key emerging messages based on desk review and lessons learned from the MDG framework include:

- Realignment of institutional mechanisms and structure for planning, monitoring and implementation of SDGs keeping in view of the devolution of governing functions resulted by the 18th constitutional amendment. This would mean clear demarcation of the roles and responsibilities of public institutions at the federal, provincial and district levels in the context of social development.

- It is crucial to institute effective coordination mechanisms and rule out coordination failures across multiple layers of governance in a devolved Pakistan. Also it is important that wide ranging partnerships between governments, civil society, international organizations,

- Promoting civil service and administrative reforms for improved service delivery and institute robust accountability framework for results and to enhance overall system of governance and rule of law.

- Instituting administrative accountability – particularly related to fiscal decentralization. Addressing different forms of inequalities – based on geography, sex, ethnicity etc – by developing systems and tools which could guide the allocation of public sector budgets and development plans.

- Building capacities of statistic machineries including the alignment of survey tools to collect analyze and report data for related to SDGs. Here the importance of role of ‘monitoring’ cannot be overlooked – also a subject requiring technical capacity development as well as use of advanced technology. At present, even the federal government is having difficulty in standardizing practices in monitoring and evaluation. There is shortage of trained staff and available data is irregular.

- Oversight mechanisms to ensure transparency remain weak. The government at all tiers must expedite implementation of local public participation in development planning, resource allocation, project appraisal, project monitoring etc. and introduce transparency and public participation specially in employment, procurement contracting and developing service delivery systems.

- Pakistan has been worst hit by disasters – both natural and man-made. Therefore it is important to develop capacities especially at the sub-national level to prevent and minimize the impact of disasters.

---

**Part II: Substantive Dialogues**

1. **Focused Group Discussion:**

   **Methodology:**
Three focused group discussion were organized with women, youth and vulnerable group. Each focused group comprised of 8-10 people involved in an interactive discussion and were briefed about the objectives of the exercise. Following questions were posed to seek their inputs and feedback:

i. Identify institutions- Which public institutions do you use/encounter during difficult times (e.g. floods/conflict)?
ii. Uncover problem/s- What specific problems are faced during the disaster or conflict (individual and community-level problems)?
iii. How do they rate public sector’s response during such times (we need specific cases/examples)?
iv. Which public institutions did you find supportive during the unfortunate times?
v. Do they have any specific grievances against a public institution involved in disaster risk reduction, relief and rehabilitation?
vi. Recommendations- If such a situation is repeated how do you think, the operations of our public institutions can be improved to better serve your needs?

The conversations resulted in identification and better understanding of the issues related to public service delivery. The information generated by the discussions will help to focus on critical aspects and possible solutions.

FGD with Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) was conducted at Jalozai IDP camp near Pubi, Nowshera at the PDMA camp office. Participants were representatives (elders) of different tribes and clans of IDP families living in Jalozai camp. It is important to mention here that participants were representing IDPs families came to the camp five years back, second lot came around 2.5 years ago and another influx just landed at Jalozai 2 months ago.

FGD with women group was organized in a community hall in the local area of Islamabad City. For identification and selection of participant, special consideration was given was low income household with tendency to avail public services institutions.

The participants of Youth FGD were students enrolled at graduate and post graduate level from different disciplines and universities in Islamabad

**Major finding of the focused group discussion:**
- Majority is unhappy about the public institutions service delivery capacity
- Public service institutions are almost non-functional in the absence of accountability and reprisal
- In absence of public service delivery private sector has filled the gap especially in education and health sectors
- A proactive regulatory mechanism is missing/weak for the private institutions
- Nepotism contributed to oligarchic widespread in public institution resulting incompetence and least intention to deliver
- A strong class system of the one who are connected and common people has emerged in past three decades
- People at large are not aware and familiar with complaints and redressal mechanism in public service delivery institutions
- Society is culturally dichotomous in terms of male and female domains(certain areas are only considered for males and others are invisibly assigned to females)
- In public services there is widespread issue of staff capacity and attitude in terms of delivery
- Complaint redressal systems are weak, very slow and almost unable to deliver
People experience discrimination because of their ethnic or religious affiliations
In remote and rural areas people are more informal hence lack access to formal service delivery institutions (CNIC for women, marriage and birth registration etc.)
A lot of service delivery issues emerge due to weak data management systems in public sector
Public delivery systems are slow and at times selective at times due to resource constraints, bribe or preferential culture
Absence of coordination and coherence in operations among federal, provincial and local public institutions

Recommendations:
- Selection of staff on merit in public service delivery institutions.
- Local representation in services and political system will enhance accountability.
- An efficient system of accountability with effective reprisal and rewards will improve provision of delivery.
- Widespread awareness about complaint and redressal mechanism help improve service delivery in public institutions.
- Positive discrimination/special importance of marginalized groups (women, religious minorities, disables, elderly etc.)
- Local and indigenous should be given preference in jobs to work in their own communities.

2. National consultation Meeting- Methodology, Key findings and recommendations:

A one day national consultation meeting was held to identify priorities, gaps and recommendations for institutional and capacity development initiatives imperative for implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). It brought together government representative, academicians, and practitioners, members of the civil society and policy makers to policy discussions on capacities and institutions for sustainable development and related inter-governmental processes. The sessions were structured around the following two main themes:

1. Capacity development and Institutional needs: A post 18th Amendment agenda:
2. State-action, Citizen Participation and Accountability for Addressing Vulnerabilities and Strengthen Resilience

1. Capacity development and Institutional needs: A post 18th Amendment agenda:

The lack of adequate capacities and effective institutions to roll out the MDG framework was one of the constraints identified during the first phase of 2015 consultations in Pakistan. Weak institutional structures and their capacity to plan, coordinate and monitor the national MDGs framework are the serious contributing factors for Pakistan’s weak performance on MDGs. After the 18th Constitutional Amendment, the role of institutions, especially at the sub-national level, has significantly changed. Now the most of the development planning and the implementation of plans is the sole responsibility of the local institutions. The discussion on the theme was undertaken in the sectors of health, education, public finance management and capacities and institutions need from the provincial perspective.
Following are the key findings and recommendations:

Health:
- There is a lack of public demand for good and effective public institutions. Citizens are not aware of the existing laws, their rights and entitlements to generate demand of quality of services in the health and education sectors and built pressure on government to improve performance as for electricity and law and order, pressurizing the government to invest in the energy sector.

- SDG demand governments to take the responsibility putting pressure on the government not to just chunk out funds but should realize the management of it through effective governance for the delivery of results. MDGs were pretty straight with three goals with narrow and vertical focus on health. Yet we failed to delivery on MDGs. There are two fundamental changes in SDGs universal health coverage is squarely on the agenda and non-communal diseases, which governments have to institutionalize.

- 70% health care services are delivered by the private sector. Government has to harness the capacity of the private sector to deliver the services, do regulatory rethink for what their role is. Create institutions and fundamentally transform them. Government need to come out of their comfort zone of vaccination and should deliver the quality basic health services.

Public Finance Management:
- Pakistan needs to increase its revenue collection for sustainable for growth. Fiscal space is needed to achieve the MDGs/SDGs for which growth through investment and finances.

- Pakistan current revenue collection stands at 17-18% of GDP. In the 7th NFC Award all provinces were allocated 57.7% of the total share of the revenue. The available 42.3% of the recourse with the federal government goes into debt services, defense spending and cost to run the government leaving very little for development spending. The 7th NFC Award made it mandatory for the provinces to increase the revenue collection/ mobilization above the provincial average. This puts huge responsibility on the provinces to support federal government in mobilizing additional resources/revenue. Better picture of resources is needed to deliver the SDGs as

- Major reforms needed at the Federal board of revenue for revenue and tax collection and all institutions should be brought into the ambit of the tax net.

- It becomes inevitable for the government to take loan to cover the fiscal deficit. However, the composition of the internal and external debt is important. Foreign debt is relatively cheaper with Interest/markup of less than 4% with longer maturity period along with grace period of five years. The local/internal loans are relatively expensive with an interest rate range between 9-13% depending
upon the maturity of the instrument (3-6 months). Higher local borrowings results in its roll over despite paying off.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Internal (local)</th>
<th>External (Foreign)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 2009</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 2014</td>
<td>68.3</td>
<td>31.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- The Fiscal responsibility and Debt Limitation Act 2005 asks the government that it must protect the pro-poor expenditures as mentioned in the PRSP, at least 4.5% of the GDP. Although, there is a strong need that this limit should be enhanced, the government should double its budget allocations for health and education.

Education:

- Political interference should be reduced as out of 185 days of a teaching calendar, most of the days are spent on non-teaching activities such as dengue walks, polio campaigns, youth festivals and elections etc.

- Limited administrative management capacity and under manned institutions at the provincial level i.e. only secretary education is responsible for managing everything which is not doable. It is hard to find provincial officer in far afield districts of KPK or Balochistan, where only an EDO has to manage the multiple charges. A national conversation is useful but the required granularity in terms of the capacity of the public sector to do things is needed for the system to deliver.

- In the past fifteen years, where on the one hand, we are doing decentralization, as seen in the 18th Amendment the transfer of powers from federal to provinces, but, on the other hand, centralization has increased where executive autonomy is rested, Centralized administrative authority is hindering in day to day decisions making system inefficient. Clarity

- Constant centralization of the executive authority in our structures has made the management at districts level very weak. It is hard to find provincial officer in far afield districts of KPK or Balochistan, where only an EDO has to manage the multiple charges.

- Target establishing, generating public demand through awareness and advocacy, holding office bearers and institutions accountable and mobilizing resources- structures is simply not capable of responding to the needs until entirely restructured. International community cannot do anything in this and host government has to do this job. Administrative systems in provinces are inadequate to deliver in education sector reforms

- There is need for establishing institutions with effective and equal participation of all the federating units without coercive intrusion of government to plan and take decisions effectively.

- Even after the devolution in the context of 18th amendment planning commission is centralized

- There is need for transformation in institutional structures to adapt to the need of roles and responsibilities and empowered to take decisions.
2. State-action, Citizen Participation and Accountability for Addressing Vulnerabilities and Strengthen Resilience

Civil Service Reforms:

- The findings of the National Commission for Governance Reforms provide the blueprint for undertaking the required reforms and take into account the issues of merit, tenure and performance not entitlement as basis for modernizing the civil service.

  "If we reduce discretion and enhance disclosure, half the battle is won in terms of making the civil service a more accountable civil service" Farrukh Moriani, Governance & Public Policy Expert

- The Civil service reforms need to be undertaken in an organized manner by doing breakdown civil service reforms areas in bind size pieces. Sachet reforms may be focused instead of mega reforms to attain simple viable products to achieve a larger goal.

- The most important aspect of the civil service reforms relates to accountability of the civil servants, an area where not much has been done on ground in terms of what and how it should be done. The roles of the civil servant should be redefined for the functions they perform and how these problems can be overcome. We have institutes like parliamentary committees, NAB, Anti-corruption departments, courts to hold government servants accountable for financial irregularities, but unfortunately their credibility and affectivity is not evident so far.

- There is need for making government servants accountable in terms of performance and service delivery. Performance targets and indicators need to be defined. But equally if not more importantly ways of doing business in government departments needs to be reformed (particularly decision making process involving movement of files across the bureaucratic hierarchy). Staff rationalization is also key reform area.

- Performance measurement system can be used as instrument to trigger accountability. The Annual performance report should not be confidential and can be used to drive the civil service reforms in other aspects as well.

- Use technology should be encouraged to simplify things not only for the processes within the government to do business but also to simplify things for public whom are being served.

- Although, there will be issues related to political economy factors which will arise even from these sachet reforms. But there is greater opportunity and low risk as compare to the mega reforms and result in making small but important step.

Social Accountability and Citizen Participation:
• Accountability institutions such as parliamentary committees, NAB, Anti-corruption departments and courts are extremely critical and should play a substantive role. Unfortunately, we have these institutions but their credibility and effectivity is not evident so far.

• Citizens should have the basic rights to claim the accountability and transparency space within the powerful structures of civil/ district administration and be part of decision making process. If the public stop demanding, the will government stops responding.

• Political opportunity, such as the Pakistan Right to information Act 2013 provides the space to the ordinary citizens to have the access to information in all matters of public importance. This will enables the transparent functioning of the public service resulting in improved governance, reduce corruption and hold the office bearers accountable to its citizens.

• There is a strong need to create awareness among the general public to exercise their formal spaces available in the law as tool for them to engage in the decision making process. This will help to reduce gap between the policy and practice at different tiers of government.

• The government needs to be forthcoming and initiatives should be taken in translating these policies in action enabling citizen to claim the formal spaces available as means for engaging to engage themselves in the decision making process.

• Engagement with the private sector is inevitable now. Private sector has claimed the space where government has failed to deliver e.g. education, health, water provision etc. The government should establish the regulatory mechanisms for the private sector that also takes into account citizen’s participation.

  • Use of ICT/ technology for social accountability should be enhanced to get citizen’s feedback, online complaints at all level and taking measures to ensure that their complaints are resolved in a timely manner.

Localizing and Monitoring Development Plans:

• The Vision 2025 of the Government of Pakistan shows complementarities and similarities between SDGs and vision 2025. The seven pillars are very much consistent with the proposed 17 SDGs. However, after the 18th constitutional amendment, most of these goals are to be implemented by the provinces and the federal government has a role to play for coordination to be able to effectively report back to the United Nations.

• Federal and Provincial government fiscal relationship play a key role. Pakistan is under an IMF programme, targets of which cannot be achieved alone by the federal government. Strong support from provinces is needed to achieve these targets without any manipulation of data. Federal government is giving the money to the provinces with an incentive for non-spending. The reward for non-spending will hamper the delivery of public service and ultimately the achievement of MDGs/ SDGs.
• The Pakistan Bureau of Statistics needs to be strengthened to play an effective role in monitoring of these goals and achieving the targets. There should be separate department dealing with the statistics/ data related to SDGs and MDGs and the international community can play strong role here. Manipulation and political interference in the preparation of data should be limited. Media and civil society has a strong role to play in educating people.

• It is proposed to have a full-fledged Ministry of Social Sector which is fully empowered and play the important role of coordinating with the provinces where the actual implementation for the achievement of these targets will take place.

Part III: Synthesis of the Online Survey on Citizen’s Feedback on Public Service Delivery:

While discussing the concept of good governance, it is important to gauge the demand-side of the services of institutions responsible for implementation of social sector priorities. An online survey was conducted, targeting 1500 respondents, based on the experience of general public in dealing with and availing of services from the public sector / government institutions. The survey was designed using qualitative information to capture the feedback of the end-users to inform the ongoing national and international post2015 discussions.

The citizen feedback survey was circulated through social media as well as through UNDP and SDPI official websites. Outreach teams also posted out emails to request feedback on the online survey to their networks. The survey assesses public

Dimensions of the Public service delivery covered in the online survey:

Efficiency: The respondents were asked about the quality, timeliness, accessibility of the range of services they have availed. This also includes safety measures, staff quality etc.

Inclusivity: Respondents were asked about the ability of institutions and service providers to foster inclusivity and managing the demand from an increasing diversity of actors.

Accountability: Respondents were asked if they are aware with the policy and legal safeguards available for the accountability of the public service providers.

Transparency: Respondents were asked if they have sufficient access to information on public utilities and their services. If they have to make any unofficial payment and why.

Grievance redress: The respondents were asked questions related to grievance redress mechanisms, whether they know where to file a complaint, if yes, did they filed complaint, received a response, and were
institutions in three sections: efficiency, inclusivity and accountability.

The valid responses included 53% of respondents from Punjab; 16% from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, 12% from the Capital territory, 12% from Sindh, 4% each from Balochistan and Azad Jammu Kashmir and 3% from Gilgit Baltistan. The vulnerable groups were well captured with in each of the provinces and female cohort had a share of 55% in the overall survey response.

It is essential to capture information from the neglected areas of the country and therefore 37% of the respondents of this survey belong to the rural Pakistan. Our percentage is low given that in this rapid assessment we were making use of social media tools which may not be available in several rural communities given low internet penetration rates. This may also be regarded as a limitation of this study. The survey allows the respondent to choose public institutions on which they wish to provide feedback. The main public institutions selected by our respondents included health, education, municipality water and sewerage, electric supply, natural gas supply, police and security, postal and communication services, transport and land revenue departments.

**Survey Findings:**

**Accessibility** of the social services continues to be an issue despite increased fiscal transfers and administrative powers to the provinces. 35% respondents in total had indicated some grievance in accessing one of the selected services. Out of these 35% we had 52% female respondents. Where accessibility was not an issue the efficiency (cost and timeliness) factors seem neglected.

Still however the accessibility of most facilities does not seem to be an alarming issue for male members in the communities, in both rural and urban area. Female respondents also found most facilities easily accessible in urban localities. However female respondents in the rural areas had specific difficulties in accessing health care and police services.
Sector-wise responses:

A. Health: A majority 35% of the rural population remained unsatisfied with the public health services. Reasons associated with the delay in health services include: low presence of qualified staff, unavailability of qualified staff, inadequate health emergency infrastructure, and no or expensive medications. In urban areas female respondents were not satisfied with the quality of the health services available. They particularly reported about the long hours of wait at the public facility due to which they have to neglect household chores and children.

More than half of the total population pointed out that availing the service was difficult and they had encountered some problem in the attempt, even though facilities are accessible in their locality. Even of
more concern is the number of female respondents who reported to have faced a problem in trying to avail the required health service; 67%. The most common complaint from the respondents was poor quality of services.

Most of the total population found health facilities non-compliant with basic health and safety measures; male population (64%) rates health facilities in their locality unsafe while a female population of 49% rated the facility non-compliant. This difference in opinion may be due to the respondent’s knowledge of universal safety standards.

53% urban and 69% rural respondents reported that publically supplied water was not compliant with basic health standards. They were well aware about the threats that water-borne diseases carry for their health and seemed frustrated with the weak response of current grievance redress mechanisms at the public water supply and sanitation departments.

**B. Education:** 62% respondents (within which 42% women) who raised issues with low quality education being given to their children. The value for money in case of primary and secondary education was questioned. Parents were well aware of skills mismatch and reported that their children should receive education that has demand in the labour market.

The problem of ghost teachers still prevails in the country and is of grave concern. 82% of the rural population claimed to have faced problems or challenges in availing education services in their locality. 67% of the female respondents reported to missing facilities in the public schools.

**C. Electricity & Gas Supply:** Over 60% of the sample reported to have faced a problem in availing both electric and natural gas services. Most common complaints with these services were: long waiting time for availing connection, irregular supply, poor quality and highly priced services. Incompetent and politically recruited staff at the public utilities was also identified as a major issue.

**D. Police and Security:** There was a low female response rate on our section dealing with access to police services. This may be attributed to: a) women’s low levels of interaction with police and legal services in Pakistani society, and b) fear of reporting to police or formal justice mechanisms. Over half the sample reported: ‘Police matters should only be dealt by male members in household or communities’.

**E. Transport:** Majority of male and female respondents reported to have some issues in timely access to public transport facilities within their localities; majority marked them as non-compliant to basic safety measures. In overall terms 79% claimed that they faced trouble in availing the service out of which 62% were female respondents. Three main weaknesses of the service included: low incentives for workforce employed in this sector, low technical knowledge of staff and insufficient supply of the service or inadequate required equipment. The respondents also informed that a lack of competition in this sector is strengthening cartelization.
I. Inclusivity

The top-3 reasons why our respondents may have faced difficulty in accessing a public service included:

a) favoritism resulting in discriminatory supply of such services (42%),
b) deprived due to gender (26%) and deprived due to some disability or being part of a marginalized cohort (11%).

A follow up question asked if such discrimination in supply of public services was a regular phenomenon. For 27% the incidence of discrimination in accessing public service is recurring. 61% had reported this discrimination or grievance however less than half were provided relief.
Accountability

We asked our respondent about their awareness on public accountability mechanisms and institutions responsible for ensuring accountability and anti-corruption. A low number reported awareness of most of the following institutions or legislative mechanisms (see table below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution/Law/Agency</th>
<th>Percentage reporting awareness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Accountability Ordinance</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Accountability Bureau</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Anti-Corruption Strategy</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountability Courts</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Investigation Agency</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Right to Information Act</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wafaqi or Provincial Mohtasib</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial anti-corruption cells</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auditor General of Pakistan</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee of the National Assembly</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e-governance initiatives at the federal or provincial level</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Procurement Regulatory Authority</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The survey results show local citizen participation in the decision making process due to limited knowledge of the government policies and mechanisms available to them.
Salaries of public officials are low
Public officials are overburdened
Demand of service is high
Political favoritism in providing services
High official rates of service
Other

Reasons for Unofficial Payments

Sources of Information on Public Services

Website
Publicity Material
Helpline
SMS Service
Public Seminar
Other

Urban
Rural
Factors Encouraging Citizens Engagement to make Public Service Accountable

- Legislation & Accountability Institute: 10% (Female), 15% (Male)
- Information & Communication: 18% (Female), 10% (Male)
- Clear Roles of Provincial & Federal Government: 9% (Female), 9% (Male)
- None: 8% (Female), 8% (Male)

Percentage of Respondents Aware of Institutions/Legislation/Mechanism Available for Public Service Complaints

- Not aware at all: 17% (Urban), 12% (Rural)
- Lack of clarity: 13% (Urban), 5% (Rural)
- Somewhat aware: 15% (Urban), 15% (Rural)
- Fully aware: 9% (Urban), 6% (Rural)
Effectiveness of Media in Ensuring Accountability of Public Institutions

- Very Effective: 23%
- Slightly Effective: 40%
- Not Effective: 27%
- Don't Know: 10%