CREATING MOMENTUM:
TODAY IS TOMORROW
Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow


357pp.
1. South Asia - Sustainable Development.
I. Title.

© SDPI & Sang-e-Meel Publications

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, digital, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Publisher.

2015
Published by:
Afzaal Ahmad
Sang-e-Meel Publications,
Lahore.

Edited by:
Sarah S. Aneel
Uzma T. Haroon
Imrana Niazi

Cover design by:
Abdul Basit Khan

Disclaimer
The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this anthology are entirely those of the authors and should not be attributed to the Sustainable Development Policy Institute or Sang-e-Meel Publications. Any text that has not been referenced or cited as per the Authors’ Guidelines is the sole responsibility of the author(s).


Sustainable Development Policy Institute
38 Embassy Road, G-6/3, Islamabad
Tel: (92-51) 2278134, 2278136 Fax: 2278135

Sang-e-Meel Publications
Phones: 37220100-37228143 Fax: 37245101
http://www.sang-e-meel.com e-mail: smp@sang-e-meel.com
25 Shahrah-e-Pakistan (Lower Mall), Lahore-54003 PAKISTAN
# Table of Contents

Preface  
About SDPI  
Acknowledgements  
Keynote Address: *Thoughts on Inclusive Economic Reforms in Pakistan* – Hafiz A. Pasha  

**I. Shaping Momentum: Role of Religion, History, Literature and Language**  
1. Islamic Conception of Freedom of Belief: The Case of Apostasy – Eaisha Tareen  
2. Revisiting Key Episodes of the Parliamentary Communist Movement in India: Contributions of Rajani Palme Dutt - Nathalène Reynolds  
3. Rifles or Roses: Power of the Written Word - Ayesha Salman  
4. Language Policy and Education in Pakistan - Tariq Rahman  

**II. Creating Momentum: Role of Women Empowerment in Economic Development and Environmental Sustainability**  
5. Pakistani Rural Women and ‘Development’ in an Age of the ‘Anti-Politics Machine’ – Haider Nizamani  
7. Women and Sustainable Mountain Development: An Illustration of Indigenous Women’s Adaptation to Climate Change in Himalaya - Bhagwati Joshi and Prakash C. Tiwari  
8. Women as Agents of Change in Litchi Production: A Case Study of Khanpur, Pakistan – Saima Bibi, Ahmad Hussain, Muhammad Mumtaz Malik, Sadaf Siddique and Sundas Shaukat  

**III. Retaining Momentum: Role of Inclusive Growth, Service Delivery and Post-Conflict Livelihoods**  
9. Learning from Cross-country Experiences for Inclusive Growth in Pakistan – Nadia Tahir  
10. Citizen State Engagement for Service Delivery in Bangladesh, Pakistan and India - Faisal Haq Shaheen  
11. Ethnic Groups and their Livelihood Activities and Options in Post-conflict Nepal - Bishnu Raj Upreti and Sony KC  

**IV. Fuelling Momentum: Role of Energy and ICT**  
12. Impact of Information and Communication Technologies on Pakistan’s Economy and Poverty- Mohammad Yasin and Asim Manzoor  
14. Deindustrialisation in South Asia: Role of Energy Crises - Bushra Yasmin and Wajeeha Qamar
V. Securing Momentum: Avoiding Water Conflicts

15. Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya: A Precondition for Water Security and Climate Change Adaptation in South Asia - Prakash C. Tiwari and Bhagwati Joshi 277


Annexure: Conference Agenda
Preface

It is a pleasure to present the anthology of SDPI’s Sixteenth Sustainable Development Conference (SDC) titled ‘Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow.’ This annual Conference, a flagship event, is considered the largest congregation of people working in South Asia and on South Asian [and beyond] issues. Over the last two decades, I have observed that the scale, contents, and quality of presentations at the SDC have greatly enhanced. This pursuit of perfection is not only confined to the three jam-packed Conference days (10-12 December 2013) of research and policy analysis discourse, but is also carried forward in this compilation by the collective efforts of our contributors, review panel and editorial team, making this one of SDPI’s most treasured publications.

The realisation that today is the time to act otherwise we will be condemned to a tomorrow which offers little hope for improved living conditions in the region is the basic theme of this compilation which starts off with the keynote address of the Conference, followed by 16 peer approved chapters, to culminate with the Epilogue.

These chapters bring together the thoughts of some of the best minds and statespersons of South Asia and other regions about the ‘momentum of change’ which is required if we want our allied future to be better than what it is today. The 22 authors deliberate upon factors such as religion, history, literature, philosophy and language which can shape this momentum. Special attention is paid to the role women are playing and which should be strengthened in creating that momentum and thus, there is a section on women empowerment in economic development and environmental sustainability. The third section explores in depth the economic growth, service delivery and livelihood trajectories of countries like Pakistan, Bangladesh, India, South Korea, China, Nepal, and Sri Lanka which are crucial for retaining any momentum for change for betterment across societies. Importance of energy and ICT is highlighted in the fourth section which are critical for fuelling momentum not just for nations and people today, but which have become ever more critical for future progress and prosperity. While South Asia as a collective shares similar hopes and dreams, the region also shares a collective challenge and that is the availability of clean, pure, abundant water from rivers and streams which geographically intertwine all of our destinies, because without water life anywhere on Earth is not possible, and so it was very logical to conclude the compilation with the determination and possible directions for avoiding inter and intra state water conflicts.

As always, the beauty of these chapters is that they do not merely present the authors’ point of view, rather in many cases also present the input and ideas provided by Conference delegates belonging to all walks of life. I hope you would find this book a valuable addition to your list of essential readings.
My team and I look forward to your feedback on how to further improve the quality of SDC in general and SDC anthology in particular.

Dr. Abid Qaiyum Suleri  
Executive Director  
Sustainable Development Policy Institute  
22 October 2014
About the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI)

Who we are
The Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) is one of South Asia’s leading policy research organisations providing the global development community representation from Pakistan and the region as a whole with the mission ‘to catalyse the transition towards sustainable development, defined as the enhancement of peace, social justice and well-being, within and across generations.’

Where we come from
The Institute’s genesis lies in the Pakistan National Conservation Strategy (also known as Pakistan’s Agenda 21), which approved by the Federal Cabinet in March 1992, outlined the need for an independent non-profit organisation in the country to serve as a source of expertise for policy analysis, evidence-based research and training services. The Institute, therefore, started its humble beginnings in August 1992.

What we do
We function in an advisory capacity by carrying out robust research, policy advice and advocacy; and in an enabling capacity by strengthening other individuals and organisations with resource materials and training. Specifically, our broad-based yet holistic mandate is to:

• conduct evidence-based research, advocacy and training from a broad multi-disciplinary perspective;
• promote the implementation of policies, programmes, laws and regulations based on sustainable development;
• strengthen civil society and facilitate civil society-government interaction in collaboration with other organisations and activist networks;
• disseminate research findings and public education through the media, conferences, seminars, lectures, publications and curricula development; and,
• contribute to building national research capacity and infrastructure.

How we do it
The diverse array of socio-economic and environmental projects and programmes that SDPI has been involved in over the past 22 years outline the following core activities:

• Providing policy advice to the government;
• Facilitating and organising forums for policy dialogue;
• Supporting in-house, local, regional and international academics, students and researchers;
• Publishing critical research for public and private sector use;
• Acting as a conduit for North-South dialogue;
• Creating an environment for information dissemination and training;
• Campaigning for regional advocacy and networking.
**Why we do it**
Despite the political, economic and even environmental turmoil which Pakistan has endured over two decades, the Institute’s efforts remain unwavering in its vision to become a Centre of Excellence on sustainable development policy research, capacity development and advocacy in the country and South Asia by producing knowledge that not only enhances the capacity of the state to make informed policy decisions, but also engages civil society and academia on issues of public interest for the betterment of current and future generations.

**How we reach out**
Since its inception, the SDPI has organised innumerable seminars and conferences. However, the Sustainable Development Conference (SDC) series has become a flagship event of the Institute that not only provides a forum for highlighting SDPI’s own research, but also offers space to other researchers and academics from South Asia in particular and across the globe in general, to share their work and engage in constructive dialogue with fellow panelists, movers and shakers from the public and private sector, students and the general public.

To date, SDPI has organised sixteen SA-centric annual conferences. The papers published in this anthology were presented at the Sixteenth SDC titled ‘Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow’ held over a three-day period (10-12 December 2013) in Pakistan’s capital Islamabad (see Annexure for detailed Conference Agenda).
Acknowledgement

Donors and Partners
SDPI’s Sixteenth Sustainable Development Conference was held in major collaboration with the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Canada; and, IDRC’s Think Tank Initiative (TTI).

Other partners and donors included: Aawaz, a Department for International Development (DFID) funded programme, implemented by Development Alternatives, Inc Europe (DAI Europe) and Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI); Heinrich Boll Stiftung (HBS); United Nations Development Programme (UNDP); United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)- Asia-Pacific Forum for Environment and Development (APFED); United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP); World Food Programme (WFP); Food and Agricultural Organisation (FAO); and International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD); Consumer Unity & Trust Society (CUTS) International; Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES); Secure Livelihoods Research Consortium (SLRC); Minorities Rights Group International (MRGI); Commission on Science and Technology for Sustainable Development in the South (COMSATS); United States Agency for International Development (USAID) Agribusiness Project (UAP); International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) - Pakistan Strategy Support Program (PSSP); Oxfam; and the World Bank.

Review Panel
Each chapter in this anthology was peer reviewed by experts having diverse academic and technical expertise. The independent reviews provided critical and honest comments that assisted the authors, as well as anthology editors, in making this publication as reliable and thorough as possible. The Institute and editors wish to thank the following academics, researchers and professionals for their peer review:

Dr. Abrar Ahmed is a PhD in Agricultural Science from University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan. He joined the SDPI in 2013 as Advisor-Sustainable Agriculture. He is now associated with the Institute as a Visiting Research Fellow.

Dr. Adnan Ahmed Khan is Associate Professor at the Department of Electrical Engineering, College of Telecommunications, National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), Pakistan. He has authored 40 publications, and conducted several trainings on ‘Advanced Cellular Systems’.

Mr. Ahmad Salim has a Masters in Philosophy from Karachi University, Pakistan. He is a recipient of the President’s Pride of Performance Award 2010 in recognition of his contributions in the field of literature. Presently, he is working as Senior Advisor, Education and Religious Diversity at SDPI in Islamabad, Pakistan.

Dr. Aisha Azhar, a Fulbright Scholar, is working as an Assistant Professor at UCP Business School, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. Her areas of expertise
are public management, capacity building, non-profit organisations and sustainability. She is currently working on the subject of women empowerment.

Dr. Aneel Salman is Assistant Professor at the COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad, Pakistan. His areas of research expertise include climate change, behavioural, energy and development economics, institutional governance, international trade, and public policy. Recipient of the NCCR Postdoctoral fellowship (Switzerland), Fulbright (USA) and HASS scholarship (USA), he also has extensive experience in conducting capacity building trainings for the government, profit and non-profit sectors in leadership, supply chain management and entrepreneurship.

Dr. Asaf Niwaz is an Assistant Professor at the Department of Education, University of Haripur, Pakistan.

Mr. Asif Saeed Memon is an Associate Research Fellow at SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan. He has worked on education, economics and governance in his capacity as a researcher as well as a monitoring and evaluation specialist. He has a Masters in Comparative Social Policy from the University of Oxford, UK, and is a doctoral candidate in education policy at the George Washington University, USA.

Dr. Bhaskar Singh Karky is a Resource Economist working as a Regional Coordinator for the REDD+ Initiative at the International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD), Nepal. He follows climate negotiations on REDD+ and adaptation and has numerous publications on these topics.

Dr. Bishnu Raj Upreti is Director of the Nepal Centre for Contemporary Research (NCCR) and teaches at Kathmandu University, Nepal. He is associated with various international academic and research institutions and has authored/co-edited 40 books and is frequently published in international journals and anthologies.

Dr. Bushra Yasmin is Chairperson, Department of Economics at the Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

Dr. Eaisha Tareen is an independent Clinical Psychologist in Colchester, UK. She has special interest in gender issues and Islam. She did her Masters in Islamic Studies from Birkbeck College, University of London, and has taught Islamic Studies at the undergraduate and postgraduate level. Her doctoral research was in the area of social support and depression in Pakistani women from the University of Essex, UK.

Dr. Faisal Bari is an Associate Professor of Economics at the Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS), Pakistan. His teaching and research interests revolve around microeconomics, industrial organisation, game theory and development. His recent research is focused on rural Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) and Balochistan. He is also a Visiting Research Fellow at Mahbub-ul-Haq Human Development Centre (MHDC), Pakistan where he is involved in a 5-year four-country education sector research project in collaboration with researchers from Universities of Cambridge,

Mr. Faisal Haq Shaheen is a senior civil servant at the City of Toronto and a PhD candidate at Ryerson University, Toronto, Canada. He is a lecturer and researcher, and has worked on South Asian policy issues related to trade, environment, administration and municipal governance.

Dr. Farhana Nosheen is an Assistant Professor at the Department of Food Science Nutrition & Home Economics, GC University, Faisalabad, Pakistan. She is an author of 20 research articles published in international and national gender focused journals, and has worked with various UN and international organisations on gender issues.

Dr. Haroon Sarwar Awan is Assistant Chief at the Planning Commission, Pakistan where he is dealing with macroeconomic issues and has been part of the Growth and Vision 2025 Team. He has taught macroeconomics, econometrics and statistics at the University of Sargodha, Pakistan. He has published many articles in local and international journals and recently completed a study on microenterprises for the Korean Institute of Development Studies. He received his PhD degree from the University of Sargodha, Pakistan.

Dr. Irfan Muzzafar is a teacher, teacher educator, and education researcher. His current research interests centre on teacher education, mathematics education in multilingual contexts, and politics of education reforms. He has published his work in *Comparative International Review, Education Theory, Cultural Studies of Science Education,* and *Journal of Social and Policy Sciences.* He also contributes a biweekly column on education related issues.

Ms Imrana Niazi is Coordinator of the Sustainable Development Conference (SDC) and a member of the English Editorial Board at the SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan. She has been associated with the Institute since 2008 and has done Bachelors in Computer Arts and Masters in Communication Sciences from the Fatima Jinnah Women University (FJWU), Rawalpindi, Pakistan. She has also been associated with Bahria University, Islamabad, and FJWU as a Lecturer. She is the co-editor of this anthology, as well as those published in 2014, 2013, 2012, and 2010.

Ms Irina Mosel is a Research Fellow at the Overseas Development Institute (ODI), London, UK. She is a researcher and development professional with experience in displacement, urbanisation and livelihoods in Sudan, South Sudan, Uganda and Pakistan.

Prof. Dr. Michael J. Casimir is Professor Emeritus at the Department of Social and Cultural Anthropology, University of Cologne, Germany. He has widely published on cultural ecology, pastoral nomadism and the anthropology of emotions.

Dr. Mohammad Akmal Makhdom trained at Cambridge University, UK and worked as a National Health Services Consultant Psychiatrist until 2012. He is an Honorary Fellow of
University of Essex and University Campus Suffolk, UK and Honorary faculty of AAA University, California, USA. He is a co-author of ‘Churchill’s Pocketbook of Psychiatry’ (2000) published by Harcourt Brace, USA. Presently, he is doing private practice and developing new clinical models in UK and Pakistan.

Ms Mome Saleem is Research Coordinator and Associate at SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan. Academically an anthropologist, she has contributed towards the discourse on gender, peace and conflict and climate change apart from other subjects.

Dr. Muhammad Ahsan Wagha is a General Linguist and language researcher. He has worked as founding Head and teacher of the Department of Linguistics, Quaid-e-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan and contributed to Siraiki literature and has a number of books to his credit.

Dr. Muhammad Khalid Bashir is serving at the Institute of Agricultural and Resource Economics, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan. His areas of research specialities are food security and rural development.

Dr. Muhammad Naazir Mahmood is a senior development professional with experience spanning over 25 years. He has taught and trained at the Institute of Business Administration (IBA) Karachi, Pakistan for eight years and has worked on projects funded by the EU, UNDP, USAID, DFID, and other international development agencies. Presently, he is working as external monitor for the Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development (DFATD) (formerly CIDA).

Dr. Nathalène Reynolds has a doctorate in History of International Relations from the University of Panthéon-Sorbonne, Paris, France. Presently, she is a Visiting Fellow at the SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan, and a member of the Peace-Keeping Operations Network of the University of Laval, Montreal. She is also research fellow at the Institut Français de Recherches sur l’Afrique (French Institute of Research on Africa), Nairobi, Kenya. Previously, she has been an Associate Researcher at the Centre for Asian Studies (Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies) in Geneva, Switzerland.

Dr. Prakash C. Tiwari is Professor of Geography at Kumaon University, Nainital, Uttarakhand, India. He is a mountain natural resource management and sustainable development specialist, and working on climate change adaptation, livelihood and food security, disaster risk reduction, gender, institutions and governance, and has worked with various national and international organisations in India and abroad. He is also a Visiting Fellow at SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan, and Senior Fellow of Earth System Governance (ESG) Project of International Human Dimension Programme (IHDP).

Dr. Purna B. Nepali is Regional Project Coordinator, Food Security Governance for Nepal and Myanmar, at DanChurchAid. He has a PhD from Kathmandu University/Zurich University in Human and Natural Resources Studies. His expertise lies in land reform, livelihoods and social conflict in Nepal.
Mr. Safal Ghimire is a PhD Candidate at the Centre for Peace Studies, University of New England, New South Wales, Australia. Formerly, a Research Officer at the Swiss National Centre of Competence in Research (NCCR North-South), he has co-authored books and journal articles on conflict, peace and security in Nepal.

Dr. Saira Ahmed has a PhD in Economics, Markets, Institutions from IMT Institute for Advanced Studies, Lucca, Italy. She is now Consultant Economist with the Poverty and Economic Policy Research Network and Eni Enrico Mattei Foundation, Venice, Italy.

Ms Sarah S. Aneel, a Chevening Fellow, has been working with SDPI, Pakistan, since 2003 in various capacities (including Programme Coordinator). Presently, she is a Visiting Associate and Editorial Consultant with the Institute, having compiled several annual reports, edited eleven peer reviewed conference anthologies, and numerous research papers. Apart from academic editorship and publications, her areas of interest include environmental governance, leadership, human security, gender and child sexual abuse. She is also co-editor of this anthology.

Ambassador Shafqat Kakakhel is a former Pakistani diplomat who also served as UN Assistant Secretary General and Deputy Executive Director of the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP). He has been a member of the UN Clean Development Mechanisms Executive Board; Pakistan Advisory Committee on Climate Change; ENERCON Fund Board and the Board of Directors of the Mountain Glacier Protection Organisation. Presently, he is Chairperson, Board of Governors, SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Dr. Shama Dossa holds a PhD in Community Development from the University of Toronto, Canada. She is a visiting faculty member at a number of universities and is presently Director, Evaluation Research and Learning at the Agha Khan Foundation, Afghanistan.

Dr. Sheryar Khan Toru is a Research Fellow at SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan. He holds a PhD in Social and Policy Sciences from the University of Bath, UK. His research interests include understanding governance problems in Pakistan and public policy.

Dr. Sofia Ahmed worked as a Research Economist at the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Islamabad, Pakistan from 2006-2013. She is now a freelance economic and social policy researcher in Sydney, Australia.

Dr. Urs Geiser is a Senior Researcher, Development Study Group at the Department of Geography, University of Zurich, Switzerland.

Ms Uzma T. Haroon holds a Masters degree in Communication from the University of Hawaii, USA. She has over 20 years of experience in media and communication. Presently, she is the Senior Coordinator, Sustainable Development Conference (SDC) Unit at SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan. She has been coordinating the annual international
conference series since 2003 and is co-editor of the past eleven SDC anthologies, as well as this one.

Dr. Vaqar Ahmed is Deputy Executive Director and head of the Economic Growth Unit at SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan. He has worked as an economist with the UNDP, Asian Development Bank, World Intellectual Property Organization, Oxford Policy Management, Irish Rural Economy Research Centre and Ministries of Finance, Planning and Commerce in Pakistan. He is a visiting faculty member at the National University of Ireland, IMT Institute of Advanced Studies in Italy, and Pakistan Institute of Trade and Development.

Editors
Apart from the cooperation of panel organisers and the entire SDPI staff, the Sixteenth Sustainable Development Conference (SDC) and this publication would not have been possible without the constant support of the following SDPI colleagues/co-editors:

• Ms Sarah S. Aneel, Visiting Associate and Editorial Consultant, SDPI.
• Ms Uzma T. Haroon, Senior Coordinator, SDC Unit, SDPI.
• Ms Imrana Niazi, Coordinator, SDC Unit, SDPI.

Cover Designer: SDPI is grateful to Mr. Abdul Basit Khan for designing the cover page of this anthology and the conference poster.
Keynote Address at SDPI’s Sixteenth Sustainable Development Conference

Thoughts on Inclusive Economic Reforms in Pakistan
Hafiz A. Pasha*

‘Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow’ is indeed a very relevant topic and is extremely relevant in the context of a country, which following democratic and political transition after its 2013 General Elections, has moved on peacefullly into a new government-- a government, which has committed itself to democratic traditions, and which is now trying to achieve a better economic future.

This talk is based on a multi country research project called the ‘Economy of Tomorrow (EoT)’ supported by Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES) which explores constructing a ‘new development path’ that enables the formation of ‘discursive coalitions’ in order to build momentum and power for its implementation. The participating countries include China, India, Indonesia, South Korea, Thailand, Vietnam and I am glad to say, Pakistan as well. The idea behind the project is to conduct a comparative study of how countries can become ‘welfare states’, something close to the vision of the Father of the Nation, Quaid-e-Azam. The objectives of the study include looking at:

1. an economic and development model that can serve as a guideline for overcoming current economic, ecological and social crises;
2. a parallel narrative to the dominant neo-liberal discourse which gives countries vision and orientation for socio-political debates and struggles;
3. a platform where reform-oriented actors can join forces in moving towards this alternative and parallel development path.

The project not only covers civic actions which can lead to faster growth, but also sustainable and inclusive growth, the kind of growth which can make societies more resilient.

India and What We Can Learn
The issue of inclusiveness, reminds me of a wonderful new book, ‘An Uncertain Glory: India and its Contradictions’ written by Jean Drèze and Amartya Sen. The two leading

* Dr. Hafiz A. Pasha is a distinguished economist who has served as Pakistan’s Federal Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs, Education Minister and Commerce Minister in three governments. He was till recently Dean of the School of Social Sciences at the Beaconhouse National University, Lahore, Pakistan. Till 2007, he was working as United Nations Assistant Secretary General and United Nations Development Program Assistant Administrator and director of the Regional Bureau for Asia and the Pacific. He is the first Pakistani to hold this distinction. Dr. Pasha was awarded the ENGRO Lifetime Achievement Award in the field of Social Sciences in 2012 and earlier the Congressional Medal of Achievement by the Philippines Congress.
economists of India argue that the country’s main problems lie in the lack of attention paid to the essential needs of its people, especially of the poor and often of women. They show how in India, there have been major failures both to foster participatory growth and to make good use of public resources generated by economic growth to enhance people’s living conditions. According to them, from one side, India appears to be conquering the world; from another, it is rolling steadily towards the edge of a cliff. Take, for instance, how India is…

...falling behind every other South Asian country (with the exception of Pakistan) in terms of many social indicators, even as it is doing spectacularly better than these countries in terms of growth per capita income (Drèze and Sen 2013, p. 50 and 54).

Bangladesh, for example, has overtaken India in terms of social indicators like life expectancy, child survival, enhanced immunization rates, reduced fertility rates and even some schooling indicators. They point out that even if the gap in social indicators between India and Pakistan ‘has not been fundamentally altered in most cases...in some respects such as immunization rates, things seem to have improved more in Pakistan than in India (p. 54).’ Such appalling unequal patterns of development, say Drèze and Sen, are...

...making the country look more and more like islands of California in a sea of sub-Saharan Africa (Drèze and Sen 2013, p. ix).

Whenever, I have driven past the Delhi Parliament House, the truth of this inequality truly sinks in. Very much, I am sad to remark, similar to when one drives past the Parliament House in Islamabad and the new luxury shopping malls of the capital - an index of the amount of black money that is being generated into achieving ‘inclusive growth.’

Pakistan: Where Do We Stand in the World?
What is the situation of our country today? We have slipped, again, in the Human Development Index, falling from medium to low level human development. Pakistan is ranked even below Bangladesh- our poor former cousin- in the Prosperity Index. There is one view in the United States that Pakistan is approaching the status of a ‘failing state’ and that within Asian countries there are only two countries, which are ranked in the top 20 in terms of the probability of failing. One is Pakistan, unfortunately, and the other is Afghanistan.

There is, however, some good news because I don’t want to sound too depressing either. We do seem to be doing better than other South Asian countries in the Food Security Index. We have improved in the Corruption Perception Index, and this is very important, because this was where we were floundering in the last five years, and I am very proud to see that today we are ranked 127 out of 175 countries. Last year, we were ranked 139, so an improvement of 12 places is exceptionally remarkable and this testifies to the new government.
Pakistan’s Economic Governance and Institutional Gaps
The Planning Commission, one of the most critical institutions of governance, has only now finally been given the status of a ‘Ministry’ and while this was long overdue, I am not quite sure how the Commission’s first ‘assignment’ of developing a twelve year 2025 vision for the country will go since I have become one of those who can no longer even plan for the next two weeks or months given the ever changing state of affairs in the country; and because of the possessiveness of the country’s Finance Ministry which seems to think that no other ministry is really needed when it comes to fiscal negotiations with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and has all its meetings without the input of other critical state departments.

So, while I let our new ‘Ministry’ tackle the 2025 vision, I will here focus on the medium term, by which I mean the next two to three years. The view we have taken is (and if I can tout it to impress you with somewhat technical terms) is that there is a certain path of dependence. The future of Pakistan is dependent, to some extent, on the present. If one forecasts till 2025, one is liable to ignore the present, but, if you project for the next two to three years, then I am afraid the ‘present’ counts a great deal. I have been studying the economy for the last 40 years and the degree of uncertainty today about the future of Pakistan’s economy is higher than ever before. No doubt, under the present leadership, it can go up, and I hope it will, but it could also just as easily slip under. We are poised at the ‘knife edge’ and can go either way.

According to Pakistan’s Ministry of Finance, we will see a boom at the end of the year: a GDP growth rate of 5% which is predicted to rise to 7% by 2015-16. Given the fact that over the last 5 years, we have been growing at a paltry 3%, this is almost tantamount to wishful thinking. I am afraid this degree of optimism in the initial macroeconomic framework developed by the Ministry of Finance only shows how much in isolation it seems to be working without serious discussions with the other ministries, including the Planning Commission. As opposed to this, we have signed a contract with the IMF through the extended fund facility where we readily accepted the fact that the growth of this year will be hardly 2.5% and probably in the next two years, if we are lucky, we might reach 4% growth. Look at the divergence! 7% optimism by the Ministry of Finance, and, then we sign a document where we agree that we cannot do more than 4% and even this latter figure is problematic unless as pointed out by Dr. Abid Suleri (SDPI’s Executive Director) ‘we get our act together’.

Pakistan’s Economic Prospects and Dependence on Non-Economic Factors
The big ongoing debate in both government and non-government circles is that there is a wide divergence: that some in the government think we will prosper and bloom as an economy in the next 2-3 years; while others are saying that we will remain flat or even fall. What exactly will determine the path we take? The answer to this question rests on in-depth analysis of a host of factors. Under the FES EoT project, I was mentioning earlier, we have identified 30 factors of varying importance and I will discuss a few of
them. What is the probability that we will achieve faster, inclusive and sustainable growth in the next few years, and what is the probability that these different factors will operate in a favourable manner? That is the question we have to answer. One distinguishing feature of this period in Pakistan’s history is how dominant non-economic factors have become in influencing our economic fate and there are a few of them that are of critical importance.

The first is, of course, whether we begin to see some reduction in the acts of terrorism. Particularly after 2014, we paid a cost of USD 12 billion for acts of terror, i.e. direct costs as well as indirect costs --- over 5% of our GDP. The real cost that this country has borne on behalf of the world is much more. Unfortunately, the world has not adequately recognised this sacrifice that Pakistan has made.

The other big issue is load-shedding. In 2012, Pakistan carried the cost of load-shedding to industry, to commerce, to agriculture, to domestic and other consumers, to a staggering 1400 billion PKR annually, equivalent to 7% of our gross domestic product. The cost kw/h is coming to at least 26-27 PKR kw/h. If we only tackle load-shedding in the presence of unutilized excess capacity, Pakistan could easily raise the growth rate of its GDP annually by 1.5 to 2 percentage points.

The other non-economic issue, which we are all concerned about, is improvement in the law and order situation especially in our industrial, commercial and financial hub, Karachi. Karachi today is a four trillion PKR economy. A statistic never mentioned before. Four thousand billion PKR is the size of the economy of Karachi and daily loss in economic activity in this city alone costs the country 11 billion PKR and daily tax revenue loss of 2.5 billion PKR. So, if we have a truck strike and so on, one can imagine we lose approximately 80 billion PKR in terms of the economy.

Nowadays, we also have the long-standing issue of insurgency in Balochistan. Most recently, there have been positive developments like the decision of current Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif not to form his own government in the province, and opting to accept a coalition-led government by the nationalists. This was extremely mature behaviour and what is even more promising is that the province is the first one to conduct local government elections. However, what we don’t know is that the Baloch economy has been declining in absolute terms over the last five years. It has declined by 10% in real terms. This is a statistic that very few people know about and I want to emphasise this because the previous government had started the Aghaz-e-Haqooq-e-Balochistan (AHB) package and enormously increased the National Finance Commission Award (NFC)1 to Balochistan in 2010. Why then is the Baloch economy falling so rapidly? This is something which has to be focused on. For example, very few people realise that the recent tomato crisis in Pakistan occurred when India stopped exporting to us because of its own shortages. One third of our consumption of tomatoes is fulfilled by India, but what we don’t appreciate is that over 30% of the production of tomatoes is from

---

1 Editors’ Note: The National Finance Commission Award is a series of planned economic programmes enacted since 1951 under Article 160 of Pakistan’s Constitution to fix financial imbalances and fairly manage financial resources to the four provinces of the country.
Balochistan, and if we don’t look after the agriculture side of Balochistan, we will continue to see a major explosion in the prices of vegetables.

On the other side, we have the Sindh and Punjab provincial governments disrupting the local governance processes and I must impress some degree of disappointment about the nature of the local government that was proposed by the Punjab government since it will be a *quasi* provincial government rather than local government. It is disappointing that in a democratic dispensation, the government of Punjab is not willing to let go. The establishment of District Education Authorities (comprised of 9 to 15 members including MNAs and MPAs, local government members, retired bureaucrats and other officers) for regulating schools and resolving education related problems in Punjab is also completely contrary to the Constitution, I feel.

Another non-economic factor is sectarian violence and polarisation which is now rapidly spreading throughout the country, even in the more peaceful province of Punjab.

**New Path for Pakistan: Final Thoughts**

After sanctions were imposed on us following the country’s nuclear tests in May 1998, the first thing we should have done was compression of non-essential imports. Yet, we have not touched imports. Total imports of Pakistan currently stand at USD 40 billion, increasing at a rate of 14% per annum, which is 60 to 80 times more than our exports. Major imports, which are basically machinery, mineral and chemical products, petroleum and petroleum products, fertilizers, medicines, edible oil and pulses and so on, account for 60% of our import bill; the remaining 40% consists of very interesting items: Pakistan imports exotic foods, consumed in mega shopping malls where you can find expensive beverages and chocolates and so on. This may sound wonderful but it is costing the economy billions of dollars. Can we not stop consuming luxury food items for some time to save our country and preserve our self-respect? We are spending 300 million dollars in importing cosmetics, leather hand bags and branded high-end luxury garments. All we have to do is tighten our belt a little and save two billion dollars out of 20 billion dollars of non-essential imports and we can say goodbye to uncle IMF and uncle Sam. Let’s do what we did in 1998: we cut back, we had a dual exchange rate, essential imports had lower exchange rate and non-essential imports were higher, almost 8 or 10 PKR higher and we managed it without any assistance from the West. This was the classic example of self-reliance, yes, we did make mistakes, we had frozen lots of currency accounts, but we persevered.

Now, how are we managing our balance of payments? We are told by the Ministry of Finance that although we have bought the US $ at 108 PKR, we will bring it down to 98 PKR in next few days. This is contrary to every law of economics that I have read.

---

2 Editors’ Note: The Punjab Assembly passed the Punjab Local Government (Amendment) Bill 2013 on 9 December 2013.
3 Editors’ Note: The Punjab government decided to establish DEAs in June 2013.
4 MNA: Member of National Assembly.
5 MPA: Member of Provincial Assembly.
throughout my life. I will officially declare my retirement if we could do this in next few weeks.

This country’s economic outlook for the second half of 2013-14 hinges on inflows from sale of 3-G licenses of about USD 1.2 billion; USD 0.8 billion from the privatisation proceeds particularly of PTCL\(^6\); and continuous coalition support fund (CSF) money of about USD 1.2 billion. But, yesterday, we heard something else. The World Bank and the Asian Development Bank may be signing new loans, but there is no cash disbursement. Government assistance is negative today. In the month of November 2013, we lost USD 1.2 billion of reserves, in another 2 months we may be finished.

Where is this complacency coming from? Unless we have signed a secret deal with some dear friends in the North, or in the West or in South West; barring this, I see no reason for complacency. As soon as the Government stops harassing exchange companies and lets the market really work, we could see meltdown of the exchange rate that we have already seen in 2008. The Planning Commission and its leadership need to ‘get its act together’ and break into finance meetings.

The last issue that I want to take up is the longstanding issue of raising the tax-to-GDP ratio which has remained sluggish at around 10-11% or so and even declined in recent years. Today, Pakistan has a lower tax-to-GDP ratio compared to other Asian countries. General Musharraf started the universal Self-assessment Scheme and people were asked to voluntarily file tax returns, but ironically, the scheme was not accompanied by a strengthening of the audit process.

Nowadays, instead of focusing our energies on raising productivity and efficiency, we have become masters in the art of making sexy power point presentations and convincing ministers to give concessions and they accept it. Take the recently announced Immunity/Amnesty Audit Scheme\(^7\) which runs counter to the taxation proposals announced in the 2013-14 budget and which reminds me of the time a former Finance Minister under Musharaff’s regime gave exemptions from taxation of capital gains on securities when the stock market was booming. As a result, in five years, we gave to speculators and stock brokers 500 billion PKR of tax benefits, and created a new class of capitalists in Pakistan.

If you want to raise the tax-to-GDP ratio, you have to do the following: withdraw all exemptions and concessions. Is the Government ready to do this? Some of the fat cats in the country enjoy these privileges. Pakistan is the only country in the world where its laws give Corp Commanders tax privileges, special privileges are given to Supreme

\(^6\) Pakistan Telecommunication Company Limited.

\(^7\) Editors’ Note: Under the proposed scheme, the Government will exempt those who don’t have National Tax Numbers from paying additional tax, penalty on late filing of tax returns and default surcharge on payment. For availing the facility, an individual doing business but not having an NTN can file tax returns for the past five years, with the maximum payment of 25,000 PKR per year as fixed rate.
Court judges, High Court judges, Presidents, Prime Ministers, Federal Ministers, and so on. What kind of law is this? If you want to look after them, give them a higher tax-free salary, but don’t show it in the law. The Law should show equal treatment.

I am now retired, but still deeply hurt, and I hope that our younger blood will save the country.

Reference
Section I

Shaping Momentum: Role of Religion, History, Literature and Language

1. Islamic Conception of Freedom of Belief: The Case of Apostasy – Eaisha Tareen
2. Revisiting Key Episodes of the Parliamentary Communist Movement in India: Contributions of Rajani Palme Dutt - Nathalène Reynolds
3. Rifles or Roses: Power of the Written Word - Ayesha Salman
4. Language Policy and Education in Pakistan - Tariq Rahman
Islamic Conception of Freedom of Belief: The Case of Apostasy
Eaisha Tareen**

Abstract
This chapter examines the conceptualisation of the rights of freedom of belief and freedom of religion in Islam. It analyses Qur’anic textual references to freedom of belief and religion in the light of the context in which they were revealed. Freedom of belief and religion implies the right to change one’s beliefs and/or religion. However, changing one’s religion or apostasy is viewed as an offence which merits capital punishment in most Islamic schools of legal thought. This chapter analyses scriptural evidence for this as well as early historical evidence and demonstrates how the latter points to the political context of the offence rather than its religious nature. Finally, the views of some reformist Muslim scholars will be considered who advocate a reconstructionist approach as the means by which Muslim jurisprudence can be revised in a manner as to be more relevant to the needs of contemporary society.

* This chapter has been approved as a Scholarly Article by the referee.
** Dr. Eaisha Tareen is an independent Clinical Psychologist in Colchester, England. She has a special interest in gender issues and Islam. She did her Masters in Islamic Studies from Birkbeck College, University of London, and has taught Islamic Studies at the undergraduate and postgraduate level. Her doctoral research was in the area of social support and depression in Pakistani women from the University of Essex, UK.
Introduction
Freedom of belief and freedom of religion are considered basic human rights enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights adopted by the United Nations in 1948. During the debate over the text, some Muslim delegates expressed reservations about the universality of the philosophical and political assumptions underlying the Declaration, viewing some of them as incompatible with Islamic Law. The Saudi Ambassador, for example, strongly objected to the right to change one’s religion. However, the Pakistani representative, Mohammad Zafrullah Khan, asserted that Islam not only recognises but advocates the concept of human rights, including the freedom of conscience and religion (Sajoo 1990).

Since then other declarations have been passed such as the Universal Islamic Declaration of Human Rights issued by the Islamic Council for Europe in 1981 and the Cairo Declaration of Human Rights in Islam adopted by the Organisation of the Islamic Conference in 1990. While the former is a non-governmental organisation whose statements are not binding, the latter comprises representatives of Muslim states and holds some political authority. However, these appear to amalgamate the language of human rights within the pre-existing framework of the Shari’a or Islamic Law (Bielefeldt 1995). For example, Article 2 of the Cairo Declaration which deals with the right to life includes a caveat stating that ‘it is prohibited to take away life except for a sharia’a prescribed reason’ (OIC 1990).

There has been much debate about the relationship between human rights and Islam, which is not only theoretically relevant to the universalisation of human rights but also particularly relevant to the practical realisation of human rights in the Muslim world (Baderin 2007). This is due to the significant role that Islam plays in the social, cultural, legal and political affairs of most Muslim countries, which in turn directly affects human rights issues, particularly in relation to the rights of women and religious minorities. Although it is beyond the scope of this paper to engage with this discourse, it must be emphasised that efforts for the promotion and protection of human rights in the Muslim world must take into account the influence of Islam.

It is in this context that this chapter will explore how the rights of freedom of belief and freedom of religion are conceptualised in Islam. Firstly, by defining the key terms in the title, then briefly looking at the concept of Shari’a, usually translated as Islamic Law, and its sources. Qur’anic textual references to freedom of belief and religion and the context in which they were revealed will be examined with particular focus on the issue of apostasy which is considered to be prohibited in traditional Islamic Law. This, of course, would be viewed as a violation of article 18 of the Universal Declaration, which confers the freedom of thought, conscience and religion, including the right to change one’s belief or religion.

Definition of Key Terms
Looking at the key terms in the title and considering the last one first, apostasy means leaving one’s religion or conversion to another religion. One who commits apostasy is
known as an apostate. It can also refer to abandoning a political party or cause (often in favour of an opposing cause). The Merriam Webster dictionary gives two definitions:

1. Renunciation of a religious faith
2. Abandonment of a previous loyalty

The significance of the different meanings will be considered later.

Freedom of belief can be defined as the right to choose and adhere to any idea; the right to think, believe, express, teach, promote and act on one’s beliefs so long as the rights of others are not obstructed and public peace and order is not disrupted. Similarly, freedom of religion refers to the right to choose any religion; the right to practice one’s faith, to express religious beliefs, to propagate one’s religion, to leave one’s religion and to critique one’s religion (Kadivar 2006).

The first term ‘Islamic’ is the most difficult to define as is the term from which it is derived – ‘Islam’. What constitutes Islam? Is it a religion, in terms of being a system of personal beliefs and practices? Is it a way of life, a way of being in society, with social, economic, political, legal implications? Which Islam are we talking about? Traditional Islam? Liberal Islam? The Taliban version of Islam? The Sufi version of Islam? There seems to be a bewildering plurality and diversity of understandings and interpretations. However, for the purpose of this chapter we will turn to the primary sources of Islamic knowledge, the Qur’an which is the revealed scripture and the Hadith which are the sayings and traditions of the Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him). It is these sources that are considered to be the bedrock of Islamic Shari’a.

The Concept of Shari’a

The term ‘Shari’a’ also means different things to different people. The original meaning of the word is ‘the path or the road leading to water’, i.e. a way to the very source of life. In its religious usage, from the earliest time, it meant ‘the highway of good life’, i.e. religious values, expressed in concrete terms to direct the lives of human beings (Rahman 2002). The concept of Shari’a from the beginning had a practical intent: it is The Way, ordained by God, by which human beings conduct their lives in order to realise the Divine Will. It includes spiritual, mental, physical, social and institutional aspects of conduct. But the question is how can the Shari’a be known?

In the earliest period after the Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him), two sources were recognised – the Qur’an and the Sunnah (tradition) of the Prophet. But as these could not suffice to meet the needs of a rapidly developing community, the principle of human intelligence and understanding was recognised – learning or ilm and understanding or fiqh. Independent reasoning or ijtihad became the foundation for understanding the Shari’a and is the central principle for adapting to change within Islam.

Other secondary sources emerged to develop understanding of the Shari’a, the two main ones being ijma and qiyas. Ijma, meaning consensus, originally referred to consensus of
the Muslim community but later came to mean ‘the consensus of the learned jurists’. *Qiyas* is a particular type of *ijtihad* based on analogical deduction. It involves drawing parallels from the Qur’an and Sunnah between two different situations. The legal judgements that were reached by analogy became part of Islamic Law if they acquired the ‘*ijma*’ of the jurists (Sardar 2006).

*Shari’a* is, therefore, the cumulative effort to understand Divine Will by using these sources and methods. The greater part of *Shari’a* is jurisprudence developed during the seventh to the tenth century in a specific historic context. Although *Shari’a* is derived from the Qur’an and Sunnah, it is not divine in origin. However, over time the opinions and rulings of jurists came to be viewed as sacrosanct and immutable and the *Shari’a* which was meant to be dynamic and progressive became frozen in history. Hence, when Muslim countries adopt the *Shari’a* they replicate the medieval context, with its patriarchal norms, tenth century criminal law, and division of the world between believers and non-believers (Sardar 2006). Although the contributions of these jurists and scholars to the development of Islamic legal thought is immeasurable, it must be taken into account that they were a product of their time and this is reflected in their rulings and their interpretations of the Qur’an and Sunnah. The challenge now for Muslim scholars is to interpret the Qur’an and Sunnah in such a way as to meet the needs of Muslims today living in a rapidly changing and diverse world.

**Freedom of Belief in the Qur’an**

There are a number of Qur’anic verses that support the concept of freedom of belief, including that of religion. The most frequently quoted one is:

> There is no compulsion in religion: true guidance has become distinct from error, so whoever rejects false gods and believes in God has grasped the firmest hand-hold, one that will never break. God is all hearing and all knowing (2:256).\(^1\)

The rejection of force and compulsion in this verse is tantamount to an endorsement of freedom to choose one’s religion. This requires freedom to enter into a religion and also freedom to leave it (Kadivar 2006).

This passage was revealed on the occasion when some of Prophet Muhammad’s Companions among the *Ansar* ( Helpers), who had recently converted to Islam, asked the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) for permission to compel their relatives, who still practised Christianity or Judaism, to accept Islam. At this point the verse was revealed and the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) told his Companions to give people the choice to decide which religion they wanted to follow (Kamali 1992). This clearly indicates that faith has to be voluntary and based on freedom and conviction.

---

\(^1\) Two translations of the Qur’an have been used in this chapter: M.A.S. Abdel Haleem (2004) and A. Yusuf Ali (1975).
Another verse reminds the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) that if God does not endorse the imposition of faith on people, he cannot do so either:

*Had your Lord willed, all the people on earth would have believed. So can you [Prophet] compel people to believe?* (10:99)

Another group of verses refer to freedom of belief in the context of freedom to find or lose one’s way:

*Say: Now the truth has come from your Lord: let those who wish to believe in it do so, and let those who wish to reject it do so.* (18:29)

*We have sent the Scripture down to you [Prophet] with the Truth for people. Whoever follows the guidance does so for his own benefit, whoever strays away from it does so at his own peril: you are not in charge of them.* (39:41).

Thus, although the Qur’an shows people the just path, human beings are free to choose or ignore it. There are many other verses in a similar vein which emphasise freedom and the importance of free will in choosing one’s religious beliefs (Kadivar 2006).

Other verses repeatedly state that the Prophet’s responsibility is only to convey and spread the message of justice, rather than impose it on people or force them to accept it:

*The Messenger’s duty is only to deliver the message: God knows what you reveal and what you conceal.* (5:99).

*Whether We let you [Prophet] see part of what We threaten them with, or cause you to die [before that], your duty is only to deliver the message: the Reckoning is Ours.* (13:40).

*We have not sent you to be their keeper: your only duty is to deliver the message.* (42:48).

*So [Prophet] warn them: your only task is to give warning, you are not there to control them.* (88:21-22).

Another related aspect of Qur’anic evidence is the recognition of the truth and essential unity of other revealed religions, belief in which is an integral part of Islam:

*Say: We believe in God and in what has been sent down to us and to Abraham, Ishmael, Isaac, Jacob and the Tribes. We believe in what has been given to Moses, Jesus and the prophets from their Lord. We do not make a distinction between any of the [prophets]. It is to Him that we devote ourselves.* (3:84).

Multiple similar references confirm that Islam accepts the right of people to retain the religion of their choice and practise it.
The strongest evidence regarding the Qur’anic conception of freedom of belief lies in the surah (chapter) called ‘The Disbelievers’, in which the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) is directed to say to the disbelievers:

Say: O Disbelievers. I do not worship what you worship, you do not worship what I worship, I will never worship what you worship, you will never worship what I worship. You have your religion and I have mine (109:1-6).

The word *deen* is translated as religion here, but other translators have used the word ‘way’, implying ‘way of life’ which is a more comprehensive meaning.

**Qur’anic References to Apostasy**

Several verses of the Qur’an refer to apostasy (*ridda* in Arabic) — the rejection of the Islamic faith after having accepted it:

If any of you revoke your faith and die as disbelievers, your deeds will come to nothing in this world and the Hereafter, and you will be inhabitants of the fire, there to remain (2:217).

How shall God guide those who reject faith after they accepted it and bore witness that the Apostle was true and that clear signs had come unto them? But God guides not a people unjust; Of such the reward is that on them (rests) the curse of God, of his angels, and of all mankind; In that will they dwell; nor will their penalty be lightened, nor respite be their (lot); Except for those that repent (even) after that, and make amends: for verily God is oft-forgiving, most merciful; But those who reject faith after they accepted it, and then go on adding to their defiance of faith, - never will their repentance be accepted; for they are those who have (of set purpose) gone astray (3:86-90).

There is no mention in the Qur’an of any penalty for apostasy in this world, neither the death penalty nor any other penalty. There is, however, the warning of punishment in the Hereafter. Even with the apostates there appear to be two categories: those who later repent can attain God’s forgiveness; and those who persist in their disbelief rather increase it by preventing others from believing and plotting against the believers. This group will not be forgiven. The following verses refer to the second category:

Those who turn on their heels after being shown guidance are duped and tempted by Satan; they say to those who hate what God has sent down, ‘We will obey you in some matters’ – God knows their secret schemes (47:26).

Those who disbelieve, bar others from God’s path, and oppose the Messenger when they have been shown guidance, do not harm God in any way. He will make their deeds go to waste.... God will not forgive those who disbelieve, bar others from God’s path and die as disbelievers (47:32, 34).
The strongest evidence against the death penalty for apostasy, in my view, lies in the following verse:

As for those who believe, then reject the faith, then believe again, then reject the faith again and increasingly disbelieve, God will not forgive them, nor will He guide them on any path (4:137).

If apostasy carried the death penalty, the apostate could hardly have had the opportunity for repeated belief and disbelief. Thus, even repeated apostasy does not merit capital punishment according to the Qur’an (Kamali 1992).

References to Apostasy in the Hadith Literature

The second major source of knowledge in Islam is the Sunnah, which refers to the example and conduct of the Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him). Hadith, literally meaning a story, narration or report, refers to a short narrative purporting to give information about what the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) said or did or what he approved or disapproved of. Each Hadith has two parts: the text (matn) and the chain of transmission (isnad) which gives the names of the narrators (Rahman 2002).

After the death of the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him), a need was felt to record his sayings and actions in a more formal manner for the benefit of later generations as there was a danger of verbal transmissions being lost or distorted over time. Identifying the authentic sayings of the Prophet (the Hadith) became a major challenge for the Muslims and an entire science evolved to collect, edit and compile authentic hadith. Although analysis of the methods of collection and the different categories of hadith is beyond the scope of this chapter, it is important to note here that they were classified on the basis of authenticity and had to meet certain criteria such as coherence, rationality and accordance with the teachings of the Qur’an (Sardar 2006). There have historically been differences of opinions about the hadith which continue to date.

In Islamic legal tradition, the punishment for apostasy being the death penalty is generally traced to a hadith of the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) which proclaims ‘Whoever changes his religion shall be killed.’ It must be noted here that this is a hadith termed as ahad (literally ‘solitary’). This means that it does not meet the conditions of mutawatir (literally ‘successive’) hadith, which is one that has been transmitted by so many narrators that it cannot be untrue. As the above is an ahad hadith, some scholars have found weaknesses in its transmission (e.g. Rahman 1978). Moreover, even within the discipline of hadith, ahad hadith are not considered binding in the same way as mutawatir hadith are.

According to Rahman (1978), the fact that neither the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) nor any of his Companions ever compelled anyone to embrace Islam or condemned anyone to death for mere renunciation of the religion also leads one to question this hadith. It is worth quoting Mahmud Shaltut, the late rector of Azhar University in Egypt, who after analysing evidence from the Qur’an concluded that apostasy carries no temporal punishment as the Qur’an only refers to punishment in the Hereafter. He goes on to say:
As for the death penalty for apostasy, the jurists have relied on the hadith reported by ibn Abbas in which the Prophet has said man baddala dinahu faqtuluh [Whoever changes his religion, kill him]. This Hadith has invoked various responses from the ulama, many of whom are in agreement to the effect that the hadud [prescribed] penalties cannot be established by the Ahad [solitary] hadith, and that unbelief by itself does not call for death punishment. The key factor which determines the application of this punishment is aggression and hostility against the believers and the prevention of a possible fitnah [oppression and lawlessness] against religion and state. This conclusion is sustained by the manifest meaning of many of the passages in the Qur’an which proscribe compulsion in religion (Shaltut 1959, cited in Kamali 1992, p. 72).

Historically, many prominent ulema (religious scholars) have also held the view that apostasy is not a punishable offence – Ibrahim al-Nakhai (died 95 AH/715 CE), Sufyan al-Thawri (died 162 AH/783 CE), the jurist al-Baji (died 494 AH/1100 CE). The renowned jurist Ibn Taimiyyah (died 728 AH/1328 CE) declared that apostasy was punishable only by the discretionary punishment of ta’zir (punishment at the discretion of a judge, usually for minor crimes).

Other scholars have also concurred with Mahmud Shaltut’s analysis that apostasy is punishable by death only if it is aggravated by treachery in a military context (Talbi 2006; Akhtar 1989; Al-Awa 1982). According to Al-Awa (1982), the death penalty mentioned in the hadith is not for apostasy per se but for high treason or hirabah:

 Hirabah occurs when apostasy is accompanied by hostility and rebellion against the community and its legitimate leadership (cited in Kamali 1992).

Talbi (2006) points out that this hadith is generally mixed with rebellion and highway robbery in the books on hadith. According to him:

The cited cases of ‘apostates’ killed during the Prophet’s life or shortly after his death are all without exception of persons who as consequence of their ‘apostasy’ turned their weapons against the Muslims, whose community at that time was still small and vulnerable. The penalty of death appears in these circumstances as an act of self-defense in a war situation. It is undoubtedly for that reason that the Hanafi school of fiqh does not condemn a woman apostate to death, ‘because women, contrary to men, are not fit for war’ (Talbi 2006, pp. 113-114).

---

2 English translation inserted by Editor/s.
3 Editors’ Note: AH refers to Anno Hegirae, Latin for ‘Year of the Hegira’ (or After Hijrah), while CE refers to Common Era or Christian Era.
Another *hadith* cited by Kamali (1992) that is often quoted in support of the death penalty states:

*The life of a Muslim may be taken in three cases only, in the case of an adulterer, one who has killed a human being and one who has abandoned the religion, while splitting himself off from the community (mufariq li al-jama'ah).*

This *hadith*, however, is explicit that to be given the death penalty the apostate must also be a *mufariq al-jama'ah* i.e. one who boycotts and challenges the community and its legitimate leadership (Al-Awa 1982, cited in Kamali 1992).

The military endeavours of the first caliph Abu Bakr (632-634 CE) are often cited as historical evidence supporting the death penalty. After the death of Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him), some tribes rebelled against Abu Bakr’s rule and refused to pay the *Zakat* (alms), which he quelled by force. Although the rebellion was political in nature, some traditional theologians likened it to apostasy on part of the tribes (Talbi 2006).

**Contradictions or Clarifications?**

The above analysis demonstrates that in the Qur’an, the primary Muslim scripture, there is no temporal punishment designated for renouncing or changing one’s faith, which is in line with the broader Qur’anic concept of freedom of belief. The repeated appeals to reason and understanding in the Qur’an strengthen the argument for faith to be based on conviction and commitment, both of which imply freedom of choice. The content of the *hadith*, the sayings of the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him), needs to be understood in their specific socio-historic-political context, as the ones prescribing the death penalty for apostasy on closer examination appear to be referring to treason rather than apostasy. Thus, what appears to be a contradiction between the Sources in terms of the concept of freedom of belief is not so on deeper investigation.

Discussion of issues such as apostasy is not just of theoretical significance, rather they have the potential to have far-reaching practical and legal implications in Muslim countries, particularly those that aspire to *Shari’a* law. Individuals may be prosecuted as heretics or blasphemers for political or theological dissent or may be arbitrarily declared to be apostates and executed (Mayer 1998). Despite the assertion of Talbi (2006, p. 113) that there has been ‘no implementation throughout the history of Islam of the law condemning the apostate to death — until the hanging of Mahmoud Taha in Sudan in 1985’, the case of apostasy needs to be clarified so that it cannot be used as a threat.

The necessity for this is reflected in the findings of a recent public opinion survey conducted by the Pew Research Centre based in the United States. This survey, published in April 2013, examined the social and political views of Muslims in different countries. It revealed that 64% of the Egyptians and Pakistanis surveyed supported the death

---

5 The death penalty for adultery is also a subject of much controversy as it has no mention in the Qur’an.
penalty for those who left Islam or converted to another religion. Interestingly, the vast majority of the same population (95% Pakistanis and 75% Egyptians) said that they supported religious freedom.

What seems to be a glaring contradiction needs to be understood in the context of the history of apostasy in Islam and its linkage with treachery and treason. Thus, while the majority of Muslims support freedom of choice in relation to matters of faith, which is regarded as a fundamental human right, when it comes to apostasy, its negative political connotations in Islamic history and the resultant rulings in traditional Islamic law are at the forefront of their consciousness.

The Way Forward

As noted in the introduction to this chapter, an overview of recent social, cultural, legal and political developments in Muslim countries reveals varying degrees of Islamic influence, in both private and public spheres, which impinge on human rights issues. This influence is formally reflected in the constitutions of some countries such as Pakistan which declare Islam to be the religion of the state and provide for the establishment of state courts that apply Islamic law. Herein lies the need to engage with Islamic law in relation to promotion and protection of human rights. The words of the human rights scholar, An-Naim, are even more significant in relation to Islam:

*The implementation of international human rights norms in any society requires thoughtful and well-informed engagement with religion (broadly defined) because of its strong influence on human belief systems and behaviour... religious considerations are too important for the majority of people for human rights scholars and advocates to continue to dismiss them simply as irrelevant, insignificant, or problematic* (An-Naim 2000, p.95).

However, the poor human rights record of governments in most Muslim countries encourages the notion that Islam is not compatible with human rights, particularly when governments try to justify their human rights violations by making allusions to Islamic Law or Islamic culture. An effective means of challenging such arguments would be to counter them with relevant evidence that Islam does not support human rights violations such as the death penalty for apostasy, to take one example. The current chapter demonstrates how the basic human right of freedom of belief, including freedom of religion is enshrined in the Qur’an.

In my opinion, the way forward lies with Islamic scholars who advocate reopening the doors of *ijtihad* (independent reasoning) and engaging with the primary sources of Islam, allowing for fresh interpretations which address the concerns of contemporary societies. Such scholars are in the process of developing an intellectual discourse that can be categorised as reformist or modernist. Their principal focus is on the Qur’an which is seen as a progressive and dynamic text, open to interpretation for all time. Understanding of the spirit of the Qur’an and the Prophetic tradition is needed rather than the letter of the text (Kamrava 2006).
God has revealed only broad principles and endowed man with the freedom to apply them in every age in a way suited to the spirit and conditions of that age. It is through the Ijtihad that people of every age try to implement and apply divine guidance to the problems of their time (Ahmad 1999, p.43).

According to reformist scholars the exercise of *ijtihad* even takes precedence over the literal dictates of the Qur’an which must be read in its historical context to be properly understood and implemented (Kamrava 2006). The example of Caliph Omar, the second Caliph of Islam and a very close Companion of the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him), is often given, who on more than one occasion overruled Qur’anic directives in order to meet the needs of the particular situation.

One of those who have contributed to the development of a methodology of interpretation of the ethico-legal texts in the Qur’an is Fazlur Rahman. According to him, despite the importance of method in interpretation, basic questions of method and hermeneutics were not adequately addressed by Muslims. He criticises traditional methods of interpretation as being too atomistic and piecemeal and not trying to understand the Qur’an in a holistic manner, i.e. against the background of the society in which it was revealed. His method is known as the ‘double-movement theory’. In the first movement, the socio-historical context of the Qur’an is considered in exploring specific verses to reach general principles such as justice and fairness. In the second movement, these principles are used as a foundation to develop laws and rules relevant to modern times (Saeed 2006; Rahman 1982).

Prior to Fazlur Rahman, another modernist thinker, Allama Muhammad Iqbal, advocated a reconstructionist approach which involved both a critique and adaptation of the present. He argued that ‘there is no such thing as finality in philosophical thinking’ (Iqbal 1960, Preface). Reconstruction for him meant a critical approach to the Muslim philosophical tradition and modern knowledge in order to open new frontiers of understanding (Moosa 2000).

*The teachings of the Qur’an that life is a process of progressive creation necessitates that each generation, guided but unhampered by the work of its predecessors should be permitted to solve its own problem* (Iqbal 1960, p.134).

This focus on the spirit of the Qur’an and continuous *ijtihad* has gathered momentum in the last few decades. Within the reformist discourse another major theme is that of democratic pluralism, which is viewed as a salient feature of the spirit of the Qur’an as well as the *Shar’ia* and *Hadith*. However, a project of ‘deconstruction’ is needed whereby the layers of historical *Shar’ia* are removed to reveal the true spirit of Islam (Kamrava 2006).

*The challenge for Muslims today, as ever, is to tap the tradition of Koranic pluralism to develop a culture of restoration, of just intrareligious and interreligious relationships in a world of cultural and religious diversity. Without restoring the principle of co-existence, Muslims will not be able to*
It is the Islamic conception of freedom of belief that inspires just intra-religious and inter-religious relationships. Public awareness of this conception needs to be increased in order to promote freedom of belief and challenge religious discrimination in Pakistan.
References


Shaltut, M. 1959, Al-Islam Aqida wa Shari’a, Dar al-Qalam, Kuwait.


Revisiting Key Episodes of the Parliamentary Communist Movement in India: Contributions of Rajani Palme Dutt

Nathalène Reynolds

Abstract

In the second edition of his work India Today (1947), Rajani Palme Dutt wrote:

On a world scale the subjection of India has been the largest and most important basis of empire domination of the modern world. For centuries the wealth and resources of this vast territory, and the life and labour of its people, have been the object of Western capitalist penetration, aggression and expansion, and finally of absolute domination and intensive exploitation. The ending of this system will not only open up a new future for one-fifth of the human race. It will also mean a decisive change in the balance of world relations, a further weakening in the world system of imperialism, and a strengthening of the advance of freedom of the people throughout the world (Dutt 2007, p.1).

On the eve of the departure of the British coloniser, this Marxist theoretician, an eminent member of the Communist Party of Great Britain, announced the start of a new era, with the sub-continent searching for political, economic and social dignity. Considering the 2015 deadline for the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), is the time ripe to make an assessment? And do we dare envisage a Marxist - or at least Marxian - analysis to shine a light on the past?

Of course, the Indian sub-continent is today divided into three states and the progress made since this time is far from negligible. But might we not agree with Rajani Palme Dutt in stating that, still today, ‘two facts stand out: one is the wealth... the natural wealth, the abundant resources, the potential prosperity of the entire existing population...; the other is the poverty..., the poverty of the overwhelming majority of the people...’ (Ibid. p. 21)? He added – writing of the sub-continent as a whole – that: ‘Between these two, lies the problem of the existing social and political order in India.’

This chapter conducts an analysis of R.P. Dutt and his work India Today as well as other documents available through the P.C. Joshi Archives of Jawaharlal Nehru University – works that have today fallen into neglect outside of Communist or Marxist circles. Looking back at the key episodes in the history of the Indian Communist movement, we will examine with Dutt its engagement in the political life of the Indian Union, and its contribution to the construction of a ‘social’ India. Finally, we will look at the construction of an Indian Union in which prosperity – bragged about by so many today despite the crisis – might be brought to benefit a maximum number of men, women children: a true fulfilment of the MDGs.

* This chapter has been approved as a Research Paper by the referee. It was written before the 2014 General Elections in India.

** Dr. Nathalène Reynolds has a doctorate in the History of International Relations from the University of Panthéon-Sorbonne, Paris, France. Currently, she is a Research Fellow at the Institut Français de Recherche sur l’Afrique (French Institute of Research on Africa), Nairobi, Kenya, a Visiting Fellow at the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Pakistan and a member of the Peace-Keeping Operations Network of the University of Laval in Montreal.
Introduction

‘The biggest democracy in the world’
What is rightly or wrongly called the ‘biggest democracy in the world’ is holding its elections in 2014. The sixteenth General Election will choose new members of the lower house (the Lok Sabha, or People’s Chamber) of the parliament of the Indian Union, the current members of which will end their mandate on 31 May 2014. Opinion polls suggest that the Indian National Congress (INC) will come out of the elections weakened, while the Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP, Indian People’s Party) will have another opportunity to preside over the country’s destiny. In this event, it would be the Chief Minister of Gujarat, Narendra Modi\(^1\), who would become the Prime Minister. In any case, one will see a new slanging match between the two parties that despite their public denunciations of one another, both support the slogan of ‘shining India’\(^2\). An inevitable consequence of globalisation? Corruption has reached levels unprecedented in the history of this young state, particularly during the most recent two Congress-led administrations. Those guilty scarcely feel obliged to even make a show of contrition.

At the twelfth General Elections in 2004, the Congress Party managed to take advantage of the ‘Shining India’ campaign of the BJP-led National Democratic Alliance, drawing attention to the miserable lot of the majority of the population. If one excludes a brief interlude of thirteen days in 1996, the Bharatiya Janata Party has ruled for only one mandate of five years (March 1998–May 1998). The Indian National Congress (INC) – the leading component of the United Progressive Alliance (UPA-I that became UPA-II after the withdrawal of the Left Front\(^3\)) – won the support of the electorate in 2004 and in

---

\(^1\) In 2002, Gujarat, already led by Modi, was the scene of terrible communalist attacks (in fact, anti-Muslim pogroms) that the state authorities appear to have supported. Modi, however, escaped justice and has of late posed as an ardent defender of harmony between religious communities.

\(^2\) This slogan was coined on the eve of the announcement of early General Elections in 2004 by the BJP, principal member of the National Democratic Alliance (NDA) governing coalition. However, it resonated only with that minority of the population whose living conditions afforded it the luxury of identifying with the goal of ‘shining India’ which implied, amongst other things, the construction or even assertion of Indian power. The majority of Indians, even if attached to the idea of a nation that would soon be in a position to occupy the rank it ‘merited’, felt the phrase was premature.

\(^3\) Following the agreement on use of nuclear power for civilian purposes reached by India and the United States, the Left Front withdrew, in July 2008, its support from the UPA government that it had been supporting ‘from outside’. The Front was too weak to influence the country’s future and it declined to associate itself too closely with the ‘bourgeois’ decisions of the government that went, in its view, against the interests of the majority. One of the key battle cries of the Left Front remains the struggle against all forms of ‘imperialism’, of which, for the Front, the United States is the archetypal representative. Imperialism may be defined as the policy of a state that aims to reduce others to political or economic dependency on it. I choose to place the word in inverted commas in order to show that I am using communist terminology. I will do the same each time I borrow a Marxist term in order to maintain the impartial approach that researchers should strive for.
Revisiting Key Episodes of the Parliamentary Communist Movement in India: Contributions of Rajani Palme Dutt

The Left Front, made up of the Communist Party of India (Marxist) (CPI-M, often abbreviated to CPM), the Communist Party of India (CPI), the All India Forward Bloc (AIFB) and the Revolutionary Socialist Party (RSP), rang the alarm bell in vain, especially since the fall of the Soviet Union (USSR), accelerated liberalisation of the world economy that began at the start of the 1990s, socialist, Marxist or communist ideologies seem, to have gone out of fashion. Does civil society, employing them as conceptual tools, aim to inspire a generous humanist movement that many political leaders, often concerned more with the fragile internal balance of their party and protecting their personal interests, have abstained from supporting? Whatever the case, movements such as those led by Anna Hazare and parties like the Aam Aadmi Party (AAP, Party of the Common Man) of Arvind Kejriwal can mobilise at the very least sections of the middle class. Similarly, regional parties or those representing underprivileged castes have managed, particularly since the beginning of the 1990s, to attract support from voters disillusioned by the record of national parties. If one looks at the World Bank statistics, 32.7% of India’s population of 1.24 billion is living below the international poverty line placed at $1.25 per day (World Bank 2010a). 68.7% live on less than $2 a day (World Bank 2010b).

The CPI will lose its status as a national party if the slide in its support cannot be stemmed in the next general elections. The CPI(M) tries to defend such a status despite

---

4 The Left Front, whose level of support had been continually eroding, had managed something of a revival in the 2004 elections, winning 59 seats of the 545 in the Lok Sabha, made up of 43 for the CPI(M), 10 for the CPI, and 3 each for the AIFB and the RSP. Five years later, it had only 24 MPs [Members of Parliament], 16 from the CPI(M), 4 from the CPI and 2 each for the AIFB and the RSP.

5 Until 11 April 1964, there was a single Indian communist party that represented a significant opposition force. On this date, the left wing of the party split away, deciding to form a separate party, a little later choosing the name Communist Party of India (Marxist). This first split was followed by a second when the leadership of the CPM decided, in 1967, to expel its members from the left wing of the party. The latter grouping was itself far from united, and only a part of its forces was to form, on 1 May 1969, the Communist Party of India (Marxist-Leninist), the CPI (M-L).

6 There is no space here to describe in detail the elements making up the Communist Party of India (Marxist-Leninist), so I will limit myself to noting that it is divided into two factions: the first is currently in favour of a legal struggle, but takes care to avoid any association with those parts of the Left Movement it considers too legalist; the second, often referred to by the generic term ‘Naxalite’, considers that only an armed struggle can change the unjust economic and thus social structure of the country.

7 The AAP was founded on 26 November 2012, arising out of differences between Hazare and Kejriwal. The former wanted the movement he had launched – India Against Corruption – to remain apolitical, while the latter believed it was necessary to compete in the elections.

8 According to the criteria laid out by the Election Commission, ‘6B. Conditions for recognition as a National Party – A Political party shall be eligible to be recognised as National Party, if, and only if, any of the following conditions is fulfilled: (i) The candidates set up by the party, in any four or more States, at the last general election to the House of the People, or to the Legislative Assembly of the State concerned, have secured not less than six percent of the total valid votes polled in each of those states at that general election; and, in addition, it has returned at least four members to the
its elected representation being limited to states including Tripura, Kerala and West Bengal. It continues to govern the former, but lost power in the two other states in the 2011 elections. Its importance cannot be entirely neglected, since there are only four other political parties with ambitions on a national scale. The CPI and CPI(M), split over parliamentary politics, have doubtless had to compromise in accepting the parliamentary way. They rightly argue that the Indian Constitution guarantees property rights, thus de facto outlawing any genuine redistribution of wealth. However, they currently face tough competition from the Naxalite movement that oppose – as could be seen in West Bengal under communist rule – a system that, notwithstanding an egalitarian discourse – has maintained the poor in a state of subjection. The Naxalite message attracts all the more support from the worst off since India, in pursuit of power, has allowed big industrial concerns to appropriate arable land. These projects, often based in the special economic zones, the creation of which the state has encouraged, leave peasants with no other choice than to join the growing urban lumpenproletariat in the slums. Another aim of Indian capitalism has been to exploit natural resources, many of which are located in tribal areas which the state had earlier sought to protect and many of whose inhabitants are today threatened with expulsion.

The reputation of the Congress today stands tarnished; the attachment of the BJP to secularism, the foundational theory of modern India, is less than convincing; a centrist group is the Bahujan Samaj Party (BSP, the Majority Social Party, representing the interests of the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Castes (OBCs)); and lastly the Nationalist Congress Party (NCP).

**Methodology**

Looking back at the struggle for Indian independence, popular imagination has long focused on figures such as Mahatma Gandhi and Jawaharlal Nehru (who held the post of Prime Minister from 15 August 1947 until his death on 27 May 1964). The original Communist Party of India (CPI) was condemned for two reasons: 1. the party tried to ‘transplant’ a foreign, totalitarian ideology onto the Indian body politic; 2. the party was unable to fully accept the rules of democracy. One may wonder about the marginal character of today’s Indian communist movement. However, it must be acknowledged that after a brief revolutionary period (1948-51), the party has participated in the

---

9 Lumpenproletariat is a German term first used by Marx and Engels in the mid-nineteenth century to describe, in their terms, that part of the working-class unlikely to achieve class consciousness. More recently, it has come to signify the section of population unable to integrate into the formal economy, generally poor, with few prospects.

10 Note that Congress has 206 seats in the Lok Sabha, the BJP 116, the BSP 21 and the NCP 9.
republican legal (and essentially Congressist\textsuperscript{11}) system. Its analysis is all the more interesting in that a minority of the privileged in India, joining the cheerleaders of globalisation, seems to have forgotten the mission that the country gave itself after the start of the struggle against British colonial power. Worse still, it appears that the elite, of which parties like Congress and the BJP are, in spite of their discourse, the representatives, has great difficulty to admit that they are part of a country, the majority of which is poor.

My work will not be based on Kriegel’s 1964 work about French Communism and the French Workers’ Movement since the French historian tackles the issue of the ‘transplant’ of an ideology that the Soviet Union, through the Comintern and then the Cominform\textsuperscript{12}, tried to spread around the world. It is rather in the brilliant analysis of politics, society and the economy of India set against a global backdrop that I would like to revive interest in Rajani Palme Dutt\textsuperscript{13} (19 June 1896-20 December 1974), a British Communist leader, whose work retains relevance today. The government of British India deemed it a threat, since the work India Today – a first version was published in 1940 and a second in 1947 – was officially banned in India.

I will also make use of the analysis by eminent members of the Indian communist movement. My doctoral thesis was titled The Political Strategy of the Indian Communist Movement (1936-1964). The Impact of Foreign Influences. I was affiliated for four years with the School of Political Science of Jawaharlal Nehru University (JNU), studying the Joshi and Adhikari archives. The latter are composed mainly of personal papers left by Puran Chand Joshi (14 April 1907-9 November 1980) and Gangadhar Adhikari (15 December 1898-21 November 1981), Indian communists who remained members of the original CPI after the split. The former, who was Secretary General of the CPI from 1935 to 1947, donated, with the agreement of his party, his papers to the Archives on Contemporary History of JNU, while those of the latter, in his day the party’s leading ideologist, are preserved at the headquarters of the CPI in New Delhi.\textsuperscript{14}

\textsuperscript{11} Use of the expression ‘Congressist republican legality’ is appropriate, in my view. In effect, the Congress party, artisan of India’s independence, took initiative in passing the Constitution on 26 January 1950, and enjoyed a near-monopoly of power until the 11\textsuperscript{th} Lok Sabha in 1996.

\textsuperscript{12} The Comintern, founded by Lenin in 1921, was to be an international assembly of workers. Any communist party that wished to be affiliated had to fulfil 21 conditions, notably to show an unfailing loyalty to the Soviet Union. The Cominform was created at the end of September 1947 during a meeting in Poland of communist parties and workers from the Soviet Union, Hungary, Bulgaria, Poland, Rumania, Czechoslovakia, Yugoslavia, Italy and France. The objective of this ‘information office’ was to coordinate the efforts of the communist parties.

\textsuperscript{13} Dutt was born in England to an Indian father, Upendra Krishna Dutt, who was a surgeon. His mother, Anna Palme Dutt, was Swedish. Upendra Dutt came from a prestigious Calcutta family, the Rambagan Dutt. His uncle, Romesh Chandra Dutt, is considered a leading Indian economist of the nineteenth century (Dutt 2007) Such, at least, is what is indicated in the biographical note published by People’s Publishing House, the organ of the Communist Party of India.

\textsuperscript{14} These documents were untitled, and the libraries which inherited them have tended to classify them on the basis of the themes of the different documents found in each file – hence the difficulty on occasion to include a reference without using three to five lines of text to do so.
The Argument Made

I will adopt a four-fold approach in this chapter. Firstly, I will look at the issue of the Indian nation, as the sub-continent saw the birth of the Indian National Congress. This party, not sticking to the loyalist position on which the British government had been counting, embraced nationalism, albeit initially a timid one. In the second section, we will look at the awakening of an egalitarian ideology in British India. It will also be an opportunity to examine the origins of the Communist Party of India, using two divergent readings made by two different communist currents of thought: the first underscores the commitment to internationalism of any communist movement; the second gives in to the demands of nationalism. In a third part, we will look at a dispute that still today illustrates the difficulty in apprehending the role of the Indian national bourgeoisie. Then we will, with Dutt’s help, sketch the situation in India on the eve of the departure of the British coloniser. Finally we will reflect upon a communist movement trapped in participation in a parliamentary system. The space available obliges me to limit myself to the legal communist movement, omitting analysis of the Naxalite movement15, active in India since the end of the 1960s.

Finally, I will, through recommendations, look at – employing a phrase that was in vogue until recently – ‘Rising India’. Anxious to assume the role of world power that it believes it merits, India forgets that the resources invested in the arms race or in sending satellites into orbit could permit its villages and shanty towns to be rid of the distress of a bygone age. We will envision the construction of a ‘social India’ that the Indian communist movement defends. The latter also considers that prosperity – bragged about by so many today despite the crisis – should benefit a maximum number of men, women and children: a true fulfilment of the MDGs.

Birth of a National Movement under the British Raj

The Issue of the Indian Nation

The new world order, characterised by the ‘global war on terrorism’ that was declared by the United States in the aftermath of the dramatic attacks of 11 September 2001, has almost led us to forget that the international scene was divided – for many years – into Western16 and Soviet blocs.17 What was then more frequently referred to as ‘the West’ was for a long time concerned that the new nations born following decolonisation would succumb to communist ideology. No doubt the ‘October Revolution’ (the term

15 The term ‘naxalite’ is derived from a Maoist movement that had its origins at the end of the 1960s in the village of Naxalbari (West Bengal).
16 It is perhaps worth noting that the term ‘the West’ – with a capital ‘W’ – refers to a geopolitical reality born of the alliance, after the start of the Cold War, between North American and West European states that opposed the influence that the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics was seeking to exercise.
17 After the former had created the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation in April 1949, the latter responded in May 1955 by establishing a military organisation generally referred to as the Warsaw Pact.
‘revolution’ itself having come to be questioned\(^\text{18}\) had inspired people subjected to colonial rule, as it demonstrated the possibility of overthrowing supposedly divine and seemingly unshakeable power.

\[\text{It was on this wave of idealism that communism came to India. Here it mingled with another stream – nationalism – sometimes supporting it, sometimes opposing it. India was then waking from a long slumber into a new consciousness of its pride and dignity (Masani 1954, p. 19).}\]

The author of these few lines, Minocher Rustom Masani, well-known for his anti-communist positions, was one of the key figures of Indian socialism. One interesting aspect of his work is that he consciously suppressed his feelings to attempt an impartial analysis, emphasising how the ‘October Revolution’ seemed to attest to the existence of a doctrine that could liberate from foreign domination and the damaging consequences of capitalism. The new leaders in the Kremlin denounced all forms of imperialism – especially tsarist imperialism – and declared their will to come to the material aid of all the oppressed population of the world. In this way, the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics might constitute a country of adoption, all the more so, given its stated position of challenging the concept of national belonging, preaching rather the existence of a single working class.

Like Congress, the CPI had no intention of presuming that the matter of an Indian nation was a settled issue – even if the British colonisers had long done so. Dutt, who was in a sense the mentor of the Indian communist movement\(^\text{19}\), wrote:

\[\text{Is there a people of India? Can the diversified assembly of race and religions, with the barriers and divisions of caste, of language and other differences, and with the widely varying range of social and cultural levels, inhabiting the vast sub-continental expanse of India, be considered a “nation” or ever become a “nation”? Is not this a false transposition of Western conceptions to entirely different conditions? Is not the only unity in India the unity imposed by British rule? (Dutt 2007, pp. 283-284).}\]

In fact, the approach to the national question evolved over time. Initially,

\[\text{The older school of imperialists dismissed with contempt any conception of an Indian nation as an illusion (Dutt 2007, p. 284).}\]

During the twentieth century, ‘the liberal imperialist school’ (Dutt 2007, p. 284), challenged by the dynamics of the national movement, argued that the British government could congratulate itself for this outcome, of which it had been the architect. Even as Congress militated against such a reading of history, insisting that India had

\(^{18}\) Convinced communists still term the coup d’état of 25 October 1917 (in the Julian calendar, corresponding to 27 November in the Gregorian calendar) the ‘October Revolution’.

\(^{19}\) I will return to this point in the third part of this chapter.
existed since time immemorial, the CPI conformed to the Marxist analysis that Dutt had relayed through his *India Today*. Additionally, the author added that neither France nor Great Britain of the pre-capitalist era could pretend to be described as a nation. The trade-unionist Bhalchandra Trimbak Ranadive, Secretary General of the CPI from 1948 to 1950, added that the feeling of belonging to a nation was born in the struggle against foreign domination (Ranadive 1996).

**A New Elite**

Underlining that the Indian elite was a British creation, the Communist Party of India recalled the introduction, by Her Majesty’s Government, of English-language education. This development gave rise to generations of administrators (Kapur 1988, p. 316). In parallel, encouraged by a retired senior civil servant, Allan Octavian Hume, the colonisers had instigated birth of the Indian National Congress. The Viceroy, Lord Dufferin, aimed to ‘build up through the Congress a basis of support for the Government, by separating the “loyalist” elements from the “extremists”’ (Dutt 2007, p. 316).

The CPI believed that the episode of 1885 bore witness to the beginnings of a passive revolution promoting a progressive reform of the system that would enable it to survive. Similarly, British ‘imperialism’ had instilled a non-violent orientation in the nationalist movement (Dutt 2007, p. 517). Nonetheless it could not claim to be ‘the foster-parent’ of Indian Nationalism, since ‘from its early years, even if at first in very limited and cautious forms, the national character began to overshadow the loyalist character’ (Dutt 2007, p. 309). Her Majesty’s Government, thus, quickly came to look on Congress ‘as a centre of “sedition”, carried forward by the developing mass movement of national struggle’ (Dutt 2007, p. 310).

Rajani Palme Dutt specified that the progressive elements of the bourgeoisie and enlightened intellectuals who presided over the first steps of the surge of nationalism believed that:

> ...the main enemy was... the backwardness of the people, the lack of modern development of the country, the strength of the forces of obscurantism and ignorance and the administrative shortcomings of the “bureaucratic” system responsible for the situation (Dutt 2007, pp. 321-322).

They also expected – in vain – British support for the struggle they envisaged. The British communist leader was nonetheless quick to point out that the first Congress supporters were not ‘reactionaries’ in thrall to a foreign power, but revolutionaries in circumstances of the time.

---

20 A group of eminent leftist historians, composed of Bipan Chandra, Sucheta Mahajan, Aditya Mukherjee, Mridula Mukherjee and K.N. Panikkar, reacted against what they considered the myth of the creation of Congress. They argued that the foundation of the party constituted ‘an objective necessity’, a challenge to which all Indian nationalists responded (Chandra 1989, pp. 73-4).
Dutt, incidentally, emphasised the significant impact of the ‘October Revolution’ on the development of Congress, and thus on the vision of an Indian nation that the INC intended to construct, once the colonial power had been chased away. From its inception, it displayed an ambivalent attitude: it sought to launch a true national struggle, but was fearful that the supporters it would mobilise might question the privileges of the dominant classes (Dutt 2007, p. 318). Such was also the position of the industrial and financial bourgeoisie, whose very existence was threatened by British ‘imperialist’ interests (Chandra 1989, p. 378), but which was equally afraid of any revolutionary move that civil disobedience might provoke. Conscious of the need to promote the growth of an internal market, these first capitalist entrepreneurs were not opposed to a certain division of wealth (Chandra 1989, p. 376). And in the middle of the 1940s, men such as Purshottamdas Thakurdas, J.D.R. Tata, G.D. Birla, Ardeshir Dalal, Kasturbhai Lalbhai, A.D. Shroff and John Mathai elaborated a ‘Bombay Plan’ that promoted the idea of massive agrarian reform and the creation of cooperatives.

**India’s Awakening to an Egalitarian Ideology**

**Eloquent Denunciations**

Too early to be alarmed by the possible repercussions of Marxist ideology on India, the British Intelligence Service worked on investigations allowing the Viceroy’s government to organise, when it was deemed useful, spectacular trials\(^2\), the objective of which was to demonstrate the existence of a communist conspiracy to undermine the security of the state. Moreover, the government adopted the General Communist Notification (GCN) in 1922. This text, amended in 1927 and 1932, outlawed the entry into India of any book or pamphlet calling for revolution, or that could promote the development of a movement inspired by class struggle (Archives on Contemporary History: 1942/24 Home Poll, file N°41/6/42(I) Cancellation of the General Communist Notification prohibiting the bringing into India of documents issued by the Communist International or its allied organisations and its substitution by a notification (N°3 of 1943) under Sec. 19 of the Sea Customs Act, laying the criterion of objectionable literature to be the contents rather than the source of such literature. 2. Cancellation of certain notifications Under the Sea Customs Act prohibiting the import into India of certain Communist publications).\(^2\)

Marxist-Leninist works were nonetheless clandestinely brought to India. In April 1921, the trade-unionist Shripad Amrit Dange (10 October 1899-22 May 1991), in *Gandhi vs. Lenin* (1974), tried for the first time to popularise the ideas of Marx and Lenin in India.

\(^2\) Peshawar Conspiracy Trial 1922-23, Kanpur Conspiracy Trial 1924, Meerut Conspiracy Trial 1929-33. Note that the Indian National Congress Working Committee formed a Central Defence Committee, with members of the Congress who were lawyers acting as defence counsel for the accused.

\(^2\) Consulting the personal papers of Puran Chand Joshi, the historian can see that, throughout his career, this leader was able to have access to and make copies of numerous Intelligence Service reports. Such documents allow us to trace in great detail the first steps of the Indian communist movement.
‘Comrades’ translated reference works into Indian vernacular languages. By 1934, the Communist Party Manifesto had been translated into Telegu, the language of what would become Andhra Pradesh.

Meanwhile, Communist denunciations of the system in place were not lacking in eloquence, as is illustrated by the Manifesto of the Anti-Imperialist Conference, organised secretly in India in October 1934. The arguments developed in this document remained in use by the communist movement in India for a long time. G. Adhikari, apparently the author of the text, opened in the following way:

*The Indian people is groaning under the yoke and exploitation of British imperialism. Relying upon their political and economic supremacy and squeezing millions of rupees year after year the blood-thirsty imperialists have brought toiling masses of the people to the state of famine, helpless poverty and intolerable slavery. British imperialism retarded the economic development of the country in every way, supporting and relying upon all that is backward and reactionary in town and country* (Roy 1976, p. 8).

The Manifesto adds that Mohandas Gandhi’s non-violence, far from undermining the existing order, had the effect of sustaining it by preaching in favour of the submission of the people. It argued that:

*The policy of Gandhism on which the programme of Congress is founded uses the cloak of vague phrases about love, meekness, modesty and hard-working existence, lightening the burden of the peasantry, etc. but under this cloak it preached and preaches, defended and defends the interests of the Indian capitalists, the inevitability and the wisdom of the division of society of rich and poor- eternal inequality and exploitation* (Ibid. pp. 15-16).

The Communist Party was, thus, of the view that Congress positioned itself as the defender of popular demands as it was worried about the possible spread of revolutionary ideas on Indian territory. Its position on non-violence betrayed its counter-revolutionary role, since Gandhism attempted to prevent any armed national insurrection of the working masses (Ibid. pp. 16, 18). The communist evaluation, if it underlined quite rightly the Congress’ desire to ‘channel’ popular enthusiasm, was partly wrong. Non-violence, philosophical and religious principle to which Mahatma Gandhi was attached, constituted both an ideology and a strategy.

The Congress leadership, not denying the inequalities that marked society, remained persuaded that the particular course of struggle in which it was engaged would allow it to promote a gradual reform of the economic and social system. Furthermore, it judged that any violent action would allow the British to respond in kind, and to dismantle the fragile nationalist network. Above all, the INC did not subscribe to the dangerous idea of a single international workers’ party that a small group, at the instigation of a foreign power, sought to extend to a context in which it was not appropriate. The CPI, meanwhile, was convinced that it would succeed in a ‘creative’ implementation of
Marxism. Karl Marx had famously excluded the possibility of a successful revolution in under-developed countries where the proletariat was still only embryonic in form. In addition, the CPI, whose leading members – like their Congress counterparts – were members of the upper castes, took little trouble to examine the resilience of this system in its political, economic, social and religious dimensions.

**A Double Birth**

With capitalism today still triumphant, it is useful to make what may at a first glance appear to be a digression, but will allow the reader to gain an insight into the Indian communist movement’s difficult quest for identity. It is simple to argue that its opponents, worried by an ideology that called on the populace to dare to cast off the shackles of the past, were very happy to attack this Achilles’ heel. One must similarly point out that the Soviet Union took advantage of communist parties, which were doubtless naive, to promote its international stature. However, the tactic employed by the CPI contravened the rules of political fair play that the Congress, which saw itself as a broad church, was seeking to put into practice. The Congress Socialist Party (CSP), still in its infancy, paid a heavy price for the desire for quick domination on which the CPI was counting. An initiative, originated with a group led by the socialist Jayaprakash Narayan, took up a directive from Moscow that called for the creation of an ‘anti-imperialist people’s front’ within the Congress. It was in this way that the communist movement, by loading the newly created groups with its own placemen, seized control of the CSP units. The division became final in March 1940. However, the communists, in addition to their individual membership of the Congress of which the Congress Socialist Party was part, could now claim significant additional strength, since their movement, until then limited to urban areas, had gained access to the countryside.23

One of the disputes that long drew the attention of an Indian political class eager to embarrass the communist movement was the birth of the CPI. Did this take place in Tashkent, then capital of the Turkestan Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic, today, Uzbekistan? Or in Kanpur, in the heart of northern India, today in Uttar Pradesh? Such a question, it is true, arose late in the day, when the People’s Republic of China, suddenly declaring itself the heir to the Manchu Empire, demanded changes in its border with

---

23 The communists would be excluded from Congress in the aftermath of World War II. The Congress leadership, imprisoned after the adoption of the resolution on the Quit India Movement (8 August 1942) that called for the departure of the British, would take this decision immediately upon their release. Having qualified, on instructions from Moscow, the war as ‘imperialist’, and refusing, like Congress, to support the United Kingdom’s war effort, the CPI, not without reluctance, gave in to a fresh Soviet directive that qualified the conflict as a ‘people’s war’; this followed the attack on Soviet territory by Hitler’s forces (22 June 1941). Leaders aware of global affairs like Nehru had been very reluctant to join the Quit India Movement. The exclusion of the communists from the Congress movement was essentially aimed, on the eve of independence, at undermining a competitor with a rival ideology.
India, which the latter, defending the colonial legacy, refused. A brief conflict ended in October 1962 with a humiliating defeat for India.

The border dispute concealed another difference that was doubtless of greater importance at the time. The revelations made at the Twentieth Congress of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union (CPSU) held in February 1956 denounced the crimes of the Stalin era (1929-53). In parallel, Moscow was trying to promote the theory of ‘peaceful transition to socialism’ of which India, it believed, was an excellent illustration. It continued to call on the CPI to support Congress policies or at least its progressive elements. Prime Minister Nehru, in a sense, had been rewarded for the non-aligned orientation he had adopted after independence and to which the USSR as well as China had finally warmed up to. Beijing, however, did not share Moscow’s new analysis. Indeed, the Chinese Communist Party (CCP), equally concerned to assert itself, at least within Asia, tried to show that the People’s Republic, unlike the USSR, was a country of socialism that had not emptied Marxism-Leninism of its content in order to benefit nationalist and selfish considerations.

In any case, it was in such circumstances that the dispute regarding the date of the party’s foundation arose. Half a dozen Indian Marxist-Leninist revolutionaries in exile had founded the Communist Party of India on 17 October 1920 in Tashkent. Manabendra Nath Roy (21 March 1887-25 January 1954), whose real name was Narendra Bhattacharya, was the leading figure. His background gives an interesting insight in the career path taken by a number of Indian intellectuals. Bengali and Brahman (the highest status in the Hindu caste system), he was for a while a terrorist before turning to Marxism, the enemy ideology of the ‘imperialist’ camp that was subjugating India. Attracting Moscow’s interest, India was becoming a laboratory which the Comintern used to try out its policies (Gupta 1980, p. 1).

On 19 August 1959, the Central Committee of the then still undivided CPI announced that the Kanpur Conference had resulted in the foundation of an Indian communist

---

24 Sino-Indian relations had, it is true, deteriorated after the flight of the Dalai Lama, who found refuge in India on 31 March 1959. Beijing sought to crush a revolt that had broken out in Tibet. New Delhi granted political asylum to the Dalai Lama. This could be deemed as contravening the Panch Shila (Five Principles) agreed by the two states on 29 April 1954, notably the principle of strict neutrality and non-interference in the internal affairs of the other. As for the border dispute between India and China, it was exacerbated by the Khinzemane incident (in Ladakh in the western part of the Mac-Mahon border) of 7 August 1959.

25 It is not a question of underestimating the importance of this episode that reflected the desire of China to project itself across the region, and the belief that its own efforts to strengthen itself since the communist takeover in 1949 were well advanced. Besides, an appeal to a sense of wounded nationalism is always a good method of distracting the population’s attention away from sensitive internal matters.

26 With the international stage already dominated by the logic of two antagonistic blocs (one Western and the other led by the Soviet Union), India was a precursor of a third way: a policy of non-alignment.
movement (Adhikari 1982, p. vi). It emphasised the – legal – impossibility of creating an Indian communist party outside of the sub-continent, arguing that half a dozen expatriate revolutionaries could not speak for a whole people. The Central Committee was perhaps seeking to downplay the Tashkent episode and the role played by M.N. Roy. In so doing, it was in line with official Soviet history that more or less considered Roy a traitor; he had been expelled from the Comintern in December 1929.

In any case, the Communist Party of India was long to remain concerned about gaining national respectability. As Indian communist leaders continued to consider it necessary to present the public with an official history of their movement, without managing to do so, Adhikari began to prepare several volumes of CPI documents for publication. He also wrote the introductions, in October 1971 taking the opportunity to remind readers that the Indian revolutionary movement of the 1920s had been divided into four distinct factions (Adhikari 1982, p. 1). Roy belonged to the first of the three groups of revolutionaries operating from outside the country. There was also, within India, a fourth faction, many of whose members had abandoned Gandhism after the failure of the campaign of civil disobedience in 1920-21. This group opted to support scientific, socialist, Soviet achievements having demonstrated the value of such an approach. Adhikari, emphasising that he was not trying to negate the work of Roy, nonetheless followed the official party position that the life of the Tashkent CP had been but brief. When some of its members returned to India, they were jailed at the Peshawar Conspiracy Trial (Oral History Interview with Shri S.V. Ghate, 9 July 1970, pp. 30-31).

---

27 The Kanpur conference aimed to unite communist groups, notably those of Calcutta, Bombay and Madras. The CPI was a clandestine party from 1934 till 1942, years in which it chose, ‘encouraged’ by the Communist Party of the Soviet Union, to support the British war effort.

28 Joseph Stalin, who had every intention of determining not only the course of communism in the Soviet Union but around the world, probably suspected that Roy might steal the limelight from him. The Indian communist had distinguished himself during the First Congress (19 July-7 August 1920) of the Third Comintern, opposing Lenin on the question of the role of the national bourgeoisie in colonised countries. He asserted his belief that Asian revolution would have a determining role on the fate of communism.

29 The CPI’s strict adhesion to Moscow’s line brought about its downfall. When Prime Minister Indira Gandhi declared the state of emergency (1975-77), the CPI continued to support her. The CPM was opposed, thus demonstrating the independent line it had adopted since its foundation. To this date, observers underline that the electorate did not forgive the CPI for this ideological and strategic error. One should also recall that the 1964 split happened along regional lines; the majority of communists from the Bengali and Keralite bastions joined the CPM.

30 The second faction included revolutionaries of the Pan-Islamic Khilafat Movement and of the Hijrat Movement, while the third was militants of the Ghadar Party. The Khilafat (Caliphate) movement (1919-1924), with a pan-Islamic outlook, sought to defend, at the end of the First World War, the Ottoman Empire that the victorious powers were preparing to dissect. The Hijrat [migration] movement, after the Treaty of Sevres (concluded on 10 August 1920), demanded the restoration of this empire. As for the Ghadar Party, it saw itself, as indicated by the Urdu term ghadar – meaning revolt or rebellion, as a revolutionary group. It had been founded in 1913 by Punjabis who had emigrated to North America.
From its very foundation, the CPM advocated defining policies adapted to Indian society. Not fearing accusations of being an agent of a foreign power, it paid homage to Roy who had taken the initiative to create groups under Shripad Amrit Dange in Bombay, Muzaffar Ahmed in Calcutta, Malappuram Singaravelu Chettiar in Madras, Ghulam Hussain in Lahore and Shaukat Usmani in the United Provinces (Haithcox 1971, pp. 31-32). The Marxist party continues, incidentally, to underline that a communist group existed well before 1925, since it circulated, during the Congress Party annual meeting in 1921, a resolution calling for a struggle for the independence of the sub-continent. The CPI also refers to this event with pride, declaring that communists were the first to make such a demand.

Is the relevance of such a proposal lost in today’s world? Or is the parliamentary communist movement wrong to repeatedly claim that in seeking to ally with the United States and integrate into the global economy, the country has given away if not its precious independence then at least the margin for manoeuvre that for long allowed it to determine (or at least influence) its destiny? Has Rising India forgotten that a development model based on semi-autarchy adopted after independence in 1947 allowed it to develop its agriculture and industry, sheltering them from brutal competition? The CPI long emphasised the existence of a ‘collaborationist’ bourgeoisie, before abandoning such references after the Indo-Soviet rapprochement. Perhaps it is worth revisiting this concept.

Rajani Palme Dutt, Mentor of the Indian Communist Movement

A Significant Dispute

Rajani Palme Dutt for long could not obtain authorisation to travel to India. As special envoy of the newspaper of the CPGB, *The Daily Worker*, he finally visited the country between 31 March and 31 July 1946. He had, however, long followed the political, economic and social situation in the sub-continent very closely. In accord with the directive of the Fifth Congress of the Comintern that called for the building of close relations between the communist parties of ‘imperialist’ and colonised countries, the CPGB had in effect established the Colonial Committee in 1925. During a meeting organised by the Colonial Bureau of the Comintern in Amsterdam in July, Rajani Palme Dutt had asserted the willingness of his party to take on the leadership of the Indian communist movement (Chowdhuri 1976, p. 73), of which he thus became the mentor, enjoying unequalled authority. He, nonetheless, had to push aside M.N. Roy, whose analyses attracted the interest of Indian revolutionaries.

Before looking in more detail at Rajani Palme Dutt’s analysis on the eve of the departure of the colonisers, it seems useful to first look at a dispute in the middle of the 1920s that brought him in opposition to M.N. Roy. The former was the author of *Modern India,*
while the latter had published *The Future of Indian Politics*. Such a digression appears relevant at a time when the Indian elite, of which at least a part is thoroughly enamoured of globalisation, is asking itself whether capitalism with a human face is possible.

In 1926, the founder of the Tashkent CPI emphasised the opposition between the ‘national bourgeoisie’ and the ‘revolutionary masses’: the bourgeoisie sought to make common cause with ‘imperialism’ in order to save the subcontinent from possible revolution. Roy called for the exclusion of the upper classes from the independence struggle, and denied that the middle classes could play any revolutionary role, given that their concern to improve their material condition meant they would inevitably compromise. The future of India, thus, rested on the shoulders of the workers, the peasants and the petit bourgeoisie, which were opposed to ‘imperialism’. As a consequence, Roy argued for the creation of a ‘people’s party’, big enough to welcome all revolutionary forces, but not limited to being a party of the proletariat.

Dutt did not contest Roy’s analysis. He was of a mind to agree to a union of workers of different social origins, but he invited leftist, nationalist elements to fight within existing movements. At the start of 1927, however, he came round to Roy’s position, and qualified the Indian bourgeoisie as a ‘counter-revolutionary force’, accusing it of having formed a pact with the ‘imperialists’ to prevent any revolution. He concluded that only a popular movement based on a ‘united front’ of workers and peasants would lead to the regeneration of Indian political life.

*Rajani Palme Dutt and An Evaluation of British ‘Imperialist’ Governance in India*

On the eve of the departure of the British coloniser, this Marxist theoretician announced the start of a new era, with the subcontinent searching for political, economic and social dignity. He did not, however, look kindly on the powers that be. As soon as he arrived in the subcontinent, the British communist leader took the opportunity to criticise the results of British governance. Workers’ wages were very low, and children worked all day long for two or three pence (Dutt 1946a, p. 183). Lodgings in the big cities were

31 Unfortunately, we have been unable to have access to these two short works; this section draws on the summary of them made by S.R. Chowdhuri (1976, pp. 74-78).

32 Was Dutt looking for a pretext to seize leadership of the Indian communist movement? Whatever the case, he did not come round to Roy’s position until after his envoys to the subcontinent had been successful in their mission. More than a year after the failed trip of Percy E. Glading, George Allison travelled to India on 30 April 1926, to be followed on 30 December by Philip Spratt. At the beginning of 1927, the Comintern sent Roy on a mission to China. The British CP could in this way easily realise its plan, pushing even members of the CPI to contest the authority of the Indian leader. Roy tried to react, but Fazal Elai, whom he sent to India was arrested on 5 April without having been able to achieve his goal. In the meantime, Benjamin F. Bradley, a member of the CPGB, joined Spratt; together they undertook to organise the CPI. In December 1930, Roy tried to return to India. Since 1924, he had been the subject of an arrest warrant for conspiracy to threaten the British rule. He was jailed in July 1931, then condemned to twelve years imprisonment, of which he served just over five years.
overcrowded: small rooms without light or ventilation housed up to thirty persons. In cities like Bombay and Calcutta, the situation was disastrous (Dutt 1946b, p. 7). The living conditions of peasants were worse still: they were trapped between the demands of land-owners, tax-collectors and money-lenders (Dutt 1946a, p. 183). The war had aggravated this economic disarray: inflation had risen, also hitting the middle classes (Dutt 1946a, p. 184). The volume of money in circulation had increased seven-fold (Dutt 1946b, pp. 3-4).

The British leader denounced the fantastic enrichment of the few and the impoverishment of the many. The rich, whether they were Indian or English, were totally indifferent to poverty and famine. The calorie intake needed for a healthy life was judged to be 1600-1800 in Austria and Germany, but in India it was officially estimated at 960-1000 (Ibid. p. 8). The black market and corruption had become omnipresent. Everything had a price, whether it was votes, candidacies or seats in the assemblies.

According to Dutt, the war had had a catalysing effect on the aspirations of the colonies, notably on the Indian people, who made up three-quarters of the population of the Empire and seven-eighths of its colonial inhabitants (Dutt 1946a, p. 185). It had destroyed the myth of Great Britain’s invincibility; liberation movements were mushrooming all over the empire. The political, economic and social situation of India pushed the populace to revolt. The revolt of the Royal Indian Navy was an illustration of this; it also revealed the alliance between, on the one hand, Congress and the Muslim League, and, ‘imperialism’ on the other. Acting in collusion, they sought to avoid any growth of a mass movement that threatened to sweep away the existing social structure. Dutt also drew attention to the desire of the colonial power to keep India in the Commonwealth, in order to prevent it attaining genuine independence (Dutt 1946a, p. 198).

In Freedom for India, published in July 1946 (Dutt 1946a), he argued, like the CPI, that big capital was influencing the Congress more and more. He accused Indian industrialists of having concluded a year earlier a secret pact with their British and American

---

33 This mutiny erupted on 18 February 1946 in a training centre in Bombay. The following day, Attlee announced the dispatch of a mission composed of three members of his Cabinet which would allow the establishment of a representative government in India. On the morning of 19 February, there was a genuine insurrection in which more than 20,000 sailors – garrisoned in Bombay and its surroundings or serving on one of the twenty ships anchored in the port – took part. The flags of Congress and the Muslim League replaced the Union Jack. Demonstrations took place across the entire city, rallying behind the flags of these two parties, as well as red flags. Troops were immediately placed on high alert in Bombay, as well as in Karachi and Madras where similar troubles were brewing. On the 21st morning, the battle began. Congress and the League refused to support the insurgents. The trade unions of Bombay and the CPI, however, declared a general strike that began on 22 February. The battle raged in Bombay on 22nd and 23rd, massive and brutal repressive measures were taken, killing more than 250 people. Congress and the Muslim League put pressure on the Strike Central Committee, which resigned itself to putting an end to the movement, although it did declare that: ‘We will give in to India, but not to England.’ Gandhi, meanwhile, condemned the ‘unholy alliance of Hindus and Muslims’ that, had it triumphed, would have delivered India “to the rabble” (Bettelheim 1962, pp. 17-19).
counterparts (Dutt 1946b, p. 5). Rumour suggested that 25-30% of the shares of all joint enterprises were in British hands and it was the latter who would decide which products would be manufactured in India and which in the United Kingdom. The finished products would be sold as ‘made in India’.

**The Legal Communist Movement trapped in the ‘Parliamentary Path’**

Dutt did not question the patriotism of Congress leaders. On the contrary, he portrayed them as symbols of progressive nationalism (Overstreet and Windmiller 1960, pp. 91-92). It is a matter, in considering the evolution of the Indian political scene from the death of Jawaharlal Nehru – and especially from the destruction of the Babri Mosque – onwards of a period of which one must retain a memory, since the BJP endeavours to promote a re-writing of the history of its period. Such a current of thought believes that Sardar Vallabhbhai Patel (31 October 1875-15 December 1950) would have been better placed to lead India. It recalls that Mahatma Gandhi – unfortunately – asked Patel to step back and allow Nehru the post. The democratic Indian Union that today is a regional and even global player is nonetheless the heir to this period. Nehru, from a Westernised well-to-do family, was able to help India assume international rank quickly, at a time when the international scene was divided into two dominating blocs, one Soviet and the other Western. Similarly, his belief, at least partial, in the Fabian socialism that he had encountered during his foreign trips brought him to implement an economic and social model that, despite its limits, promoted the rise of a country that had been the scene of great colonial exploitation. Such reminders are doubtless necessary since those born into the internet generation tend to forget quickly the isolation in which many parts of the world lived until recently.

Patel, the ‘Iron Man’, was able to stem all the revolutionary efforts made by an ill-prepared communist movement between 1948 and 1951. Three paths were attempted: the first was Yugoslav-inspired (the ‘intertwined revolution’, that is to say a ‘people’s democratic front’ uniting workers, peasants, petit bourgeois elements and progressive intellectuals); a Soviet-style proletarian path; and finally, a Chinese path, that emphasised the peasantry as the leading force in the country. I lack the space here to deal with this period in detail, but suffice to say that repressive measures were severe. During its history, independent India never hesitated to employ methods that, frequently violated human rights, aimed to crush any movement that it labelled a threat to ‘national security’.

---

34 On 6 December 1992, *kar sevaks* [volunteers from the Hindu nationalist movement] destroyed the Babri mosque of Ayodhya (Uttar Pradesh). Defending the position of the Hindu nationalist movement, they demanded the ‘re-construction’ of the temple that, according to them, had existed on the site of the mosque in the very place where Lord Ram had been born. Note that the expression ‘Hindu nationalism’ tends to give a positive spin to a radical ideology equally intolerant as extreme currents of political Islam; adherents of the latter, however, are usually referred to as fundamentalists.

35 This current, incidentally, fails to take into consideration Patel’s death, which occurred shortly after independence. Nehru’s long life allowed him to realise his plans for the state.

36 There is a paradox here: the Chief Minister of Gujarat, Narendra Modi, who now claims to be a disciple of secularism, yet at the same time promotes an image of Sardar Patel as a communalist.
and ‘territorial integrity’. Telengana, at the time a region in the princely state of Hyderabad (Deccan), had seen a communist-led revolutionary movement (1946-1951) which was brutally put down.

Nehru, committed to the principle of parliamentary democracy, wanted the CPI, like any other group, to be represented in parliament. In this way, he promoted a democratic path of which the legal communist movement is to this day an ardent defender. Nehru’s course of action was not motivated solely by idealistic considerations; the Prime Minister hoped that communist discourse would erode when confronted with the realities of government. Moreover, the communists of Kerala and West Bengal who were in government, often declared that it was impossible for them to go ahead with major reform, since the ‘bourgeois’ system protected property rights. They denounced the democratic nicety that long sought to limit them to the role of official opposition even though their level of representation was small. In 1957, Kerala saw the first democratically elected communist government in the world. It was ejected following a protest movement instigated by the Kerala Congress section, which thus sought to regain power. On 31 July 1959, the central government employed Article 356 of the Constitution. Better known as ‘President’s Rule’, this article requires New Delhi, in the event of troubles threatening public order, to dismiss the elected government of a state and take temporary charge of the management of day-to-day affairs.

The non-aligned foreign policy that India pursued was an obstacle to the Indian communist movement’s ambition to dominate. The latter had to manage a tricky contradiction: praise Nehru for his foreign policy, while attacking his domestic measures. Indeed, it found itself forced to retract positions that were important to its respectability within India. Initially, the party had celebrated independence on 15 August 1947. During its Second Congress (28 February - 6 March 1948), it aligned itself with the Soviet analysis – which apparently matched a pre-existing position of one of its currents: Indian independence was artificial, since the whole of the bourgeoisie stood for ‘imperialism’. In 1956, encouraged by the Soviet Union, it reverted to recognising independence.

In 1964, the Indian communist movement split. It was riven by personal rivalries between individuals seeking to succeed to the post of Secretary General. Ajoy Kumar Ghosh (20 February 1909-13 January 1962) had held this post from 1951 until his death. The Sino-Soviet ideological conflict that followed the Twentieth Congress of the CPSU and the Indo-Chinese border dispute had destabilised the fragile consensus that Ghosh had managed to maintain. Such issues revealed what might be termed as ‘growing pains’: part of the Communist Party of India considered itself capable of defining policy without the ‘help’ of the ‘fraternal’ Soviet and Chinese parties.

The CPM, however, stuck to a ‘parliamentary path’ that its founding members contested. The thirty-four years of a communist-dominated Left Front was to vindicate this decision. The error of Marxist communists, however, was to overstay their time in power, believing that any period out of power would represent a time in the ‘wilderness’.
Incidentally, the All India Trinamool Congress\footnote{Note that this party’s support is essentially limited to West Bengal.} (literally meaning All India Grassroots Congress) that has governed West Bengal since its electoral victory in May 2011 has made use of methods similar to those employed by the CPM in order to remain in power (patronage politics and clientelism). Were one to be cynical, one might say that the Bengali Marxist party has resolved its quest for identity. Nonetheless, its voters expected it to live up, at least partially, to the generous ideology and the rigour that it preached. Above all, after its striking 2006 election victory, it tried to implement economic reforms that the Left Front, worried about upsetting its essentially rural vote bank, had long neglected. The government of West Bengal attempted, at the initiative of the Chief Minister Buddhadeb Bhattacharjee, to set up Special Economic Zones, attracting industrialists interested primarily in acquiring fertile land, while promising to promote the rebirth of the Bengali industrial sector. The population was not fooled by the ‘social engagement’ of these businessmen, and rightly feared themselves ending up as an urban lumpenproletariat stuck in a shanty town.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

**Conclusion**

During its Twentieth Congress (4-9 April 2012), the Communist Party of India (Marxist) adopted a *Resolution on Some Ideological Issues*, of which it is useful to reproduce certain extracts here, since they give insight into the role of the bourgeoisie. The opening words were as follows:

> The current global crisis of capitalism, more intense in many of its manifestations than the great depression of the 1930s, has once again resoundingly demonstrated capitalism’s inherent oppressive and exploitative character. This crisis is imposing greater miseries on the vast majority of the world’s population (*Resolution on Some Ideological Issues, Adopted at the 20\textsuperscript{th} Congress of CPI(M) at Kozhikode, Kerala, 4-9 April 2012, p. 1)*.

‘Imperialism’s quest for global hegemony’, if one is to believe the CPM, prevents the emancipation and progress to which humankind aspires. ‘Large segments of the big bourgeoisie in developing countries’ have chosen the path of collaboration, forgetting the role that this social class played during independence (Ibid. p. 6). Following the departure of the colonisers from India, the ‘domestic bourgeoisie’,

> While allying itself, as in India, with domestic landlordism... had sought to pursue a path of capitalist development with a degree of autonomy, pursuing non-alignment in foreign policy which enabled it to use the Soviet Union to bargain with imperialism. But the inherent internal contradictions of such regimes, combined with the collapse of the Soviet Union and the emergence of international finance capital seeking to

Note that this party’s support is essentially limited to West Bengal.
The Marxist Party regretted the abandonment by the ‘domestic ruling classes of developing countries’ of the ‘position of relative autonomy’ that they had occupied: they caved in to the neo-liberal model.

Today’s ‘emerging economies’ are in difficulty, and yesterday’s slogan has fallen out of fashion. The Indian Union flattered itself to be described as ‘rising’ or ‘shining’. Moreover, India is now in election mode; no one is keen to remind the voters that the will to national power is pursued at the expense of the majority. It is scarcely fashionable to speak of imperialism, and the vocabulary employed by Indian communists is outdated or even tainted by a past when communism was associated with dictatorship. Even so, India’s various communist movements still congratulate themselves for not having given in to global pressure, exchanging communist terminology for that drawn from the more acceptable social-democracy.

In the aftermath of the collapse of the Soviet bloc, the Indian communist movement for a while lost its sense of direction. Its opponents, taking advantage of a temporary vulnerability, underlined that an ideology which claimed to free people had submitted them to a servitude perhaps unequalled in the history of humankind. The Indian communist movement, at least in its public discourse, never renounced the myth of a socialist motherland devoted to the universal cause of the workers. Nevertheless, the end of the Soviet bloc freed the legal communist movement from the burden of a ‘big brother’ whose foreign policy undermined its position at the national level, to borrow an expression from the French historian Hélène Carrère d’Encausse (1983).

If one must blame the Indian communist movement for its unceasing loyalty to the seductive ‘well-oiled’ Soviet discourse, its analysis, still today, should not be neglected, not least since it brings a critical view of a globalisation which never stops proclaiming that economic growth (and thus, in a sense, the destruction of the environment) will miraculously solve the problem of poverty. This is a half-truth which the well-to-do, eager to avoid any responsibility for the society of which they are part, believe all too often.

The task of the historian is, in a sense, a privileged one, since he/she can freely go back to archival sources, unlike the majority of people who are limited to unceasing flow of press articles or search engines that provide instant information and access to rapid, but simplistic knowledge. With the exception of the statistics given, the picture of pre-independent India painted by Rajani Palme Dutt remains, alas, all too relevant to the India of today. The country, of which a tiny fraction now belong to the economic decision-makers of the world, seems – partially, at least – to have fallen back into the grasp of the Western powers who are trying however they can to preserve their dominance.
Recommendations
Taking into account the Millennium Development Goals Report 2013 that makes provisional evaluation of the situation of the world in the run-up to the MDGs deadline at the end of 2015\textsuperscript{38}, but also considering World Bank figures or those compiled by the 2011 Indian census, it is perhaps timely to remind the Indian elite of a national responsibility which wealth and the gloss of globalisation appear to have obliterated. This elite, more often than not, seems happy to leave the initiative to a few measures taken by the central or state government or by one of the increasing number of NGOs. A national introspection, independent of political point-scoring, is required.

It is perhaps necessary to simply dare declare that a tiny part of the population\textsuperscript{39} should not become accustomed to live beside such significant poverty, hoping that growth, according to a disputable ideological position, will gradually reduce it. In particular, one should question the soundness of the special economic zones that allow rich investors to seize arable lands, forcing the displacement of the population. In such circumstances, the increase in the level of urbanisation cannot be synonymous with development (annual rate of increase in India: 2.4\% (CIA 2014)).\textsuperscript{40} This is illustrated, for example, by the pavements of Kolkata on which such rural exiles, from West Bengal but also further afield such as Bihar, set up their ‘homes’, living in conditions perhaps worse than in the countryside.

The Congress-led central government has, it is true, taken the initiative in recognising low rural incomes. On 5 September 2005, Parliament adopted the National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (NREGA), emphasising its desire to enhance the ‘livelihood security of the households in rural areas of the country by providing at least one hundred days of guaranteed wage employment in every financial year to every household whose adult members volunteer to do’ (The Gazette of India 2005, p. 1). Similarly, the UPA-II administration enacted the National Food Security Bill (better known as the ‘Right to Food Act’) on 10 September 2013. In its preamble, the act stipulates that it aims ‘to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity.’ The law targets fully two-thirds of the population; 75\% of the rural population and 50\% of the urban population. This is the proof that ‘Shining India’ or ‘Rising India’ has realised, at least in part, the necessity of no longer manipulating poverty statistics.

At least partial access to subsidised food is a central element to any improvement in living conditions, particularly for vulnerable sections of the population, pregnant or

\textsuperscript{38} This report offers regional evaluations, thus avoiding injuring national pride.
\textsuperscript{39} Estimates of the size of the Indian middle-class diverge; some are as low as 5\% of the population (50 million people), while others put the figure at 30\% or 300 million.
\textsuperscript{40} According to the same source, India remains in large majority rural (31.3\% of the population lived in urban areas in 2011).
breast-feeding women and young children. It will allow in conjunction with the necessary accompanying policies to address other problems highlighted by the MDGs, notably reducing maternal and infant mortality (which overtime may reduce birth rate), increasing literacy rate, and enabling the conditions for genuine promotion of gender equality.
References


Dutt, R.P. 2007, India Today (Reprint), People’s Publishing House, New Delhi, India.


Dutt, R. P. 1946b, Four Months in India, Archives on Contemporary History: 1946/1.


Rifles or Roses: Power of the Written Word*
Ayesha Salman**

Abstract
An innocent mind needs to be nurtured and nourished. No one is born corrupt and no child is born with a moral perspective that teaches violence and cruelty to others. Yet in Pakistan and indeed many other countries across the world, the streets are soiled with the blood of millions where killing is indiscriminate, as is the enslavement of others, spreading a cancer that is gnawing at our foundations. The annihilation of the other, the weaker, the vulnerable, is what feeds a sense of power and becomes an all-encompassing obsession which leads to a will to rule and subjugate. Among other tools, scripture is frequently used to justify heinous crimes in the name of justice, faith, honour, pride and a multitude of reasons that to many are sacrosanct and unquestionable.

The chapter is divided into two parts. First I talk of the importance of literary education in shaping the way future generations will react to and perceive people from other faiths across the globe. I discuss the way in which literature and philosophy have helped inform us and how we can use that knowledge to influence our thought process. In the second half, I highlight the limitations that exist within the Pakistani public school and madrassa (religious school) education system and give recommendations on what we can do to improve the system. We can only alleviate poverty and progress if we educate our children in the right way and if we teach them to treat all human beings with dignity and respect.

---

* This chapter has been approved as an Essay by the referee.
** Ms Ayesha Salman is a novelist. She works as a Freelance Development Consultant and lives in the UK.
Introduction

*It is the mark of an educated mind to be able to entertain a thought without accepting it* (Aristotle).

In the aftermath of the 9/11 attacks, there was widespread persecution of Muslims all over the world. We now live in a new world that has been created out of the ashes of the old, where terrorism is a word used as a weapon to discriminate, a licence to torture and inflict genocide on nations. This quote from a speech by the former President of the United States, George W. Bush (who after 9/11 talked about the threat of terrorism and how to combat it), is a clear reflection of that. After a detailed description of the attack on Iraq and the kind of prisoners held in Guantanamo bay, he said:

*Like the struggles of the last century, today’s war on terror is a struggle for liberty and freedom. We are fighting for our way of life and our ability to live in freedom...for the cause of humanity against those who seek to impose the darkness of terror and tyranny upon the entire world and we are fighting for a peaceful future for our children and grandchildren. God bless you all* (Information Clearing House 2002).

This, as thousands were being tortured and killed, in the name of freedom. He uses words like ‘liberty’ and ‘humanity’ to justify mass murder. The irony in this speech is plainly evident as are the many contradictions.

And yet sadly in Pakistan, Muslims are killing Muslims and we continue to persecute and kill people from minority groups. The list of assassinations and murders are unending and the breakdown of the justice system is evident from the fact that no one has been reprimanded for these crimes and there are no laws to protect the rights of minorities. Muhammad Ali Jinnah said in his first Presidential Address to the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan:

*You are free; you are free to go to your temples, you are free to go to your mosques or to any other place or worship in this State of Pakistan. You may belong to any religion or caste or creed -- that has nothing to do with the business of the State.*

Jinnah’s dream would remain unrealised. Today, as yesterday, religious conflict prevails in Pakistan and as mentioned earlier indeed in many parts of the world. Freedom fighters and pacifists such as Nelson Mandela embraced all religions in his quest for peace and repeatedly emphasised the good that comes out of faith. Talking about the time he spent in jail Mandela said:

*.... it was religious institutions, Hindus, Moslems, leaders of the Jewish faith, Christians, it was them who gave us the hope that one day we would come out. We would return. And in prisons, the religious institutions raised funds for our children who were arrested in thousands and thrown into jail.*
Writers such as Ghalib talked about how the purity of faith is more important than an outward display of it, how enlightenment comes from within and not from an object of faith. Faith was seen as important in itself (Sison 2013).

But how can we emancipate the mind, allow our children to question authority and think for themselves? How do we take what we have learnt from Jinnah, from Ghalib and from all the other great thinkers and use that to influence our young and protect them from hatred being instilled in their minds at a young and impressionable age?

**Life Lessons from Philosophy and Literature**

Many philosophers, poets, writers, and playwrights have enlightened us for centuries with their fresh and informative perspectives on life. Their work is relevant to all societies because the issues they talk about are universal in nature and relate to the way in which we interact with each other. Justice, faith, peace, kindness: these and many others are all intrinsic to the essence of our existence and our relationships. In an attempt to shed light on the significance of these missing aspects of an education that relies largely on a heavy dependence on the accumulation of wealth and power, I refer to some of the most respected philosophers and writers in history who have influenced millions and whose work we need to take a deeper look at as the foundations upon which education was originally built.

One such writer, philosopher and mathematician was *Omar Khayyam* who lived from 1048 to 1131. Amongst his most famous works was the *Rubayyat of Omar Khayyam* which consist of between 200 and 600 quatrains.1 In them, he reflects upon mortality, existence and the fleeting nature of our time on earth. He likens human beings to tiny specks of floating dust in a huge cosmic expanse, where there is no escape from an inevitable demise. Paradoxically, it is the knowledge of how finite our existence is that inspires us to celebrate life. The recognition of our own feeble and transient existence is the key to our happiness. The soul must soar in order for us to recognise that we are mere mortals that must live and then die and that is what will enable us to truly understand the joys of life. We are only at that point finally released from the confinements of the judgements that we place upon ourselves and on others.

Khayyam has influenced generations all over the world with his writings. His poetry takes the reader on a journey where there is no ‘sense’ of difference between human beings. He creates an image of a world where we are placed together in a space that has only one purpose and that is to live without prejudice, hate or distinction of any kind. He talks of joy, peace and in fact turns away from dogma and rigid instruction of any kind. His poetry teaches a wisdom that encourages and promotes peace and unity. He has shown that we must question our own rules and learn to live within the boundaries of that which has been given to us. To celebrate life and creativity which is the essence of living. He depicts this thought in all his quatrains including the following:

---

1 Editors’ Note: A quatrain is a type of stanza, or a complete poem, consisting of four lines.
But yours the cold heart, and the murderous tongue,  
The wintry soul that hates to hear a song,  
The close-shut fist, the mean and measuring eye,  
And all the little poisoned ways of wrong....

Myself when young did eagerly frequent  
Doctor and Saint, and heard great Argument  
About it and about: but evermore  
Came out of the same Door as I went (Khayyam 1952 transl. by Edward Fitzgerald).

Khayyam’s vision is of a world where people live in harmony and where there is no end to self-discovery.

Similarly, amongst the most influential and renowned philosophers who laid the foundations for education, was the Athenian philosopher **Socrates** (470/469 BC – 399 BC) who also unlocked the key to infinite possibilities within the human psyche. Although Socrates treats the subject matter in an entirely different manner, many of his concerns are similar to Khayyam’s and he is largely preoccupied with the suspension of judgment through a process of questioning oneself. For him, an education system that is based purely on instruction will lead to a narrow worldview which limits the student and takes away his/her ability to think in more lateral and innovative ways. It also leads to dictatorial practices and the suppression of the mind. Socrates challenges that method of teaching through a particular method known as the ‘Socratic Method’. Much of his dialogue is reflected in Plato’s *Socratic Dialogues*. In the ‘Socratic Method’ of teaching, the method of questioning is rhetorical. Socrates asks his student a question and the student answers from within the perspective of his own worldview. Socrates would then ask him another question that springs from the student’s original answer. That then would lead on to another question and so on and so forth. Such discourse ultimately leads to the student realising that the certainty with which he answered the original question no longer existed and that the set of beliefs that he initially thought were true were no longer true. The student challenges his own mind and so the inward journey for truth begins with the last question. It is not until the last question is asked that he fully understands that he cannot be certain about his beliefs because the premise on which he started his argument no longer exists. For example, in a dialogue between Socrates and Atreus’ on beauty, Atreus begins by saying that a thing of beauty is one which is physically attractive. Socrates answers by asking him if beauty is only what pleases the eye and if that is true how we could call music beautiful, after all he says, you cannot see music. Atreus changes his definition of beauty to include sound, even character, justice and as more aspects of beauty are included the questions increase and so do the problems with his new more vast definitions of beauty.

---

2 Editors’ Note: In Greek mythology, Atreus is the eldest son of Pelops and Hippodamia and becomes the king of Mycenae. The House of Atreus is ‘virtually unrivalled in antiquity for complexity and corruption.’
Talking to Euthyphro on piety and impiety, Socrates asks if the gods are in disagreement about what piety and impiety are, how we can be sure about which actions are impious and which pious. Socrates ultimately deduces that if some gods believe that some acts are pious and other gods believe the same acts are impious, one cannot have a definition of impious and pious acts so there is no way to truly ‘know’ what constitutes impiety and piety. Socrates defied the entire ethos of an education system that rested on a stringent and instructive method of education. The above dialogues on piety are particularly relevant to our current discussion because they show how what might be a pious act to one, may be impious to another and so we cannot judge based on our own beliefs. We must consider the worldview of those that we live with and we must accept our differences with impunity. In many ways what happened to Socrates ultimately is a premonition of what was to come in later centuries as many who were proponents of freedom of thought also faced a similar fate and do so even today. In 399 BC, Socrates was put on trial by the Athenians and sentenced to death on the grounds that he was corrupting the youth through his method of teaching.

The vehicle for change can be simple and easy and the Socratic Method is testament to that. Through the simple act of questioning one’s own set of beliefs, one can open up the mind to new possibilities and eventualities. But another very powerful tool for change is a story. Great writers are often activists for change and reflection. A writer is compelled to tell a story that mirrors the society in which we live and through the pictures he/she creates we enter into a world where masks are removed and often unpleasant truths are unveiled. As we unfold the secrets of the written word we find that beneath the beauty of language lie uncomfortable and disturbing realities that we as readers are compelled to think about. They often move us and urge us to look at things in lateral ways and even change the way we perceive the world around us. A story is emotive, it makes us cry, laugh, reflect and allows us to relate to others in a more personal manner.

The plight of the poor, the marginalised, often known as ‘the underclass’ is frequently reflected in literature. The victimisation of those who remain unheard is also a prevalent theme in many works of fiction and the conflict that is at the root of such oppression is, therefore, a predominant theme. Whether the conflict is borne out of differences in religious beliefs or a deeper hatred that springs from a political bias or a will to rule, a will to power, it is often about suppression and raw barbarism. Religion is more often than not a tool to instigate violence or to enforce a rule of law that gives one nation supremacy over another, or one group of people power over another or one person authority over another and this is shown in many works of literature.

One writer who spoke about a larger force that we are in an inherent battle with, Franz Kafka, uses imaginary situations that we are unfamiliar with and creates scenarios that we gradually become familiar with during the course of his stories. For example, in his

---

1 Editors’ Note: Dated after 399 BC, during the weeks leading to Socrates’ trial, Euthyphro is one of Plato’s early dialogues which features Socrates and Euthyphro, a religious expert, trying to define holiness/piety.
2 Editors’ Note: Franz Kafka (1883-1924) was a German-language novelist and short stories writer. Considered one of the most prominent authors of the 20th century.
story *Metamorphosis*, Kafka subjects the reader to psychological violence, a mental turmoil that forces us to think beyond our sedentary lives, beyond the apathy that covers our existence. In his writings the workplace — bureaucracies, courts, castles — all stand for mysterious and punishing Authority. Kafka’s works are stories of the struggle of his characters, the authoritarian figure always crushing the protagonist. In his elaborate metaphors, he captures the encroachment of the enemy and the enemy is often open to interpretation. Is it the state, conformity, or religion that is used as a weapon? We enter into a world of fantasy that takes us to the depths of our everyday realities, the conflicts that we face and the violence that we are victims of.

His story *Metamorphosis* in which the main character Gregor wakes up one morning as a monstrous vermin and is eventually ostracised by his own family and dies of neglect, is punctuated with...

...religious resonances: the “conversion” itself, the wrath of the father, the fatal apple, Gregor’s “Christ-like” death, “nailed” to the floor by the apple thrown by his father. But what does it all amount to?...Gregor’s transformation brings no apparent redemption; is he not a creature of God too? Then why must he suffer for the mistakes of others? Despite the religious undertones and because of them, the story is neither one of good or evil, redemption or damnation (Breckman 2000).

Yet surely we are all creatures of God. Where does salvation lie? Kafka urges us to become participants in a ‘partnership between reader and writer in which neither the writer nor the reader’ (Breckman 2000) are the wiser and in which right and wrong are not the question. We are not the ones who must decide. It is not within our realm or our capacity to do so (cited in Nowak 2004).

The symbolism in the works of writers such as Kafka are a reflection of the conflicted world in which we live, the battle between beliefs, values, the self and external forces that try and control us.

The war within manifests itself in a self-effacing confessional rapport offered to us by Harold Pinter\(^5\) as does the inability to involve the other in the intimacy of your personal universe. In his plays, Pinter talks of an inner conflict shown through the dichotomy between words and actions. His plays mirror this disconnect and often there is miscommunication between characters where one person is saying something that seems perfectly simple and yet the other perceives it in an entirely different way, resulantly the conversation becomes an unending maze of questions and answers that lead to a sort of confinement and confusion. There is also a lack of clarity of intentions as the characters engage in actions that have unclear consequences. The reader is shown familiar situations such as a birthday party and yet the way in which characters converse is almost alien because they are often talking at cross-purposes and the absurdity of the situations that

---

5 Editors’ Note: Harold Pinter (1930-2008) was a Noble laureate playwright, screenwriter, director and actor. Considered one of the most influential modern British dramatists.
occur are almost disturbing. When focussing on the way that he uses language to create a sense of discomfort and unease, looking at his plays the *Celebration* and the *Room*, we see that they are almost haunting in their portrayal of a gamut of characters who all seem isolated and lost in a world where even their own recollections of their lives seem a collection of illusions. Between their skewed conversations that are laced with insults and prejudice we are faced with people who have chosen materialism as a way of life which has left them soulless and searching for something more meaningful. The fragmented structure of conversation that Pinter uses to portray this lack of direction and comprehension is both effective and is presented in simple language that is neither verbose nor unattainable. In addition, his writing is also a critique on political regimes that use words to shroud hidden agendas. Pinter was fierce in his opinions on public affairs in western and eastern countries including the atrocities that were committed by the United States of America in Guantanamo Bay, in Iraq and Afghanistan. In many ways, his fiction is a microcosm of his political views.

Many contemporary Pakistani writers too have been preoccupied with questions of conflict, violence and power. One of the first who talked about the conflict of religion, race and ethnicity was Hanif Qureshi. He is concerned with the clash between communities and families regarding religion and race. In one of his interviews about identity he said:

> It’s hard to remember it now, but in the early 60s, if you were an Indian or a Pakistani in England you were considered to be inferior... When people met my father they thought that he was a lesser man.... It was very, very oppressive, that sort of racism, the assumptions that people would have about you – “he’s a Paki, and we know what they’re like”... (Brown 2008).

His short stories and novels are a candid and insightful portrayal of the difficulties that Asian migrants faced when they first settled in the United Kingdom in the 1960s.

More recently writers such as Mohammad Hanif are passionate about the plight of minorities. In his latest book, *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*, the abuse Alice Bhatti and her family suffer as Christians is clearly depicted:

> Alice Bhatti is a Choohra... and a subset of the group better known as Dalits or “untouchables”—born in the French Colony of Karachi’s largest Christian slum; her father, Joseph, has the official title of “janitor for the Municipal Corporation”.... and her mother died under mysterious circumstances, likely involving rape, while working as a domestic (Row 2012).

In Pakistan, it is mostly the minorities who are victimised but on a global scale, as mentioned earlier, in the aftermath of 9/11, the world as we know it has changed with Muslims being victimised all over the world. Mohsin Hamid, another popular and respected Pakistani writer has touched upon the backlash that has been created as a result of that victimisation in *The Reluctant Fundamentalist*, a novel and now a film in which after the towers are attacked, the protagonist is repeatedly questioned and humiliated by
the US authorities because he is Muslim, until finally he breaks down and decides to return to his country of origin, Pakistan.

The writers I have talked about are only a few of the many who have had and are continuing to have a significant influence on the way people think. Through their stories we live the lives of all those who are suffering silently and who are facing a sea of trials and tribulations every day.

Over the years, scholars have debated on what an education system should aspire to achieve and there are often divergent views on what constitutes a ‘good’ education. In the modern age of consumerism, there is a continued emphasis of education being led by economics. Education is often seen as a means to prosperity and advancement. The view that materialism will guarantee a ‘better’, ‘happier’ life, one that will lead to fulfilment and contentment is a popular notion. The human aspect of education where values are questioned and larger philosophical concerns are examined are often missing, thus, in many ways stripping us of our humanity which ultimately leads to a society in which self-worth is measured purely in monetary terms. Such a society is one that is dangerous and riddled with problems. Noam Chomsky\(^6\), in his pursuit to uncover the many miseries that are shrouded in a flawed education system, states that an education that produces commodities rather than human beings is tailored to enforce ignorance and limit intellectual freedom. In his book *Class Warfare: Interviews with David Barsamian*, he said about mass education:

\[ \ldots \text{the freer the society gets, the more dangerous the great beast [the people] becomes and the more you have to be careful to cage it somehow} (\text{Chomsky 1996}).\]

In order to have progressive education for our future generations and teach them to treat others with respect and dignity, it is imperative to have a two-fold approach: one is to identify the limitations and flaws within our current education system and the second is to reflect on the works of the writers and philosophers such as those I have discussed above and imbue their teachings within our education system.

**Pakistan’s Current Life Story**

There have been a number of recent murders based on religious conflict in Pakistan. One of the most highly publicised of these was that of the murder of Governor Salman Taseer who was brutally murdered in the capital city Islamabad in 2011. He was shot 29 times and the reason given by the murderer was that he felt Salman Taseer was ‘blasphemous’ because he was trying to reform the country’s Blasphemy Laws. In the same year, Pakistan’s only Christian minister Shahbaz Bhatti was shot 25 times, again for opposing the Blasphemy Laws and promoting freedom of speech.

\(^6\) Editors’ Note: Chomsky is an American who is considered the ‘father of modern linguistics’. He is a prize winning philosopher, cognitive scientist, logician, political commentator and peace activist.
These shocking episodes and many others like them stem from deep seated ignorance that prevails in our society and so we must look at both the literacy rate in Pakistan and the curriculum we teach in our schools and then try to structure a reformatory way of teaching children. Education should be seen as a vehicle to free the mind and allow the self to create and flourish. If education is a means of suppression it is simply a tool to control, to give sanction to an agenda. Education must necessarily enable people to think for themselves. The methods used to control people through education vary in different societies. In Pakistan, the curriculum contains material that is dangerous in the injustices that it promotes including extreme prejudice towards people from different religions and faiths. This kind of control that divides societies again stems from fear and the need to imprison children’s minds. Writers, artists and thinkers need to be invited into forums where discussions for policy reform are taking place. Add to that, the work of ancient and modern writers, philosophers and thinkers like the ones mentioned should be translated and communicated to children in an accessible manner. According to a fact sheet about Pakistan’s education:

- One in three children in Pakistan do not have a primary school education. This is the world’s second highest.
- Two thirds of the children who do not attend school are girls (3 million girls).
- 49.5 million adults are illiterate which is the third largest in the world.
- The Pakistani Government has reduced spending on education from 2.6% of gross national product in 1999 to 2.3% in 2010 (UNESCO 2012, pp. 1-2).

The prejudice that is corrupting the young and causing polarisation between different religions is shown in a study Religion and Conflict (Hussain, Salim and Naveed 2011). Some of the key findings of the study are:

- A review of compulsory Urdu language textbooks, for all students up to grade 10, published by the Punjab Textbook Board, found that 96 chapters and poems out of 362 had a strong Islamic orientation, without any mention of Pakistan’s religious minorities or their beliefs.
- Teachers often expressed negative views about Ahmadis, Christians, and Jews.
- Textbooks often portray non-Muslims as kafirs (infidels) or mushrakeen (pagans).
- Non-Muslims are not described as citizens with protected rights.
- 80% of public school teachers viewed non-Muslims as ‘enemies of Islam’.
- Hindus were depicted in especially negative terms, and references to Christians were often offensive.
- Public school and madrassa (religious school) teachers had limited awareness or understanding of religious minorities and their beliefs (Hussain, Salim and Naveed 2011).
Recommendations

Pakistani primary and secondary schools use textbooks that foster prejudice and intolerance of religious minorities, especially Hindus and Christians. Hussain, Salim and Naveed (2011) make the following recommendations:

- Create tolerance by setting national textbook and curricula standards that promote tolerance towards all persons, and ensure that this standard is maintained.
- Implement improved guidelines for textbooks used in public schools in addition to replacing current public school textbooks with ones that exclude messages of intolerance, malice, or violence against any group of people based on religious or other differences.
- Ensure that a madrassa oversight board is established to train teachers in human rights (Ibid. 2011, pp. 125-126).

With regard to other government reforms, their study recommends, reforming the Blasphemy Law ensuring ....

....those accused of blasphemy, their defenders, witnesses, and judges are given adequate protection... that minority affairs ministries are established in all four provinces; and enforcing government-mandated employment quotas for minorities and working to see that religious minorities are recruited into government jobs (Ibid.).

The Government of Pakistan needs to recognise the gravity of what is happening in our country with regard to the hundreds of deaths of minorities and different sects of Muslims recently and make the changes necessary to bring about peace and unity. The reformatory aspect of education is imperative if we are to make progress with respect to creating tolerance between different sects of Muslims and other religious minorities. There is a need to inculcate critical thinking in our youth. But this is only possible if we use different approaches to teaching. Educational reform is a vast topic and it is not within the scope of this chapter to cover the details of the mechanisms that will lead to complete reform. The intent here is to provide larger general principles upon which to build in order to ensure a more tolerant society. The ‘approach’ is discussed as opposed to the structure which is what will hold it together, but for which a more detailed focus on that aspect of education must be explored. From what has been shared above and from my own personal experience, simple and practical steps can be taken as ‘baby steps’ towards creating a more tolerant youth:

- Teachers should be trained to use various tools to impart knowledge to students such as encouraging reading by allocating a certain amount of time to reading in the day so each student has a story to read. The stories should include characters from different religions and races. A certain amount of time should be given to discussing these stories so that the students can recount the messages within them and reflect.
There should be regular performances by students in the form of plays and individual performances to boost confidence and encourage team work.

Music and art should be a large part of the curriculum so that students can share their thoughts through pictures. Music is both inspiring and calming and creates a common platform where there are no distinctions between people. Art can communicate feelings and emotions that sometimes words cannot.

The Socratic Method of teaching where a questioning stance is taken should be introduced albeit in a simpler form than the original Socratic Method so that children learn to ask questions and teachers should not take a dictatorial approach whereby they are simply conducting lectures. In order to learn, students have to be involved in the learning process and lectures alone cannot achieve that objective.

Lectures are necessary for the purpose of those aspects of learning which involve learning by rote. This too is important, for example learning dates in History or formulas in Science and Mathematics. However, the concept of each subject matter must be explained clearly; so for example, it is not sufficient to know that $3 \times 3 = 9$, the student must be taught what that means. In our current education system, the tendency is to simply teach the children to memorise everything so they do not understand why things work the way they do.

A day in the week should be dedicated to current issues so that children are aware of what is happening in the world around them. That will help them learn from other societies and contextualise what is happening in their own country.

Regular school trips where children of one school meet children of another should be a feature in all schools. That way teachers can learn from each other and students will be exposed to different learning approaches and other communities. This may not be possible over large geographical distances due to lack of funding but even if it is another local school to begin with, it would be a valuable experience for staff and the children.

Parents should be involved in homework and in helping their children with plays and art work so that the child feels confident and secure with what he/she is doing. If parents cannot help with the homework due to lack of education, they must show an interest in the child’s education by monitoring their work and encouraging involvement on school projects and homework.

Although these recommendations are some of the reforms that I feel are important for progression. It has to be added that any reform system must have the input of all stakeholders in Pakistan which includes the government and civil society. There should also be an independent monitoring body to check how schools are running. Ideally, this body should consist of educationists and members from different stakeholder groups so that their assessment is fair.
One of the essential ingredients for learning purposes in any sector, field or area (and one of the most effective ways in which an issue can be highlighted) is through actual case studies because these are lived experiences that we all have and if we share these, it is easier for us to relate to the situations we all face on a day-to-day basis. They also give us clarity and a platform to discuss change. It is suggested, therefore, that case studies could also be shared with students to shed light on how we can change things for the better.

Some of my own lived experiences also indicate how widespread the conflict between people from different faiths is, as part of our everyday lives and in our homes. In fact this has helped me to understand the situation better despite the fact that I had read a plethora of literature on the subject prior to moving to Pakistan. In my years of living in Pakistan, I had often wondered why there was such a general aversion to the Christian communities. Although there is discrimination against many other minority groups as well, this was the one which was always most apparent to me on a day-to-day basis. My first job was at an international organisation where most of the employees were ‘educated’ people. I was nervous as one is on the first day of work, but I found solace in the fact that it was after all an international organisation and I was surrounded by the paray likeh (educated) of the capital city of Pakistan. The first person who greeted me was the tea boy. His name was Yusuf. He smiled widely and asked me if I wanted tea. I replied in the affirmative. I felt comforted by this small gesture. As the days passed, I met more and more people and started to form impressions of my colleagues as one does. Some I instantly disliked, others I thought I needed time to assess and some I took a liking to as soon as I met them. Eventually I was left with three, three of those I felt I could talk to with ease. One day as I was talking to one of them, Yusuf passed by and there was this grimace on her face. All of a sudden she turned to me and said, ‘Oh my God, I wish he wouldn’t come so close. These people stink.’ I was shocked and before I could say anything she added, ‘Have you noticed all these Christians smell the same?’ That was just the beginning of a peregrination that would take me through many such conversations and many such situations.

Initially, I reacted with anger, I would vehemently defend the man/woman who was being insulted and berated but soon I realised that that was not having the desired effect and that I was trying to fight a mindset, a mindset that had been formed in childhood and was firmly entrenched in the psyche of these people. In fact, anger only instigated more anger and a stronger desire to defend their opinions. Years later, I was living in rented accommodation that I shared with my landlady. We lived on different floors. She came to visit me one day, looking rather perturbed. The conversation began ‘Ayesha, I am very disappointed with you especially as you are a Syed.’ I asked her what was wrong. She answered, ‘I have noticed that you have employed a cook who is Christian.’ I could feel the blood rise in my cheeks and my temper was rising, but for the first time I managed to stay calm and I sat her down, took her hand in mine and said, ‘Hasn’t Islam made all of us the same? God made them just as God made us, surely He would not want us to fight. We must be kind to each other, we are the same…’ and I continued in that vein. Even though she was ‘uneducated’ and was from a remote village, it seemed to work and
gradually I saw her attitude change towards my Christian cook and many others of the same faith.

Where there are those who live in the dark, there are also those who are progressive and who fight for reform everyday of their lives and from them we draw hope. It was in Pakistan that I met a lady who is now one of my closest friends, who told me that she believed in equality. What did that mean, surely not the kind of equality I had been exposed to so far where you sat around at coffee parties discussing how sad the lives of poor people are while treating your own domestic staff with total disdain and often contempt? But she showed me what she meant by inviting me to one of her parties. I was surprised to see that her cook and her housekeeper were mingling with the guests and dancing and singing along with everyone else. She was one of the few that actually treated people from all walks of life and religions with the same dignity and respect, the same respect we would demand for ourselves.

**Conclusion**

Many years ago when it was thought that there would never be an end to the atrocities and injustices against the African community, people like Nelson Mandela and Abraham Lincoln fought for their rights and today because of them and others like them millions of people have been freed from the shackles of slavery and servitude. It is not for the rights of minorities or the rights of women or children that we must fight, but for ‘human’ rights. We are all human beings despite our colour, race or religion and every human being has a right to live in peace and dignity. Martin Luther King’s famous speech on emancipation is a message which will live beyond us and well into centuries to come, a message which promises a brighter future for tomorrow’s world:

*I have a dream that one day this nation will rise up and live out the true meaning of its creed: We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal* (U.S Constitution n.d.).
References


Language Policy and Education in Pakistan*
Tariq Rahman**

Abstract
Pakistan is a multilingual country with six major and over 59 weak languages. However, the languages of the domains of power—government, corporate sector, media, education are English and Urdu. The state’s policies have favoured these two languages at the expense of others. These have resulted into the expression of ethnic identity through languages other than Urdu. It has also resulted in English having become a symbol of the upper class, sophistication and power. The less powerful indigenous languages of Pakistan are becoming markers of lower status and culture shame. Some weak languages are also on the verge of extinction. It is only by promoting additive multilingualism that Pakistani languages will gain vitality and survive as cultural capital rather than cultural stigma.

* This chapter has been approved as a Research Report by the referee. An earlier version appeared in 2006 as ‘Language Policy, Multilingualism and Language Vitality in Pakistan’, in Anju Saxena and Lars Borin (eds.), Trends in Linguistics: Lesser-known Languages of South Asia, Mouton de Gruyter, Berlin and New York, pp. 73-104.
** Dr. Tariq Rahman is currently the Dean School of Education at Beaconhouse National University, Lahore, Pakistan. He is also the HEC Distinguished National Professor and Professor Emeritus at the National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad for life. He is a highly published scholar with over 99 articles in scholarly journals; 18 books; 29 book contributions and several book reviews.
Introduction
Pakistan is a multilingual country. Its national language, Urdu, is the mother tongue of only 7.57% people (GoP 2001) though it is very widely spread out in urban areas of the country otherwise. Its official language is still English as it was when British ruled the country as part of British India. In addition to this, the country has five major indigenous languages given below:

Table 1: Pakistani Languages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Languages</th>
<th>Percentage of speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Punjabi</td>
<td>44.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pashto</td>
<td>15.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi</td>
<td>14.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siraiki</td>
<td>10.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>7.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochi</td>
<td>3.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>4.66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


There are also over 50 other languages, some of them on the verge of extinction, which are given in Appendix 1. These are weak languages because they are not used in the domains of power (government, administration, judiciary, media, military, education, commerce, research, etc). The term ‘weak’ can be understood with reference to power which will be explained in the next section. What is important is that a language may be weak because of the small size of the community which speaks it but, even more importantly, where communities may be large but the language is not used in the domains of power so people do not give priority to it nor do they learn it in the formal system of education. Since using a language in the domains of power is part of government policy, this chapter begins by looking at language policy in some detail before going on to study the effects of this policy on the weaker languages of Pakistan. As the issue of power is central to policy and defines weakness and strength of languages, let us consider it first.

Power
Power is that quality which enables the users of that language to obtain more means of gratification than the speakers of other languages. The gratification may be tangible goods: houses, cars, good food or they may be intangibles like pleasure, ego boosting, and self-esteem. Since power is ordinarily understood as that which makes it possible to dominate others, this definition needs explanation. Briefly, domination is also gratifying in itself. Moreover, those who dominate also command more goods and services. Thus, my definition of power is more inclusive of all shades and forms of power than others (for full explanation see Rahman 2002, pp. 38-42). Powerful language is one which makes it possible for its speakers and writers to obtain a higher share of these gratifications than others.
This is mostly possible in settled, modernising or modern societies where there are domains such as religion, education, bureaucracy, judiciary, military, commerce, media, research and so on. In primitive tribes, the manipulation of language matters less, whereas in agricultural societies it emerges and becomes pervasive but it is not the only passport to power; while in industrial, modern societies it becomes vitally important. Entering domains of power without being able to manipulate language could be a challenge. It is the language of employment (Rahman 2000), and without employment one cannot possess power in modern societies.

Weak language is one that carries less prestige and does not qualify one for employment as compared to another language which gives both these advantages. Thus, English is the strongest language in Pakistan. After English, comes Urdu followed by Sindhi. Pashto, Balochi and Brajvi are also strong but these three are considered more as an identity symbol and hold no advantage for the user in public life. Punjabi is an example of a major language which is held in affectionate contempt by its own speakers and is, therefore, a weak language. Other languages of the country, especially those which are spoken by small communities, are weak on both counts: being small in size and not being used in the domains of power.

**Consequences of Pakistan’s Language Policies**

There have been statements about language policy in various documents in Pakistan; in different versions of the Constitution, statements by governmental authorities in the legislative assembly debates, and, above all, in the various documents relating to education policy which have been issued almost by every government. The following is stated in the 1973 Constitution:

(1) The National language of Pakistan is Urdu, and arrangements shall be made for it being used for official and other purposes within fifteen years from the commencing day.

(2) Subject to clause (1) the English language may be used for official purposes until arrangements are made for its replacement by Urdu.

(3) Without prejudice to the status of the National Language, a Provincial Assembly may by law prescribe measures for the teaching, promotion and use of a provincial language in addition to the National Language (Constitution of Pakistan, Article 251).

The national language of Pakistan is Urdu (it was Urdu and Bengali from 1955 till 1971 when East Pakistan became Bangladesh) though it is, and has always been, the mother-tongue of a minority in the country. This minority came from India, mostly after the creation of Pakistan in 1947, and is called *mohajir* (refugee or immigrant).

The rationale for this privileging of Urdu, as given by the Government of Pakistan, is that Urdu is so widely spread that it is almost like the first language of all Pakistanis. Moreover, since most jobs are available if one speaks or specially knows how to write Urdu, it is only just that all children be given a chance to learn it. It has established itself as a symbol of unity and helps create a unified ‘Pakistani’ identity. In this symbolic role,
it serves the political purpose of resisting ethnicity, which may otherwise threaten sovereignty of the federation.

**Consequences of Privileging Urdu**

The major consequence of privileging Urdu is that it has spread widely in Pakistan and is understood by all literate people and majority of illiterate ones as well. Those who watch television, Urdu films (Indian and Pakistani), listen to radio or come in contact with educated people pick up Urdu. This means that small language communities, especially ones with school-going children, are undergoing a language shift. For example, it has been noted that middle-class Punjabi families often speak in Urdu with their children rather than in their native Punjabi.

In the Northern Areas, where Urdu reached along with a major road (the Karakorum Highway) in 1974, Urdu words are fast replacing indigenous ones. This is the price these settlers are willing to pay, i.e. ‘Urdu-isation’ of their languages for the sake of development. Hence, it was only natural that Urdu should be used in place of the ‘lesser’ languages. This has weakened other languages of Pakistan along with Punjabi, Siraiki and Hindko which are mutually intelligible with it. People speaking these languages have started to internalise values of Urdu speaking majority as enforced by the mainstream media. They regard their own language as fit only for private conversation, songs, jokes, and so on.

Rather paradoxically, the second major consequence of privileging Urdu has been ethnic resistance to it. This is because Urdu has been a symbol of the central rule of the Punjabi ruling elite which was opposed in other provinces of the country. The use of Urdu as an ethnic symbol is given in detail in Rahman (1996).

However, as people learn languages for pragmatic reasons (Rahman 2002, p. 36), they are prioritising Urdu themselves. This phenomenon, sometimes called ‘voluntary shift’, is not really ‘voluntary’ as the case of the native Hawaiians, narrated by Nettle and Romaine (2000, pp. 94-97). What happens is that market conditions are such that one’s language becomes deficit in what Bourdieu (1994, pp. 230-231), the French Sociologist, would call cultural ‘capital’. Instead of being an asset it becomes a liability. It prevents one from rising in society. In short, it is ghettoising. Then, people become ashamed of it as the Punjabis, otherwise a powerful majority in Pakistan, are observed to be.¹ Or, even if language movements and ethnic pride does not make them ashamed of their languages, they do not want to teach them to their children because that would be overburdening the children with far too many languages. For instance, Sahibzada Abdul Qayyum Khan (1864-1937) reported in 1932 that the Pashtuns wanted their children to be instructed in Urdu rather than Pashto (GoNWFP 1932). Then in 2003, the Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA) government chose Urdu over Pashto, as the language of the domains of power, including education, in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province (the then North West Frontier Province of Pakistan).

¹ For a survey of the attitude of Punjabi students towards their language see Mansoor (1993, pp. 49-54).
In Baluchistan the same phenomenon – the choice of Urdu in place of the mother-tongues of the people--has been noticed. Balochi, Brahvi and Pashto were introduced as compulsory medium of instruction in government schools in 1990 (GoB 1990). The language activists enthusiastically prepared instructional material, but on 8 November 1992, these languages were made optional and parents switched back to Urdu (Rahman 1996, p.169). Such decisions endanger the survival of minor languages and even devalue major ones, but they are precisely the kind of policies which have created what is often called ‘Urdu Imperialism’ in Pakistan.

In short, the State’s use of Urdu as a symbol of national integration has had two consequences. First, it has made Urdu the obvious force to be resisted by ethnic groups. This resistance has strengthened their languages by corpus planning (writing books, dictionaries, grammars, orthographies etc.) and acquisition planning (teaching languages, pressurising the state to teach them, using them in the media). Second, it has jeopardised additive multilingualism recommended by United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO 2003) and, by many eminent linguists and educationists (Edwards 1994). As Urdu spreads through schooling, media and urbanisation, pragmatic pressures make the other Pakistani languages retreat. In short, the consequence of privileging Urdu strengthens ethnicity while, at the same time and paradoxically, threatens linguistic and cultural diversity in the country.

Policy about English

In the 1973 Constitution, English was supposed to continue as the official language of Pakistan for fifteen years when the national language(s) were to replace it. However, this date came and went by as many other dates before it and English is as firmly entrenched in the domains of power in Pakistan as it was in 1947. The major reason for this that replacing English with national language(s) is the ‘declared policy’ of the ruling elite in Pakistan, not the ‘real’ one. The real policy can be understood with reference to the elite’s patronage of English in the name of efficiency, modernisation and so on.

To begin with the Civil Service of Pakistan (CSP) was once an ‘Anglicised’ body of men who had moulded themselves in the British tradition. The officer corps of the Armed Forces, as Cohen (1998, pp.162-163) suggests was also ‘Anglicised’. Cohen called it the ‘British generation’ which dominated Pakistan Army till 1971 (Ibid.). It is understandable the Pakistani elite had a stake in the continuation of English because it differentiated them from the masses; gave them a competitive edge over those with Urdu-medium or traditional (madrassa) education; and, above all, was the kind of cultural capital which had snob value and constituted a class-identity marker.

What is less comprehensible is why members of these two elites, who now come increasingly from the lower-middle and middle classes who have studied in Urdu-medium schools (or schools which are called English-medium but teach mostly in Urdu),
should also want to preserve, and indeed strengthen, the hegemony of English; a language which has over the years been instrumental in suppressing their class?

For years, the elite have invested in a parallel system of elitist schooling of which the defining feature is teaching all subjects, other than Urdu, through the medium of English. This has created new generations, and ever increasing pools of young people who have a direct stake in preserving English. All the arguments which applied to a small ‘Anglicised’ elite of the early generation of Pakistan now applies to young aspirants who stand ready to enter the ranks of this elite. And their parents, themselves not at ease with English, have invested far too much in their children’s education to consider decreasing the cultural capital and importance of the language.

Moreover, most people think in terms of present day realities which they may be critical of at some level but which they take as permanent facts of life. This makes them regard all change as utopian or suspiciously radical activities. To think of abolishing English is one such disquieting thought because, at least for the last century and a half, people of this part of the world have taken the ascendancy of English for granted. In recent years, with more young people from the affluent classes appearing in the British O’ and A’ level examinations; with the world-wide coverage of news channels like BBC and CNN; with globalisation and talk about English being a world language; with stories of young people emigrating all over the world armed with English; with all these things, English is a commodity, which is more in demand than ever before.

The author carried out a survey of 1085 students from different schools in Pakistan in 1999-2000. The results of this survey regarding English are reproduced in Table 2:
Table 2: Attitudes of Students towards English

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Madrassas (N=131)</th>
<th>Sindhi medium schools (N=132)</th>
<th>Urdu medium schools (N=520)</th>
<th>English medium schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What should be the medium of instruction in schools?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>43.51</td>
<td>9.09</td>
<td>62.50</td>
<td>4.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>33.33</td>
<td>13.65</td>
<td>79.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother tongue</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>15.15</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>2.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>25.19</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>16.79</td>
<td>37.88</td>
<td>16.54</td>
<td>5.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Do you think higher jobs in Pakistan should be available in English?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>10.69</td>
<td>30.30</td>
<td>27.69</td>
<td>72.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>89.31</td>
<td>63.64</td>
<td>71.15</td>
<td>27.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NR</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>6.06</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Should English-medium schools be abolished?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>49.62</td>
<td>13.64</td>
<td>20.19</td>
<td>2.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>49.62</td>
<td>84.09</td>
<td>79.04</td>
<td>97.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NR</td>
<td>00.76</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>1.16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The results do not add up to 100 in some cases because those choosing two or more languages have been ignored.

These results suggest that 16-year old students of matriculation (or equivalent level) in Pakistani schools are not in favour of English as the medium of instruction in schools except in English-medium schools. In other schools they suffer because of English and, therefore, do not favour it. When they grow up and enter elitist positions their investment in English grows, as it becomes the language of schooling of their children, and they no longer support policies which would replace English with other languages.

However, paradoxically, even school students do not support the abolition of English-medium schools. Perhaps this seems too radical, visionary and impractical to them. Perhaps they feel that English-medium schools provide good quality education and should remain available for the modernisation of the country. Or perhaps they understand that such schools are a ladder out of the ghetto of their socio-economic class to a privileged class which their siblings or children might make use of. In short, it is probably because of their pragmatism and acute realisation that nothing is going to change that they want the English-medium schools to keep flourishing.

‘Real’ Policy Regarding English

As mentioned earlier, the British colonial government and its successor Pakistani government has rationed out English. Its stated policy was to support Urdu but that was only to create a subordinate bureaucracy at low cost (vernacular-medium education costs less than English-medium education). It was also to keep an anti-ethnic, centrist, ideological symbol potent and vibrant in the country.
The Armed Forces, better organised than any other section of society, created cadet colleges from 1950s onwards. These schools, run on the lines of elitist British public schools, were subsidised by the State. In the 1960s, when students from government colleges, who came by and large from vernacular-medium schools, protested against these bastions of privilege, the Government appointed a Commission to investigate into their grievances. The report of this Commission agreed that such schools violated the constitutional assurance that ‘all citizens are equal before law’ (Paragraph 15 under Right No. VI of the 1962 Constitution) (GoP 1966). However, the Commission was also convinced that these schools would produce suitable candidates for filling elitist positions in the military and the civilian sectors of the country’s services (Ibid. p. 18). This meant that the concern for equality was merely a legal nicety. And this, indeed, was what happened. Today cadet colleges are as well-entrenched in Pakistan’s educational system as ever before. Their total spending is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadet college</th>
<th>Budget</th>
<th>Average monthly tuition fees</th>
<th>Part of the budget covered by fees</th>
<th>Number of students</th>
<th>Total cost per student per year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kohat</td>
<td>19,981,217</td>
<td>4,701</td>
<td>44% (8,785,923)</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>34,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Larkana</td>
<td>23,176,006</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>95% (22,017,205)</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>56,617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pitaro</td>
<td>71,720,000</td>
<td>6000</td>
<td>80% (57,376,000)</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>1,02,457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawrence</td>
<td>98,886,181</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>18.19% (17,987,396)</td>
<td>711</td>
<td>1,39,080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hassanabdal</td>
<td>48,223,000</td>
<td>1350</td>
<td>12.75% (6,148,433)</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>1,00,465</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mastung</td>
<td>36,300,000</td>
<td>2200</td>
<td>15.75% (5,500,000)</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>1,00,834</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source*: Collected by author from offices of respective institutions except for the cost per student per year which was obtained by dividing the total budget by the number of students.

The total expenditure is not covered by tuition fees. Cadet colleges receive subsidies from provincial governments, grants by visiting dignitaries and free gifts of various kinds from the alumni and officials of the state. Spending on other educational institutions is as follows:

---

4 Editors’ Note: 2001-02 Pak Rupees per US$ fluctuated between Rs. 60-64 to US$ 1.
Table 4: Differences in Costs in Major Types of Educational Institutions-2001\(^5\) (in Pak Rupees)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Average cost per student per year</th>
<th>Payer (s)</th>
<th>Cost to the state</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Madrassas</td>
<td>5,714 (includes board and lodging)</td>
<td>Philanthropists and religious organisations.</td>
<td>Very little as subsidy on computers, books etc in some madrassas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu-medium schools</td>
<td>2264.5 (only tuition)</td>
<td>State</td>
<td>2264.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elitist English medium schools</td>
<td>96,000---for ‘A’ level &amp; 36,000 for O’ level and below (only tuition)</td>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>None reported except subsidised land in some cantonments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cadet colleges/public schools</td>
<td>90,061 (tuition and all facilities).</td>
<td>Parents, state (average of 6 cadet colleges and 1 public school)</td>
<td>14,171 (average of 5 cadet colleges only)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data obtained by author from several institutions.

By supporting English through a parallel system of elitist schooling, Pakistan’s ruling elite acts as an ally of the forces of globalisation at least as far as the hegemony of English, which globalisation promotes, is concerned. The major effect of this policy is to weaken the local languages and lower their status even in their home country. This, in turn, militates against linguistic and cultural diversity; weakens the ‘have-nots’ even further and increases poverty by concentrating the best paid job in the hands of the international elite and the English-using elite of the peripheries.

English, after all, is the language of great power in the contemporary, globalised world. It spread as the language of the colonies of Britain in African and Asian countries (Brutt-Griffler 2002). After British withdrawal from its colonies, English spread because of American economic power, American control of world media and international commerce after 1945. This was condemned as ‘linguistic imperialism’ by Phillipson (1992, pp. 38-65) and by Skutnabb-Kangas (2000) who called English a ‘killer language’ (p. 46).

**Psychological and Cultural Costs of ‘Linguistic Imperialism’**

As movements (like the Welsh, Irish, Basque, Catalan, Flemish etc.) for the preservation of minor (or weaker) languages in Europe tell us, if a child is told that his or her language is inferior, the message being conveyed is that he/she is inferior. In short, one is giving a negative image to a child by telling him or her that the ‘cultural capital’ they possess is not capital at all but a stigma and a handicap. This makes the child reject an aspect, and

\(^5\) Editors’ Note: 2001-02 Pak Rupees per US$ fluctuated between Rs. 60-64 to US$ 1.
Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow

Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow

Incidentally, the poor and less powerful classes and communities have always been ashamed of aspects of their identity. In South Asia, the caste system forced labourers (like sanitary workers, cobblers, tanners etc.) to live miserable lives. This was unjust, but the worst form of injustice was perpetrated by the fact that the ajlaf (lower castes) like kammis (menial workers), sudras (the lowest of the Hindu caste system) etc. not only accept lower social status, but look down upon people lower in the social scale and even upon themselves. That is why when people became literate and rose in affluence and power, they left their communities and even started using names of groups with higher social respect. In British India, ‘number of Shaikhs and other categories’ like Syed, Mughal and Pathan, ‘increased phenomenally, while the occupational caste groups registered a sharp decline’ (Ahmad 1988, p. 115).

Moreover, there are many literary works in Urdu and other languages, not to mention the writer’s own observation, which show how embarrassed the poor are by their houses, clothes, food, means of transportation and, of course, their languages. In short, reality constructed by the rich and poor alike conspires to degrade, embarrass and oppress the less powerful, the less affluent, the less gifted of the human race. This relates to language-shame, being embarrassed about one’s language, hence to possible language death.

Strength and Weakness of Minor Pakistani Languages

The year 2000 saw three excellent publications on language death. David Crystal’s, Language Death; Daniel Nettle and Suzanne Romaine’s Vanishing Voices and Tove Skutnabb-Kangas’ Linguistic Genocide in Education or Worldwide Diversity and Human Rights. These books made linguists conscious that, with standardisation created by the modern state and the corporate sector, smaller languages of the world were dying. Either the speakers die or, which is more often the case, they voluntarily shift to a powerful language which helps them survive but as members of another group rather than their own.

In Pakistan, as brought out earlier, linguistic hierarchy is as follows: English, Urdu and finally local language. The state television dramas use the term ‘Urdu-medium’ for lack of sophistication. The children of elitist English-medium schools are indifferent to Urdu and claim to be completely bored by its literature. They are proud to claim lack of competence in the subject even when they get ‘A’ grades in the O’ and A’ level examination. They only read English books and not Urdu ones nor those in other languages.
Such attitudes are having a squeezing effect on Pakistani languages. Urdu is safe because of the huge pool of people very proficient in it and especially because it is used in lower level jobs, the media, education, courts, commerce and other domains in Pakistan. Punjabi is a strong language and will survive despite ‘culture shame’ and neglect. It is used in the Indian Punjab in many domains of power and, what is even more significant is that it is the language of songs, jokes, intimacy and informality in both Pakistan and India. This makes it the language of private pleasure and since many people use it in this manner, it is not in real danger.

Sindhi and Pashto are both strong languages and their speakers are proud of them. Sindhi is also used in the domains of power and is the major language of education in rural Sindh. Pashto is not a major language of education nor is it used in the domains of power in Pakistan. However, its speakers see it as an identity marker and it is used in some domains of power in Afghanistan. It too will survive even though Pakistani ‘city Pashto’ is now much adulterated with Urdu words. Educated Pashtuns often code-switch between Pashto and Urdu or English. Balochi and Brahvi are small languages under great pressure from Urdu. However, there is awareness among educated Balochs that their languages must be preserved. As they are not used in the domains of power they are likely to survive as informal languages in the private domain. However, the city varieties of these languages are likely to become ‘Urdufied’.

In Northern Pakistan, there are over 50 small languages, which are under tremendous pressure. The Karakorum Highway which has linked these areas to the plains has put much pressure on these languages. The author visited Gilgit and Hunza (2002, pers. comm., August) and met local language activists among others. They all agreed that their languages should be preserved, but they were so appreciative of the advantages of the road that they accepted the ‘threat’ to their languages with equanimity. Urdu and English words have already entrenched themselves in Shina and Burushaski and, as people increasingly migrate to the cities they are shifting to Urdu.

Even in Karachi, the Gujarati language is being abandoned, at least in the written form, as young people seek to be literate in Urdu and English---the languages used in the domains of power. Some of the languages which are about to (or have more than likely) become extinct include:

**Badeshi:** It is indigenous to the Chail Valley of Swat and is probably a variety of Persian. However, Baart (in Baart and Rehman 2003) confirms that it is under great pressure and may cease to be spoken soon.

**Chilliso:** Spoken by a small number of people on the East bank of the Indus River in Kohistan district in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province, this too is under great pressure by Shina. According to D.G Hallberg ‘A point which further underscores the idea that language shift is taking place in this community is the fact that of the thirteen individuals

---

6 Since there are people whose second language is Urdu. Anyone who is literate, and even those who work in cities without being literate, know Urdu. This means that that there is a huge reservoir of people proficient in it.
who were asked, four said that they spoke Chilisso in their home as a child but speak Shina in their home today’ (SSNP 1992a, pp. 122-123).

**Domakaiki:** This is the language of the Doma people in Mominabad, Hunza. SSNP (1992b, p. 82) reported only 500 speakers in 1992. This number dropped to 300 according to an estimate by the author made during a visit in 2002.

**Gowro:** It is a language of the people of the East bank of Indus river in District Kohistan, mainly spoken in the village of Mahrin by the Gabar Khel class. D.G. Hallberg wrote that ‘it would seem that the dominance of Shina may be slowly erasing the use of Gowro’ (SSNP 1992a, p. 131). Dr. Joan Baart confirmed that 1000 speakers were left and the language may be dying (Baart, J. 2003, pers. comm. 10 August).

**Ushojo:** This is spoken in the Chail Valley of Swat. According to Sandra J. Decker of the Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL), it was spoken by 2,000 people in 1990 (SSNP 1992a, p. 66). She also reported that both men and women spoke Pashto with her (Ibid. p. 76). Dr. Joan Baart also suspected that the language was under great pressure and may be moribund (Baart, J. 2003, pers. comm. 10 August).

The smaller languages of Chitral may also be lost. The Kalasha community, which follows an ancient religion, and lives in the valleys of Chitral, has been in danger of losing their language. Some young people are reported to have left the language when they converted to Islam (SSNP 1992e, p. 112). Other small languages Yidgha, Phalura and Gawar-bati are also losing their vitality.

Two small languages, which would have been lost otherwise, were recorded in 1999 till 2004 by local language activists with the help of Dr. Joan Baart and Rozi Khan Burki, a resident of the village. The first is Ormuri, the language of the village of Kunigaram in South Waziristan, which was described as ‘a strong language in that area’ by Hallberg in 1992 (p. 60). The other one is Kundal Shahi which was discovered by Khwaja Abdur Rahman, a sociolinguist from Azad Kashmir, and is spoken in the Neelam Valley in Azad Kashmir, about 75 miles from Muzaffarabad. This is being preserved by Khwaja Rahman with the help of Baart by developing its dictionary and grammar.

In the smaller languages of Pakistan, the State or the private sector schools do not produce any reading material nor are there any trained teachers to teach in them. However, teachers do tend to explain lessons in the language of the children if it happens to be their own language also. In some languages, there are primers and other reading material created by native speakers or other Pakistani writers. There are also primers, dictionaries and collections of oral literature by foreign linguists which have been the only means of preserving these languages till the emergence of local language activists who value their languages and want to preserve them (Rahman 2006).

---

7 A linguist and senior administrator of the Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL).
While only the remotest and smallest of languages of Pakistan are in danger of dying, all other languages have decreased in stature. The undue prestige of English and Urdu has made all other languages seem a burden rather than an asset. This is the beginning of language sickness if not death.

**Can Weak Languages be Strengthened?**

The question then is whether the weak languages of Pakistan can be saved from further weakening and death? The answer to this question in the context of the world is as follows:

*Yes, more of them can be saved than has been the case in the past, but only by following careful strategies that focus on priorities and on strong linkages to them, and only if the true complexity of local human identity, linguistic competence and global interdependence are fully recognised* (Fishman 2001, p. 481).

In the case of Pakistan, the strategy should be to strengthen weak languages. This can be done as follows:

1. Employment in communities with a majority in certain languages should be given to people who can read and write that language. This means that people will have to learn even small languages formally in order to gain employment. This will strengthen the weak languages and make people interact with the lower bureaucracy from a position of equality and strength rather than weakness and subordination.
2. Government should encourage education of children in their mother tongue. To begin with, language communities living close to each other and having over 20,000 speakers should be given this facility as a right.
3. There should be radio, television, stories, songs and dramas in all languages spoken by over 10,000 speakers. These should be distributed at very little cost to the language communities in question.
4. Efforts should be made to make computer software, including e-mail, games and the internet available in as many languages of Pakistan as possible.
5. Reading material, including primers and story books, should be available in all the languages of Pakistan.
6. Adult literacy centres should teach both the mother tongue and a link language like Urdu.

**Mother-Language Education (MLE)**

While it is not part of government policy to promote teaching in the mother tongue in Pakistan – with the exception of Sindhi in rural Sindh; and Pashto in some areas of Khyber Pakhtunkwa and Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) only up to Class 5

---

8 Editors’ Note: This number can be used as a reference point but it is not based on any scientific calculations.

9 Ibid.
there are some language activists who are promoting MLE, generally with the help of foreign institutes, sometimes helped by volunteers from the Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL), USA and institutions like the Forum for Language Initiatives (FLI), Pakistan (See Appendices 2 and 3).

Kachi is a small language close to Gujarati which is spoken in India and the city of Karachi. It is a low ranking poor community of agricultural workers and for the preservation of their language they have established two schools that teach children up to class 5 in this language. In 2011, Khwaja Rehman and Mohammad Zaman, two language activists and linguists from Northern Pakistan, interviewed and tested ten students from these schools and concluded that they were competent in their mother tongue, Sindhi, English and Mathematics. They were not, however, compared with students of government schools studying in Sindhi or Urdu.

The Parkari language, another mother-tongue of the Hindu community in Sindh living near the villages of the Tharparkar and Nagar regions, is taught in 27 MLE schools up to class-5. These were established by the Parkari Community Development Project (PCDP). According to Rehman and Zaman (2011), who interviewed students and teachers, these schools provided a supportive atmosphere to this poor, minority community which was under-confident and uncomfortable in government schools. In Karachi, there are Balochi-language schools established in Liyari, one of the poorest areas of the city, by the Balochi Language and Literacy Organisation (BLLO). Four schools were established from 2002 onwards and teach pre-primary school children for two years.

There are also MLE schools in parts of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province (Appendix 3). Rehman and Zaman (2011) reported that there are two Palula language schools in Ashret, Chitral that have been functioning since 2008 and offer two years of pre-school education. They compared four MLE students with four non-MLE ones and found their scores higher in recognition of the alphabet, response to simple instructions, understanding of words and Mathematics. They also interviewed students and teachers in the only Kalasha school in the Bumboret valley in Chitral. This school offered education up to class 5 and again found its students more proficient in the above subjects than non-MLE students.

In KPK, Gawri is a language of Kalam in Swat and it is the medium of instruction in a school run by the Gawri Community Development Programme (GCDP) which is supported by the Forum for Language Initiatives. Dr. Baart, a linguist and senior administrator of the SIL, has helped to support this project. The students are said to perform very well in academic subjects. Another minority language, Torwali, is taught in a school up to class 2. However, it is expected to be offered up to class 5 eventually. This project was initiated by the Idara Barae Taleem-o-Taraqqi (Institute for Education and Progress) and offers two years of MLE.

Another interesting case study is of Aslam Academy in the Kaghan Valley. This Academy has been offering education in the Gojri language since 2008. It started with 14 students and in 2013 had 34. Interviews with students suggested that the students find the atmosphere using their mother-tongue more friendly than the government schools which teach in Urdu; though they too use the local Hindko, but not Gojri, for explanation. In short, Rehman and Zaman (2011) suggested that MLE education makes it easy for students to learn not only their own mother-tongue but also other subjects.

These, however, are very small and fragile programmes which may come to an end as soon the activists who support them so ardently or their foreign supporters are unable to help them any further as educational authorities have no credible policy to support the linguistic minorities of the country.

**Conclusion**

Language policies of Pakistan, declared and undeclared, have increased both ethnic and class conflict in the country. Moreover, our Westernised elites, with their own interests, are helping the forces of globalisation and threatening cultural and linguistic diversity. In this process, they are impoverishing the already poor and creating much resentment against the oppression and injustice of the system.

Both globalisation and the continuation of colonial language policies by the various governments of Pakistan have increased the pressure of English on all other languages. While this has also created an increased awareness of language rights and movements to preserve languages, it has generally resulted in more people learning English. In Pakistan, this means that the poor are under more pressure than before because they cannot afford expensive schools which ‘sell’ English at exorbitant rates. As such linguistic globalisation is anti-poor, pro-elitist and exploitative.

While it may not be possible to reverse the trend of globalisation, it is possible to promote the concept of ‘additive bilingualism’ rather than ‘subtractive bilingualism’. This means that we should add to our repertoire of languages to gain power while retaining skills and pride in our own languages. In order to do this, the state and our education system should promote the concept of linguistic rights.

There are tolerance-related and promotion-oriented rights. In Pakistan, we have the former but not the latter. This means that, while we keep paying lip service to our indigenous languages, we create such market conditions that it becomes impossible to gain power, wealth or prestige in any language except English and, to a lesser extent, Urdu. It is this which must be changed and the change must come by changing the market conditions. This is what they did in the case of Catalan, a language while had been banned by General Franco of Spain, and which has been revived. Since they made Catalan the language of jobs and the government of Catalonia (Hall 2001), it changed the power equation and people started learning Catalan.

What we need in Pakistan are such promotion-oriented rights for our languages. What will go with such rights is a good but fair system of schooling which will teach the
mother tongue, English and Urdu equally to all children. English should be taught but not as it is done now; very well to the elite and very badly to all others (for details see Rahman 2002). MLE has started due to the initiatives of committed linguistic activists supported by foreign individuals and institutions but these programmes, mainly in Sindh and KPK, are very weak and reach very few people. They should be strengthened and MLE should become part of education policy all over the country. This and such other steps might save us from the more harmful linguistic effects of policies which are weakening the languages of our people and threaten them with extinction.
References


GoNWFP 1932, ‘LAD-F: Legislative Assembly Debates of the North-West Frontier Province’, 12 October 1932, Pakistan.


Appendix 1: Minor Languages and Dialects of Pakistan
The number of language listed in the Ethnologue (Grimes 2000) for Pakistan is 69. The table below, however, lists only 56 languages and dialects. The major languages (Punjabi, Sindhi, Pashto, Siraiki, Urdu and Balochi) are given elsewhere. Lexical similarity and intelligibility of varieties of a language are given if known. Judgments about a form of speech being a language or a dialect are not given. However, some of the mutually intelligible varieties of Greater Punjabi (Potohari, Chachi and Pahari) have not been included in this list.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language or Dialect</th>
<th>Alternative Names/ Lexical Similarity to other Languages and Dialects</th>
<th>Where Spoken</th>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aer</td>
<td>None/ 78% lexical similarity with Katal Meghwar and Kachi Bhil. 76% with Raburi; 76% with Kachi Koli.</td>
<td>Jikrio Goth around Deh 333, Hyderabad and Jamesabad. Also in Kach Bhuj in Gujrat, India.</td>
<td>200 in 1996.</td>
<td>Grimes 2000, p. 589.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bagri</td>
<td>Bahgri; Bagria; Bagris; Baorias; Bauri. Dialect of Rajasthani. 74% lexical similarity with Marwari Bhil of Jodhpur; 54% with Jandavra.</td>
<td>Sindh and Punjab (nomadic between India and Pakistan).</td>
<td>200,000 in Pakistan including 100,000 in Sindh.</td>
<td>Grimes 2000, p.589.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bhaya</td>
<td>84% lexical similarity to Marwari sweepers; 75% to Malhi; 73% Bhat; 72-73% Goaria; 70-73% Sindhi Meghwar; 63-71% Sindhi Bhil and 70% Urdu.</td>
<td>70-700 in 1998.</td>
<td>Grimes 2000.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahvi</td>
<td>Brohi, Brahuidi, Kurgalli, Brahuigi/no similarity with any language in Pakistan but with many loan words from Persian, Balochi and Urdu.</td>
<td>2,000,000 in Pakistan and 2,210,000 in all countries (1998).</td>
<td>Grimes 2000, p. 590.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghera</td>
<td>Sindhi Ghera, Bara/Quite different grammatically from Gurgula and similar to Urdu. 87% lexical similarity with Gurgula. 70% with Urdu.</td>
<td>Hyderabad Sindh.</td>
<td>10,000 in 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goaria</td>
<td>75-83% lexical similarity with Jogi; 76-80% with Marwari sweeper; 72-78% with Marwari Meghwar; 70-78% with Loarki.</td>
<td>Cities of Sindh.</td>
<td>20,000-25,000 in 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gujrati</td>
<td>Gujrati.</td>
<td>Karachi, other parts of Sindh. Major language in India.</td>
<td>45,479,000 in India and 46,100,000 in all countries. Probably 100,000 in Pakistan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindko</td>
<td>Hazara Hindko, Peshawar Hindko, Hindki/ a variety of Greater Punjabi. Intelligible to Punjabi and Siraiki speakers.</td>
<td>Mansehra, Abbottabad, Haripur, Attock Districts. The inner city of Peshawar and Kohat etc.</td>
<td>3,000,000 in 1993 i.e. 2.4% of the population.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jatki</td>
<td>Jatgali, Jadgali, Jat.</td>
<td>Southern Balochistan and Southwest Sindh. Also in Iran.</td>
<td>100,000 in both countries in 1998.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalami</td>
<td>Bashgharik, Dir Kohistani, Bashkarik, Diri, Kohistani, Dirwali, Kalmi Kohistani, Gouri, Kohistani, Bashkari, Gawri, Garwi.</td>
<td>Upper Swat Kohistan from Kalam to upper valleys also in Dir Kohistan.</td>
<td>60,000-70,000 in 1995.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Characteristics</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koli Kachi</td>
<td>Kachi, Koli, Kachi Koli/ similar to Sindhi and Gujrati. 78% lexical similarity but being influenced more by Sindhi in Pakistan. Its dialects are Rabari, Kachi Bhil, Vagri, Katai Meghwar, Zalavaria Koli and Tharadari Koli.</td>
<td>Lower Sindh around towns of Tando Allahyar and Tando Adam; also in India around the Rann of Kach.</td>
<td>170,000 in 1998.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koli Parkari</td>
<td>Parkari/ Lexical similarity with Marwari Bhil and Tharadari. 77-83% lexical similarity with Marwari Bhil; 83% with Tharadari Koli.</td>
<td>Lower Thar Desert Nagar Parkar. Also in India.</td>
<td>30,000 in 1980.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koli Wadiyara</td>
<td>Wadiyara, Wadhiyara/ intelligibility with Kachi Koli and its varieties.</td>
<td>Sindh in an area bounded by Hyderabad, Tando Allahyar and Mirpur Khas in the north, and Matli and Jamesabad in the South.</td>
<td>175,000-180,000 in Pakistan. Total in Pakistan and India 360,000 in 1998.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>Number 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Od</td>
<td>Odki/ similarity with Marathi with some Gujrati features. Also influenced by Marwari and Punjabi. 70-78% lexical similarity with Marwari, Dhatki and Bagri.</td>
<td>Scattered in Sindh and south Punjab.</td>
<td>50,000 in 1998.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Populations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torwali</td>
<td>Kohistani, Bahrain Kohistani/ 44% lexical similarity with Kalkoti and Kalami.</td>
<td>Chail and Bahrain in Swat.</td>
<td>60,000.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vaghri</td>
<td>Vaghri Koli/ 78% lexical similarity with Wadiyara Koli.</td>
<td>Many places in Sindh. Also in India.</td>
<td>90,000 in India.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix 2: MLE in Sindh, Pakistan-2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Community &amp; Location</th>
<th>No. of Schools/Students</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Balochi</td>
<td>Baloch/Lyari. One school is in Shahigoth and one in Maroro. The latter was shifted to Machi Goth in 2009.</td>
<td>4/650.</td>
<td>Started in 2003.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kachi</td>
<td>Mirpur Khas and Magsi Goth.</td>
<td>2/Not known.</td>
<td>Education till grade 5.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parkari</td>
<td>Mirpur Khas and Rattanabad. Isolated villages of the Tharparkar and Nagar region.</td>
<td>27 schools/1200 students</td>
<td>Education till grade 5.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source:* Rehman and Zaman 2011.
### Appendix 3: MLE in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan-2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Community &amp; Location</th>
<th>No. of Schools/Students</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Palula</td>
<td>Ashret in Chitral.</td>
<td>2/Not known.</td>
<td>After one year of MLE, Urdu and English introduced. Students did better than non-MLE ones in English and Mathematics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalasha</td>
<td>Bamboret in Chitral.</td>
<td>1/ Not known.</td>
<td>Education till grade 5. English and Urdu are introduced from the beginning. MLE students did better in language proficiency and Mathematics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torwali</td>
<td>Bahrain in Swat.</td>
<td>1/ Not known.</td>
<td>Education till grade 5. However, by the end of 2011, education till grade 2 was available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gojri</td>
<td>Budgram in Kaghan Valley.</td>
<td>1/ 34.</td>
<td>Started in 2008 with 14 students and two teachers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Rehman and Zaman 2011.*
Section II

Creating Momentum: Role of Women Empowerment in Economic Development and Environmental Sustainability

1. Pakistani Rural Women and ‘Development’ in an Age of the ‘Anti-Politics Machine’ – Haider Nizamani

2. Is Gender Equality Possible in the 21st Century? Remedies for Slow Pace of Progress in Pakistan and India - Nathalène Reynolds

3. Women and Sustainable Mountain Development: An Illustration of Indigenous Women’s Adaptation to Climate Change in Himalaya - Bhagwati Joshi and Prakash C. Tiwari

4. Women as Agents of Change in Litchi Production: A Case Study of Khanpur, Pakistan – Saima Bibi, Ahmad Hussain, Muhammad Mumtaz Malik, Sadaf Siddique and Sundas Shaukat
Abstract
In rural areas across Pakistan, the word ‘NGO’ is not an abbreviation, rather a term with multiple meanings. For the villager, a non-governmental organisation aka ‘NGO’ implies arrival of a ‘development’ project that will possibly (albeit temporarily) employ some of them, particularly women; its arrival leads to the expectation of receiving goods, services, and information along lines decided by the higher-ups in the ‘NGO’. But ‘development’, as commonly understood by NGOs, remains as elusive today as it was ten years ago. With efforts to alleviate poverty and women empowerment becoming the centre plank of ‘development’ agencies and strategies, the National Rural Support Programme, one of the main organisations in Pakistan focusing on fighting poverty, shared with me that ‘poverty in Pakistan has increased over the last decade.’ It can, therefore, be safely assumed that the existing ‘development’ paradigm is a poor guide for fighting poverty and empowering women.

This chapter is about how dominant ideas and approaches regarding ‘women in development’ reach the village level and their practices. It is about what shape they end up taking as they travel from top to the bottom. It is argued that ‘women in development’ projects and practitioners have brought rural women in the global grid of an ‘anti-politics machine’. The key argument here is that an effective momentum to fight poverty and empower women requires politicising the issue.

* This chapter has been approved as a Perspective/Argument Essay by the referee. It draws upon a chapter from the author’s forthcoming book Politics of Development in Pakistan.
** Dr. Haider Nizamani has a doctorate in Political Science and is based in Vancouver, Canada where he periodically teaches at the University of British Columbia and Simon Fraser University.
Introduction

Whilst in ordinary life every shopkeeper is very well able to distinguish between what somebody professes to be and what he really is, our historians have not yet won even this trivial insight. They take every epoch at its word and believe that everything it says and imagines about itself is true (Marx 1932).

What are the obstacles to women’s participation in Pakistan’s politics? No single paper can offer an adequate and holistic answer to this question because of the multidimensional nature of this issue. Usual explanations run on the following lines: 1) Dominance of patriarchal values limits women’s participation in public life and politics; 2) Gender segregation leaves little or no room for women in public space. Politics mirror society and in a society where women are invisible in public sphere, we cannot expect them to be at the forefront of politics; 3) Political-economy of statecraft in Pakistan is dominated by the Armed Forces, an institution which takes pride in masculine power. A combination of these factors, therefore, stacks the deck against women’s participation in politics.

The aim of this chapter is not to assess relative merits of these explanations. I ask, and try to critically answer, the following question: What has been the role of the ‘development’ sector and ‘development’ practitioners on the question of women and politics? Terms like ‘development’ sector and ‘civil society’ are used interchangeably here and always put in quotation marks because their definitions are contested.

By and large, the role of ‘development’ sector has been to depoliticise ideas and practices concerning women and politics. This assertion can appear oxymoronic when most civil society organisations (CSOs) and NGOs working in Pakistan have women empowerment as an integral part of their platform. The answer lies in the dominant development paradigm that has guided most practitioners from the 1990s onward.

The first section of this chapter attempts to clarify the notion of depoliticisation at work. I borrow heavily from James Ferguson’s (1994) book aptly titled The Anti-Politics Machine to clarify this theme. The second section focuses on the paradigm of ‘anti-politics machine’ in action at the grassroots level. It is based on a general account of ‘development’ projects and their sponsoring institutions in a village in Sindh as of 2011. The concluding section outlines salience of politics in the age of ‘anti-politics machine.’ I argue that ‘women in development’ projects and practitioners have brought rural women into the global grid of an ‘anti-politics machine’. My key argument is that an effective momentum to fight poverty and empower women requires politicising these issues. Bringing politics back in today’s twin discourses of ‘poverty alleviation’ and ‘women in development’ is imperative if the aim of the development interventions is to work towards a Pakistan where women are equal and empowered citizens. A real possibility of this paradigm shift, I must confess, is quite slim.

What this chapter is not: It is not about vilifying the ‘development’ sector for its questionable practices and lack of accountability and transparency. Nor is it about assessing the intentions of the ‘development’ managers who are accused of peddling the idea for personal gains. It is about how dominant ideas and approaches about ‘women in
development’ reach the village level and their practices. It is about what shape they end up taking as they travel from top to the bottom.

‘Development’ and Village Women: A Conceptual Lens
In rural areas across Pakistan, the word ‘NGO’ is not an abbreviation, rather a term with multiple meanings. For the villager, a non-governmental organisation aka ‘NGO’ implies arrival of a ‘development’ project that will possibly (albeit temporarily) employ some of them, particularly women; its arrival leads to the expectation of receiving goods, services, and information along lines decided by the higher-ups in the ‘NGO’. But ‘development’, as commonly understood by NGOs, remains as elusive today as it was ten years ago. It can, therefore, be safely assumed that the existing ‘development’ paradigm is a poor guide for fighting poverty and empowering women.

The village and its women remain ‘under-developed’, thus, providing a rationale to continue ‘development’ efforts. One main reason of ‘under-development’, according to the mainstream ‘development’ paradigm, is women not having power:

*The terms development, modernity and progress in the Imperial and Pakistani lexicon were politically and morally loaded and, crucially, were considered to be the domains of the state and its agenda* (Haines 2010, p. 3).

Nowadays, the state partners with international institutions and local ‘development’ organisations to bring ‘modernity’ to rural women. Practitioners of ‘development’ in Pakistan prefer to call themselves members of civil society. Like India, ‘civil society’ in Pakistan is used as:

.....a social sphere outside the state and market institutions, in which people come together, as equal rights-bearing citizens, on a voluntary basis, and may engage in deliberative action in addressing public problems (Harriss 2008, p.109).

Harriss (2008, p.123) observed in cases of Delhi, Bangalore, and Chennai that people from the middle class ‘dominate the sphere of civil and social associations including those organisations in which informal workers are mobilised.’ The preferred language of these organisations is of...

.....human rights rather than of citizenship, as well as service providers... (who) serve these people, rather than being of them...they seem to treat the people for whom they work as “denizens” rather than citizens—as people “to be done unto”, through “dispensing drops of charity” rather than as people endowed with the rights and responsibilities of citizenship (Harriss 2008, p. 124).

Why should it be a concern if ‘development’ organisations are dominated by people from the middle class? Harriss used Satish Deshpande’s (2003) work as the source to conceptualise the middle class who instead of empirical description of the middle class proposes…
...three hypothetical definitions: the middle class is the class that articulates the hegemony of the ruling block—in the sense both of giving voice to and of linking or connecting; it is the class that is most dependent on cultural capital; and it is an increasingly differentiated class—its elite fractions specialising in the production of ideologies and its mass fraction engaged in the exemplary consumption of these ideologies (Harriss 2008, p. 110).

A prominent feature of the world of ‘development’ is that the ‘middle class activists… tend to prefer technocratic, problem-solving approaches’ (Harriss 2008, p. 125). The result is not only that the problems relating to inequality and to power are evaded, but also that existing inequalities and the structures of power that sustain them are reproduced through developmental practices:

By uncompromisingly reducing poverty to a technical problem, and by promising technical solutions to the sufferings of powerless and oppressed people, the hegemonic problematic of ‘development’ is the principal means through which the problem of poverty is depoliticised (Ferguson 1994 cited in Harris 2008, pp. 4-5).

I concur with Breman and Das (2000, p. 19) that…

....the deprivation and degradation of the poor cannot be understood as the inevitable outcome of stagnation and backwardness. Their origins lie in the politics and policies of the development process itself.

As mentioned earlier, the conceptual lens used here to understand notion of women in ‘development’ and the politics surrounding it is significantly inspired by James Ferguson’s (1994) The Anti-Politics Machine, study of development projects in Lesotho. Ferguson argues (1994, p. xiv) that ‘development’ institutions generate their own forms of discourse, and this discourse simultaneously constructs Lesotho as a particular kind of object of knowledge, and creates a structure of knowledge around that object. Interventions are then organised in the name of that knowledge. What the ‘development’ apparatus does is create…

....an anti-politics machine, depoliticising everything it touches, everywhere whisking political realities out of sight, all the while performing, almost unnoticed, its own pre-eminentely political operation of expanding bureaucratic state power (Ibid., p. xv).

In scholarly literature on ‘development’, the word used has two quite distinct meanings. One, it is used to mean the process of transition or transformation towards a modern, capitalist, industrial economy. Two, much in vogue in the 1970s, defines it in terms of ‘quality of life’ and ‘standards of living’ and refers to the reduction of amelioration of poverty and material want.
Development is no longer a movement in history, but an activity, a social program, a war on poverty on a global scale (Ferguson 1994, p. 15).

In line with Ferguson (Ibid., p. 17), this chapter focuses not on the people who are to be ‘developed’ but on ‘the apparatus that is to do developing.’ Most rural development projects pre-suppose ‘picture of an isolated, backward, agricultural economy which stands to be completely transformed by some combination of technical inputs, new knowledge, and infrastructure’ (Ibid., p. 86). Conceptual apparatus of ‘development’ quite often systematically translates ‘all the ills and ailments of the country into simple, technical problems’ constituting ‘a suitable object for the apolitical, technical, “development” intervention’ (Ibid., p. 87). Lack of certain characteristics in society is often exaggerated to justify planned interventions.

‘Development’ Organisations and Projects in KKN, Sindh (2011)

‘Development’ industry is thriving in villages with the arrival of the ‘anti-politics machine’. The village in Sindh, Pakistan where I conducted research in 2008 and 2011 is named KKN and has a population of around 4,000, according to my field study. This section is a brief overview of various ‘development’ agencies currently working or those who have just concluded their projects in KKN. NGO is the generic term used for ‘development’ organisations in Pakistan in general, and in KKN in particular. The conception of a Non-Government Organisation (NGO) is of an agency that brings money for a specific project and remains active during the length of the project and often provides entry level jobs to men and women to select people of the village as per requirements of the project.

There is no permanent office of any ‘development’ organisation in KKN nor is there any government or non-government agency one can consult to get accurate and updated information about ‘development’ organisations and projects active at a given time in KKN. I had to rely on informal but in-depth conversations with four people in KKN who were well-versed in activities of NGOs to create a general profile of the state of ‘development’ agencies in KKN. More than half-a-dozen ‘development’ organisations were actively and directly working in the village in 2011. That, however, is not the whole story. Most of these organisations are, in a way, local faces of dozens of international donor agencies. In my conversations with KKN residents who are familiar with the work of ‘development’ organisations, NGOs in their parlance, I noticed they made extensive use of acronyms for organisations and their projects assuming I was familiar with organisations and projects under discussion. When I requested them to pause and spell out the organisation they were talking about, they often were at a loss for words because for them anyone interested in ‘development’ would know about these organisations. Later in this section, we will come across acronyms used by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) for its projects in Pakistan that are Urdu words with little relation to actual projects and have little connection with the US government’s agency. A possible reason could be to keep the US connection hidden or in the background as the public perception about the US’s role in the country is that of a power inclined to interfere with impunity in Pakistan’s internal affairs. The names of four organisations repeatedly cropped up as the most active in ‘development’ projects in KKN.
and surrounding villages. Each of these organisations, in turn, was directly or indirectly relying on a plethora of national and international organisations. The four organisations, namely, AMRDO, HANDS, SAFWCO, and NRSP, were cited as quite active in KKN.

AMRDO stands for Al-Mehran Rural Development Organisation and is the smallest of the four in terms of scope, staff, and its budget. I will discuss the AMRDO in detail in the subsequent section as I selected its annual report for a focused analysis. Mehran is one of the words used for river Indus in Sindhi language. AMRDO’s website accessed on 9 October 2010 mentioned seven organisations among its partners and clients. The word donor is now seldom used by ‘development’ organisations to describe sources of their funding. The list of AMRDO’s ‘partners and clients’ was an interesting mix of Pakistani and foreign government and non-government organisations. In 2009, eight of AMRDO’s fourteen projects were funded by Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF). The PPAF is sponsored by the Government of Pakistan with World Bank as the major source of its funding. AMRDO’s lists the PPAF as one its ‘clients’. Three Pakistani organisations funded one project each for AMRDO: Trust for Voluntary Organisations (TVO); Strengthening Participatory Organisation (SPO); and Orangi Pilot Project’s-Orangi Charitable Trust (OPP-OCT). OPP-OCT receives support in part from micro-loan programmes funded by the provincial government and called Sindh Rural Support Programme.\(^1\) ORIX Leasing Pakistan, which is a subsidiary of Japan’s leading integrated financial service company partnered with AMRDO to offer microloans to villagers. From Down Under, money from the Australian government’s aid programme in Pakistan made its way to AMRDO. Last but not the least, ASHA—Urdu or Hindi word for hope—which otherwise stands for American Schools and Hospitals Abroad is a USAID programme whose funds reached AMRDO.

SAFWCO (Sindh Agricultural and Forestry Workers Coordinating Organisation), formed in 1986 believes in participatory development and self-help to achieve the goal of sustainable development. In its 2009 Annual Report, SAFWCO acknowledged the following organisations for financial and technical support ‘to achieve the objectives of the organisation’ (SAFWCO Annual Report 2009, p. 5) The PPAF and the USAID are shared donors of the AMRDO and SAFWCO. Two UN agencies, namely, United Nations Development Program (UNDP) and United Nations Children’s Fund, formerly (1946–53) United Nations International Children’s Emergency Fund (UNICEF), along with Catholic Relief Services (CRS) made it to the list of SAFWCO donors. Oxfam GB (Oxford Committee for Famine Relief) formed in 1942 provides programme support to SAFWCO as does Oxfam NOVIB—a confederation of fourteen development agencies formed in 1994 when the Netherlands Organisation for International Development (NOVIB) joined Oxfam International. Agribusiness Support Fund (ASF) is also among ‘partners’ of SAFWCO. The ASF was established by the Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture & Livestock with the support of Asian Development Bank to provide ‘farmers, farmer groups, and entrepreneurs with demand-driven technical and managerial

services on a matching grant basis to improve their productivity, competitiveness and creditworthiness to access financing for their enterprises’ (ASF n.d.).

The National Rural Support Programme, better known as NRSP, was formed in 1991 with mandate to ‘alleviate poverty’ and claims to be working with more than half a million households in Pakistan. Some households in KKN, I was unable to ascertain the exact number, have received microloans offered by the NRSP. Strengthening Participatory Organisation (SPO), a national level development organisation, sponsored a project aimed at imparting training to members of Community Based Organisations (CBOs) of KKN for capacity building. In 2011, the SPO was assisting SHEEDO—Sindh Health and Development Organisation—in a programme titled, according to my informant, ‘Sexual Reproductive Health Rights’. The Aga Khan Foundation (AKF) programme on parental health trained Lady Health Workers (LHWs) and doctors as well as provided equipment to KKN’s Basic Health Unit (BHU), the public sector healthcare facility for the duration of the project where equipment like oxygen cylinders and incubators were in the village government healthcare unit for about two-and-a-half years from 2005 onward. Helping Hand, a US-based Muslim charity organisation supports orphans in schools of the KKN and surrounding villages by providing them school supplies as well as cash by way of financial assistance. It encourages school children of the area to participate in sports and provides sporting equipment. Known simply as Helping Hand in KKN, the organisation’s official name is Muslims for Humanity: Helping Hand for Relief and Development.

HANDS, Health & Nutrition Development Society, is among the most active ‘development’ agencies in KKN with a special focus on health and education. In 1979, a group of health professionals formed the voluntary organisation to help poor patients living in suburbs of Karachi by establishing a healthcare unit. It was formally registered as a non-profit organisation in 1993 and received funding for its first project in the following year from the Agha Khan Foundation. In 2011-12, it was managing 94 projects. HANDS’s first project in 1994 began with funding of PKR 3 million and in 2012 it was executing projects worth PKR 1740 million. In the last decade, HANDS run projects have directly benefited 4.2 million people living in 42,795 villages all over Pakistan (HANDS 2012, p.1). HANDS annual audit report gives indication of the sources of its funding for projects. HANDS counts Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction of Asian Development Bank among the list of its donors and is one of 85 ‘partner organisations’ of the World Bank funded and Government of Pakistan sponsored Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund. The US-based David Lucile & Packard Foundation’s goal in Pakistan is to ‘decrease early and unwanted fertility among young couples by improving access to family planning...safe abortion and post-abortion care.’ HANDS is the Foundation’s partner in Pakistan to achieve the above goal.

The USAID is a major partner of HANDS and names of its programmes are an interesting mix of English with unsuspecting Urdu acronyms. HANDS’s list three such

---

2 Editors’ Note: As of 1994-95: 1 US$ = PKR 30.45 on average.

3 Editors’ Note: As of 2012-13: 1 US$ = PKR 100 on average.
projects in the field of health where it partnered with the USAID. The acronyms of these projects were frequently referred by KKN development workers. One project was called PAIMAN, an Urdu word which can be translated as pledge, and it stood for ‘Pakistan Initiative for Mother and Newborn’. TACMIL for someone familiar in Urdu would mean completion, but in this case meant ‘Technical Assistance for Capacity Building in Midwifery, Information and Logistics’. FALAH in Urdu is betterment but the acronym of the USAID project is spelled out as ‘Family Advancement for Life and Health’. FALAH focuses on revitalising birth spacing for improved health of Pakistani mothers and children. It aims to ‘satisfy couples’ unmet need for family planning information, services and products.

In 2010, development workers in KKN listed at least eight on-going or completed projects in the village run by HANDS. Most of these programmes were in the area of community health. In one project, HANDS was encouraging the formation of a Health Management Committee (HMC) whose aim was to make the local Basic Health Unit (BHU) accountable to villagers. Another project was simply referred to by the village development workers as MCH and as per their understanding it was a mother child health awareness programme. HANDS also trained midwives in the village and extended micro credit facilities to Lady Health Workers (LHW). HANDS, in collaboration with district government, was running a Life Skill-Based Education (LSBE) aimed at imparting education about HIV at the local secondary school. Early Childhood Education (ECE) is another area where HANDS started classes for girls and boys separately. Teachers were hired from KKN for this programme and the ECE classes used facilities available at KKN schools. Under rubric of Early Childhood Development (ECD), HANDS ran, what it called, a parvarish (upbringing) centre on the lines of a daycare centre. The preschool and the daycare centre lasted for couple of years. HANDS forays into microfinance and apparently facilitated Khushhali (Prosperity) Bank’s micro credit scheme in KKN. Established in 2000 with initial funding from the Asian Development Bank, Khushhali Bank is Pakistan’s first licensed microfinance institution.

With dozens of ‘development’ projects and their funding sources ranging from Japanese leasing company to US government and corporate sector, KKN appears to be a laboratory of ‘development’ projects. The aim here is not to write what is commonly termed monitoring and evaluation of ‘development’ projects underway or just concluded in KKN. The purpose is to look at paradigms that guide ‘development’ organisations in their work and show how their discourse and practices of ‘women and development’ are located in general lexicon of ‘development studies’. This is not, as I argue, merely a sign of intellectual dependence. Intellectual dependence, in part, emanates from financial dependence of the local NGOs on international donors. A look at the acknowledged sources of funding in the annual reports of few NGOs working in KKN will demonstrate that the ‘development’ activities aimed at empowering women in the village are part of the global grid of development paradigm. Finally, for illustrative purposes we will carefully look at a final report of the project undertaken by a local NGO in which KKN was a locale.
Let’s Empower Women and ‘Develop’ the Village: A Woman’s Story

The story narrated here is taken from the annual report of a grassroots level NGO and shows at work the dominant ‘development’ paradigm concerning empowering women. The annual report of the AMRDO provides a template which the sector uses for ‘rural development’ and ‘empowering’ the poor and disadvantaged women. The AMRDO report quotes the case of a 40 old mother of four whose husband is a daily-labourer as an example of success of their microfinance scheme. The lady in question was a homemaker relying mainly on her husband’s average monthly income of PKR 3000 ($30). Then she met the AMRDO credit officer who was ‘advocating a credit program in the neighborhood. She came to know that the loan will be paid back in monthly instalments and proper utilisation of the loan would make it possible to repay the loan and make profit. AMRDO representative convinced her to borrow money and start selling clothes and bangles from her home. She received PKR 10,000 ($100) loan, whose interest rate and amortization period are not mentioned in the AMRDO annual report, and went to Hyderabad (about 60 KMs from her residence) to buy unstitched clothes and bangles. After deducting expenses and loan repayment instalment, she saved PKR 1,000 ($10) in the first week. After six months in the business, the woman was having net savings of PKR 3000 ($30) to PKR 4000 ($40) per month. AMRDO extended her another loan of PKR 12,000 ($120) after she had successfully paid off the first loan.

Such stories are common in reports of organisations that deal in microfinance schemes and extend loans to women. Small success stories of such individuals serve as postcards for promoting and justifying microfinance as the best way to ameliorate poverty and empower women. But a closer look at postcard stories of microfinance raises questions about the whole process. Let us unpack figures of the illustrative case. A woman without any business experience starts her home-based business of selling clothes and bangles on borrowed money of PKR 10,000 ($100). In the very first week, her net profit is PKR 1,000 ($10) and from there onward her net profit ranges from PKR 3,000 to PKR 4,000 ($30-40) per month. Even if we take the lower figure for the net profit, the lady in question had earned a whopping PKR 36000 ($360) in the first year on the initial start-up capital of PKR 10,000 ($100). Almost quadrupling the investment in the first year with net profit of 360% is bordering on incredulity. I asked several established small and medium size retailers in KKN as well as nearby towns about the likelihood of accruing such profit and they uniformly laughed at such a suggestion. Undeterred by cautionary tales of established retailers, I asked a few bankers about the likelihood of such profit margins in the clothing business. The bankers were of the view that the net profit of tripling the investment in span of a year is not the basis on which the banking sector operates. When established retailers and bankers are unable to explain the profit margins claimed by the AMRDO report it is only fair to ask how an illiterate woman went to Hyderabad and negotiated deals with cloth and bangle merchants that led to such astronomical profits? Breakdown of her expenses remains unclear. The AMRDO report does not mention the interest rate it charges on microfinance loans. I gathered in my informal conversations with recipients of micro loans that the annual interest rates on loans hovered around 20% or more.
The seemingly fair and transparent process of microfinance to impoverished villagers, especially women, in practice comes with strict social, economic, and psychological conditions that make it impossible for the borrower to default. Contrary to the claim of being a democratic and participatory process, the model from its inception is based on unequal power relations between the lender and the borrower. Women borrowers are treated as customers who are asked to form a group, which in turn works as social collateral for the individual borrower. Although not mentioned in the AMRDO document, my research suggests most microloans are amortized for a one-year period and payable with interest in twelve equal instalments. That arrangement puts heavy burden on the borrower who has to arrange for the first instalment the very month in which funds are disbursed. The borrower usually takes money out from the principal to pay the first instalment. The report assumes based on the questionable case of the woman making unrealistic annual profit equivalent to three-and-a-half times the amount she borrowed that most women borrowers would be making enough profit to pay high interest rates amortized over a short span as well as other expenses and still making enough money to lift themselves from poverty. The economic viability of microcredit in villages like KKN becomes more questionable when we factor in limited mobility of a woman borrower, both as a buyer of products as well as seller of goods or services. Any product that needs to be bought from the wholesaler in Hyderabad, or other town, requires physically travelling to a male dominated market place where women, particularly if she happens to be an impoverished illiterate lady from a village, buyers are seldom seen doing business. Our microcredit borrower would often rely on male members of her family to buy goods from the wholesale market. Additionally, the small amount at her disposal does not give her advantage of discounts available to bulk buyers. In all likelihood, she would be buying the product at retail or near retail rate and bringing back to the village for re-sale. As a seller, her actual customers are other economically poor women of the village. With interest rates in access of 20% and other expenses incurred she has to sell clothes and bangles at 30% margin to break even. To triple her investment in a year one can only imagine how unaffordable and unrealistic her asking rate would be for goods she is selling. The whole cycle becomes akin to an impoverished woman selling products to other impoverished women at rates that far exceed those in open market at the village and town levels. Interestingly, the overemphasis on financial viability of microcredit programmes leaves little room to assess social and political aspects of the whole enterprise. Politics is admittedly not mentioned in reports promoting microcredit and positive social aspects of microfinance for borrowers, especially women, are assumed rather than critically established. KKN has been an experimental ground of several microfinance loan schemes. Still, I was unable to find a success story of a female or a male establishing a viable business with borrowed money from the microcredit amount. Most of these loans, as Rahman (1999) found out in the case of Grameen Bank loans, are used to meet consumptive or emergency needs of the impoverished family and are recycled to keep the borrowers in good standing.

The section on microfinance in the AMRDO report concludes by stating that in 2003, the AMRDO began offering small loans to 30 ‘clients’ and by the end of 2007 the number of ‘clients’ had reached 8,000 which speaks of AMRDO’s commitment to ‘economic sustainability.’ Whether or not recipients of microfinance loans have actually become
economically sustainable, appears slim, since it is obvious that organisations in chain of ‘development’ industry have progressed well providing higher and middle-level managers economic opportunities and enabling them to climb up the social ladder.

Microcredit or microfinance is the reigning mantra to empower women and eradicate poverty amongst economically poor and socially disadvantaged classes of urban and rural poor. It is ‘small amounts of collateral-free institutional loans extended to jointly liable group members for self-employment’ (Rahman 1999, p. ix). In its current incarnation, microcredit as a model to alleviate poverty was pioneered by Bangladesh’s Grameen Bank in the mid-1970s whose founder Muhammad Yunus was awarded the Nobel Prize for his efforts. Some conclusions of Rahman’s (1999) study of the impact of lending practices of the Grameen Bank on women are appropriate not only for microfinance model as applied in KKN but his challenging of certain myths about practices and impacts of microloans on women empowerment have relevance in the Pakistani case too.

We know that the loan is extended to a group of women on projects that are patently individual. The amortization period is usually twelve months to be paid back in twelve instalments. The AMRDO report does not provide details whether the loan is extended simultaneously to all members of a group or sequentially. In the Grameen model, it was extended sequentially where two members of a group receive the loans and if they have kept up with payments for a month or two then the another pair of borrowers receive the loan, thus, the group ensures continuation of the cycle. The whole group works as collateral for individual loans so there is constant pressure on every member to make repayments on time. In the Grameen model, the stated aim of ‘group lending’ was to provide members with vital information, develop leadership skills, and build solidarity among the poorest sections of the society. The AMRDO report also alludes to such aims.

In my conversations with KKN women, I wanted to assess whether microloans were economically empowering borrowers and consumers of those goods, who are mostly poor women, and leading to solidarity among them. To gauge economic empowerment my line of enquiry was on the following lines: a. To determine longevity of businesses started with microloans and how they have fared compared to home-based businesses started without microloans from ‘development’ organisations. b. Ascertain whether businesses that started with a microloan have managed to grow into an outlet that can compete with established businesses in the village in the same sector; and c. To get some idea how consumers rate microloan business in comparison to other businesses selling similar goods. The account offered here is based on conversations with people in KKN as no statistical data was available to answer these questions. Microloans are extended to start home-based retail businesses often selling clothes or snacks or help women in providing services, for example tailoring of clothes, in more efficient ways. Established outlets in KKN selling groceries and other consumer goods do not consider businesses started with microlon as a challenge. Interestingly, most shop owners or their employees were not even aware that such businesses were being funded by ‘development’ organisations. As for borrowers, I did not come across sterling financial success like the woman mentioned in the AMRDO report who made 360% profit in the first year. None of the women in different neighbourhoods of KKN who are known for selling candies and other snacks from their tin-boxes are in business because of
microloans by ‘development’ organisations. From the consumers’ vantage point, entrepreneurs who started home-based businesses do not offer competitive prices. The reason most likely has to do with high borrowing costs and higher prices these women pay to buy goods from the market. Based on information gathered in KKN, I can claim that microfinance is a financially doubtful venture for the poor women and it certainly does not offer cheaper option for them as consumers. The model does little to build solidarity among women who are organised in borrowing groups or others who are not organised but serve as their customer base. The organised group, especially its leader, are primarily concerned about arranging timely payment of monthly instalments contributing more towards social friction than solidarity among borrowers. As the model dictates the group responsible for the repayment, a member who misses payment because the business is not doing well or the funds were diverted to meet health emergency or any social obligation has to face additional pressure from group members along with dealing with the health and social issues.

Champions of microcredit model seldom inform us that the whole edifice is based on ‘imposing systems of collective responsibility for debt repayments that can imprison rather than liberate’ (Harvey 2012, p. 21). Borrowers are expected, in fact required, to sell at high margins to repay debt extended at interest rate of 18% or more. When the microcredit schemes in countries like Pakistan are funded by international institutions such as the World Bank, the borrowers directly paying back to international lenders and multinational and national corporations gain access to the massive aggregate market constituted by the 2 billion people living on less than $2 a day (Harvey 2012, p. 21). Harvey’s (2012, p. 21) observation is spot on that the market of the...

...“bottom billion” is to be penetrated on behalf of big business by constructing elaborate networks of sales people (chiefly women) linked through a marketing chain from multinational warehouses to street vendors.

Bring Politics Back In

The empty defense of development must be left to the bureaucrats of the development apparatus and those who support it, such as, the military and (not all of) corporations (Escobar 1995, p.217).

Efforts to empower women have assumed centre plank of ‘development’ agencies and strategies. ‘Development’ projects and practitioners have done and are doing their part to bring rural women, as examples cited above show, into the global grid of the ‘anti-politics machine’. Women villagers are directly and indirectly interacting with and co-opted in this machine whose levers lie outside the boundaries of the village. The world of ‘development’ and its reigning paradigms regarding health, education, micro-finance, human rights, and governance are brought to the village both as ideas and practices mainly through local foot-soldiers of ‘development’. However, inequality is one of the defining features of the relationship between the woman to be developed, and village level ‘development’ worker, on the one hand, and managers of NGOs on the other. Women are expected to organise in small groups and cooperatives, but rules of the group formation are devised by the ‘development’ elite. Women are extended loans in paltry
amounts and conditions so strident that borrowers are chiefly preoccupied with arranging timely payment of loan instalments and the illusion of wealth creation is realised only in project reports that are written to fulfil requirements of donors.

Women, particularly poor women, become objects of ‘development’ subjected to expert knowledge and management. The management of women becomes a rationale for interventions in education, health, hygiene, morality, and employment and the instilment of good habits of associations, savings, child-rearing, and so on.

A look at the areas where ‘development’ organisations focus shows ‘development’ agencies often dabble in marginal sectors like the goods and services sector of the village economy, while conveniently bypassing the established market and vendors of the village and its attendant relations with suppliers and brings the poorest women into the market as sellers and consumers of goods. They do not bother with education or try to fix the deteriorating public school system and are content with either applying band-aid solutions like providing periodic relief (uniforms and satchels) to female students or by establishing a separate school. Same is the case when it comes to health sector. Publicly funded health units are dismissed as dysfunctional and answer is often sought in creating parallel health structures based on funds by donor agencies which are ultimately transferred, at the end of the project period, to the local community for running. Like schools, whose fortunes decline with the withdrawal of ‘development’ money, health units meet the same fate leaving behind debris of ‘development’.

Agents of ‘development’ often unwittingly, teach women how to become docile and willing participants in the neoliberal economic order. Subjects — the women—on their end are expected to play the part of quiet and willing consumers of ‘development’ projects. They attend meetings, form committees, borrow and return money, get vaccinated, draw charts; in short, do what is necessary in the process. Women of the village have little say in deciding and determining aims and objectives or means of the projects. They have to subscribe to methods devised elsewhere. The technical language of ‘development’ and organisational forms hardly resonate with people’s needs or priorities. The common perception of women in villages is that the ‘development’ project and goods and services provided under it are temporary, therefore, it is better to accept what is on offer without much fuss. Future of ‘development’ is secure as are jobs of the people associated with the projects. The same, however, cannot be said of objects of development, namely the rural women.

‘Development’ projects claim to be apolitical in nature, and this leads to a fundamental contradiction in the role ‘development agencies’ are intended to play:

*One the one hand, they are supposed to bring about “social change,” sometimes of a dramatic and far-reaching sort. At the same time, they are not supposed to “get involved in politics”—and in fact have a strong de-politicising function. But any real effort at “social change” cannot help but have powerful political implications, which a “development project” is constitutionally unfit to deal with. To do what it is set up to do (bring about socio-economic*
transformations), a “development” project must attempt what it is set up not be able to do (involve itself in political struggles) (Ferguson 1994, p. 226).

‘Development’ practices and the paradigm guiding interventions in women’s lives mainly ends up being a project aimed at smoothening some rough edges of existing unequal political, economic, and social structures and institutions. It seldom calls into question political and economic structures that dis-empower vast segments of population, including women. The paradigm trains people in its ranks to teach ordinary women how to live with the system rather than engage and encourage them to challenge and change the grossly unequal economic, political, and social structures. Arundhati Roy’s polemical assertion succinctly captures limits of the dominant ‘development’ paradigms when it comes to women empowerment:

Real political resistance offers no such short cuts. The NGO-isation of politics threatens to turn resistance into a well-mannered, reasonable, salaried, 9-to-5 job with a few perks thrown in. Real resistance has real consequences. And no salary (Roy 2004).
References


Is Gender Equality Possible in the 21st Century? Remedies for Slow Pace of Progress in Pakistan and India*
Nathalène Reynolds**

Abstract
In the aftermath of the Second World War (1939-1945), the French, and Western society more broadly, were shocked and surprised, to discover Simone de Beauvoir’s *The Second Sex* (1949). The author wrote in the opening lines of the second volume:

One is not born, but rather becomes, a woman. No biological, psychological or economic fate determines the figure that the human female presents in society; it is civilisation as a whole that produces this creature, intermediate between male and eunuch, which is described as feminine. Only the intervention of someone else can establish an individual, and as an Other (Beauvoir 1956, p. 273).

Were Western societies, similar to conservative segments of today’s Second and Third Worlds, moved by a language that questioned the order to which they themselves had adhered to? Were men as a group worried by an impending challenge to the authority which until then they were enjoying alone? More prosaically, nothing suggested that sharing of public space and privilege of controlling its resources would put men – already facing sharp competition – into difficulty. Here, partly concealed beneath the surface, is what still concerns the male-dominated societies of the world, and, at least in part, what explains the difficulty in improving the conditions of women.

There is, of course, abundant literature that deals with the gender issue; no one can contest its inclusion as a proper object of study for human sciences any longer. The author hastens to note, to pre-empt criticism, that this is by no means a trivial comment; for long there simply was no gender issue. With the rise of secularism in the West, social order succeeded to Divine Order; both took it for granted that each sex had its ‘natural’ role. One will no doubt recall the term ‘suffragette’, employed to describe (female) activists who demanded the right to vote. In response, not only male but also female voices retorted that their efforts were useless, or even ridiculous, since (male) democracy was performing the task asked of it well, namely that of assuring the ‘universal common good’. As for the Second and Third Worlds, the issue was usually dodged, since women obtained the right to vote when the colonisers left. In many places, as illustrated in certain parts of Pakistan, they still exercise this right with parsimony; but the condition of women has remained relatively unchanged.

It is a matter, throughout this chapter, to keep in mind international resolutions, in particular the United Nations Millennium Development Goals (adopted in 2000). In addition, we wish to look at the various aspects of equality, notably political, but also economic and social problems. It will also be relevant to attempt a comparative study of, on the one hand, Western indicators, and, on the other, those in India and Pakistan. We will, thus, come to formulate recommendations which would permit, if not attaining genuine equality, then at least a path that would lead towards such a goal.

---

* This chapter has been approved as a Perspective/Argument Essay by the referee.
** Dr. Nathalène Reynolds has a doctorate in History of International Relations from the University of Panthéon-Sorbonne, Paris, France. Presently, she is a Visiting Fellow at the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Pakistan, and a member of the Peace-Keeping Operations Network of the University of Laval in Montreal.
Introduction

Faced with abundant and varied literature dealing with the female condition around the world, to propose a fresh analysis of genuine interest is something of a challenge. In taking this path, the researcher – whose concern is not fame alone – may consider a part of the objective to have been achieved if he or she avoids falling into the trap of simply repeating the numerous common positions that have taken on the aspect of inescapable truths. Have gender studies, which detractors long endeavoured to deny the status of a social science, become victim of their own success? Or did the brazen political instrumentalisation of the discipline in the aftermath of the 11 September 2001 attacks and the American decision to engage in hostilities, notably in Afghanistan, obstruct any constructive reflection? What stirs up the debate even more is that each citizen of the world has a strong opinion - often expressed in a learned tone - on male and female roles. And many of them can debate the subject for hours and hours, implicitly claiming their own expertise.

The female sex, well before the appearance of monotheist religions, constituted an ‘issue’, the ramifications of which, even today, cannot be fully understood, especially since many women remain imprisoned in feudal societies, and within families, clans or tribes, whether these be religion or non-religion based political constructs. The academic is privileged in enjoying both methodological tools and the time needed to observe the changes in relations between men and women – the most radical of which have been quite recent from a historical perspective. Is it a matter of the biological role that nature gave to women, source of life, while men wanted the link with their descendants to pass principally or solely through them, ignoring the undeniable female ‘contribution’? Which readings have been – and are – made of religious texts, the sacred texts? Temporal power represented – and represents still today – the key to relations that, notwithstanding the screen offered on the one hand by religions, and on the other by couples and families remains conflictual rather than harmonious. Is this not the case of male and female universes, each of which is criss-crossed with tensions?

Analysis of the status that has been imposed on women across the centuries of which we are the heirs and heiresses, represents a special case, not least due to the fact that much of the role – and workload – of women is played out on the stage set by the family structure. This, and society as a whole, tends to resist changes that would, while allowing a better development of human and natural resources, also bring about a profound alteration to a social order that offers stability in the face of an uncertain future. Notwithstanding

---

1 Operation Enduring Freedom (October 2001) on Afghan soil constituted, in the first place, reprisals against the Taliban regime that had offered shelter to Osama Bin Laden, and hosted a range of ‘Islamist terrorists’ who sought to broaden their area of action. Washington, nonetheless, tried to justify this intervention (others termed it an invasion) ideologically, with the objective of securing the support of the populations of industrialised nations. The poor condition of Muslim women was, thus a useful theme; despite a slight whiff of neo-colonialism it helped rhetorically to emphasise the superiority of Western civilisation.
conscious national and international policies, one may wager without risk that many inequalities that mark the relations between men and women will be with us for much more time to come, especially (but not only, as illustrated by the challenges to women’s advancement in the West) in the Third World.

In the work presented here, it appears important to begin by looking at how success in politics of a few women tends to distract attention away from the condition of ordinary women. These ‘chosen few’ perpetuate a number of myths surrounding the lives of women. Little concerned by their ‘sisters’, they seek first of all to avoid any confrontation with a political world that remains marked by historical prejudices from which they too suffer.

The author will analyse gender, drawing in particular on the work of two French intellectuals, the philosopher Simone de Beauvoir and the sociologist Pierre Bourdieu. The gender issue has recently become a factor in theoretical debates, gaining in academic respectability as a discipline worthy of interest. Beyond the examination of resolutions adopted by international bodies – including the MDGs\(^2\), it will look at not only political, but also social and economic equality: progress towards which appears very slow. The chapter will also undertake a comparative study of, on the one hand, Western European indicators pertaining to Sustainable Development Goals, and, on the other, those of India and Pakistan. Keeping the post-2015 development agenda in mind, it will formulate recommendations to promote the establishment of an acceptable ‘equality’, even as female voices struggle to make themselves heard in such diverse domains as the socio-political, the economic and the environmental.

**Women and Politics: Some Case Studies**

**A Necessary Digression**

It seems important to begin by what may appear, at first, to be a digression– the question of women in politics. We will take the case of France which, despite its liberal republican values, has resisted the promotion of women to senior-most political positions. We will, then, consider briefly two female leaders who have captured the imagination of women of the sub-continent without, however, having seriously tried to modify the condition of women: the former Indian Prime Minister, late Indira Gandhi, and her Pakistani counterpart, late Benazir Bhutto, daughters of two charismatic statesmen.

One can see that in the ‘North’ as much as in the ‘South’, prominent women whose social position would have enabled them to challenge an unfair system have often remained complicit. In such circumstances, one cannot be surprised that many of the international conventions that deal with the position of women have struggled to give the intended results. About 17 months – at the time of writing – from the deadline fixed for the

\(^2\) Note that the MDGs were adopted in September 2000, about a year before the events of 11 September 2001.
MDGs, one must ask whether such objectives were not set in order to give an ‘international community’ that was trying to show it carried a good conscience when faced with a complex political, economic and social environment.

The Case of Europe

In an evocatively titled article, ‘A Woman for All Seasons’, the German journalist Clemens Wergin celebrates overhearing an eight-year-old girl travelling with her mother in the Berlin U-Bahn who asked whether it was possible that Germany could have a male Chancellor (Wergin 2013). Wergin revels in the knowledge that his own daughters aged seven and ten were growing up in such an atmosphere. They had seen no example but that of a government led, since 2005, by Angela Merkel.

Older Europeans remember the example of two Prime Ministers: Britain’s Margaret Thatcher, who enjoyed a particularly long term in office (1979-1990) and Edith Cresson, the only French woman to hold the post of Prime Minister, albeit for a rather short period (15 May 1991 until 2 April 1992). One tended to ascribe virility to the former in a nonetheless flattering term, the ‘Iron Lady’. It was implied – even if in a satirical puppet broadcast, the Bébête show (the word is derived from ‘bête’, or ‘stupid’) that aimed to take a humorous look at French political life – that the latter had a sexual relationship with François Mitterrand, President of the Republic, which explained her ‘promotion’. Men – and women – who claimed to be faithful to the ideals of the Left and to support the then socialist government happily backed this ‘explanation’. Few worried about this denigration of a woman, moreover a symbol for women in general, reducing her to a base biological and social role. Perplexed, French women wondered about the possibility. They were used to seeing such social phenomena through a misogynist prism. The capacity of women to equal men, at least in certain fields, was implicitly put in question. An old reflex, perhaps, that one could not take seriously a woman who had reached the top of the ‘greasy pole’, since she had ‘evidently’ used arms only her sex possessed to get there.

Cresson, who was 57 years old at the time, did not match what were deemed the standards of beauty (gossipers criticised Mitterrand for having made such a poor choice, notwithstanding the fact he was 75 years old and was not himself an Adonis!). Whatever the case, many gladly linked, on the one hand, an ‘inadequate’ physical appearance and, on the other, defective moral and intellectual qualities. France prided itself on its revolutionary legacy of which, ‘liberty, equality and fraternity’ was the motto. Yet, it was not ready to welcome into one of its highest posts a woman who had enjoyed a remarkable career in the academic world and in politics and had no little charisma; many preferred to underline a style qualified as ‘brutal’. Men of all political leanings wanted to keep a male bastion out of the reach of women. Ten months later, the Prime Minister –

---

3 This phrase, which appeared shortly after the collapse of the bloc led by the Soviet Union, is – at last – the object of debate in the West itself.
4 Inequalities in Germany remain blatant as Wergin illustrates, even if this anecdote suggests that the future for women may be brighter.
Is Gender Equality Possible in the 21st Century? Remedies for Slow Pace of Progress in Pakistan and India

uniquely in the history of the country – stepped down from her position, ‘amidst cat-calls, dumped by François Mitterrand’ who ‘had chosen her against everyone else’s opinion’, to be ‘attacked by her friends in the PS (Parti socialiste [Socialist Party]), lynched by the press and maimed by the Bébête show’ (Schemla 1993, p. 15).

The lesson had been learned: women, without explicitly acknowledging it, looked on the senior-most positions with caution. More recently, in 2007, the Socialist Ségolène Royal decided to stand for president. She fought using, at least in part, the weapons of the patriarchy. Before launching her campaign, she chose to undergo at least one (possibly several; this is supposed) extensive cosmetic surgery procedures, having, in particular, her teeth straightened. Royal, a mother of four children, whom, she implied, had been raised by her and her then partner, François Hollande, alone without the aid of home helps or nannies, sought to portray herself as an accomplished woman, wife and mother. Despite her 54 years of age, she projected – without embarrassment – a PR-friendly image of a young-looking, slim body; the very image that plagues the lives of many other women in the West and in many developing countries.

Seduced by the candidacy of a woman (the first in the history of the country to qualify for the second, run-off election), few voices spoke up against the perpetuation of an illusion. In effect, the consumer society – of which women remain the commercial target of choice – had skilfully instrumentalised the incomplete struggle for feminism. Without a ‘good’ birth, financial means, as well as family support, it would scarcely be possible for any women to lead – successfully – both a family and a career, especially not in politics. The path chosen by Royal met the requirements of the dominant patriarchal ideology that expected women to forge an exceptional life. All this was injurious to women in general, left to soldier on through the drudge of their daily lives.

The Indian and Pakistani Cases

The sexist reflexes of many male French politicians on the benches of parliament have recently been revealed and condemned. They do not hesitate, for example, to comment out loud on the physical appearance and dress of their female colleagues, especially when the latter rise to take the floor. In contrast to the French case, South Asia looks at first sight rather better off, since it remains attached to long-standing social practices, at least in public life. Such, at least, is the impression gleaned by the novice, innocent to the ways of the corridors of power. In reality, political circles seem to be a reflection of the societies from which they are derived. To the traditional roles that are the cadence of lives and the relations between the genders, are added in South Asia a recent traumatising

---

5 In taking the decision to nominate Cresson, Mitterrand intended to leave his mark on history. This was a risky gamble since her predecessors (Laurent Fabius and Michel Rocard) were against taking the risk of hoping a woman would succeed in managing a tricky economic situation, when they themselves had been obliged to step down. Note that by virtue of the 1958 Constitution (that instituted the Fifth Republic), the Prime Minister is in effect forever on an ‘ejector seat’. He or she is blamed for the government’s negative results, in order to maintain the President’s national stature intact. Given the crisis in France, this ‘safety valve’ has even more difficulties to function.
Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow

history that was for long muted. In the limited space available, we will simply underline that the events of the Partition, in which the female body was a contested object, left a lasting mark on dominant collective mentalities. As women who survived the terror enclosed themselves in silence, men tended to have an ever more exaggerated sense of honour; mothers, wives, sisters and daughters were required to be its repository, and thus to be guarded jealously.

The career course of South Asian women politicians has rarely been straightforward. And Benazir Bhutto represents an emblematic case in this field as we will see below. We will make reference only to the Indian and Pakistani cases. The author has lived on a number of occasions in these two countries, conducting fieldwork there, while her knowledge of Bangladesh, Bhutan, Nepal and Sri Lanka is insufficient to attempt an analysis worthy of attention.

The rise to power and courage shown by two Prime Ministers, Indira Gandhi (19 November 1917-31 October 1984) in India, and Benazir Bhutto (21 June 1953-27 December 2007) in Pakistan are remarkable. As for their tragic (in the Shakespearean sense) deaths and their choice not to hide from the threat of assassination that both knew hung over them, they cast a positive light on administrations that were marked by murky intrigue and corruption – in much the same way as those of their predecessors and successors. Dare we, indeed, draw attention to the fact that, having been destined to spend their lives in the shadows rather than the limelight, it was the deaths of individuals close to them (father or husband) that was to give them the legitimacy to rise to the very summit? In referring to South Asia, Kamla Bhasin (2006, p. 11) judged that:

...when some women do assume important political positions (Sirimavo Bandaranaike, Indira Gandhi, Benazir Bhutto, Khaleda Zia), they do so, at least initially, because of their association with some strong male political personalities, and they function within the structures and principles laid down by men. In spite of being the only region in the world that has had so many

---

6 Two works of particular note appeared in 1998: that of Ritu Menon and Kamla Bhasin eloquently titled Borders & Boundaries: Women in India's Partition; and The Other Side of Silence: Voices from the Partition of India, respectively, a set of witness accounts patiently collected and analysed by Urvashi Butalia.

7 Rumour had it that the Prime Minister was ill-prepared to work in an essentially male world, in which men sought to put her in embarrassing positions, not least by scratching their groin in front of her. The reader may choose whether to be shocked by this remark, or rather by the behaviour itself.

8 Gandhi’s assassination followed the recapture of the Golden Temple in Amritsar through Operation Blue Star, in which – to simplify – a Sikh separatist movement had been holed up. To note that she had refused shortly before her death to change the composition of her personal security detail, traditionally made up of Sikhs. The murder of Benazir Bhutto took place when she was campaigning for the legislative elections in 2007. It remains the subject of much speculation (and various legal proceedings). Was the killing carried out by the Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP, Taliban Movement of Pakistan), a movement which denied involvement? Or was President General Pervez Musharraf alarmed at the return to the country of a formidable adversary?
women heads of state, the percentage of women in parliament has never and nowhere been more than ten per cent, in South Asia.

Indira Gandhi, like her daughter-in-law, Sonia, did not remarry after the death of her husband; indeed she is not known to have had romantic relations thereafter. On the eve of her first mandate, Benazir Bhutto, single until then, did what her position as a young woman required of her: she chose an arranged marriage. She emphasised that despite her opposition to such a practice, she had dedicated her life to political struggle and, therefore, lacked the time to find a husband. She had placed herself in her mother’s hands; this in itself, she doubtless hoped, was a tacit demonstration of culturally appropriate modesty. She tried to protect her future by marrying a businessman little known in political circles, Asif Ali Zardari, who, she wrongly believed, would be happy to stay out of the limelight. Already 35 years of age, Bhutto was in a hurry to show that she was also taking on the responsibility of motherhood. She broke, it is true, certain taboos by campaigning while pregnant, but time was indeed against her. She spoke to the New York Times of how her fear of ‘male prejudice’ pushed her into certain choices. She made implicit reference to the opposition raised by her mother, who would have preferred that her elder son, Mir Murtaza, preside over the fate of the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) that had been founded by her late husband, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. She added:

...once my father died, I knew the day would come when, like all feudal families, they’d lock up the daughter so that the son takes over (Kamm 1994).

The South Asian political world, still bearing the imprint of male domination, qualifies ‘Mrs’ Gandhi and ‘Mohtarma’ (Respected) Benazir Bhutto as ‘exceptional’. These women, apart from occasional electoral compulsion, scarcely sought to mould a better destiny for women. Such a contribution was all too necessary. Social indicators in South Asia – we will look at them in more detail in the third part of this work – show not just alarming inequalities between men and women, but also serious attacks against the human rights of women.

---

9 Jawaharlal Nehru was Prime Minister of India from its independence (15 August 1947) until his death (27 May 1964). He had doubts as to the skills of his daughter, who remained devoted to him throughout his life. At his side, she acquired rich political experience, rubbing shoulders with the good and the great. Nehru himself did not remarry after being widowed. Indira Gandhi was twice Prime Minister, from January 1966 to March 1977 and then from January 1980 until her murder in October 1984.

10 Bhutto held the post of Prime Minister on two occasions, from November 1988 to October 1990 and from October 1993 until November 1996.

11 Was the qualification ‘exceptional’ intended to pay homage? Or did it rather imply that the female electorate should be satisfied by these few remarkable cases? Considering the difficult career path of women, in spite of their possession of education and experience, one may speak of a ‘glass ceiling’ that keeps them in ‘their place’.
Some Theoretical Considerations

Choice of Methodological Tools
It is worth exploring, drawing notably on the work of Simone de Beauvoir and Pierre Bourdieu, various methodological approaches. Some may question this choice. The former uses a cutting language that can, still today, shock some Western circles attached to gender roles. One can, therefore, imagine the reaction in traditional groups elsewhere in the world.

Beauvoir wrote *The Second Sex* (1949) in a particular context: that of a post-war France that was trying to rebuild employing limited means, albeit means that would appear significant if compared with those available to many states today. As the MDGs illustrate, simple subsistence and the eradication of hunger remain crucial issues. States often lack the means to offer an education of quality to all. Those who enjoy, within their family, a ‘dominant’ position – men and boys – absorb whatever resources are available, while women and girls are deprived. Women empowerment in such a context makes little sense, other than to satisfy the wishes of donors, generally from the West, who, moreover, impose an inappropriate interpretative framework. In addition to such issues, one must consider the political, social, cultural and even religious context; hence the necessity of listening to researchers and observers from a given region. In this section, we will limit ourselves to looking at the nation-state, a historical, political and social construction that offers no place of importance to female actors.

A Theoretical Approach to Gender
In 1949, a young woman born into an upper-class French family that had fallen on hard times published a work whose striking title – *The Second Sex* – contained two propositions: that men and women were sexualised beings, an assertion that, more often than not, was only implicitly acknowledged when talking of the female gender; and that women, the subject of the book, had an inferior status. Simone de Beauvoir denounced a social practice, based – wrongly in her view – on the biological differences between men and women, which allowed the former to boast of their virility, while the latter had been inculcated from an early age with a sense of shame about their bodies. The philosopher wrote:

*Woman? Very simple, say the fanciers of simple formulas: she is a womb, an ovary; she is a female – this word is sufficient to define her. In the mouth of a man, the epithet female has the sound of an insult, yet he is not ashamed of his animal nature; on the contrary, he is proud if someone says of him: ‘He is a male!’ The term female is derogatory not because it emphasises woman’s animality but because it imprisons her in her sex; and if this sex seems to man*

12 The works of Simone de Beauvoir and Pierre Bourdieu are extremely rich in content. Beauvoir’s *The Second Sex* was first published in 1949; in 1956 its English translation was published. The available space is insufficient to illustrate the argument fully.
too contemptible and inimical even in harmless dumb animals, it is evidently because of the uneasy hostility stirred up in him by woman (Beauvoir 1956, p. 33).

It should be recalled that at the time Western Europe was scarcely used to such words. Its population, in line with the political commitments of the age, believed that the betterment of the standard of living would allow men and women an improved ‘human condition’. Women, even if they harboured a mute resentment at the workload required of them and the limitations that society placed upon them in comparison to the freedoms enjoyed by men, decided that that was simply the way things were. And moreover, was it not the case that wives and mothers attained a respectable place ‘in exchange’ for their sacrifices?

However, France, of which Beauvoir was a citizen, had in a sense opened Pandora’s box when it had allowed young women access to higher education that had long been the reserve of their male counterparts. As for the use of contraception in Western Europe and the demand for the right to abortion, they would lead to a re-examination of the role of women. Beauvoir formed part of a lineage of Western feminism that at the time was still taking its first, hesitant steps. Her contribution challenged the long-standing order of things and raised issues that remain pertinent to this day - whatever our geographical location. She declared that:

One is not born, but rather becomes, a woman. No biological, psychological or economic fate determines the figure that the human female presents in society; it is civilisation as a whole that produces this creature, intermediate between male and eunuch, which is described as feminine. Only the intervention of someone else can establish an individual as an Other (Ibid., p. 273).

In 1998, Pierre Bourdieu, following the publication of his study Masculine Domination, would take this argument further when he emphasised the existence of ‘an embodied social programme of perception’ that applied to ‘all the things of the world and firstly to the body itself in its biological reality’ (Bourdieu 2001, p. 11). Such a programme constructed...

...the difference between the biological sexes in conformity with the principles of a mythic vision of the world rooted in the arbitrary relationship of

13 For more than a century, females were not allowed to sit the French baccalaureat examination (equivalent to A-level) used to select the elite. It had been introduced during the First Empire (1804-1815). The Camille Sée Law of 1880 and the Bérard Decree of 1924 unified the male and female baccalaureats, even though the system continued to target a very small elite. The proportion of successful candidates who were female increased quickly, from 6% in 1914 to 36% by the eve of the Second World War. By the start of the 1960s, there were as many female as male passes (Chaperon 2007, p. 3). Lest it be forgotten, French women only got the right to vote in 1945.
domination of men over women, itself inscribed, with the division of labour, in the reality of the social order (Ibid.).

The sociologist added that:

I say that the idea of masculinity is one of the last refuges of the identity of the dominated classes [...] it’s characteristic of people who have little to fall back on except their labour-power and sometimes their fighting strength (Fowler 1999).

In reading this analysis, one thinks of the evils (conjugal violence, rapes, and ‘crimes of honour’) that the sub-continent now dares to address publicly. The work done by non-government organisations (NGOs) and researchers cannot be ignored. Are we to see a fresh rise in these abuses as a result of the increase in the number of women in public life? Or are such women more ready to speak out?

Women, too, are Actors in National History

In considering the high mortality rates of women in childbirth in developing countries, one must first recall what many feminists have already underlined – a female tragedy is essentially under male management. This line of thought argues that if men were suffering from such a phenomenon, the United Nations and the ‘international community’ would have rapidly taken such matters in their hands for an immediate solution. One may, in any case, think of the wars of which men are the central actors, and of the official commemorations that they continue to inspire.14

As the Women’s Liberation Movement (MLF) was taking its first steps on the French political stage, some women militants decided in August 1970 to target the symbol. At the time, there was no commemoration in France; this small group aimed to support the strike movement led by American women.15 Armed with banners, they placed a wreath on the tomb of the unknown soldier.16 Two slogans were chosen: ‘One man in two is a woman’ and ‘One thing is even more unknown than the unknown soldier – his wife.’ The torch of the unknown soldier, located under the prestigious Arc de Triomphe in Paris, is relit every evening. The place…

14 The resources spent on the arms race, quite apart from the danger the latter represents to the planet, should be emphasised. Pakistan and India boast of their nuclear status, but poverty continues to undermine the two societies.
15 The National Organisation for Women (NOW) thus sought to respond to the worrying anti-feminist attacks. The context was peculiar: women had ‘made the right to abortion a central demand of their movement’, since they believed ‘that they would never be equal to men as long as they did not control their reproductive life’ (Parti Socialiste de Lutte 2013).
16 Since 11 November 1920, a French soldier, whose identity remains unknown, has been the symbol of all those who died during the first modern war in history – the First World War – that saw slaughter on an unimagined scale.
...embodies a particular vision of History, male, national, martial and popular, from which women are radically excluded (Chaperon 2007, p. 4).17

Pakistan and India, occupied with the imperatives of building the nation-state, fit into this historical, political and social construction. The objective of the young states, born in 1947, was two-fold: to give a ‘natural’ priority to men, builders of new nations; and to draw a line under their collective incapacity, during the partition, to live up to the traditional male role, that is to say the protection of the female sex. A legacy of the foundations of the colonial state, the two countries granted equal citizenship rights to men and women, including such important points as the right to vote and equal rights of access to education. As for the dramatic events of the partition, it was left to historians and writers to explore them. No one evoked the dramatic female ‘contribution’ to the birth of the two nations. Incidentally, rape was long considered an ‘established practice’ that victims ought to have known how to avoid. It was only on 20 June 2008 that the Security Council adopted a resolution that qualified rape as:

...a tactic of war to humiliate, dominate, instil fear in, disperse and/or forcibly relocate civilian members of a community or ethnic group18 (United Nations 2008).

Similarly, one tolerated the social rejection or even murder19 of victims by members of their family keen to ‘cleanse’ their honour or avoid a possible sullying of their ‘race’.

Menon and Bhasin (2007) rightly underline the need for a re-writing of history from a feminist perspective. They argue that:

Women’s history... has a dual goal: to restore women to history and to restore our history to women. The aim of the enterprise is to ‘make women a focus of enquiry, a subject of the story, an agent of the narrative’; in other words, to construct women as a historical subject and through this construction, disabuse us of the notion that the history of women is the same as the history of men, that

17 It is only very recently that François Hollande, France’s President coming from the Socialist movement, spoke of the necessity that the Pantheon, the archetypal republican monument, also hold the remains of women, about whom the national history, at least that taught in schools, has been silent. We have become – unconsciously – used to the adage engraved on the imposing edifice that reads: ‘A Nation Grateful to its Great Men’.

18 Rape may now be considered ‘a threat to international security’. The Bosnian conflict (1992-5), during which more than 20,000 women suffered this horror, marked the start of the criminalisation in international law of ‘systematic rape’ (UNICEF 1996). The ‘international community’ had already been moved by such tragic events as the Rwandan genocide (6 April – 4 July 1994). For the first time, the International Criminal Tribunal for ex-Yugoslavia employed the terms ‘torture’ and ‘crime against humanity’ to qualify the nightmare that these women had gone through.

19 Should one, indeed, talk of murders or suicides of women and girls who were ‘encouraged’ to jump into a well? Reading Urvashi Butalia’s work (1998) suggests that the latter practice was widespread within the Sikh community.
significant turning points in history have the same impact for one sex as for the other (Ibid. pp. 8-9).

Did Pakistan experience greater difficulties in dealing with the legacy of partition? Or was it that after the death of the Quaid-e-Azam (Great Leader), Muhammad Ali Jinnah, on 11 September 1948, and then the assassination of Prime Minister Liaquat Ali Khan on 16 October 1951, the country had no more charismatic leaders that could have, for a time, been the symbol of the State – whose very borders augured ill for its balance. It is widely known that Jinnah, during a speech at the Muslim University of Aligarh on 10 March 1944, declared that:

No nation can rise to the height of glory unless your women are side by side with you; we are victims of evil customs. It is a crime against humanity that our women are shut up within the four walls of the houses as prisoners. There is no sanction anywhere for the deplorable condition in which our women have to live (Encyclopaedia of Women’s History 1994).

However, Jinnah, the first Governor General of Pakistan, scarcely had the time to put this plan into action. Anxious to rally people around the creation of Pakistan, he let it drop, and it was thus the Objectives Resolution that prevailed. Adopted on 12 March 1949, the Aims and Objectives of the Constitution was conceived to combine the principles of Western democracy with the injunctions of Islam:

The Objectives Resolution proclaimed the following principles: Sovereignty belongs to alone but He has delegated it to the State of Pakistan through its people for being exercised within the limits prescribed by Him as a sacred trust (Ghazali 1999, pp. 1-2).

There followed the period in power of General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq (July 1977 - August 1988) who would cement the role of women into that of the repository of a strictly male honour which will be discussed later. For the time being, we will simply add that following the American Operation ‘Enduring Freedom’ in Afghanistan (October 2011), the task of Pakistani civil society became – and remains – more difficult. As the Moroccan sociologist, Fatima Mernissi (1991, p.), writes:

Delving into memory, slipping into the past, is an activity that these days is closely supervised, especially for Muslim women.

---

20 The Resolution provided in paragraphs 2, 3 and 4 that: ‘2. The State shall exercise its powers and authority through the chosen representatives of the people. 3. The principles of democracy, freedom, equality, tolerance and social justice, as enunciated by Islam, shall be fully observed. 4. Muslims shall be enabled to order their lives in the individual and collective spheres in accordance with the teachings of Islam as set out in the Qur'an and Sunnah. [...] 7. Fundamental rights shall be guaranteed’ (Ghazali 1999).
Difficulty of Promoting Gender Equality and Empowering Women

Important Dates in the Promotion of Gender Equality

Before looking briefly at the content of the MDGs (in the light of promotion of gender equality and women empowerment – goal 3 of MDGs), it seems important to mention the key international agreements and declarations that aim to improve the condition of women around the world. These efforts have not only tried to extend the benefits of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights adopted on 10 December 1948 to a significant part of the world’s population – indeed half of it. They were also predicated on a more immediate concern: the benefits of the advances in health care translated into an alarming increase in the world’s population. Women of reproductive age might be encouraged to claim their rights as inscribed in the Universal Declaration, thus becoming more and more reluctant to go through the repeated pregnancies that patriarchy dominated societies impose upon them. They would be keen to take up contraceptives that were now available to them.

In December 1979, the United Nations General Assembly adopted the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW):

CEDAW is often referred to as the Women’s Convention because, unlike conference declarations, it sets legally-binding principles and standards for realizing women’s rights (UNFPA 2008).

In September 1994, in Cairo, 179 states adopted the Programme of Action (POA) during the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD). One year later, representatives of 189 states agreed on the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action during the Fourth World Conference on Women (FWCW). What was at the time not yet described in short-hand as the ‘international community’ not only underlined its commitment with regard to the equality of the sexes, but also – and perhaps first and foremost to development, judged necessary since it was synonymous with peace and security in the world.

---

21 It is perhaps unnecessary to recall that the term ‘man’ made - and makes - reference to a humankind that for long tended to give primacy to the masculine.

22 International hypocrisy cannot be denied. Allies of the United States, such as Saudi Arabia, are free to limit women in a subordinate position. A topical example is how the condition of women in Pakistan attracts the world’s attention and pity. Simplifications abound, as illustrated by the recent interest in the terrible attack suffered by the young Malala Yusufzai on 9 October 2012. Miraculously saved by the Western medicine to which she had the chance to have access, she now presents herself as a sort of muse of female empowerment. The Western media, in propagating what Ms Yusufzai herself describes as a campaign, neglect two important dimensions. Many Pakistani women advocate the need for gender equality, even risking their own safety to do so. In addition, there are a number of Pakistani women (including Pashtuns, the ethnic group to which Malala belongs) who follow a programme of regular schooling and go on to university. One should not confuse social conservatism and Taliban ideology.
In the wake of the CEDAW, another convention grew to prominence, the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), which was to become ‘the most widely and rapidly ratified human rights treaty in history’ (Ibid.).

> It was drafted over the course of 10 years (1979-1989) with the input of representatives from all societies, all religions and all cultures. Ratification formally binds governments to meet the obligations and responsibilities outlined in the Convention. It includes protection of children from early and forced marriage, recognition of adulthood as 18 years, [and] rights to education (Ibid.).

At the start of 2000, the United Nations General Assembly adopted the United Nations Millennium Declaration. At the dawn of the new millennium, it reaffirmed its ‘faith in the Organization and its Charter as indispensable foundations of a more peaceful, prosperous and just world’ (United Nations 2013a). The resolution declared its attachment to ‘human dignity, equality and equity at the global level.’ The state signatories emphasised their duty towards the vulnerable, especially children who represent the future. They were particularly concerned by the fate of the 1.1 billion human beings (30% of whom were children) who were living on less than one dollar a day (Ibid.). In the future, human rights and dignity were to be inextricably linked to a standard of living that would be considered their surrogate.

**MDGs Generous but Utopian for Pakistan and India**

The MDGs contain eight proposals that are no doubt worth listing since they appear – at least in retrospect today in the light of world events – generous but utopian. These objectives were (and remain, since the rapidly approaching deadline falls at the end of 2015) to:

(i) and thus ‘halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day’;

(ii) Achieve universal primary education;

---

23 The ‘international community’ reaffirmed its commitment with regard to the MDGs during intermediary meetings (cf. The 2005 World Summit High-level Plenary Meeting of the 60th Session of the General Assembly, 2008 High-level Event on the MDGs, 2010 Summit on the Millennium Development Goals). In 2010, the United Nations Summit on the Millennium Development Goals adopted a ‘global action plan to achieve the eight anti-poverty goals by their 2015 target date’ (United Nations 2010). The summit emphasised that the ‘Global Strategy for Women’s and Children’s Health’ could save ‘the lives of more than 16 million women and children, preventing 33 million unwanted pregnancies, protecting 120 million children from pneumonia and 88 million children from stunting due to malnutrition, advancing the control of deadly diseases such as malaria and HIV/AIDS, and ensuring access for women and children to quality health facilities and skilled health workers’ (Ibid.).

24 Only a brief overview is provided here. The interested reader may refer to the following document: UNICEF 2012.
(iii) Promote gender equality and empower women by eliminating ‘gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015’;
(iv) Reduce child mortality;
(v) Improve maternal health;
(vi) Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases;
(vii) Ensure environmental sustainability; and finally
(viii) Develop a global partnership for development (United Nations 2013a).

The order in which these objectives are presented is not inconsequential. The promotion of gender equality and women’s empowerment are placed in third position. The signatories were, thus, of the view that it was on the achievement of this objective that depended progress on those that followed. The debate will go on: it is easy to reply that at the very least, balanced nutrition, improved maternal health, access to contraception, and the fight against disease constitute necessary pre-conditions for improving the lot of women. More cynically, one must ask whether it was simply a matter of ‘paying lip-service’ for states that have been and remain generally led by men, men eager to ensure they have male heirs, to stress their concern at the pitiful fate of women, especially in the Third World.

The MDGs, nonetheless, have the merit of uniting the member states of the United Nations around a common project, reminding them of their primary duty. The governments drawn from the elite that had taken over from the colonial powers in many Third World countries often abstained from modifying the social structures in place at the time of their independence. This allowed leaders to perpetuate the authority they enjoyed in political, economic, social and sometimes even religious terms – amounting in some contexts to what might be termed feudal power. In parallel to the structures that the new elites had put in place, number of other groupings of various sizes and roles also remained in place (temples, mosques or churches, panchayats/jirgas etc. in the subcontinent). One may add of course that various actors, such as religious leaders, landowners and other notables still exercise considerable influence on the political realm. Incidentally, Indians and Pakistanis have but moderate confidence in their state; in parts of those countries, the level of dissatisfaction is such as to call into question the state’s very legitimacy; to paraphrase Weber (1994), authority is legitimate when those

25 The term ‘panchayat’ is composed of the word ‘ayat’ (assembly) and ‘panch’ (five); the panchayat was made up of respected elders (originally five in number) chosen by the community and whose arbitration was recognised. What is considered the oldest form of government in the sub-continent was taken over by the Indian and Pakistani states after independence. Since 1992, India, through the gram (village) panchayats, organises the elections of male and female representatives at the level of the village (even if the panchayat can represent more than a single village), the janpad (block) and zila (district). Note also the existence of the khap (caste) panchayat. For its part, Pakistan has both a jirga and a panchayat system whose members are men. The former is an assembly through which tribes take decisions pertaining to their affairs. Note that the recent creation in Swat of a female jirga, known as the Khwaindo Tolana (‘Sister’s Group’), that aims to struggle against a system that safeguards male interests.
governed adhere to the State. He describes three forms of authority operating in modern societies: traditional, charismatic or legal-rational, which, in practice, overlap26 (Ibid. p.312).

It is also relevant to underline the dialectic of change and tradition. The past continues to confer an identity on numerous social groups across the Third World. Moreover, it permits a ‘visible continuity in the maintenance of traditional forms which... provide the necessary foundations for the functioning and legitimation of new powers’ (Le Gennec-Coppens and Parkin 1998, p. 12). Of course, the state claims for itself the bureaucratic model, attempting to minimise ‘the role of customary chiefs’ in order to maximise that of its own agents. Its influence extends to the most isolated areas of its territory. In this way, ‘little by little, traditional relations based on kinship, clientelism and commerce are transformed’ (Ibid.). However, national and local state employees, even if they draw their authority from the position the state accords them, are often from a social background that demands respect. They, thus, ‘possess a double authority, one personal and the other institutional.’ They must in turn ‘fulfil two sets of demands, pleasing the members of the local community and obeying... the higher authority’ (Ibid.).

In the Indian and Pakistani cases we are looking at here, a pyramidal social structure represents an additional dimension, in which social class is muddled up with caste.

Reading between the Lines
The Millennium Development Goals Report published by the United Nations (2013b) summarises the situation in developing countries. First of all, we would like to examine certain indicators that allow one a statistical overview of India and Pakistan; these may be compared with figures for France and Germany. We will make but scant reference to the report mentioned above, since it deals mainly at the level of broader regions rather than individual states.

The report endeavours to demonstrate progress made at the global level without upsetting national pride. In looking at the results, should we congratulate ourselves on what has been achieved since the base-line data from 1990? Or should we rather think that the member states of the General Assembly that are not always prompt in communicating reliable statistics, tend to manipulate them in order to please the global powers that be?

Of France’s population of 65.7 million (2012), 7.9% live in poverty if the threshold is placed at 50% of the median standard of living; the figure rises to 14.3% if the threshold is placed at 60% of the median income (Observatoire des inégalités [Inequality Observer] 2013). Germany uses the latter measure. Its population is 81.9 million (2012), and 16.1% of these are considered to be living in poverty (Mediapart 2013).

---

26 Ration-legal authority presupposes the strict application of legal rules; those who exercise such authority in the name of the state only do so as long as they are in a given post.
Some 32.7% of the Indian population – 1.24 billion – are living below the international poverty line placed at $1.25 per day while 68.7% live on less than $2 a day (World Bank 2010a). Pakistan declines to employ the standard World Bank statistical measure of poverty, but estimates based on the poverty headcount ratio suggest that 22.3% of the population (about 193 million, according to the latest figures) live below the poverty line (World Bank 2010c). The latter recently estimated that the ‘intensity of deprivation – that is the average percentage of deprivation experienced by people living in multidimensional poverty – in Pakistan was 53.4%’ (UNDP 2013, p. 5).27

One can imagine, of course, the insalubrious conditions in which this segment of the Indian and Pakistani population lives, as well as their poor access to health care and education. The statistic that women in these two countries have a life expectancy of two years more than their male counterparts – 67 years compared to 65 (World Bank 2013b) – does not count for much.28

Unfortunately, we lack the space to examine various other indicators that would allow a fuller evaluation of the situation in Pakistan and India. In this section, therefore, we will limit ourselves to an examination of the issues of fertility and maternal health, as well as the tenacity of the custom of child marriage. The fertility rate is 1.4 children per women in Germany, 2 in France, 2.5 in India and 3.3 in Pakistan (World Bank 2013d). The figures for India and Pakistan are thought-provoking: the population of these two countries remains in large majority rural – 31.3% of Indians and 36.2% of Pakistanis lived in urban areas in 2011 (CIA 2014a; CIA 2014b).

The maternal mortality rate in Germany is 7 per 100,000 live births and 8 in France (World Bank 2013c). The comparable figure remains much higher, both in India (200) and Pakistan (260). The Millennium Development Goals Report 2013 notes, however, that ‘globally, the maternal mortality ratio declined by 47% over the last two decades, from 400 maternal deaths per 100,000 live births to 210 between 1990 and 2010’ (United Nations 2013b, pp. 4-5). The UN, thus, welcomes the development that pregnant women are better supported. One may wonder whether the professionals tasked with such work are properly qualified. Do Pakistani Lady Health Workers or Indian Community Health Workers, notwithstanding the good will they display, receive adequate training? Do they have the necessary equipment to make basic diagnoses? Not so, in many cases.

The adolescent fertility rate in Germany is 5 per 1,000 females aged between 15 and 19 years, 7 in France, but 28 in Pakistan and 36 in India (World Bank 2013a). While the sub-continent tradition, in spite of the various laws in place29, accepts child marriage, in

---

27 The Millennium Development Goals Report 2013 (United Nations 2013b) estimates that ‘in developing regions, the proportion of people living on less than $1.25 a day fell from 47% in 1990 to 22% in 2010. About 700 million fewer people lived in conditions of extreme poverty in 2010 than in 1990’ (p. 4).
28 Female life expectancy at birth is 83 years in Germany and 85 in France; the corresponding figure for males is 78 years in both countries (Mediapart 2013).
29 Note that the Child Marriage Restraint Act was adopted as early as 1929.
Western Europe this is most often a marginal social problem: pragmatic governments try to avoid not by preaching abstinence\textsuperscript{30} but by promoting the use of contraception.\textsuperscript{31} As indicated in a Plan Asia Regional Office report published by the International Center for Research on Women (ICRW) at the beginning of 2013, ‘one-half of all girls affected by child marriage reside in South Asia’ (p. 7):

\textit{46 percent of children are married formally or in informal union before they are 18. Girls are significantly more likely than boys to be married as children – 30 percent of girls aged 15-19 years are currently married or in union in South Asia, compared to just 5 percent of boys in the same age bracket} (Ibid., p. 5).

According to a Peshawar-based Pakistani NGO, Blue Veins, the figures have advanced this year:

\textit{More than 60 million girls around the world were married under the age of 18 last year, out of which 24\% were from rural Pakistan and 18\% from urban areas} (The Express Tribune 2013).

Like India, Pakistan is a state party to the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The age of marriage in both countries should, therefore, have been raised from 16 to 18 years – both in law and in practice. India has also adopted the \textit{Prohibition of Child Marriage Act, 2006}. Civil society in the two countries lobby for change, but the political will is still missing. Indeed:

\textit{Customary laws, social norms and poverty-driven economic needs often trump national policies and legislation} (ICRW 2013, p. 5).

Children’s bodies, lest it be forgotten, are vulnerable to repeated pregnancies and similarly, the young ones are not in a position to care for newly born babies. Last but not least, the custom of early marriage further compromises the equal access of the genders to primary and secondary education.

\textsuperscript{30} It is not a matter of condemning or condoning this phenomenon, but simply of drawing attention to its existence. These adolescents, more often than not, become mothers following sexual relations with an adolescent from a similar age group. In passing, one may note that the state in Western Europe seeks, through a system of social security, to support them in order that the child be brought up in the best possible conditions. In the sub-continent, young married women are usually paired with older, if not to say over-aged, husbands.

\textsuperscript{31} The World Bank database offers no indication as to the level of use of contraception in the countries of interest to us. Basing oneself on the World Factbook’s older figures (2007-8), 27\% of Pakistani women and 54.8\% of their Indian counterparts used contraception (CIA 2014a; CIA 2014b).
Control of the Female Body in India and Pakistan

Another important indicator in judging the progress made in implementing genuine gender equality is the infant mortality rate. According to the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and Pacific (UNESCAP), which bases itself on figures published by the World Health Organization Global Health Observatory (WHO/GHO), the World Health Statistics and the UN MDG Indicators Database:

The under-five mortality rate (U5MR) in Asia and the Pacific was reduced from 86 per 1,000 live births in 1990 to 49 per 1,000 in 2009 (UNESCAP 2011).

Outside of Africa, two zones, notwithstanding some progress, remain of concern in terms of both infant mortality rate (IMR) and U5MR: South and South-West Asia:

The highest U5MR (likewise the highest IMR) is found in Afghanistan – a shocking 199 per 1,000 live births. This statistic stands in contrast to the three next highest, which are an order of magnitude below that of Afghanistan: Cambodia (88), Pakistan (87) and Bhutan (79) (Ibid.).

India, meanwhile, provides the backdrop for an alarming deficit in female children: 37 million. The 2001 census had already set alarm bells ringing, with only 933 women for every 1000 men and 927 girls for every 1000 boys (GOI 2011). Ten years on, this trend remains (943 women per 1000 men, 919 girls for every 1000 boys). Three states – which are among the most economically developed in the country, have the most skewed ratios: Haryana, Punjab and Gujarat (in descending order). Indeed, one may ask whether the reduction in the size of families has not pushed families into sex selection. Does the payment of the dowry, considered economically disastrous for many amongst the poorest, and a significant loss of capital for the wealthy, explain this phenomenon? In our view, one can but conclude that a society that was not accustomed to welcoming the birth of baby girls has pitilessly seized the tools of modernity to avoid them. The public authorities have taken few measures likely to reverse the trend. Doctors practising echography are not supposed to reveal the sex of the embryo to its parents.

Another phenomenon of concern is what looks very much like a strengthening of control of women’s bodies in India as much as in Pakistan. Could it be that patriarchy, worried

---

32 Nonetheless, numerous countries "are unlikely to achieve Millennium Development Goal 4 (MDG-4), which targets a two-thirds reduction in U5MR between 1990 and 2015" (UNESCAP 2011).

33 Trivedi and Timmons (2013) emphasise that the age cohort which is said to commit most acts of aggression against women has grown from 7 million in 1991 to 17 million in 2011. This explanation appears incomplete if one considers that a proportion of those recently found guilty of rape were married. Could it be that the visibility of women and their access to privileged professional positions has provoked resentment amongst men stuck in more ancillary positions? It is also worth noting that one body of opinion in Indian society – whose strength is difficult to gauge – deplores the trend for women to reveal more of their bodies, wearing tight clothing instead or the traditional shalwar and kurtas considered too short and too close to the body.
about retaining its privileges, has ‘regulated’ in this domain? The Islamic Republic of Pakistan took this course during the ‘reign’ of General Zia ul-Haq, raising customs that restrained women’s roles to the level of the law.\textsuperscript{34} The \textit{Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood Ordinance)}\textsuperscript{35}, promulgated in 1979, is an illustration of this till date. It has not been abrogated, despite the mobilisation efforts of civil society and some of the political class. The Ordinance targets those guilty of \textit{zina} (i.e. those who have voluntarily engaged in sexual intercourse outside of the legal framework of marriage – or \textit{nikah}). Under the terms of the Ordinance, stoning is the punishment for married women, while unmarried women suffer up to one hundred lashes and up to ten years in prison. The punishment has never been executed; judges impose a prison sentence on the woman alone, while the man accused generally escapes punishment with a simple denial.

Until the introduction of new legislation – The Protection of Women (Criminal Laws Amendment) Act, 2006 (Act VI of 2006) – during the period of rule of President Pervez Musharraf, female victims of rape, if they dared make a formal complaint, had to find four male witnesses of impeccable religious piety who had witnessed the act of penetration (GoP 2006).\textsuperscript{36} In addition, the Ordinance did not seek to distinguish between \textit{zina} (generally translated as ‘fornication’ or ‘adultery’) and \textit{zina-bil-jabr} (rape); children in puberty were considered legally responsible for their actions. The 2006 legislation raised the age of criminal responsibility to 16 years for girls and to 18 for boys (Ibid.).

As in Pakistan, India proclaims – in its constitution – its attachment to respect for the fundamental rights of the individual. In both countries, however, violations of the rights of women are frequent; the \textit{panchayats}, the \textit{khap panchayats} (in India) and the \textit{jirgas} (in Pakistan) continue to act as the guarantors of a patriarchal order that considers itself sovereign. These two societies, through families that can refer matters to these elected bodies, exercise an often strict control over the sexuality of their members, and caste or tribal endogamy remains the norm. So-called ‘crimes of honour’, both in Pakistan and in India, as well as other crimes such as acid attacks, constitute the ultimate ‘regulatory mechanism’.

\textsuperscript{34} Is it necessary to stress that Zia ul-Haq, employing a particular interpretation of Islam inspired by Saudi Wahabism, aimed to prevent any blossoming of civil society? Women were a principle target; legislation refused them protection, forcing them to limit their mobility in the public domain.

\textsuperscript{35} Hudood, plural form of \textit{Hadd} (limit or restriction), refers to the punishments applied to those who cross the line.

\textsuperscript{36} A further dimension is that the legislation questioned women’s full citizenship, since – following a disputed interpretation of the sacred text – the testimony of two women was equivalent to that of one man.
Conclusion and Recommendations

Conclusion

It is necessary, first of all, to congratulate the United Nations for the MDG initiative, and the particular emphasis it places on women. Of course, the international political and economic order remains inequitable. It dictates terms to developing countries, and compromises their economic, social and environmental balance. Unregulated development, the throwing open of borders to competition, creation of special economic zones that harm the economic and social balance of communities whose members could have lived on a modest income rather than being forced into an exodus from rural areas or even suicide; the latter phenomenon is of worrying proportions in parts of India. As for urbanisation, it cannot be considered synonymous of progress when one looks at the growth of shanty towns. If the MDGs advocate for the preservation of the environment, they contain little of practical use in this regard. They do, however, have the merit of drawing attention to different issues, in particular that of gender equality.

The Indian patriarchal order is marked by a hasty and highly damaging step: at least in urban areas, a significant number of couples envisage limiting their offspring to two males. Those women who do survive this ‘slaughter’ are, moreover, compelled to worry about their physical safety. Apart from the risk of rapid growth in the number of rapes, poor states such as West Bengal are the stage for another phenomenon that one might qualify as modern slavery. Poor men, coming from regions with a shortage of girls, purchase a woman who is shared amongst two or three brothers. And this ‘wife’ has the ‘duty’ of giving birth to male children. Such is the information provided to the author by a reliable female witness during a stay in Kolkata in 2011.

The West tends to believe that Indian women are better off than their Pakistani ‘sisters’. This appears to be based on erroneous analysis. The two states were once part of the same territorial entity and continue to suffer (along with Bangladesh) from similar problems, while individuals of different faiths can make use of their religion to justify repressive practices.

The sad condition of the majority of women in Pakistan has doubtless deteriorated for two reasons: the country has tried to maintain what it calls its ‘strategic depth’37 following the launching of the American Operation Enduring Freedom, supporting various Taliban movements in Afghanistan and Pakistan itself. As for Washington, since 2006, it has decided to make use of drones in order to attack Taliban targets sheltering in civilian areas. What is the motive of the Pakistani Taliban when they destroy girls’ schools? The acquisition of knowledge being synonymous with access to power, one must wonder whether this phenomenon does not reflect anxiety at the prospect of a future

---

37 Pakistan, whose attention remains at least in part focused on India, continues to be concerned by the aggressive designs of its neighbour. Afghanistan, in such a circumstances, would represent a ‘fall-back’ zone in the event of an attack from the larger neighbour, hence the necessity, for Pakistani strategists, of encouraging or even helping establish a friendly regime there.
in which men and women enjoy genuine equality. Are the Taliban afraid of the identity crisis that Western men face today?

This is doubtless a simplification of a complex reality; subordinate to a foreign power, free territories transformed into colonies underwent a rupture in their evolution. And it was often the colonising states which drew up the borders that remain in place today. The declarations of Indian and Pakistani independence occurred against a bloody backdrop; the two societies need to reflect on this publicly in order to mourn properly before moving towards the future. Without doubt they also have to, if not renounce completely, then at least challenge the nation-state model inherited from the colonial power, away from which the latter is gradually evolving. In this way, South Asian societies would consent to examine the imposition by men on women of an inferior status, making liberal use of the divine to justify the social edifice. Such an exercise would require a public revision of the interpretation of sacred texts that are instrumentalised by those promoting patriarchal values.

Recommendations

What should follow the MDGs in 2015 once the 15 years’ period is over? It is to be hoped that the member states of the United Nations continue their efforts? However, first and foremost, it will be a matter of reminding global political elites that they have a duty towards the society that they represent. With globalisation, the easy acquisition of wealth enjoyed by a section of the population and the race for privileges seem to have undermined the values that earlier motivated our leaders around the world. Female politicians, for their part, have responsibilities to live up to, rather than simply congratulating themselves on their success at having made it, unlike the great majority of women, to the top of the ‘greasy pole’. In India and Pakistan, to assume these responsibilities, they need to form at least one-third of the members of national assemblies, and political parties must work towards this.

While the Rajya Sabha (‘the House of States’ or upper house of the Indian Parliament) voted for the Women’s Reservation Bill, that, as in certain European countries such as France, allocates one-third of seats to women, the Lok Sabha (‘House of the People’ or lower house) continues to resist such a step. According to the Inter-Parliamentary Union, an international organisation working to promote democracy, in 2012 women made up 11% of parliamentarians of India’s lower house and 10.6% of the upper house (Interparliamentary Union 2014). The country is, thus, ranked 108th in the world.

Pakistan, in contrast, is ranked 68th, with 20.7% of female members of the lower house (the National Assembly), and 16.3% of the upper house (the Senate). It should, nonetheless, be underlined that this is thanks to a temporary measure that remains in place. Women are free to compete directly for the 272 seats in the 342-member National Assembly. Of the remaining seats, 60 are reserved for women and 10 for religious minorities. Nominations for these 70 seats are left to the discretion of political parties, which are able to name female (or minority) figures who can be relied upon not to put an essential male leadership in the shadow. In the same way, 17 of the 100 seats in the Senate are reserved for women.
The constitutions of India and Pakistan guarantee the protection of fundamental rights. Yet one should undoubtedly consider amending the articles relating to personal status that allow different religious leaders to challenge gender equality enshrined in the constitutions. Pakistan, for its part, should consider implementing a single judicial system, bringing an end to the parallel system of justice that was introduced in 1980 with the establishment of the Federal Shariat Court of Pakistan (FSC) and Shariat Appellate Bench of the Supreme Court. Such measures would permit the gradual elimination of discrimination. Similarly, states should consider penal measures against any form of patriarchal ideology, such as selective abortion, ‘crimes of honour’ or acid attacks. They also need to think about how to exercise strict control over the khap panchayats in India and the panchayats and jirgas in Pakistan, since their decisions threaten the dignity and even the lives of women.

Education, meanwhile, is a fundamental right. Improving the network of schools in India and Pakistan is necessary; it would allow female pupils to have access to establishments close to their homes. In addition, the two countries must ensure that teachers provide quality education allowing the quick acquisition of basic knowledge and skills. Parents often lack the resources to support their children’s schooling over many years. In isolation, such a change would not bring about, in the short-term, ‘a full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people’ (Target 1.B, United Nations 2013b, p. 13). Farming employment is the norm in the countryside where living conditions remain fragile, whereas the informal sector dominates in cities.

There remains another basic difficulty: the redistribution of wealth at the national level. The support enjoyed by movements such as Maoists in India or the Taliban in Pakistan would doubtless fade away very quickly, allowing the two genders to look constructively at the future. Would the Indian and Pakistani elites fulfil their role? Would they allow the population, which they intend to continue representing, to grasp a sovereignty which, at least in democratic theory, is their collective right?

---

38 In 2009, 23.1% of Indian males over the age of 15 years were illiterate, while the corresponding figure for females was 45.5%. The comparable statistics for Pakistan were 32.3% and 60.4% respectively (UNFPA 2009).
References


India,


Menon, R. and Bhasin, K. 2007, Borders & Boundaries. Women in India’s Partition, Kali for Women, New Delhi, India.


Women and Sustainable Mountain Development: An Illustration of Indigenous Adaptation to Climate Change in Himalaya*
Bhagwati Joshi and Prakash C. Tiwari**

Abstract
Due to adverse climatic condition in Himalaya brought about by global environmental changes, there have been severe impacts on subsistence agricultural economy, especially on livelihoods and food security. This phenomenon has forced large proportion of the adult male population to out-migrate in search of viable means of livelihoods making women responsible for taking care of all farm and off-farm activities. As a result, the burden of living under difficult conditions falls mainly on women, and they have become primary resource managers and a backbone of mountain agricultural economy.

During the recent past, population growth, rapid urbanisation, economic globalisation and improved access to markets have facilitated the exploitation of natural resources and land use changes resulting into ecological disruption and loss of ecosystem services. Furthermore, rapidly changing climatic phenomena are acting as an additional stressor on the Himalayan agro-ecological systems, given increased variability in rainfall pattern, making the poor and marginalised communities increasingly vulnerable to water, food and livelihood insecurity. However, due to socially constructed gender relations and ecological complexity of mountains, women experience these changes in different ways and in varying proportions, and respond to their impacts in complex and diverse manner. These women have been able to demonstrate their ability to adapt their agricultural resource utilisation practices to climate change using their indigenous knowledge and natural resource management know-how. This chapter aims at analysing rainfall variability in long-term perspective and examines its implications for water availability and food production. The chapter also looks at the responses and coping strategies evolved and used by local indigenous women to adapt their agricultural practices to increasing rainfall variability using an empirical case study carried out in Headwater of Kosi River located in Kumaon Himalaya, Uttarakhand, India.

* The chapter has been approved as a Research Report/Paper by the referee.
** Dr. Bhagwati Joshi is an Assistant Professor of Geography at Government Post Graduate College, Rudrapur, Uttarakhand, India. She is an environment and protected area management expert with experience of working in institutions of repute in India, Germany and Canada. Dr. Prakash C. Tiwari is a Professor of Geography at Kumaon University, Nainital, Uttarakhand, India. He is a mountain natural resource management and climate change adaptation specialist, and has worked with various institutions in India and abroad.
Introduction
In Himalaya, limitations of terrain and temperature restrict livelihood opportunities. As a result, subsistence crop farming and animal husbandry constitute the main source of livelihoods and food for a considerably large population living in rural areas even though agricultural land is scarce and agronomic production poor (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b; ICIMOD 2011; Maithani 1986). Nearly 75% population of the region depends for its livelihoods on merely 15% arable land which symbolises distress husbandry of land. This clearly indicates that people are practicing agriculture in highly compelling circumstances in the absence of other viable means of livelihoods (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b, 2012c). The conventional agro-ecosystem has transformed mainly in response to high population growth and consequent increased demand of agricultural resources, particularly land, water and forests, and improved access to markets during recent years (Tiwari and Joshi 2013a). Consequently, crucial agricultural resources have diminished and converted into waste and degraded lands across the region (Tiwari 2008; Sharma et al. 2007; Tiwari 2000). These land use changes have had unprecedented, adverse impacts on primary ecosystem services, particularly, water, biomass and soil-nutrients, and consequently, the region recorded considerable decline in agricultural productivity during the last 25 – 30 years (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a and 2012c; Tiwari 2008; Ives 1989). Furthermore, the rapidly changing climatic conditions are acting as additional stressors on conventional agricultural and food production system due to increasing mean annual temperatures and resulting retreat of glaciers, melting of ice and snow, rainfall variability and consequent disruptions in hydrological regimes, and mounting severity and frequency of climate change induced extreme weather events in Himalaya (Tiwari and Joshi 2013a; Tiwari and Joshi 2012c; Rawat 2009; IPCC 2007). Nevertheless, some glaciers, particularly in western parts of Hindu Kush Himalaya (HKH) are increasing in size or are at least stable (Scherler et al. 2011). Moreover, the pattern of Indian monsoon has changed during the last three decades which is resulting in acute rainfall variability, erratic precipitation, and decline in number of annual rainy-days (25%), and decreased rainfall (40%) and increased frequency and intensity of climate change induced extreme weather events in Himalaya (ICIMOD 2011; Tiwari 2010). These changes are disrupting the hydrological system of headwaters through increased run-off and reduced percolation of rainwater into the soil and consequent drying of perennial water sources (45%).

The hydrological disruptions in headwaters are, thus, undermining a variety of critical environmental services, particularly availability of freshwater for domestic and agricultural purposes and increasing community vulnerability to livelihood and food insecurity in vast lowlands where the large proportion of population is dependent on subsistence agriculture (Tiwari and Joshi 2013b; Tiwari 2010; Tiwari 2009; Singh and Bengtsson 2005). It has been estimated that these ecological disturbances in critical headwaters are likely to contribute towards decline of availability of drinking water (25%), irrigation capacity (15%), hydropower generation (21%) and food production (20%) both in the Himalayan mountains and their vast lowlands in South Asia (Tiwari 2009; Aase et al. 2009; Cline 2008). This study analyses rainfall variability in long-term perspective and examines its implications for water availability and food production. It also looks at the responses and coping strategies evolved and used by local indigenous women to adapt their agricultural practices to increasing rainfall variability using an
empirical case study carried out in Headwater of Kosi River located in Kumaon Himalaya, Uttarakhand, India.

Methodology
The variability in rainfall pattern was regarded as an important gauge of climate change in the present study since women of the mountainous region have been able to perceive changes in seasonal rainfall and its impacts on their agricultural system (Tiwari and Joshi 2013b). Rainfall variability was analysed by interpreting long-term rainfall data (Tiwari and Joshi 2012c). Detailed information about rainfall was also collected from meteorological stations located in the region and also from various other sources, such as meteorological reports and government documents. The impacts of rainfall variability on hydrological regimes of watersheds and water resources were assessed by the long-term on-site hydrological monitoring of water flow in streams and springs, through generation of relevant information pertaining to water availability and assessment of ecological condition and status of water resources (Tiwari 2011). Remote sensing techniques were employed for the survey and mapping of agricultural land use pattern and rural resource utilisation structure. Digital image processing techniques supported by on-screen recording was also used for the analysis (Ibid.). The results, thus, obtained were validated and supported by comprehensive field surveys and mapping techniques, and using participatory rural resource appraisal and management methods and tools (Tiwari and Joshi 2013b; Tiwari and Joshi 2012c; Tiwari 2011).

Detailed information with respect to irrigation potential, supply of compost/manure to farm-land; crop productivity; and availability, access, and utilisation of food were generated by conducting detailed households surveys in all 62 villages of the watershed. Specifically framed schedules and questionnaires were used for this purpose (Ibid.). Relevant data was also collected from different secondary sources that mainly included district and lower administrative level government departments. Intensive empirical studies were conducted in all the villages of Upper Kosi Catchment to analyse local women’s perception about changing climatic conditions, visualisation of their impacts on water resources and agricultural and food systems, and the coping mechanism they have evolved, and are using to respond to climate change (Ibid.). All 261 women headed households (out of total 643 households of the 62 villages of the study region) distributed in ten villages were included in the socio-economic surveys and empirical studies. As many as 587 women above the age of 18 years were surveyed (Ibid.).

The Study Area
The study was conducted in Upper Kosi Catchment situated in district Almora of newly carved Himalayan state of India. Upper Kosi Catchment constitutes the headwater of Kosi River which is one of the prominent rain-fed rivers of Uttarakhand (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a; Tiwari and Joshi 2012c). The Catchment extends across a geographical area of 107.94 km² (10794 ha) in the Lesser Himalaya between an altitudinal range 1425 and 2650 m from the mean sea level (msl) (Tiwari and Joshi 2012c).

District Almora is one of the 11 mountainous districts (out of the 13 districts of Uttarakhand, 11 are mountainous). The Catchment houses a total population of 16,080
persons scattered in 62 villages (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a). Due to constraints of high altitude and steep slopes, subsistence agriculture forms the principal basis of rural livelihoods (Tiwari and Joshi 2012c). Despite the fact that arable land is scarce and crop production considerably low, a large proportion of the population (75%) solely depends on this traditional, low productivity crop farming system in the absence of other viable opportunities of livelihoods (Ibid.). This is substantiated by the fact that nearly 90% agricultural land holdings are of less than one hectare resulting in consistently declining per capita availability of agricultural land (Ibid.). This hinders sustainable farm productivity in high mountain ecosystems (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a; Tiwari and Joshi 2012c). The constraints of subsistence agricultural economy compel large proportion of the adult male population to out-migrate in search of viable means of livelihoods making women responsible to take care of all farm and off-farm activities (Tiwari and Joshi 2012c).

**Traditional Agricultural and Food System**

As discussed in the preceding sections due to restraints of terrain and climate and resultant lack of other occupational opportunities, major percentage of the population has to depend on traditional forest based subsistence agriculture for its food and livelihoods (Tiwari 2008). Since, the availability of arable land is considerably low, productivity of agricultural system poor and size of land holdings tiny, cropping intensity is more than 150% in most villages of the Catchment (Pant 2000). In order to preserve soil fertility and productivity of land under sustained cropping, the biomass energy from adjoining forests, grasslands and pastures is transferred to the cultivated land (Tiwari 2008). The cattle population act as major pathway for the transfer of biomass energy from forests and pastures to agricultural terraces in the form of livestock labour and biomass manure (Figure 1) (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a). This clearly indicates that forests, livestock and agricultural land constitute the most critical components of Himalayan farming system in which forests are the most crucial for sustained food production for ensuring the input of adequate energy in the agro-ecosystem in the form of biomass (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a; Tiwari 2008; Ashish 1983). It has been estimated by Singh et al. (1984) that on an average ten units of forest energy is required for obtaining one unit of agricultural production in the traditional agricultural system in the Himalayan mountains.
In the Himalayan mountain ecosystem, food security is determined by local agricultural production and community food purchasing power as all villages face food deficit (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b). The level of food purchasing capacity of households primarily depends on availability of income generating opportunities within the village as well as outside (Aase et al. 2013; Tiwari and Joshi 2012a). In view of this, the region is likely to face food insecurity in near future as there are clear indications that agricultural production has declined by nearly 25% leading to a food deficit of approximately 65% (from local agricultural production) over the last 30 years (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b). This has been mainly due to depletion of critical agricultural resources and climate change (particularly changes in precipitation pattern) and resultant decline in agricultural productivity (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a and b; Rawat 2009). Further, it would be difficult to fill the food deficit gap in near future as the purchasing power of local people has declined due to loss of local livelihood opportunities in traditional forestry and agricultural sectors (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b). As mentioned earlier, low agricultural productivity results in high intensity cropping (Pant 2000), and increasing trends of out-migration of young male population (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b; Tiwari 2011; Hoermann and Kollmair 2008). This is likely to have long-term impact on local food security in terms of both its availability and access (Tiwari 2011). The declining food production is particularly affecting 75% of the poor and marginalised households (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b). This is expected to have severe impacts on ongoing development programmes including poverty reduction schemes, environmental conservation projects and even on climate change adaptation strategies in the entire region (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b; Tiwari 2011).
Changes in Rainfall Pattern and its Impact on Food Productivity

The analysis of rainfall data revealed that the annual number of rainy days have reduced from average 60 days to 50 days in the region during the last 30 years. As a result, the quantity of average annual rainfall has declined by about 25 cm during the same period. The increasing land use intensifications, shrinkage of vegetal cover and decline in the amount of annual rainfall have decreased groundwater recharge, disrupted the hydrological processes, and have depleted the perennial water sources in the entire region, particularly in densely populated up-slopes. Consequently, the water generating capacity of land to springs and streams has diminished resulting into acute freshwater crisis for drinking as well as for irrigation (Tiwari and Joshi 2013 a and c; Tiwari and Joshi 2012c; Tiwari 2000).

This has resulted in steady decline in water flow in streams and springs. For instance, the results of hydrological monitoring of Kosi River - the master stream or the main river of the Catchment – clearly indicated that the water discharge of the river had been declining continuously between 2001 and 2011 (Tiwari and Joshi 2011). More than 61% villages of the watershed have been facing severe water crisis particularly during dry winter and summer seasons affecting domestic sanitation and food production (Tiwari 2008). These hydrological changes have reduced the availability of water for irrigation and consequently declined the irrigation potential adversely affecting agricultural productivity (Tiwari and Joshi 2012c). Almost all the villages of the watershed have on an average lost 25% of their irrigation potential in terms of irrigated area primarily due to non-availability of adequate water in the springs and streams (Ibid.).

There has been considerable decline in agronomic production, and all the villages were facing annual food deficit ranging from 22% to 88% in 2012. As in other parts of Himalaya, fodder and fuel wood are the most critical resources for the rural population. The productivity of forest biomass have declined due to depletion and degradation of the forest ecosystem. As a result, the gap between demand and availability of fodder and fuel wood resources has increased respectively by 20% and 27% during last 30 years in the watershed.

Women and Subsistence Agricultural Economy

Geo-environmental constraints impose severe limitations on productivity of the agricultural system and have reduced the efficiency of infrastructural facilities and services in high mountains (Tiwari 2008). Agricultural production is enough to meet only 25% of annual food requirement. As a result, the male population has been migrating to plains and urban areas in search of livelihoods and employment leaving their families back in the mountains, and therefore responsibility of agricultural work, livestocks, collection of fodder and fuel wood, and fetching water from increasingly long distances besides taking care of children and elderly people in the family, falls on women. Women are, therefore, considered primary resource developers in Himalaya. However, only 27% women are educated and literate and school drop out rate among young girls is much higher as compared to males. Women, despite their important role as ‘primary resource developers’, are highly vulnerable to the impacts of climate change. This study found that women have to spend 5-6 hours per day to collect water which affects their
livelihoods, health and overall quality of life. In more than 95% households, women were solely responsible for bringing water for all domestic and agricultural purposes.

**Women’s Perception of Climate Change and Adaptation**

The study revealed that women have not only observed impacts of rainfall variability on the local agro-ecosystem (Table 1), but are also responding to the observed changes in rainfall and resultant depletion of water resources using their traditional resource management experience and indigenous knowledge (Tiwari 2010; Tiwari 2009). They reported increasing incidences of erratic rainfall as a major constraint for sustained agricultural productivity and food security in the region (Table 1 and 2).

**Table 1: Women’s Perception of Changing Climatic Conditions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Change Parameters</th>
<th>Women's Perception (% Women)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decline in rainfall</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decline in rainy days</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in erratic rainfall</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in high intensity rainfall</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in extreme weather events</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drying of water sources</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less water available for irrigation</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above changes are responsible for decline in crop production</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Household surveys.*
Table 2: Agricultural Constraints Perceived by Women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perception of Agricultural Constraints</th>
<th>Women’s Responses (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Erratic and less rainfall</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of irrigation</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour scarcity</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of improved seeds</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of extension services</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of fertilizer</td>
<td>02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Household surveys.*

The primary surveys conducted in 10 villages (out of total 62 villages of Upper Kosi Catchment) indicate that women, particularly female headed households (FHHs) of the region, have been using several adaptation measures (Table 3, Figures 1 and 2) to maintain minimum level of agricultural productivity under changing rainfall conditions.

Nearly 27% FHHs were replenishing their water sources by using water conservation, forestry and horticultural practices. About 19% were cultivating drought resistant crops, while 25% women cultivators sustainably managed depleting water resources by practicing locally effective rainwater collecting measures based on their traditional water resource management system (Figure 1). Nearly 21% FHHs had altered traditional cropping patterns and were practicing crop rotation. In order to increase food production, 11% had cultivated abandoned agricultural land and 27% had successfully relocated their farming through improved crop rotation.

7% had also started small businesses along the roadsides to buffer household income; while approximately 5% were also engaged in off-farm work, particularly in construction of buildings and roads, and worked for longer time to increase their food purchasing power. On the other hand, some FHHs had reduced consumption of less productive and expensive food-crops such as lentils, rice, non-local vegetables and sugar; and instead consumed locally grown millets which require less water, and wild vegetables and fruits. 11% FHHs had also decreased about 25% of their daily consumption of food-grains, with nearly 21% reducing their milk consumption, opting to sell it instead, in the local markets. About 5% agriculturally marginalised FHHs had out-migrated and settled with relatives in other parts of the country.
Table 3: Adaptive Measures being used by Women to Rainfall Variability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Villages</th>
<th>Total Households</th>
<th>Women Headed Households</th>
<th>% Women Households Practicing Adaptive Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rainwater Harvesting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kantali</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bheta</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilori</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chanoli</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dhalaur</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hatyura</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kverali</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lod</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lewsal</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mala</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>643</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Household surveys.

Figure 1: Traditional Rainwater Conservation Ponds on Agricultural Land

Photo credit: Authors.
Conclusion

Rapidly changing monsoon patterns and resultant depletion of water resources have stressed the Himalayan agricultural and food systems. Consequently, agricultural productivity has declined steadily and significantly increasing the overall food deficit. Local people, particularly women, are experimenting with several kinds of cropping techniques and coping mechanisms to adapt their food systems to changing climatic conditions. The coping responses evolved and being practised by indigenous women using their traditional experience and knowledge can go a long way in developing a community-based climate change adaptation action plan for the Himalayan mountains. The water conservation techniques and adaptive cropping pattern developed by rural women farmers can play a crucial role in building climate change resilience in agriculture and livelihood sectors across the rural Himalaya. In view of this, these local level indigenous adaptation practices need to be considered as the core elements of any micro level climate change adaptation action plan in Himalaya.

Indigenous climate change response systems, besides improving community resilience to climate change, help women in increasing productivity of traditional crops, vegetables and fruits and generating additional means of income. The contribution of indigenous women towards climate change adaptation will not only help government agencies in lessening the susceptibility of rural population to increasing food and livelihood insecurity in view of long-term impacts of climate change, but also help in reducing poverty, checking increasing trends of rural out-migration and improving overall quality of life in coming years.
However, keeping in view the sweeping and rapid changes in precipitation pattern and temperature, it would be difficult for rural communities to respond to long-term impacts of climate change in a sustainable way using their conventional practices. In long-standing perspectives the vulnerability of rural people, specifically of the poor and socially marginalised households is likely to increase as these groups do not have adequate and desired capacity to respond to rapidly changing climatic conditions. This makes it necessary to evolve an adaptive, holistic and community oriented local water governance structure capable of enhancing the efficiency and resilience of conventional strategies. This must ensure use of local ecological knowledge and active participation and involvement of local people, specifically women and civil society organisations at all stages of decision making. Furthermore, specific attempts need to be made to institutionalise water and other natural resources by strengthening and capacity building of local and regional institutions. The traditional knowledge of women should be documented and evaluated and the roles of mountain women as primary resource managers, and their contribution towards natural resource management need to be studied comprehensively and carefully. Furthermore, mountain women’s inclusion in policy dialogues, negotiations, and decisions and in all decision making bodies at various levels and scales is highly imperative for evolving any effective climate change adaptation strategy in the Himalaya.
References


Women and Sustainable Mountain Development: An Illustration of Indigenous Adaptation to Climate Change in Himalaya


Women as Agents of Change in Litchi Production: A Case Study of Khanpur, Pakistan
Saima Bibi, Ahmad Hussain, Muhammad Mumtaz Malik, Sadaf Siddique and Sundas Shaukat

Abstract
Almost 50% women participate in agriculture crop production worldwide (FAO 1995). In developing countries, women’s share has increased from 60 to 80% in agriculture, specifically, in food crop production (Gupta 2009; Mehra and Rojas 2008; Momsen 1991). Growing of *Litchi chinensis*, commonly known as Litchi tree, has been recorded as a potential means of alleviating poverty in the sub-humid and sub-tropical (annual high temperature, 28°C, annual low temperature 14°C) tract of Haripur, Pakistan, which lies at an altitude around 610 metres (2,000 ft) above sea level. The present study was organised with the objective to view the role of women as agents of change in litchi fruit raising (cultivation, harvesting and marketing) in Khanpur, district Haripur in Pakistan. The research results revealed that only 3% women are directly participating in cultivation and harvesting of litchi fruit, with almost none involved in marketing activities. The study also found that cultural barriers do not allow non-resident women to work in Khanpur. Male household members remain in search of employment in urban areas of Pakistan or abroad trying to seek different sources of income. Under this changing scenario of non-availability of male work force in agriculture and horticulture, the participation of women in horticulture needs to be encouraged through awareness raising and capacity building for sustainable fruit production in Haripur.

* This chapter has been approved as a Research Paper by the referee.
** The authors are associated with the Department of Forestry & Wildlife Management, University of Haripur, Pakistan.
Introduction
Agriculture is an important driver for elevating poverty, leading to economic growth for many countries. Contribution of rural women, especially those in the agriculture sector, to the national economy is, however, underestimated and even unrecognised in developing countries. In Nigeria, 70% women were responsible for actual farm work, which is 60% of the farming population in the country (Mijindadi 1993). According to the UNDP Human Development Report (1995), women’s economic contribution is undervalued at US$11 trillion a year internationally. FAO (1997) reported that women made considerable contribution to food production especially in horticulture and small livestock production in Latin America. Studies by Ahmad and Hussain (2004), USAID (1999), ESCAP (1996) show that women play a key role in agriculture production and food security activities with full attention and passion.

The role of women varies between and within regions and is changing rapidly across the world where economic and social forces are dependent upon agriculture sector. They manage complex households and follow multiple livelihood activities such as producing agricultural crops, tending to animals, food processing, etc. Rural women also work on daily wages in agricultural fields or other rural enterprises, e.g. different fruit orchards. These activities may not be ‘defined’ as ‘active employment’ that plays a critical role in the national economy, nonetheless, they are essential for the well-being of rural households.

The economy of Pakistan is greatly dependent on agriculture and rural women play an especially vital role in various agricultural operations, food production and food security. The USAID report (1999) revealed that Pakistani rural women participate actively in all agricultural processes including pre-harvest such as sowing, weeding and harvesting and post-harvest work like threshing, drying and storage. However, they need assistance from the government and other bodies for new information sources related to crop production as there is no specific guidance and training facilities related to crop production for rural women.

The cultivation of litchi originated from the East (China and India) and has spread over the subtropical region of the world. It is grown commercially in many countries including Australia, Brazil, China, India, Indonesia, Israel, Madagascar, Malaysia, Mauritius, Mexico, Myanmar, South Africa, Taiwan, Thailand, Vietnam, and the U.S. (Florida, Hawaii, California) (Crane et al. 2008). Across the world, export potential of litchi is favourable due to high demand in many countries. It can cost approximately $5/kg at the farm gate. Litchi is an emerging fruit of Pakistan (Rajwana et al. 2010) due to its conducive agro-ecological zones and yields high profit within a short period of time. According to the world statistics of litchi export and production reported by GHD (2013), Pakistan produces 3,000 tonnes of litchi, which is 0.13% of world production. However, despite litchi’s ‘economic’ potential, Pakistan has no mechanisms for exporting it.

This chapter tries to assess the role of women in cultivation of litchi fruit in the sub-humid, sub-tropical tract of Haripur, Pakistan and investigates their contributions in litchi
production (including hoeing, weeding, irrigation, harvesting, grading and storage). The study also looks at the role of women in marketing of litchi fruit.

**Study Area and Methodology**

The study was conducted in Khanpur (Punjkatha), district Haripur in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) province of Pakistan. The area is well watered, plain and famous for citrus orchards (especially oranges locally known as ‘Red Blood Malta’) besides a variety of fruits including loquats, plums, peaches and apricots. The area under cultivation is 24,865 hectare out of total area of 1725 square kilometer (BoI 2013). The area which has moist temperate and sub-tropical climate is quite suitable for litchi production. Litchi was introduced in Khanpur in the 1980s and now occupies second place in fruit orchards of Khanpur after citrus. The orchards of litchi are mostly grown in the following villages: Tarnava, Chitti, Dobandi, Bhera, Mohra Sardar Baig, Marchabad, Sultanpur, Ghari Syedaan, Julian, Kotha, Pindgakhra, Tofkian, Mirpur, Jandial and Nikra. The soil of district Haripur is dissected loess or piedmont plains having silty clay loam texture. Khanpur (Punjkatha region) is located to the south of capital district Haripur at 33° 48’53N, 72°56’22 E (Khan et al. 2012).

A well-constructed survey questionnaire was developed and interview protocol was used to investigate the extent of women’s role in various activities involved in litchi fruit cultivation, harvesting and marketing during 2012-13. Five villages including Dobandi, Ghari Syedaan, Julian, Pind Gakhra and Kotha were randomly selected for the study. Owners of litchi orchards were randomly selected from each village, and interviewed formally. A total of 50 persons were interviewed (Table 1 and 2).

**Table 1: Interview Respondents (2012-13)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Villages</th>
<th>Total No. of Families</th>
<th>Owners of Litchi Orchards</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Area of Litchi Planted by Respondents in Kanals¹</th>
<th>No. of Trees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dobandi</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghari Syedaan</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julian</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pind Gakhra</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>1484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kotha</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>755</strong></td>
<td><strong>334</strong></td>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
<td><strong>608</strong></td>
<td><strong>4192</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Editors’ Note: A kanal is a unit of area, equivalent to 0.0000857 square centimetres or one-eighth of an acre.
Table 2: Gender-Wise Survey Data (2012-13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Villages</th>
<th>Total Number of Respondents</th>
<th>No. of Men</th>
<th>No. of Women</th>
<th>No. of Women Working in Orchards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dobandi</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghari Syedaan</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julian</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pind Gakhra</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kotha</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>253</strong></td>
<td><strong>243</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Findings

**Cultivation of Litchi**

Land preparation
Plant yields depend a great deal on land preparation. Before planting, land for litchi cultivation must be cleared and levelled to a gentle slope. A pit of size 2x2x2 is dug and then it is filled with farm yard manure (FYM), litter, etc. The women in the region were not directly involved in digging of pits (Table 3) but they filled the pits with manure of their household livestock. Thus, women were playing a part in enhancing fertility of the soil.

Planting/layering
Planting of litchi in Khanpur starts in monsoon season from end of July each year when rainfall is high and alternatively higher temperatures are ending. At the time of planting, water requirement is high. The tree blooms at the end of March. Here the water requirement is low because it may result in falling of the flowers or may delay the time of fruiting. The initial fruiting time needs more water but rainfall is harmful for fruit. It causes fruit decay, bursting and sometime fungal attacks. The planting of litchi is successful with the method of layering. Growing a plant by seed is not successful and even mature trees do not bear fruit. Women keep the saplings safe till transplanting.

Irrigation/watering
At initial stages, after layering till transplanting, water requirement of litchi fruit is high. In Khanpur, the irrigation of litchi orchards is, therefore done through the canal system drawn from Khanpur dam. Women help on a small scale in watering of litchi when layering is done.

Weeding, cleaning and hoeing
Women were found to assist men in weeding, cleaning and hoeing of plants in the process of raising litchi orchards. Weeding, cleaning and hoeing is needed mostly in early years of orchard establishment. But weeds are generally controlled by hand during hoeing. Weeds rarely grow at a later stage because of large and dense canopy. In
established orchards, weeding is done by men. At early stages of orchard establishment, women participate in weeding to assist men.

Protection
Once fruiting starts in the region, the need of protection increases due to entry of livestock into the orchards which results in trampling of plants and shedding of fruit. Women are responsible for herding, therefore, they protect litchi orchards by keeping the livestock and birds away from the fruit trees.

Table 3: Gender-Wise Contribution in Litchi Production (2012-13)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Litchi Crop Production Activities</th>
<th>Men’s Contribution</th>
<th>Women’s Contribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Land preparation</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Planting/layering</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Irrigation/watering</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Weeding, cleaning and hoeing</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Protection</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Plucking/ harvesting</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Grading</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Storage</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Marketing</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harvesting of Litchi

Plucking/harvesting of fruit
Although plucking of fruit is an elaborate practice, women in the region do not participate in this particular activity. Most owners hand over harvesting of fruit to the market dealers (contractors) or lease out the entire orchard, thus, eliminating the role of women.

Grading
Grading is necessary for export of fruit to international markets. No export mechanism and grading strategy was found in Pakistan for litchi export. Fruit is packed randomly in small wooden boxes by men and transported to the local market.

Storage
Most of the fruit is consumed fresh or transported to the market. It is stored in wooden boxes (crates) containing 10 kg of fruit in each packing. The packing is done in layers with leaves or other cushioning material. The women generally do not take part in this process. Prolonged storage of litchi is not done and whatever limited storage is required is done by men.
Marketing of Litchi
Litchi fruit is only sold locally by males. Local markets include roadside sales’ point, city markets, restaurants and small hotels in the region.

Economic Perspective
Raising of litchi orchard is a feasible economic activity capable of finding good economic returns. Litchi trees start giving fruit in 3-5 years. A plantation may yield 25kg to 150 kg of fruit in a season depending upon its age and health. The prevailing market rate of litchi fruit is PKR 150 to PKR 200 (US$ 1-2) per kilogram. Hence, a litchi plant may give a return of PKR 5,000 (US$50) to PKR 30,000 (US$303) per season of fruiting. Most of the labour in the litchi orchards is provided by men. The participation of women as labour is comparatively minimal (5 out of 9 activities as mentioned in Table 3). A capacity-building programme in horticulture for the local women will, on the one hand, employ jobless women of the community in an economic activity; and, on the other hand relieve male members of households to seek other sources of income. Overall women’s share (6.25%) in labour was recorded in the field due to cultural barriers. All practices mentioned were being carried out by married and aged women. Only women having propriety rights in land were noticed working in their fields for litchi cultivation. No female labour is hired externally by women who own property. Generally, local male labour was available for work in the fields.

Majority of the land owners were either illiterate or less educated. The land owners of litchi orchards work outside the village to meet their household expenditure. In addition, they are also involved in litchi production because it gives them good financial return in a short period of time- litchi being a short rotation2 crop.

There were more than 4,000 trees on the farmlands of respondent families (Table 1). Hence, it is predicted that more than 10,000 litchi is produced in the region which is locally marketed in district Haripur. This brings strong economic returns to the area. It is highly recommended that litchi export mechanism should be developed and institutionalised in Pakistan.

Discussion
Empowerment of women is very necessary for the development of any country’s economy. Women’s participation in paid agricultural processes is quite limited. A significant contribution of women has been reported throughout Pakistan in different agricultural process (Aurat Foundation Pakistan 2011). However, various factors limit the role of women such as customs and cultural barriers. Table 2 highlights the contribution of women village-wise. Women’s participation in Ghari Syedan and Kotha is greater than the other three villages. Only 15 women out of 243 took part in the various

---

2 The term ‘short rotation’ refers to the period a plant takes to mature and bear fruit till ripening. Litchi starts bearing fruit within 3-5 years and harvesting of fruit takes 2 to 3 months only and is labour intensive.

3 Maund: Unit of weight varying in different countries of Asia from 11.2 to 37.4 kilograms (24.8 to 82.6 pounds).
agricultural processes. Their role is, hence, very meagre and insufficient. For sustainable agriculture, women’s participation and empowerment is necessary. Empowerment of women in agricultural aspects can help in food security and in the alleviation of poverty. Awareness raising and training programmes are urgently needed for rural women in Haripur to enhance their knowledge in litchi farming. With more and more men migrating abroad or towards urban centres, it is all the more important that rural women be armed with the tools and knowledge necessary to buffer rural household incomes.

In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, different organisations are donating funds and providing trainings for women empowerment in areas like health facilities, education and giving opportunities in social, cultural and political spaces of interest, hence, reducing gender inequality. Training opportunities in Pomology, Olericulture and Floriculture (Horticulture) should also be encouraged by local and international NGOs, which seem to be absent in agriculture. Training and awareness programmes for women in the study area may bring them to the forefront of economic empowerment.
References

Aurat Foundation 2011, ‘Women’s Empowerment in Pakistan, A Scoping Study’, Gender Equity Program (GEP), Aurat Foundation, Lahore, Pakistan.


Section III

Retaining Momentum: Role of Inclusive Growth, Service Delivery and Post-Conflict Livelihoods

1. Learning from Cross-country Experiences for Inclusive Growth in Pakistan – Nadia Tahir

2. Citizen State Engagement for Service Delivery in Bangladesh, Pakistan and India - Faisal Haq Shaheen

3. Ethnic Groups and their Livelihood Activities and Options in Post-conflict Nepal – Bishnu Raj Upreti and Sony KC
Learning from Cross-country Experiences for Inclusive Growth in Pakistan*
Nadia Tahir**

Abstract
This paper explains why growth has slowed down in Pakistan compared to China, South Korea and India by examining factors crucial to inclusive growth and the constraints to making it pro-poor. The HRV (Hausmann et al. 2005) framework is used to assess the types of reforms introduced. Pakistan is found to have experienced sporadic growth but failed to sustain it over the long period. Low productivity is the result of poor human capital and ineffective reform. Chinese economic reforms achieved structural transformation to avoid the middle income trap. South Korea instituted a blend of government interventions and market reforms to increase productive employment. India is on the path of liberalisation with emphasis on poverty reduction. The chapter concludes that simultaneous investment in human and physical capital to increase productivity is necessary for high and sustained growth. In addition, macroeconomic stability is necessary for policy credibility and absorption of shocks.

* This chapter has been approved as a Research Report by the referee.
** Dr. Nadia Tahir is an Associate Professor at Bahria University, Islamabad, Pakistan.
Introduction
It was long held that the market fails to take care of the poor. In a market economy, the poor have to take care of themselves. A strong case was built for direct government intervention in support of the poor. Governments made direct income transfers and directed resources to the poor for eradication of poverty. These types of policies failed to generate desired results over time. Inclusive growth is defined as a policy framework in which the poor can participate in the market through productive employment (Kanbur and Rauniar 2010). It is a strategy in which the market can generate productive employment for the poor by creating an enabling environment. Participation in the highly productive sector increases income opportunities. This participation enlarges market size and the volume of highly productive businesses and thus creates high income opportunities for the poor. This is a win-win strategy for the poor and for the market. The role of the government is to create an enabling environment through effective and market friendly reforms. In this way, inclusive growth becomes growth with declining poverty by raising productivity of the labour force and transformation of economy from low productivity sectors to higher productivity sectors.

The most common definition of inclusive growth is that it should be shared and pro-poor. Ianchovichina and Gable (2012) cited in Anand, Mishra and Peiris (2013, p. 3):

...describe inclusive growth as raising the pace of growth and enlarging the size of the economy by providing a level playing field for investment and increasing productive employment opportunities.

In this way, it must create employment opportunities and rising income share of the lower echelons of society. This means that incomes of the poor must grow at a faster rate than the total population. This concept integrates growth with inequality. By changing the distribution of income, inclusive growth addresses the issue of the pace and pattern of growth in the economy. It simply emphasises that the economy can generate a high growth rate by increasing investment opportunities in highly productive sectors. Expansion and investment creates employment opportunities for the poor but highly skilled labour force in highly productive activities generate increasing income returns and raises living standards. Macroeconomic stability, education, infrastructure related policies, social capital, property rights, governance, institutions and openness of trade are prerequisites of the growth enabling framework which has both a positive effect on growth and a negative effect on inequality (Lopez and Serven 2004). It also means equal opportunity for firms and individuals.

Inclusive growth, thus, has to be growth with equity. Public policy needs to ensure equal opportunity, as well as protect the weak and marginalised in the market and employment transitions. It requires concerted policy focus on determining the pace and pattern of growth in a way that reduces poverty and changes income distribution on a sustained basis (Addison and Nino-Zarazua 2012). In other words, inclusive growth focuses first on productive employment which shifts the share of the poor income and resources by participating in more productive employment and then on direct income distribution for poverty alleviation by market led growth.
In the transformation and expansion from low productivity sectors to higher productivity sectors/areas, market led policies generate growth and alleviate poverty. Several cross-country studies have shown that growth determinants are highly dependent on initial conditions and effective socio-economic reforms generate growth over time. Country growth experience is, of course, vastly different but relative incomes in almost all countries have increased over time (Romer 1987). In recent times, South Korea, India and China have generated high average growth rate as compared to Pakistan.

Pakistan has usually been described as a high growth developing economy because it achieved growth. However, it failed to develop as a prosperous, equitable and progressive nation. There is a general impression that things were better and are now going from bad to worse. In the first phase, growth strategy revolved around public sector led investment in consumer-oriented import substituting industry. In this phase, sectors and activities were identified to spur growth. The second phase (early 1980s) was marked by ‘activity-specific’ growth: trade liberalisation, industrial zoning, and adjustment in financial institutions were considered as key activities for growth. This shift was based on the concerns of the international financial institutions (IFIs) regarding macro-economic adjustment and poor social indicators. Since 2008, the country is experiencing low growth and pro-market reforms seem to be responsible for this dismal performance.

Pakistan and South Korea were implementing export oriented reforms during 1960-70 that generated high growth rate in both countries. However, Pakistan failed to sustain it in the next decade and lost the advantage of initial conditions. China and India were low growth, closed economies. However after 1980s, China, South Korea and India have been on a high growth ladder. Pakistan lost pace and momentum. The success of China and India is usually associated with the transition from closed to market oriented policies or a set of reforms resulting in a high growth trajectory. Same is the case for South Korea where export led growth did the miracle. Pakistan, largely a mixed economy, experimented with export led growth and inclusivity of growth, but the result was even lower growth rate and higher poverty.

This chapter focuses on the ways to increase growth in Pakistan by fully utilising the productive labour force which is excluded from growth processes. In this context, the chapter looks at why the GDP growth rate in Pakistan is lower than the countries that have adopted inclusive growth and market oriented reforms in the region. It looks at the growth experience of the country over time and across countries in the region. While looking at the growth variation across countries, it focuses on the type of reforms introduced and problems emerging in China, India and South Korea in pursuing an inclusive growth agenda. Why did Pakistan fail to introduce a set of reforms which are a necessary condition for inclusive growth and which could generate high growth rate in the economy? Growth in Pakistan created governments that are far from the people and the elite continue to operate with a colonial mind-set.
We also ask whether inclusive growth approach necessarily generates high growth. Towards this end, inclusive growth has a two-pronged strategy: First, it requires education and health facilities for all, a pre-requisite for productive employment. The emphasis is on improving the productive capacity of individuals and creating conducive environment for employment, rather than on income redistribution as a means of increasing incomes for the excluded groups (Ianchovichina and Gable 2009, p. 18). At a later stage, it requires good infrastructure facilities which are necessary for connectivity and mobility (McKinley 2010, pp.3-4). Infrastructure facilities are a priority for sustained growth. Secondly, it requires a set of reforms necessary to sustain private investment and innovation. These reforms include transparency, rule of law, stable macroeconomic environment, enforcement of property rights, openness to trade, and effective government that can introduce and implement these reforms.

**Literature Review**

Sustainable growth means a broad-based expansion in the pace of growth and its pattern. The idea of inclusive growth can be traced back to the Kuznets curve, relating economic growth and income inequality (Kuznets 1955). Before this, economists usually studied factors which determine growth, as in Cobb Douglas production function, that emphasises labour and capital as sources of growth. It is the amount of capital per labour unit that determines the pace of growth. It is not concerned with the pattern of development. Solow’s growth model emphasised two factors which included capital per unit of labour and the difference in output per worker (Solow 1956). It is true that a country with more capital and productive labour force can generate higher growth over time. But it fails to explain huge variations in income across countries. To view the growth differential across countries, knowledge, technology and research and development are the other important factors. However, these factors ignore the impact of growth on reducing poverty and inequalities. It is generally assumed that high absolute income means low poverty and low inequalities. The relationship between growth and inequality remains complex though (Banerjee and Duflo 2003).


There are, thus, mixed results for growth, poverty and inequality. In this scenario, there is a need to look at policies and reform frameworks to address the complex issue of inclusive growth. Lopez (2004) concludes that macroeconomic stability, education and infrastructure related policies have both a positive effect on growth and a negative effect on inequality. World Bank (2005a) holds that the key factors of growth include stable
macroeconomic environment, enforcement of property rights, openness to trade, and effective government, but this is not the whole story. Growth process requires a set of policies and institutional setups as a pre-requisite.

Measuring the effects of economic policies on GDP growth, poverty and inequality is a difficult task. The relationship between growth and inequality is complex and countries differ in initial conditions, geographically and in resource endowment. During the last decade, macro and micro methodologies were developed to evaluate and measure the impact of policies on growth and poverty. Micro techniques are based on accounting incidence analysis. In this technique, the impact of tax and public spending is evaluated in pre- and post-change in policy. It is assumed that the observed difference is due to policy change. Macro models assume that economic policies do not affect welfare distribution. These models also assume that the economy is composed of individuals in a society which are identical. It is difficult to measure the impact of policy change on one isolated group or on poverty. A major advantage of these models is that they can be used to quantify the effect of a wide range of shocks and policy measures in heterogeneous economies.
Methodology
This study analyses the impact of policy intervention in the form of inclusive growth in Pakistan, China, India and South Korea. Hausmann, Rodrik, and Velasco (HRV) (2005) decision tree is used to identify binding constraints to growth (Figure 1).

Figure 1: HRV Decision Tree


In this framework, labour supply depends on human capital, ability to acquire skills and access to labour market, whereas demand for labour depends on entrepreneurship, private investment and business environment. Private investment requires a congenial and enabling environment. Low cost of finance and economic returns are the pre-requisite for flourishing private investment. Economic returns are a function of well-functioning markets and effective governments. Effective government means credible fiscal and monetary policies at macro level and property rights and low corruption at micro level. Distorted markets proxy for coordination failure and information asymmetry. These factors are identified as constraints to high growth.
Variables and Data Sources
For assessing the impact of inclusive growth policy, data is taken from Country Policy and Institutional Assessment (CPIA) of World Development Indicators (WDI) 2013. These criteria rate countries on 16 indicators which are subdivided into 4 clusters. The variables used in this study include CPIA fiscal policy, macroeconomic management, property rights and rule-based governance, social protection, transparency, accountability, and corruption in the public sector, policies for social inclusion/equity cluster average, logistics performance index, GINI index, control of corruption, poverty headcount ratio at $1.25 a day, consumer price indicator, tax revenue, gross savings, gross fixed capital formation, GDP deflator, literacy rate, public spending on education and health expenditure.

Findings and Analysis
Highs and Lows of Growth
Cross-country evidence of growth in Pakistan, China, India, and South Korea shows that these have been high growth countries over various decades (Figure 2). It is not growth which is the problem, but sustaining it is the real challenge.

China and South Korea have unusually long periods of high growth, whereas Pakistan and India have unusually long low growth periods. India’s growth success is of recent origin. Average growth rate of these countries is 6.4%. Pakistan and India had average growth rate of 5.2 and 5.3%, whereas China had 8.3% and South Korea 6.8% during 1961-2012. It seems that Pakistan and India are growth disasters, whereas South Korea and China are growth miracles. Out of 52 years of analysis, Pakistan achieved growth rate of 6.3% and above 17 times, India 20 times, South Korea 30 times, and China 42 times.
Figure 2: Trends in Cross-country Growth

Table 1 gives GDP growth rate for various periods. In the first decade (1961-70), Pakistan and South Korea were growth leaders with growth rates of 6.7 and 8.6% respectively. In this decade, the average growth rate in China was 5.2% and in India 3.7%. In the second decade (1971-80), Pakistan failed to sustain its growth and her growth rate declined by 2 percentage points whereas S. Korea’s growth rate declined by 1.4 percentage points. China sustained its growth and achieved 0.80 percentage point increase. India remained a low growth economy in this decade. During 1981-1990, Pakistan regained its growth momentum but it was the time when China had started enjoying double digit growth, followed by South Korea. It was also the time when India started making its place in growth accounting (Figure 3).

Table 1: GDP Growth Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>China</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>S. Korea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1961–1970</td>
<td>6.70</td>
<td>5.20</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>8.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971–1980</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>6.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>7.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991–1995</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>12.80</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>7.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2010</td>
<td>4.57</td>
<td>10.49</td>
<td>7.59</td>
<td>4.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2.96</td>
<td>9.30</td>
<td>6.33</td>
<td>3.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>7.80</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>2.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After the decade of 1980s, Pakistan lost its momentum and drifted away from high growth trajectory. This was the beginning of low growth period in Pakistan. This was also the time India was entering its high growth phase. As Figure 3 illustrates, growth trend in both countries underwent a change. Pakistan has been on a declining trend, while India entered the high growth league. Around this time, China had also started to generate high growth.

**Employment and Labour Productivity**

To be inclusive, growth has to be pro-poor and it must change the income share of lower echelons of society. According to the HRV framework, growth must change labour market trends. Table 2 gives the relevant data. After adopting inclusive growth strategy, China generated employment during 1995-2005 at a rate of 1.2 % point per annum. The average for 2005-12 is 0.5% per annum.
Table 2: Employment and Labour Productivity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% change in total employment per annum</th>
<th>Labour productivity growth rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>95-00 00-05 05-08 2009 07-12</td>
<td>95-00 00-05 05-08 2009 07-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>1.2 1.2 0.5 0.6 0.5</td>
<td>3.4 10.6 10.5 8.4 5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.Korea</td>
<td>0.6 1.3 0.9 0.8 0.7</td>
<td>4.4 2.9 3.1 0.5 2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>1.9 2 2.2 1.7 0.9</td>
<td>4.3 4.4 5.9 5.4 5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>3.6 3.8 4.3 3.8 2.8</td>
<td>1.1 2.2 0.8 -2.2 0.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Total labour productivity growth rate was on average 7%. After 2005, employment had a sluggish growth rate of 0.6%, whereas labour productivity increased by 10%. South Korea also experienced sluggishly increasing employment but productivity increased at a faster rate. India is an exception where employment increased at 2% per annum and labour productivity also increased at the rate of 5%. Interestingly, Pakistan while passing through a low growth phase generated employment almost at the rate of 4%, the highest rate in the reference cross country group. But productivity declined, recorded in 2009 at -2.2%. One conclusion is that as labour productivity grows, GDP also grows. When it turns negative, employment increases without any addition to output, as it happened in 2009.

Unemployment Rate

Pakistan has the highest unemployment rate in the cross country comparison in this study. It has the highest female unemployed rate which hovered around 9% in 2009. Table 3 shows the trend of unemployment in the countries under study. Surprisingly in all these countries, the unemployment rate does not accompany the pace and pattern of high growth.

Table 3: Unemployment Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total, % of labour force</th>
<th>Male, % of male labour force</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>2.90 3.10 - -</td>
<td>- - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Korea</td>
<td>2.10 4.40 3.20 3.7</td>
<td>2.30 5.00 3.60 4.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>2.20 4.30 3.5</td>
<td>2.40 4.40 - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>5.00 7.20 5.00 -</td>
<td>3.70 5.50 4.00 -</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Vulnerable Employment

Many employed persons in the region are self-employed as ‘own account’ or contributing family workers. These workers are engaged in low incomes activities having no social protection. Of the countries with available data, Pakistan has the highest proportion of self-account workers. South Korea has the highest employer ratio (7%) in total employment.
Table 4: Employment Trend in Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Labour force participation rate</th>
<th>Share of industry in total employment</th>
<th>Share of wage and salaried workers</th>
<th>Share of own account workers</th>
<th>Vulnerable employment (VE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1999-2000</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>43.6</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-02</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>39.9</td>
<td>101.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-04</td>
<td>50.7</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>38.5</td>
<td>38.6</td>
<td>109.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-06</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>21.2</td>
<td>38.4</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>121.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-07</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>124.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-08</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>37.1</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>131.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-09</td>
<td>53.1</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>34.8</td>
<td>136.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-10</td>
<td>53.5</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>140.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-11</td>
<td>53.4</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>36.3</td>
<td>144.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: GoP 2011.

As Table 4 shows, the share of salaried workers and the share of employment in industry increased slowly and the share of own accounts workers has been declining in Pakistan. Surprisingly, however, the index of vulnerable employment has been rising. The share of employment distribution has changed from industry to services sector in Pakistan.

Reform Process

Chinese Reforms
With the rapid transformation of economic growth during 1978-2001, China introduced economic system reforms to avoid the middle income trap. The first tier of reforms in the early 70s in China included elimination of collective farming and incentives to farmers. Later, it started trade liberalisation and increased investment in human capital to increase productivity growth.

Major economic policies comprised of identifying key sectors and activities of growth. The sectors included access to infrastructure, energy, consumption, employment, environment protection, population control, endowment insurance, and rural health. As a result of these policies, labour quality and capability improved. Access to infrastructure also increased. Huge investment and increased mobility generated employment opportunities and career development. With increased income opportunities, China readjusted income distribution to narrow the income gap. The government restructured individual income tax policy.

The economic growth experience of China is based on industrialisation. Major policies were used to transform pattern and pace of growth. In this reform process, the Chinese adjusted and optimised industrial structure and shifted economic development pattern by introducing more capital into weak industrial links, applying high technology and restructuring key industries.
In addition, China introduced urban and rural economic system reforms. These reforms focused on state owned enterprises to change income distribution relationship, and provide increased social protection. By 1981, almost 85% of the population in China was living on less than $1.25 a day. After 2001, a new set of reforms opened up the economy. As a result of these reforms, China was able to reduce poverty to 13% by 2008. Rural economic system reforms related to farming land, agricultural product circulation system, and diversified agricultural production. Massive research was undertaken in agricultural science and technology.

Indian Reforms
Historically speaking, India was considered a low growth economy. Its GDP growth rate hovered around 3-3.5% per annum until early 1990s. This low growth was usually associated with a series of bad agricultural years, idle industrial capacity, and unfavourable terms of trade against agriculture (Rodrik and Subramanian, 2005 pp. 193-4). According to Bhagwati and Panagariya (2013), low growth in India was due to counterproductive growth policies. These policies include extensive controls in production, investment and self-sufficiency policy in trade and public ownership. India started neo-liberal reforms in early 1991-92. The immediate need for these reforms was severe balance of payments crisis and significant negative growth in industrial production and employment. In the post 1991-92 reforms, India abolished import compression as well as import entitlements. Industrial licensing policy was discontinued. The limit for foreign equity was increased from 40% to 51%.

As a result of these reforms, India grew at 8.5% during 2003-04 to 2010-11. Accelerated growth generated high amount of revenues which enabled the Government to start large scale distributive programmes (Bhagwati and Panagariya 2013).

The economy was opened up with the slogan: ‘India will continue to rise and, in doing so, will help everyone rise.’ These reforms aimed to achieve double digit growth. It meant that India sought to change the pace and pattern of growth. India leapfrogged from agriculture to services with less focus on manufacturing.

Agriculture remained a low growth sector and as a result yield growth declined during 1997-2005. The three pillars of India’s reforms included significant accumulation of foreign exchange and stock market reforms, information technology and improvements in telecommunications. After these reforms, India moved to a high trajectory of growth. These initial set of reforms excluded agricultural reforms and agriculture continued as a low growth sector. Rural poverty has been on the rise. The sector provides low quality employment opportunities for the masses. To bring competition in agricultural sector, some states introduced the Agriculture Produce Marketing Committees (APMC) Act to enable all farmers to sell their product directly to anyone. In this period, rural-urban divides became even more obvious, gender and social inequalities were on the rise, and it increased regional disparities as well. The hope that growth will trickle down, reduce poverty and raise living standards was not realised.
At this juncture, Manmohan Singh’s government introduced a number of crucial reforms in the social sector which reduced poverty from 47% in 1990 to 22% in 2010. These reforms are called track II reforms. One of the most important reforms for controlling poverty was National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (NREGA) 2005. This scheme was implemented in 2008 and fully operational in 2012. NREGA ensures guaranteed employment for every rural household and wages are related to consumer price index. Another set of reforms revolves around right to food legislation. Indian Parliament passed a National Food Security Act, 2013 which provides subsidised grains to the poor through the public distribution system. To provide a minimum health care cover, the Government launched a comprehensive primary health care programme in 2005. Another important initiative was private sector group health insurance scheme. As the poor cannot afford to pay, the Government would pay on their behalf. For enhancing productivity, another milestone was the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act of 2009. It required that children aged six to fourteen must go to school. As a result, the proportion of children not going to school has declined.

An attempt was made to eliminate urban bias in policies in the Tenth Plan. Various schemes and programmes in rural areas were started. These included Integrated Rural Development Programme (IRDP), Minimum Needs Programme (MNP), and Public Distribution System (PDS). These programmes helped to improve gainful employment opportunities and rural productivity. State funding was increased to alleviate poverty and gainful employment in the development of rural infrastructure. These schemes included Food for Work Programme, National Rural Employment Programme (2010), Rural Land Employment Generation Programme, and Jawahar Rozgar Yojana. The Government also increased its role and significance in the social sector. Gaps and areas were identified where private sector was reluctant to step. Public investment in education and healthcare was increased. As a result of these reforms, income poverty declined from 55% in the early 1970s to 28% in 2004-05 (Bhagwati and Panagariya 2013, p. 35, 38). Another significant reform was the Right to Information Act (2005) to make the Government responsive and transparent.

Reforms in South Korea
South Korea is the classic example of growth with equity and export-driven economic growth. It adopted a highly selective public policy regime with rapid market oriented policies. The country used a unique combination of market, government and private sector for rapid, sustained and equitable growth. Both the public and private sector heavily invested in physical and human capital. Investment rate increased to 70% in the early 1960s.

This growth pace transformed the country from a poor agrarian structure to a highly industrialised economy. The success story behind the high growth is factor accumulation and acquisition of technology. South Korea enjoyed a stable macro-economic and legal framework to promote competition. It used international trade and absence of price controls and other distortionary policies for market promotion. The Government invested in people by providing education and health facilities. It actively used industrial policies
for changing the industrial structure and promoting technological learning. According to Wade (1990), it was government which ‘governed the market.’

The success of South Korea lies with export led growth which was possible by factor accumulation, sector specific industrial policy and labour force growth. It was neutral between import substitutes and exports. But it coexisted with domestic market protection. The sector’s share of manufacturing value added nearly tripled. Total factor productivity rose and it played a crucial role in manufacturing sector growth. The economy shifted from labour intensive policies to capital intensive production.

In the pursuit of activist public policy reform, South Korea neglected labour market reforms. The share of non-regular and temporary workers has markedly increased in recent decades, resulting in the emergence of dual labour markets and labour polarisation. These workers have little job security. Social security coverage is low. There is need to introduce certain reforms in the services sector which is highly regulated but denies workers social security.

**Growth in Pakistan**

Economic growth in Pakistan has followed a cyclical path. The continued occurrence and the intensity of these cycles showed volatility, sensitivity and risk in the historical pattern of growth. Expansion followed by recession was associated with windfall gains, inflows of resources from abroad and end of conflict. Each time recession was due to bad performance of agriculture and industrial sector. The economy has the resilience to come out of recession but it is surprising that every next peak was lower than the previous peak. This means that the economy recovers but the capacity to produce remained lower than the previous peak. It may be the reason that expansion is rarely associated with sustained increase in productivity or expansion in manufacturing sector or export led growth. It is also for this reason that external factors are blamed for low growth.

The historical pattern of growth in Pakistan shows lack of depth, variety and consistency. In simple words, a country that was initially agriculture oriented, never successfully transformed into a modern, industrial, export-oriented economy. It is now struggling with an overdeveloped but low quality services sector. It generated some islands of growth but failed to maintain that performance on sustainable basis.
Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow

After independence, Pakistan generated growth with pace but failed to sustain it (Figure 4). During 1951-88, average growth rate was 5.3%. The first expansion was marked by the Green Revolution, which was followed by social unrest. After that, growth recovered with remittances and inflow of foreign resources. Since 1988, GDP growth has lost pace—it has also become more volatile. Earlier, the country had demonstrated the capacity to grow at the rate of over 6% per annum. The average growth between 1989 and 2000 was 4.46%. In these 11 years, the growth rate was higher than 6% in only two years. One of the lowest growth rates in the country’s history, i.e. 1.7%, was also witnessed in this period in 1997.

Table 5 summarises the behaviour of real GDP growth in 10 troughs in Pakistan. GDP growth rate declines sharply from peak to trough. The fall in GDP is on average 6%. The range varies considerably from 8% to 5%. The time between the end of one trough and beginning of the next is on average 4 years. Initially, Pakistan’s economy had shorter length of fluctuations which shows its volatile growth experience. The cycle from low growth to high growth is of 4 years.
Table 5: Growth Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peak</th>
<th>Trough</th>
<th>Change in GDP from peak to trough</th>
<th>Number of years between peaks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1953-54</td>
<td>1954-55</td>
<td>-8.19</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1958-59</td>
<td>1959-60</td>
<td>-4.59</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964-65</td>
<td>1966-67</td>
<td>-6.3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969-70</td>
<td>1970-71</td>
<td>-8.56</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973-74</td>
<td>1976-77</td>
<td>-4.61</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977-78</td>
<td>1983-84</td>
<td>-3.76</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984-85</td>
<td>1989-90</td>
<td>-4.12</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-96</td>
<td>1996-97</td>
<td>-4.9</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-05</td>
<td>2008-09</td>
<td>-8.6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s estimates based on National Income Accounts from Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) (2013a).

These cycles are evenly distributed in various components of GDP. Table 6 below shows the average share of each component of GDP in total output. Interestingly, the behaviour of each component did not vary significantly from peak to recession.

Table 6: Components of Aggregate Demand

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Components</th>
<th>Average in Trough</th>
<th>Average in Peak</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consumption</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Consumption Expenditure</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Government Consumption Expenditure</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross Domestic Fixed Capital Formation</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change in Stocks</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Export of Goods and Non-Factor Services</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less Import of Goods and Non-Factor Services</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s estimates based on PBS (2013b).

As Table 6 shows, consumption expenditure increases in trough as compared to peak time consumption. Capital formation, exports and imports decline in trough but not significantly. In Pakistan, the behaviour of GDP is not much different from peak to trough yet GDP declines.

Constraints to Inclusive Growth

HRV (2005) framework identifies the constraints to economic growth in Pakistan, China, India and South Korea, as growth is considered the main driver of reducing inequality and poverty. In this framework, growth requires an enabling environment in which entrepreneurial ability generates demand for labour and quality human capital provides supply. Infrastructure, control on corruption and responsive government through fiscal policy interventions create growth enabling environment which increases mobility.
Table 7: Macroeconomic and Social Indicators (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Policy</th>
<th>Macroeconomic Risk</th>
<th>Human Capital</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tax revenue (%)</td>
<td>Gross fixed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(of GDP)</td>
<td>capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gross savings (of GDP)</td>
<td>formation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.08^a</td>
<td>20.33^a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.66^a</td>
<td>27.96^a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.63^a</td>
<td>51.66^a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Korea</td>
<td>15.58^a</td>
<td>30.95^a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Inflation is also the highest in Pakistan. In 2008, Pakistan had the GDP deflator over 16%. It was half of this in India, 3.56% in China and almost 1% in South Korea. Growth requires prudent fiscal policy, increasing tax revenue and declining debt in a low growth environment. Unfortunately, none of these conditions are present in Pakistan.

Human capital is a key source of growth. It enables labour force to acquire skills which are necessary for productive employment. Access to health facilities increases productivity and education spending increases the ability to acquire skills. Bils and Klenow (2000) found that there is causality between education expenditure and economic growth. Education can increase human capital which increases the level of output (Mankiw et al. 1992). In new growth theories, human capital has been treated as the main determinant of economic growth and problem of development is actually a problem of observed pattern (Lucas 1988). It is measured by skills of labour force, health, education level, experience, and training and may other factors. It has positive impact on economic growth.

South Korea and China enjoy high literacy rates, around 94 and 97% respectively, whereas India has literacy rate of 63%. Pakistan has the lowest literacy rate. China spends almost 4.6% of GDP on human capital formation. South Korea spends almost 9%, India spends 4.46% and Pakistan spends less than 3% on human capital formation. As a result of lower spending, its labour force has low skill set and declining productivity.
Growth requires high physical capital labour ratio, change in resource allocation mechanism from consumption to saving and stable macroeconomic conditions which require prudent fiscal and credible monetary policy. Unfortunately, all these conditions are absent in Pakistan.

Productive labour force and firms need market access and good quality infrastructure is a pre-requisite for a high growth economy. It is also a source of high social returns. China and South Korea had a high logistics performance index. Pakistan has poor road to market connectivity and the same is the case in India. As Table 8 shows, Pakistan has the worst infrastructure facilities with logistic performance index less than 3 whereas S. Korea has 3.7 and China has 3.5.

Table 8: Connectivity, Equity and Corruption Constraints (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Logistics Performance Index</th>
<th>GINI Index</th>
<th>Corruption Perception Index</th>
<th>Control of Corruption</th>
<th>Poverty Headcount Ratio at $1.25 a Day</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td>30.02</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>21.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>-0.52</td>
<td>32.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>42.06*</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>-0.6</td>
<td>28.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Korea</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>31.3</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 8 also gives information on the equity and corruption constraints. Many authors have examined the relationship between income distribution and income growth. Various empirical studies proved that there is direct and significant relationship between growth and more equal income but this is not robust. When the simple growth and inequality relationship was applied to the countries under study, it was found that China with faster growth has high income inequality with GINI coefficient index value of 42.06, but South Korea has low income inequality with GINI coefficient value of 31.3. Pakistan has the lowest value of 30.02. India has grown faster in recent times but it failed to create welfare oriented income distribution in society. Inequality tends to grow at a faster rate in India as growth fails to trickle down.

The Corruption Perception Index measures the abuse of power, secret dealings and bribery in societies around the world. The Index scores 177 countries and territories on a scale from 0 which means highly corrupt to 100 which means very clean. South Korea has the highest score which is 55 for the year 2013, Pakistan is the most corrupt with the lowest score.

Control of Corruption is a governance measure which captures perceptions of the extent to which public power is exercised for private gain, including both petty and grand forms of corruption, as well as ‘capture’ of the state by elites and private interests (Kaufmann et al. 2010, p.4). The score ranges from -2.5 showing weak control of corruption to 2.5 indicating strong control of corruption. Pakistan’s score is -1.1 which shows weakest control of corruption compared to South Korea with a score of 0.42 which shows the
strongest control of corruption. India and China, despite their high growth, have little success in controlling corruption. Corruption may be the grease for growth in the short run but in long run it becomes sand for GDP growth.

Table 9: Country Policy and Institutional Assessment Rating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Knack and Keefer (1997) showed that good institutions have positive impact on the growth of a country. For assessing the quality of a country’s present policy and institutional framework, World Bank measures Country Policy and Institutional Assessment (CPIA). This ranking is used for IDA (International Development Association) allocation of concessional development assistance. Quality means environment conducive to poverty alleviation, sustainable growth and the effective use of development assistance. CPIA has 16 criteria which are grouped into four clusters. These are economic management, structural policies, policies for social inclusion and equity, and public sector management and institutions. For each criterion, countries are rated on a scale of 1 (low) to 6 (high). Rating 1 corresponds to a very weak performance, and rating 6 to a very strong performance (World Bank 2010, pp.3-41). It has been done for Pakistan and India only as IDA eligible economies.

Pakistan with its low growth also has low CPIA score. One can conclude that weak policies and institutional assessment contribute to low growth. Presently, India has almost 6% of GDP growth rate and CPIA rating ranges between 3.5-4.5 whereas Pakistan’s growth rate is less than 2% and CPIA score range from 2.5-3 (Table 9). There is direct relationship between growth and country policies. Low growth reflects poor institutional assessment.

Conclusion

This chapter explored why growth has slowed down in Pakistan as compared to China, South Korea and India. What are the crucial factors for inclusive growth and what are the constraints in achieving the objective of pro-poor and shared growth? Inclusive growth means not only increase in pro-poor income and living standards but also changing income distribution through productive employment. It is considered as a win-win strategy for firms and households. Firms are engaged in highly productive sectors and households are engaged in highly productive income generating activities. The government has to remove market distortions and give strong incentives. It has to provide macroeconomic stability, institutions, infrastructure, and property rights. In this enabling
environment, business and financial activities flourish and the economy is transformed from a low growth trajectory to the miracle of high growth.

It is concluded that for growth one needs to get the basics right. Capital accumulation and availability of quality human capital are the essentials for growth. Pakistan is facing declining capital output and capital labour ratio. For achieving high growth, it is essential to invest in human and physical capital. Labour productivity is the second essential item on the growth agenda. With declining productivity one cannot imagine growth to take place. It is another constraint to promoting business and entrepreneurial activities. It means for growth, countries have to increase investment as well as productivity. Pakistan has failed to increase saving rates; and, capital formation and productivity are declining. Thirdly, macroeconomic stability and capacity to absorb macroeconomic shocks are also essential for removing distortions and policy credibility.

The other essentials of growth include institutions, infrastructure and control of corruption. The lesson learnt from South Korea is to make head start with primary education reforms and building human capital in general. India is setting the example of integrated development plan for rural poor and China is the classic example of investing in infrastructure. Although China is a success model for growth, it needs to concentrate on inequality and institutions. South Korea needs to have drastic reforms for vulnerable employment and a system of social protection. India, like Pakistan, must concentrate on human capital for sustaining growth.

In China, the reform process started with incentives in agriculture followed by liberalisation of the economy, whereas India liberalised the economy first followed by social sector reform. Pakistan’s reform has been disorderly. The share of agricultural employment has not declined and manufacturing employment has not increased. Investment has been low and shifting towards services sector, which has low labour absorption. In the absence of social sector reform, services sector drew skilled labour out of the manufacturing sector. What is necessary is the continuation of reforms backed by acceleration of the rate of investment and boosting productivity growth. This is the road to inclusive growth.
References


Bhagwati, J. and Panagariya, A. 2013, Why Growth Matters: How Economic Growth in India Reduced Poverty and the Lessons for Other Developing Countries, Public Affairs, New York, USA.


Ianchovichina, E. and Gable, S.L. 2012, ‘What is Inclusive Growth?’ in Rabah Arezki, Catherine Pattillo, Marc Quintyn and Min Zhu (eds.), *Commodity Prices and Inclusive Growth in Low-Income Countries*, International Monetary Fund, Washington, DC, USA.


Citizen State Engagement for Service Delivery in Bangladesh, Pakistan and India
Faisal Haq Shaheen**

Abstract
Viewed as the backbone of the ‘informal city’, migrant labourers and low income communities represent the largest populations of many medium and large sized cities in South Asia. The expanse and density of Dhaka (Bangladesh), Karachi (Pakistan) and Mumbai (India) are testament to this unrelenting growth. Continued migration to urban centres and the services oriented skill set of transient workers will feed urban growth and class polarisation in the years to come. The policy aims and intergovernmental efforts to address service delivery to low income communities need to be harmonised. This chapter provides primary and secondary research on the condition of state and non-state efforts to extend municipal services to informal sector communities in South Asia’s mega cities. Given the complexity of data gathering in urban contexts, a comparative approach is coupled with the ‘process tracing’ methodology to contrast positive and negative service delivery experiences across the three mega cities. Within case study contexts, the agency of individuals and interests are seen to outpace the processes of institutions in addressing the needs of low income communities. The findings from the ‘process tracing’ exercise point to the importance of engaging lower tier state and non-state actors for low income urban development. Furthermore, the labyrinth of municipal and provincial actors with opposing interests requires clearly defined boundaries between intergovernmental jurisdictions and more specifically, service providers. Civil society actors can monitor the flash points of such efforts, bringing more transparency to urban development processes. Evidence points to the critical role of lower tier state service providers and frameworks of accountability and transparency that are required at this level of government.

* This chapter has been approved as a Working Paper by the referee.
** Mr. Faisal Haq Shaheen is a doctoral student at Ryerson University’s Policy Studies programme in Toronto, Canada; and serves as a civil servant with the Municipality of Toronto.
Introduction

Service delivery to the informal sector in South Asia’s mega cities is under-represented as far as the more prominent interdisciplinary policy literature is concerned. Contributions to comparative public administration literature have led to the development of an urban research agenda over the past few decades, which has begun to examine the potential of non-state actors in providing alternative service delivery solutions. Unfortunately, due to spread of neoliberal thinking and increased attention to the private sector, market-based models have eclipsed examination of institutional capacity building.

Critical approaches to urban political economy have highlighted the plight of the socio-economically marginalised in recent years. In light of ‘globalisation’s discontents’, most critical perspectives hold the state responsible for the reproduction of urban poverty and appropriation of resources by society’s elites. However, critical approaches do not unpack the intergovernmental dynamics between local and national/provincial levels of government. In post-colonial contexts, centre facing bureaucracies have captured the policy agendas of South Asian governments at the expense of unplanned and overwhelmed municipal governments. The operations and maintenance needs of the latter, particularly the larger mega cities, have been marginalised to the point where they are dependent on upper tiers of the state for support. Development studies research has quickly broadened to incorporate a range of models and service delivery solutions that are independent of the state. These contributions are certainly valuable in advancing their disciplinary positions and bodies of research, but are often criticised for being overly reliant on donor funding (Banuri et al. 2002; Laquian 2002), and isolated from a coordinating function that resides within municipal policy frameworks. Taken together, an inevitable policy conclusion is the need to explore the capability and capacity of service delivery extension at the local government level within the programme framework of mega cities.

Urban growth is surging in South Asia and outpacing the ability of states to ensure adequate levels of services to all segments of society. South Asia’s mega cities are among the densest, complex, diverse and institutionally weak in the developing world. According to UN Habitat forecasts, South Asia will be home to the most mega cities and medium sized cities by 2025 (UN Habitat 2007). The economic growth and development potential of large, urbanising cities is celebrated by many modernists and development thinkers. However, most of their human development models rely on a localised, microeconomic trickle down growth model of income redistribution. In reality, a small minority of wealthy urbanites are provided for with modern, secure, posh, gated communities and all of the amenities of modern living. A much larger, growing segment of society live in low income ‘slums’ and unplanned settlements and struggle with a lack of access to services (Davis 2006; Siddiqui et al. 2004). In order to access services, where civil society actors are absent, the poor pay illegal service providers 10-15 times more (WaterAid 2013) for services such as housing, water and other utilities (Devas 2005). Rising prices and unaffordable housing will further perpetuate the growth of ‘informal’ communities and demand for alternative service delivery models. If left unchecked, an urbanising mega city will witness a crowding in of illegal service providers monopolising scarce resources for profits.
A number of challenges rooted in South Asia’s colonial history prevent the equitable distribution of services within mega cities. The colonial imprint remains within each of the SAARC1 nations as an upward facing cadre of elite civil servants have created a ‘tiered’, centre facing bureaucracy (Ahmad 1992). This network of bureaucrats has been charged with establishing a series of self-sustaining institutions that preserve power within a tightly knit group of policy actors (Subramaniam 1990). The result is that resource transfers to programme levels are inconsistent and often discontinuous. Second, politicised institutions operate without due process or oversight by upper tiers. Rather than establish a framework of checks and balances to control spending and programme activity, upper tier actors often dictate programme outcomes at the local government level (Shaheen 2009; Subramaniam 1990). This not only contributes to a lack of empowerment, but removes the ‘audit’ level or ‘regulator’ role of the state’s upper tier. Subsequent swings in elected administrations further weaken municipal institutions, as they are drowned out by upper tier policies/decisions. Furthermore, the duplication of ‘legacy’ departments, through politicised functionaries is a common feature of these municipal departments. Within this challenging context, it becomes difficult to assess where programme improvements and points of intervention can be made to extend support and services to the urban poor. Before we explore a methodology that answers the challenge of engaging the mega city poor, let us examine the framework and difficulties of establishing causality across different levels of government with respect to municipal policy.

**Difficulties in Establishing Causality in Policy**

It goes without saying that different actors, operating at different levels of state and society, influence the service delivery context in South Asia’s largest cities. Firstly, among the state actors are those who operate at the upper tiers of the state, namely the central and/or provincial governments. There are also those non-state actors2 (donors, international non-government organisations and aid agencies) who also occupy this space and regularly engage with upper tier policy makers on various development initiatives. This level of policy activity, in terms of the policy stages heuristic, is concerned with agenda setting, policy development and formulation. At the lower tiers of the state are those municipal and local government actors and departments that implement programmes on the front lines. At this level are also community-based organisations as well as non-government organisations that seek to support and provide services to the poorest of the poor. Also at this level, are the technically focussed, sector specific donors who facilitate state programmes by intervening and building capacity of the non-state actors. This programme level of service delivery is concerned mainly with policy implementation and to a lesser extent, evaluation and monitoring, which should be engaged in by all service delivery stakeholders.

1 South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC).
2 Use of non-state actors refers to those domestic, indigenous NGOs (and their partners) who are active at the community level in South Asia’s mega cities. In each of the low income communities, non-state actors transfer knowledge and lessons learned from across similar contexts and slowly develop the capacity and access to state services of the informal sector.
Given the different periods of policy development, range of ideologically driven actors and alternative models that have emerged; it is difficult to trace policy outcomes to the initial source of the intervention. In other words, the roles of upper tier actors, donors, non-government actors and community mobilisation in contributing to positive service delivery outcomes is difficult to trace. For instance, prioritisation of policies at different stages of development is always changing in volatile political environments. ‘Service Delivery Events’ or ‘Community Milestones’ at the lower tiers of the state are rarely communicated back up to policy designers or frameworks. As a result, there is room for different models and research frameworks for policy examination that address complexity by involving multiple actors and comparing outcomes from different contexts. The following section will now feature the specific methodological components that make up the research design of this chapter.

**Methodology: Process Tracing**

There is value in comparing the service delivery efforts of state and non-state actors across different mega city contexts. To this end, the research question asks **how the post-colonial WATSAN service delivery contexts in Dhaka, Karachi and Mumbai compare in terms of extension to the informal sector.** Simply put, a combination of primary and secondary sources inform a contrasting of service delivery outcomes between a pair of case studies in each mega city of analysis. Research was conducted from December 2012 to December 2014. Process tracing with causal-process observations are integrated (semi-structured interviews) and nested within the case study and non-state actor experience. This brings out the causal sequence in which process-tracing observations are then situated. The key features of the process tracing framework are as follows: Each case study is divided into five year increments. Within each five year period, key service delivery extension events are described. In addition to the service delivery event, the policy stage that best defines the relationship between state and non-state actor is summarised. For this particular chapter, the author draws attention to the results from the water and sanitation sector and the roles played by state and non-state actor at the lowest tiers of the state in extending service delivery to the informal sector. In Dhaka, the relationship between the NGO Dushtha Shasthya Kendra (DSK) and the Dhaka Water and Supply Authority (DWASA); in Karachi the relationship between the NGO Orangi Pilot Project (OPP) and the Karachi Water and Sewerage Board (KWSB); in Mumbai the relationship between Sulabh International (SI) and the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai. Then, the level of engagement between state and non-state actors with reference to administrative typologies is summarised (Sansom 2006).

**Examining State and Non-State Actors**

In order to explore and compare the impacts of various state and non-state actors, the comparator variables most prevalent in the municipal policy literature are utilised (Umeh

---

3 Water and sanitation.

4 The comparison of South Asia’s post-colonial municipal contexts is a natural research outcome from the imprint left by British rule. The legacy of elitist institutions, segregated pools of professionals, class based politics have left a centre facing bureaucracy mimicking imported models of institutional development.
and Andranovich 2005; Siddiqui et al. 2004; Laquian 2002; Devas 2001). They are as follows: Political representation, Accountability and Transparency, Intergovernmental relations, Civil Society and Donor Activity, Citizen and Pro-Poor Engagement.

Findings

In the case of Dhaka-Bangladesh, a focussed and well networked NGO, Dushtha Shasthya Kendra (DSK) was found to have leveraged its expertise to the benefit of service delivery to slum communities (WaterAid 2013; Singha 2008). After ten years of focussed service delivery and relationship building with local water and sanitation officials, community based hand pumps were set up, paid for by DSK, through bill collection from the community. Over time, these ‘water points’ (community-based hand pumps, which are essentially utility service connections) were set up as accounts within slum communities. According to utility managers, bill collection was found to be more efficient with slum communities as compared to other higher income groups. The Water and Sanitation Utility, relatively free from the constraints of intergovernmental politics and interference, has been focussed on reforms that will expand service delivery and coverage across the mega city. Over time, while the Utility’s rationale was to recover non-revenue water and strengthen the institution, engagement with non-state actors has increased. The Utility has also initiated a low income slum wing, mandated specifically to engage and extend services to low income communities. Upon realising the limitations of its own staff, a number of memoranda and arrangements have been proactively set up with civil society actors, to extend services to various slum communities. Policies and programmes have also been proactively adjusted so as to streamline and ‘decouple’ service delivery efforts from bureaucratic malaise, such as land tenure, ownership disputes and other utility bylaws that are anti-poor.

The case studies from Dhaka (See Appendices 1 and 2) reveal success through community mobilisation in the face of adverse state responses. For instance, Kalyanpur Pura Basti (village) was mobilised (provided with hygiene training, capacity to engage municipal officers) by DSK and furnished with a number of water points and sanitation facilities that elevated its human development indicators and image within the community of slum dwellers. Unfortunately, the slum was evicted and demolished three times. Repeatedly, the community’s level of motivation was strengthened with the support of DSK to such an extent that they returned and re-established the slum in the same space as developer wrangling and permit processing stalled formal land development efforts. Similarly, in Karail Basti (village), the persistent coordination of water point establishment between DSK, the local community, DWASA officials and the police against the efforts of criminal water operators stealing public water and piping it through a contaminated water body surrounding the basti (village) and nearby middle

5 Here community mobilisation refers to the long, gradual capacity building of the community through trust building, education, documentation, communication and partnered advocacy for services with municipal officials. The purpose here is not to define community mobilisation in depth, but to demonstrate how partnerships between indigenous, grass roots based NGOs can mobilise community-based organisations (CBOs) representing the most marginalised of the informal sector.
income neighbourhoods resulted in the connection of an official water point in the middle of the basti. In all cases, there is proof that community mobilisation buttressed by a formal level of support from the water and sanitation authority has resulted in positive outcomes of service delivery for slum dwellers.

In the case of *Karachi-Pakistan*, an established and pioneering NGO, Orangi Pilot Project (OPP), has replicated its model of component sharing and low cost sanitation across low income communities and villages along the urban fringes of Karachi, resulting in their land tenure recognition by the municipal authorities. After 30 years of community engagement and mobilisation for service delivery access through the local water utility, the majority of Karachi’s households are now connected to a piped water supply. The NGO’s policy and research capability has repeatedly drawn attention to the high rates of water pilferage and theft by organised criminal gangs. Once thought to be based within the city’s underworld, many of the ‘ultimate beneficiaries’ have been found to be prominent politicians, members of parliament, the senate and even high ranking officials within the military. The water and sewerage board, plagued by inefficiencies and institutional malaise and interference, has been unable to realise the potential of partnering with the NGO in formal terms in order to recover non-revenue water. Field operators and management staff who sympathise with the efforts of the NGO continue to reinforce and support its dissemination to other communities. However, a broad policy and programme of formal engagement through the water and sewage board is not forthcoming, despite the recommendations of consultant reports to explore alternatives for retail service delivery that address non-revenue water and theft.

The case studies from Karachi (See Appendices 3 and 4) reveal the strength of community mobilisation when service delivery and commercial interests are combined. In other words, where resident communities are supported by the efforts of nearby markets and traders there is a faster response time from the service delivery providers to provide a connection. In Sabzi Mandi, the traders were involved in lobbying for a single water connection for the community. While the residents had long lobbied for a connection, it was only when the traders in the nearby market were involved that services were connected. Following the formal connection it was noticed that crime was reduced as local illegal water providers were being marginalised by the public utility. Political intervention, unfortunately, has stymied efforts by the water authorities to expand their reach. Several illegal hydrants have been rigged for bulk water extraction across the city. There are reports that high ranking officials have requested that bulk water hydrants be set up in their jurisdiction, so that they may start up their own business at the expense of the Utility. Where hydrants are not involved, political intervention and jangling between municipal and provincial actors restricts recognition of low income settlements and service delivery to them. For example, in Dhost Muhammad Jungar Goth, a village on

---

6 Ultimate beneficiaries are those who are sponsoring and/or funding illegal hydrants through manpower, distribution, bribery of local officials (police and water utility operators) and revenue collection. Interviews with civil society and municipal actors reveal multiple allegations of upper tier state officials financially benefitting from the resale of pilfered public water supplies through illegal hydrants.
the peri-urban fringe of Karachi, intergovernmental disagreement on the settlement’s jurisdiction is a source of conflict. The municipality as well as the province are unclear as to where the city limits and responsibilities for service delivery lie. As a result, upper tier political actors, leveraging ‘votes for services’ relationship, are threatening local community-based organisation (CBO) leaders with death, should they try to establish a robust water line and sewage main that would sustain services from the city. Efforts by civil society actors continue, but there is still a lot of political resistance both internally and externally to service delivery to low income communities.

In the case of Mumbai-India, a pioneering NGO in sanitation infrastructure, Sulabh International (SI), was engaged by the State to pilot local solutions. However, despite their success in tailored designs with local community actors, the State has continued to insist on scaling up solutions (See Appendices 5 and 6). Mumbai’s highly concentrated core has left little space for sanitation solutions and service delivery facilities. One of the earliest experiments by SI was at Dadar TT bus stand where sufficient space for a toilet block and a high rate of footfall (traffic) that would support ‘pay as you go’ toilet usage. A local entrepreneur was engaged and a mixed use model was employed for the toilet block. The facility paid for itself within a matter of months and continues to be operated as a community run toilet block today. Upon seeing the benefits of such pilots, upper tier actors within the State as well central government opted to promote scaled up and subsidised models of toilet block installation to expedite entrepreneurial involvement and achieving sanitation goals. However, the subsidisation of operations has reduced any competition for maintaining facilities and made operations unsustainable. The result has been the appropriation of each facility by private actors, local mastaans (slum lords) and shop keepers. The lesson from the dense locales of Mumbai and the innovative SI has been the need to engage community at the design stage so as to build operations and maintenance concerns into budget models. The delay of addressing such programme concerns has led to millions of rupees of waste, with no real increase in access to toilet blocks within the growing mega city.

Non-State Actors - Whither State Response
While the preceding results are merely a sample of the research findings, a number of observations with policy implications emerge from the relationships between the local civil society and state actors.

DSK: Having demonstrated exemplary service delivery within Mirpur, along with the opening of water supply to Karail slum, has now led to the expansion of service delivery extension to other parts of Dhaka. The State utility has been pushed to realise its inability to service all stakeholders and engage more NGOs like DSK. DWASA has recognised this and established memorandum of understandings (MoUs).

7 ‘Votes for services’ is rent seeking behaviour, where elected officials withhold the ability of local service providers to deliver until the elected official has a secured place in public office. Such manipulative behaviour results in residents associating services with the elected official, rather than water or other utility bills which support service delivery infrastructure.
OPP RTI: While the NGO exposed water pilferage and water revenue losses as part of reporting efforts, the *absence of broad, formalised state facilitation and collaboration that would secure the relationship with this NGO, has left the organisation and staff vulnerable.*

SI: Details regarding the nuances of local entrepreneurial design and sustainability expose the limitations of the privatised ‘one size fits all’ model. *Absence of state appreciation of local nuances of design has led to unnecessary experimentation with subsidising private sector operations and millions of rupees in outlays through the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission (JNNURM).*

**Policy Implications for State Tiers**

In brief, there are a number of policy areas, which need to tackled by all levels of state. Firstly, there is a need to disentangle upper tier actors from lower tier frontline departments. The role of monitoring and regulation needs to be re-established at the upper tiers of the state with minimal involvement in implementation. Legacy departments at the municipal level need to be aligned to reduce duplication and amalgamated where capacity benefits can be realised. Resources and mandates need to address service delivery needs across all communities. Finally, there should be official recognition and understanding with non-state actors. There needs to be an increase in the social handprint of street level bureaucrats on the communities they serve. This will require highly trained technocrats to be empowered within the communities they serve, with the potential of service delivery self-sufficiency made transparent for all stakeholders.
Appendix 1: Kalyanpur Pura Basti, Dhaka

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slum established at Kalyanpur Pura Basti.</td>
<td>DSK engages slum through local NGOs in an effort to spread hygiene awareness.</td>
<td>Basit residents evicted, assets destroyed, community resettles the slum after prolonged protests.</td>
<td>DSK evicted, assets destroyed, resettling follows, DSK MoU with DWASA.</td>
<td>DSK transfers WP and billing to Basti residents.</td>
<td>DSK sets up additional latrines.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Recognition**
- **Upper Tier**
  - Inability of developers to progress post slum eviction.
- **Lower Tier**
  - NGO CBO mobilisation and resilience during each eviction and resettlement.

**Dialogue**
- Upper tier networks of land owners marginalise slum dweller access to tenure and force evictions.
- Inability to obtain clear recognition and relationship with lower tier department (DWASA).

**Contractual**
- Education and awareness have led to mobilisation of illiterate slum dwellers and engagement of lower tier state actors. Per capita consumption in higher income areas leads to low pressure and neighbourhood pressure to evict slum dwellers. The community’s resilience in resettling demonstrates their resolve despite threats of eviction.
Appendix 2: Karail Basti, Dhaka

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slum of Karail established by migrant workers on 90 acres of public land.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DSK launches targeted water and sanitation project in part of the slum with DFID, WaterAid. Fire destroys part of slum, DSK provides assistance, first measure of trust building.</td>
<td>Population reaches 100,000; DSK WaSH effort expanded to entire slum. Karail Master Plan developed. DSK and CBO engage DWASA with no success.</td>
<td>Construction finally starts on municipal line to Karail. Delays result due to interdepartmental dispute over land ownership.</td>
<td>DWASA reforms and persistence by the CBO and DSK result in opening of additional water lines to Karail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition</td>
<td>Dialogue</td>
<td>Contractual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enable Factors</td>
<td>Dialogue</td>
<td>Disabling Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Tier</td>
<td>Drafting of policies.</td>
<td>Opaque interdepartmental land ownership, neglect of illegal water connections and permitting pilferage.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Tier</td>
<td>Persistent pressure on utility for connections, internal reforms by utility management, formalised relationships between NGO/CBO and utility.</td>
<td>Time to engage, graft at lower tiers of utility.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tension between Enabling and Disabling Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A UNDP funded CBO draft of the Karail Master Plan has led to unity, lobbying, recognition and support from lower tier state actors. Persistent lobbying with DWASA has led to official water connections against the water profiting of criminal groups and the land development interests of upper tier actors. The connections have also been laid despite the disputes of current land ownership between multiple lower and upper tier state actors.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8 DFID: Department for International Development, UK.
9 WaSH: Water Sanitation and Hygiene.
Appendix 3: Sabzi Mandi, Karachi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sabzi Mandi grows as a market.</td>
<td>Sabzi Mandi emerges as a centre of trade and distribution.</td>
<td>Criminal activity noticed by authorities and residents, little access to services.</td>
<td>Traders get together to access services from city.</td>
<td>‘Seamless’ Site renewal facilitated by OPP in working with KWSB.</td>
<td>WATSAN Services provided to all of the community.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recognition</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
<th>Recognition</th>
<th>Dialogue?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enabling Factors</th>
<th>Disabling Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Tier</td>
<td>PPP (Pakistan Peoples’ Party) and MQM (Muttahida Quami Movement) competing interests stall CBO development efforts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Tier</td>
<td>NGO facilitation of documentation and CBO momentum between local business and local resident interests.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tension between Enabling and Disabling Factors

United advocacy by the residents and the market traders for access to services from KWSB led to the implementation of a component sharing arrangement. Subsidisation by market traders for the residents has, thus, sidelined a plethora of illegal service providers and organised criminal interests whose linkages with corrupt upper tier actors had led to encroachments, illegal occupation of land and marginalised services.
Appendix 4: Ghazi Goth, Karachi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Earliest records of Ghazi Goth as a village.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Unexpected growth of people as well as state services restricted to a small police department.</td>
<td>Density increases and soak pits as well as partial septic tanks begin to pressure community health.</td>
<td>OPP RTI and CBO begin to place pressure on KWSB and KMC to provide sanitary and water lines.</td>
<td>Construction begins on water and sanitary lines. As OPP are running project, MQM interference and threats to contractor and residents stalls work.</td>
<td>OPP RTI and CBO are still filing their request for laying the line.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enabling Factors</td>
<td>Recognition</td>
<td>Dialogue</td>
<td>Recognition</td>
<td>Dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Tier</td>
<td>PPP construction and investment push.</td>
<td>MQM threats and interference.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Tier</td>
<td>NGO and CBO persistence and patience.</td>
<td>CBO engagement with the OPP led to mapping and trenches being dug by the KWSB and DCC for water and sewerage. Unfortunately, MQM and PPP wrangling over jurisdiction (influenced in part by nearby commercial development) has led to the stalling of progress and the backfilling of trenches without the lines. Local political actors have also threatened residents who are participating in the CBO and are willing to pay for the internal component portion of the water and sanitation network.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

10 Goth: Town.
11 OPP RTI: Orangi Pilot Project Research and Training Institute.
13 KWSB: Karachi Water and Sewerage Board.
Appendix 5: Dadar, Mumbai

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Twin flush toilets established in India by Sulabh International (SI).</th>
<th>Dadar TT public toilet block established with success due in part to local planning and sustainability.</th>
<th>Bangalore blocks set up through private sector with subsidies. These blocks, along with others fail due to poor design and lack of market value.</th>
<th>Pune toilet blocks set up through state and private actors. State interference in design leads to SI withdrawing from contract.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upper Tier</th>
<th>Lower Tier</th>
<th>Tension between Enabling and Disabling Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enabling Factors</td>
<td>Disabling Factors</td>
<td>MCGM(^{15}) funded work by SI led to the design, construction and operation of over 300 toilet blocks. As larger amounts of project funding were invested by the MMRDA(^{16}) and upper tier actors, local design considerations have been overlooked. A plethora of upper tier actors have increasingly intervened in project design and funding, leading to SI withdrawing from scaling up project work. In these cases, where NGOs among other contractors bid for the work, continuity is broken. In these instances, the money is in the hands of petty bureaucrats and funds are captured by middle men. Where NGOs are given the funds up front to design and sustain the toilet block, local considerations are factored in and the likelihood of project success increases.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recognition and Dialogue</th>
<th>Contracting</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enabling Factors</td>
<td>Disabling Factors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{14}\) O and M: Operations and Maintenance.  
\(^{15}\) MCGM: Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai.  
\(^{16}\) MMRDA: Mumbai Metropolitan Region Development Authority.
## Appendix 6: Dharavi, Mumbai

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50% of the city’s 5.9 million residents live in slums.</td>
<td>Dharavi is targeted by redevelopment projects, with mixed results. SPARC is part of an alliance protesting state development approaches.</td>
<td>SPARC bids for and operates a fraction of the toilet blocks in Dharavi, through networks and contacts engaged at the MMRDA.</td>
<td>MCGM, MMRDA and donors scale up toilet block projects with mixed results. Lack of community engagement, corruption and insufficient O and M considerations.</td>
<td>4,000 more toilet blocks are needed across Dharavi, concerns of scaled up projects vs. CBO engagement abound.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recognition and Dialogue</th>
<th>Contracting</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
<th>Contracting</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Enabling Factors

**Upper Tier**
- MMRDA and other actors recognise and work with SPARC.

**Lower Tier**
- Ability to network with a range of actors across lower and upper tiers.

### Disabling Factors

**Upper Tier**
- Political economy of ‘mastaan’ networks’. Desire to scale up project wise, lack of planning and community engagement, lack of recognition and enabling of lower tier state actors.

**Lower Tier**
- Lack of capacity.

### Tension between Enabling and Disabling Factors

Large scale project results have been mixed due to intergovernmental disagreements on land ownership and red tape. CBO engagement in project delivery without the requisite education and advocacy has also led to poor uptake, usage and maintenance. The roles of lower tier NGOs has been challenged by pressures from upper and lower tier actors. The lack of transparency and clear lines of accountability have also made lower tier engagement and project implementation difficult across a very dense and politicised Dharavi.

---

17 SPARC: Society for the Promotion of Area Resource Centres.
18 Mastaan: Slum Lord.
References


Abstract
This chapter looks at the livelihood options embraced by various ethnic groups in post-conflict Nepalese districts of Rolpa, Bardiya and Ilam as well as the kind and relevance of livelihood services provided by the state to them in these areas. The question of sustainability based on people’s perception of their ‘adopted’ livelihoods is also tackled in the process. The findings from this exploration indicate that in post-conflict circumstances the livelihood options undertaken by citizens vary among social and ethnic groups, and, services provided by the state are meagre especially if disaggregated. Even if better alternatives are available, most people are unaware of them, thus, information asymmetry exists. Not surprisingly, most of the ‘adopted’ and ‘provided’ livelihood options/services are not sustainable which makes future prospects dreary. Providing multiple and alternative livelihood options without proper framework mechanisms has led to negative state-people relationship in a context where conflict has just ended. The key to sustainable livelihoods in such a post-conflict situation can be achieved with a sound policy design based on people’s actual and genuine needs.

* This chapter has been approved as a Research Paper by the referee.
** Dr. Bishnu Raj Upreti and Miss Sony KC are currently coordinating the Secure Livelihoods Research Consortium project (SLRC) led by Overseas Development Institute (ODI) at the Nepal Centre for Contemporary Research, Nepal.
Introduction

The discourse on ‘livelihoods and sustainability’ among development workers and policy makers has undergone various paradigm shifts in the past decades. The 1995 World Summit for Social Development (WSSD) in Copenhagen led to discussions about livelihoods, employment and poverty yet the major focus remained on ‘employment’ (Scoones 2009). The term ‘sustainability’ became visible in 1987 when the Brundtland Report was published (WCED 1987) which then grabbed greater policy attention in the 1992 UN Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) in Rio (Scoones 2007, cited in Scoones 2009). In 1986, the term ‘sustainable livelihoods’ came together for the first time in a report titled ‘Food 2000’ (Scoones 2009). Hence, during the 1990s, ‘livelihoods sustainability’ also became a major focus of many development organisations who advocated and embedded it into their organisational setup (Ashley and Carney 1999; Scoones 1998; Chambers and Conway 1992).

Chambers (1995, p. 174) simply defines ‘livelihood’ as ‘the means of gaining a living’ or ‘a combination of the resources used and the activities undertaken in order to live.’ Moreover, shifts emerged as researchers started viewing and analysing ‘livelihoods’ specifically from the perspective of rural areas of developing countries (Babulo et al. 2008; DFID 2002; Carney 1998; Chambers and Conway 1992). So far, the term ‘livelihoods’ has been associated differently relating to people’s residency such as rural or urban livelihoods, employment such as farming, livestock, gender and social difference and other forms (Scoones 2009).

Livelihood strategies and interventions in developing countries like Nepal are indicated in similar terms. However, in Nepal, the term ‘livelihoods’ has a complex meaning as it is understood differently by different people (Upreti et al. 2012; Upreti and Müller-Böker 2010). One understanding of ‘livelihoods’ is defined at the local level which implies people’s choices and their ability to combine income generation with assets to fulfil a desired outcome (DFID 2002).

Nevertheless, Nepal’s diverse ethnic groups with the majority residing in rural areas generate evidence that the practice of livelihoods varies if examined at the household level. Seddon and Hussein (2002) state that Nepalese in rural areas mostly tend to be vulnerable when it comes to achieving their basic livelihoods and are dependent on their community. Prolonged conflict exacerbated their situation leading to displacement with many migrating to safer places, thus, leaving behind their daily (and often traditional) earning activities. The ethnic groups people belong to also determine their ability or inability to have control or access to resources and gain a spot in private or public sector jobs.

Nepal has rich evidence of various types of livelihood options and interventions provided at both local and national level by the Government and non-government organisations (NGOs) before and after the decade long conflict (1996-2006). Yet documentation of the impact of such support is rare (Upreti et al. 2012). Hence, it is necessary to look into the dimensions of livelihoods by understanding the options available to people from different
Ethnic Groups and their Livelihood Activities and Options in Post-Conflict Nepal

ethnic groups and understand the impact of the services provided by the state based on peoples’ perceptions.

Livelihoods Situation and Strategies in Nepal: From the Past to the Post-conflict

The situation of livelihoods in Nepal has undergone twists and turns in the past decades despite agriculture being the major means of living across the country, particularly in the rural areas. In the past, livelihoods were determined by people’s social status and centuries old practices of caste-based work system. However, the livelihoods picture has undergone paradigm shifts with people gradually entering the public or private sectors besides agriculture, thus, adopting diversification (Sharma and Donini 2012).

Conflict affected people’s livelihoods in relation to human and physical capital as well as individual well-being (Upreti et al. 2012). Women and children were targets of the armed conflict and suffered severe impacts because of their limited movement opportunities as opposed to men who easily moved from one place to another. Paudel and Kattel (2006) report that the armed conflict especially strained the lives of forest-dependent poor in Nepal and shoved the already poor into much vulnerable situations as they lost their resources. Seddon and Hussein (2002) pointed out that about 20% of the population residing in rural areas falls in the category of wealthy landowners, while 80% people are livelihood insecure. The armed conflict and insurgency (especially in rural areas) displaced about 70,425 people between 1996 and 2006 (GoN 2009).

As mentioned earlier, post-conflict multifarious support was provided to people by the state and non-government agencies. From female empowerment to providing skills and trainings to people, the livelihoods options and interests in Nepal are broad. This is because of the various forms of options provided by various organisations targeting specific groups based on organisational interests. For example, the Local Self Governance Act (LSGA) formulated in 1999 by the Government in order to empower local government agencies in Nepal is committed to providing livelihoods support at the grassroot level through community-managed programmes and several capacity building initiatives. There are several international development workers and policy makers who have also contributed to sustainable livelihoods (Upreti et al. 2012). Formulation of the Nepal Peace and Development Strategy (NPDS) 2010-2015 to address the issues of livelihoods and development is a huge step taken by the Government of Nepal (Upreti and KC 2013) in order to improve the livelihoods of rural people.

Despite various interventions, whether small or big, the livelihoods of Nepalese still require much attention. There are various interventions taking place simultaneously in the same areas, thus, creating a confusing situation for people. The issue of livelihood diversification, which is defined as ‘the process in which households construct a diverse portfolio of activities and social support capabilities for survival and in order to improve their living standard’ (Ellis 1999, p. 2) is prominent in Nepal. Studies show that people living in rural areas are increasingly undertaking two or more livelihood activities (besides farming) since farming alone is inadequate for survival (Babulo et al. 2008; Adi 2007).
Upreti and KC (2013) pointed out that without proper intervention on the demand side, future of livelihoods would not improve in Nepal. Additionally, providing livelihood options or a means to earn a living in the form of assets (goats, chicken, seeds, etc.) which is often practiced in Nepal have worked in some parts and failed in others. This is because of lack of proper monitoring or understanding of what people actually want in their lives (Ibid.). Moreover, the use of frameworks, in particular, the 2002 Sustainability Livelihoods Framework (SLF) by the Department for International Development (DFID) has been applied in addressing livelihood issues in rural areas in Nepal, particularly in the forestry sector, despite questions being raised about its practicality (Upreti et al. 2012).

Information and evidence about the coverage of livelihood options based on different ethnic groups is rare and limited to a few projects. For example, the forestry livelihood projects in Nepal are inclined towards community user groups and their access to resources. These projects are also highly gendered with objectives of inclusion of women and different ethnic groups. Moreover, there are speculations, based on the century’s old practices in Nepal that people of lower strata or castes have less access to better livelihood options than those belonging to higher social categories/castes. A study by Piya et al. (2011) on the Chepang\(^1\) and their livelihoods strategies revealed that they undertook diversified livelihood activities such as wage labour and making handicrafts, besides farming. However, their study concluded that despite alternative and multiple sources of livelihoods, the Chepang community required more support as their earnings remain very low.

### Methodology and Conceptual Framework

A total of 3,174 households were surveyed in three districts of Nepal: Rolpa 716, Bardiya 1212 and Ilam 1246\(^2\) between September and November 2012 based on the intensity of conflict in these areas. A clustered sampling strategy was used as a first step to select the villages and then as a second step, households within those clusters were selected. Districts and Village Development Committees (VDCs) were purposively selected. The wards\(^3\) were randomly selected to locate the specific groups of interest and to select research relevant geographical locations. Three VDCs per district were selected based on their degree of accessibility (i.e. better, good or worse). The selection of respondents was also disaggregated by gender, age and ethnicities. It is important to note that the survey does not show ‘representativeness’ at the country level. It achieves ‘representativeness’ at the district/village level based on random sampling.

One of the major focus of the survey was to understand the livelihood activities undertaken by various households based on their social groups/ethnicities. The survey

---

\(^1\) Indigenous group recognised as a hunting community.

\(^2\) Nepal Centre for Contemporary Research (NCCR) in partnership with Overseas Development Institute (ODI) has been engaged in a six year project called ‘Secure Livelihoods Research Consortium (SLRC)’. It conducted a longitudinal survey between September and November 2012 in the three selected districts of Nepal. The research is currently in its third year. The next survey will take place in 2015 among the same households.

\(^3\) Editors’ Note: A ward is a political division in Nepal. Nine wards make up a village development committee (VDC).
had a clear disaggregation of respondents from varied ethnic groups and backgrounds with the hypothesis that there will be variations among these households/individuals and consequently ethnic groups. Moreover, empirical evidence about livelihood options provided by the state to the people was also gathered during the survey to verify the quantitative information.

Using the definition of livelihoods, simply, as ‘a means of living’, this chapter analyses human, social, physical, financial and natural capital, of which four were addressed by Scoones (1998) in the SLF and one, physical capital, added by Carney (1998):

- **Human Capital**: Different ethnic groups/ household members’ knowledge and skills to understand the factors affecting their livelihood options.
- **Social Capital**: Different ethnic groups’ access based on their networks and memberships.
- **Physical Capital**: Peoples’ access to roads (based on livelihood patterns) and requirement for irrigation facilities (e.g. equipment).
- **Financial Capital**: Remittances and social protection transfers acquired to support livelihoods.
- **Natural Capital**: Peoples’ access to natural resources and their dependency on them (if any).

By understanding livelihood standings of various groups and their access to resources, the strategies people adopted during stress or vulnerability were examined. Using the indicators aforementioned an understanding about whether peoples’ livelihoods are solely dependent on one activity or more, given that they ‘adapt to’ other forms of livelihoods when one form is not favourable can be developed. The availability of options for people from different ethnicities when they have to make a daily living, especially with regard to fulfilling their basic needs can be identified based on the access they have in their periphery.

Various ethnic groups identified for the study included Chhetri (the warrior or ruler caste group and the largest caste in Nepal); Brahmin (second largest caste group in Nepal, traditionally educators, scholars and priests of Hinduism); Janajatis (indigenous group), Dalits (untouchables), Madhesis (inhabitants of Tera region), Muslims, and Kirats (indigenous ethnic group of the Himalayas mid-hills).

**Findings from the Survey**

In the context of Nepal, people make their livelihoods through casual labour in agriculture and non-agriculture sector, selling goods or agricultural and forest products, doing small-scale trading, migrating for work to Malaysia, Dubai and Arab countries or within Nepal for wage labour, employment in public and private sectors and paid or unpaid work in households. The survey findings revealed that majority households in Rolpa (94.8%), Ilam (85.9%) and Bardiya (63.8%) were engaged in cultivation, livestock and fishery for their livelihoods. Moreover, rural households (82.0%) were engaged more in cultivation, livestock and fishery than urban households (73.2%).
Livelihood Activities of Various Ethnic Groups

The livelihood activities of different ethnic groups belonging to the three study districts are presented in this section. Some 3,174 respondents were asked to provide information about their personal and family members’ engagement in livelihood activities, if any. The responses were then categorised based on their ethnic groups which is presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Ethnic Groups and their Livelihood Activities (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Own cultivation and livestock</th>
<th>Casual labour in agriculture</th>
<th>Casual labour in non-agriculture</th>
<th>Selling goods</th>
<th>Own Business</th>
<th>Casual labour in agriculture</th>
<th>Private sector in agriculture</th>
<th>Private sector in non-agriculture</th>
<th>Government</th>
<th>Remittances</th>
<th>Social protection</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brahmin / Chhetri</td>
<td>41.8</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1053</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janajatis</td>
<td>52.8</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1503</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dalits</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhesis</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslims</td>
<td>15.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>31.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>3174</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field survey 2012.

Table 1 depicts various ethnic groups and the kind of livelihood activities they were involved in ranging from agriculture to private or government sector. It is evident that majority of people are still dependent on agriculture while least dependent on private sector jobs. It was found that in aggregate, 46% of the total respondents were involved in own cultivation and livestock. Within ethnic groups, the Madhesis (57.9%) outstripped the other groups in terms of involvement in own cultivation, livestock and fishery for livelihoods. There are variances in different social groups’ involvement in own cultivation because of their centuries old practices.

What Sharma and Donini (2012) call ‘livelihoods diversification’, the trend of people gradually moving towards pursuing livelihood activities in other sectors beside agriculture, has been evident from the data. For example, Muslims (51.5%) surpassed the other groups in terms of running their own businesses. They generally do not have agricultural background and are well known as business owners (ranging from small shops to bigger marts).

Nearly 16% of Brahmins/Chhetris were engaged in government service as has been the tradition among the privileged groups. Moreover, education plays a major role if one wishes to enter the government sector and these two ethnic groups are more likely to be educated than the others.

---

4 Ages 6 and above.
The majority of Dalits were involved in casual labour in the non-agricultural sector. Given their history of exclusion in terms of livelihoods, education and other facilities, they are ready to accept any form of work. Also, since casual labour in the non-agriculture sector does not require any fulfilment criteria, they are able to make a living from such work. Interestingly, the Dalits are also able to support their households through social protection transfer. The Government has all kinds of transfers set for Dalits such as scholarships for Dalit children, old age allowance from 60 years while other ethnic groups can only obtain this from the age of 70 years. The Dalit households shared that the transfers assisted them a lot, especially in meeting food requirements for the family.

Livelihood activities of different ethnic groups varied based on their educational status and traditional livelihood practices. People who were educated were mostly involved in other sectors and people with less education were involved in agriculture. Similarly, it was found that the family members with fewer opportunities had gone abroad to fulfil their family members’ desire and sustain their livelihoods. Going abroad and working for a living was considered the best option as people of the study areas had limited alternatives for their survival. This reveals that the people in these three districts have very limited options as there was a growing number of people going abroad for work, some due to real needs and some by following others.

**Role of Remittances**

The Dalits, Madhesis and Brahmin/Chhetris tend to depend on remittances for their living, especially in meeting their basic requirements such as food. OXFAM (2012) also reported that most remittances are used to buy food in the rural areas of Nepal. Empirical evidence showed that remittances are mostly sent from India, although the trend of migration to Gulf countries is also high in the survey areas. The study tried to see any linkages between remittances from abroad and their involvement in own cultivation, livestock and fishery (Table 2).

**Table 2: Livelihood Activities and Remittances**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did your household receive any remittances in the past three years?</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>551</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>1837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>673</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>664</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>2510</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey 2012.*

**Role of Farming**

People of different ethnic groups were also enquired whether they faced any problems while pursuing farming activities. Findings suggest that people faced problems to a certain extent. Though the survey did not dig into understanding the types of problems, empirical evidence suggests that problems are associated with lack of water and difficulty in taking water up to the field, and lack of knowledge about farming...
techniques. Data suggests that ethnicity-wise, majority of the Madhesis and Muslims faced problems associated with farming. However, it is also worth noting that these groups of people are not involved in farming compared to other groups. This could be one reason for them to have expressed their concerns about difficulties in farming.

Table 3: Problems in Pursuing Farming Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Caste/Ethnic Groups</th>
<th>No (%)</th>
<th>Yes (%)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brahmin / Chhetri</td>
<td>63.4</td>
<td>36.6</td>
<td>846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janajatis</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>47.0</td>
<td>1284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dalits</td>
<td>55.8</td>
<td>44.2</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhesis</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>83.7</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslims</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>77.6</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>54.8</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>2560</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey 2012.*

Difficulties in practicing agriculture and failure to address these problems has compelled many to seek other alternatives – one of them being earning remittance money by working abroad. In a situation like this, the Government must initiate different agriculture extension programmes and provide facilities of irrigation so that people are motivated to work in their native country rather than going abroad.

**Livelihood Options**

With regard to livelihoods services, this study makes it evident that in post-conflict circumstances, livelihood options provided to people are meagre with loopholes in targeting. The livelihoods related support services in this survey were identified beforehand (Table 4).

Table 4: Livelihood Options (2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Livelihood Services</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Seeds and tools distribution</td>
<td>2956</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seed money for revolving fund (saving and credit)</td>
<td>3133</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension</td>
<td>3124</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fertilizer vouchers</td>
<td>3129</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goats and pigs for income generation</td>
<td>3011</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skill enhancement trainings</td>
<td>3024</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micro-finance credit system management</td>
<td>3149</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching women about mobilisation of funds</td>
<td>3140</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing information</td>
<td>3158</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposure visits</td>
<td>3146</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers’ Field School</td>
<td>3154</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey 2012.*
Table 4 shows that the percentage of households receiving livelihood support is very low. However, of the various services, 218 households (the highest number) of the 3174 households received seeds and tools. The major issue seems to be that people are generally unaware of the services especially in the areas where households are scattered. This leads to lack of access and information asymmetry.

Table 5: Household Member receiving Seeds and Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Which household member received the support?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Household head</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>33.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>57.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (specify)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field survey 2012.

Table 5 shows that the % of women receiving seeds and tools is the highest. One speculation why this number is high could be because men are busy with their daily labour outside the household and women tend to take up the responsibility of collecting seeds and tools and even attending meetings related to it.

Table 6: Who provided the service?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service Providers</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>27.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National NGOs</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>55.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International NGOs</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN organisations or Donors</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Institutions</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not know</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field survey 2012.

Taking seeds and tools as a base for livelihood transfers, majority of respondents reported that these were provided primarily by national NGOs followed by the Government and international NGOs. In Rolpa, Bardiya and Ilam, national NGOs seem to have played a prominent role in supporting livelihoods of people. However, it seems that their projects fade away soon leaving no forms of sustainability in the livelihoods and income generation activities of people. Also, involvement of the Government seems lower compared to other institutions. It is also worth noting that nearly 5% of the people had no idea who had provided the service (seeds and tools) to them. This could be indicative of the fact that either there is lack of information given by the service provider or a lack of understanding on part of the receiver about who actually provided the service. Most of these people resided in areas or settlements further away from where the
Government or other institutions were based. Their daily labour was limited to working in their own vicinities and travelling to other areas only when required.

Table 7 shows that of the 218 households receiving seeds and tools, the majority (83%) revealed that the transfer actually helped them improve their agricultural production.

Table 7: Seed Distribution and Improvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did the transfer/service improve your agricultural production/other livelihood activity?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>83.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not know</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Survey 2012.

Peoples’ Perceptions about their Livelihood Activities and Sustainability

The survey revealed that people had different perceptions about the livelihood activities they undertook depending on whether or not they received any external support or services. Moreover, rural people from the study areas seem to live their lives one day at a time and that is how they perceive their livelihoods as well. Many households refused services being offered thinking that they would be of little value and make no difference to their survival. A woman from Chhetri ethnicity from Rolpa stated,

*I received some loan money from the poverty alleviation fund and bought chickens. I had around 50 chickens and they all died of diseases. I did not know how to take care of their disease because we do not have veterinary help in this area.*

A farmer from Dalit background upon receiving the seeds stated,

*We get the seeds and support but sometimes they just don’t come out to be good. The main problem we have is irrigation as well. There is no water here and it is difficult to spray water on the vegetables.*

Despite receiving some form of support for income generation, people do not have any backstops after receiving it. This leads to the question sustainability and long term impacts. Moreover, this shows that while people are provided with ‘financial capital’, they lack ‘human capital’/skills about how to actually use the services provided to them. Interestingly, since less than 10% of the total respondents claimed to be receiving livelihoods support, majority of people had not received many of support options mentioned during the survey. One female respondent from Bardiya stated,

*I do not know about any forms of support provided. I have not received anything and neither have my neighbours. If they had I would have known. This area is neglected and no one cares about us. We are poor.*
A man from Ilam who is engaged in a public sector job stated,

*I work for the public sector and I do not know of any organisations that have actually committed to providing support. They come, do their work and go and they don’t leave a good trace in the lives of people. If they did leave good marks, the outcomes would have been good.*

The lack of information about livelihood interventions in some areas also shows that programmes are often patchy and designed to reach only certain areas which are accessible. Geographical challenges often recur as major problems in many cases. However, another reason why certain groups are excluded *en masse* may be due to the fact that similar ethnic groups tend to live/cluster in similar settlements and if these are in isolated areas, they remain ‘un-targeted’.

Moreover, there are people who completely neglect the options offered stating that what they have is enough for them or do not require it as they have family support. A Brahmin woman in her late fifties stated,

*My eldest son sends home remittances and my other son owns a mobile and radio shop. Their earnings are enough for me and my husband. We do not go to receive anything that is being provided. They call us but we ignore. Who would work in the field?*

**Discussion**

Farming is a major source of livelihood in the survey areas, though there has been some diversification after the conflict. Besides farming, people are engaged in private sector jobs; own businesses, and undertake unpaid activities such as taking care of children, cleaning houses, etc. People also depend on remittances from abroad and social protection for their means of living.

In terms of the kinds of livelihoods support offered, as can be seen in Table 4, the list lacks innovative options. The services are also mostly limited to accessible areas. From the survey, it was clear that Rolpa received more attention in terms of receiving livelihoods support after the conflict as compared to Bardiya and Ilam. The types of support reaching people are not only defined by the districts, but the settlements that are either close to or far from governmental or NGO headquarters.

It is worth noticing that Ilam, as compared to other districts, seems to have better livelihood outcomes as well as other facilities. There may be several reasons for this. First, Ilam lies in the eastern part of Nepal, which is considered ‘forward’ in terms of development, thus having access to infrastructure like roads and other facilities. Second, Ilam is famous for various commercial farming activities such as tea cultivation, ginger, chilli, pepper and milk products with better access to national and international markets. Ilam also shares borders with Darjeeling, India, and people are influenced by the Indian system of education and health facilities. The respondents from Ilam were more aware about who the service providers were and what they were offering as well.
Among the social groups, majority of Dalits were aware of the livelihood options and were receiving some form of support. They had positive thinking towards the support. Moreover, some of the projects were directly targeted at this group. The fact that there are different social groups poorer than the Dalit community, including Chhetris or Brahmins who fall in the upper class structure, seems to be highly neglected when it comes to livelihood interventions.

Moreover, it has been clear from the supply side that there are institutions that do not want to reach the remotest areas due to logistic complications. Hence, providing support is mostly inclined towards organisational interest and ability to cover the areas they easily reach.

As far as sustainability is concerned, most of the livelihood programmes do not seem to cover the five capitals as aforementioned. People are already deprived of social capital or lack interaction with and exposure to institutions bolstering the services. Moreover, even if they have the human capital, the lack of exposure suppresses their livelihoods. In one way or the other, people tend to be missing out one of the capitals which hampers their livelihoods. For example, in a VDC of Rolpa called Budagaon, people have skills and knowledge of producing enormous amounts of vegetables and fruits. They also have access to roads but they lack market information and do not have strong linkages.

There seems to be an imbalance between what people have and what they require to strengthen their livelihoods. One of the ways in which the livelihood options of people of these rural areas can be raised is through massive agriculture extension programmes. Almost all the study respondents are dependent upon agriculture and everyone practices agriculture but through traditional technologies. Use of modern technologies to diversify agriculture and produce higher outputs could be a positive approach. Further, the installation of irrigation facilities in these study areas would provide people an opportunity to practice agriculture all year round.

Conclusion
Post-conflict restructuring has been problematic in Nepal despite the Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA) being signed due to the failure to have a stable government. Despite various attempts to provide livelihoods support to various categories of people, including the displaced and marginalised, the study shows that reaching particular ethnic/social groups is much easier than reaching geographically challenged places.

The history of lack of sustainability of projects and programmes has always existed in Nepal and needs urgent attention. However, looking at the geographical terrain and the extent of problems people tend to have, it is quite challenging to reach out to every household especially when they are scarcely populated. The challenges of conducting field work itself in these areas where transportation does not exist proved to be difficult. Moreover, Rolpa and Bardiya were severely affected by the conflict and hence data shows minimal improvements in the lives of people living there. Also, the interventions being offered are often not based on actual local perspectives and needs which is why many do not tend to accept them.
It is also clear that incomes are generated with two or more forms of livelihood sources in most of the households which means that diversification is the key. However, diversifying can undermine the basic livelihoods on which people have been dependent from the past, i.e. agriculture and farming. When people do not receive support in agriculture, they tend to seek other forms of income generating activities. The issue of seasonality also looms when it comes to dependence on ‘nature’ for farming. It may be concluded that majority of the people are still dependent on cultivation and livestock and thus require support in these areas through mechanisms that are planned holistically and sustainably by the state and other service providers.
References


Ellis, F. 1999, Rural Livelihood Diversity in Developing Countries: Evidence and Policy Implications, Overseas Development Institute, London, UK.


Section IV

Fuelling Momentum: Role of Energy and ICT

1. Impact of Information and Communication Technologies on Pakistan’s Economy and Poverty - Mohammad Yasin and Asim Manzoor


3. Deindustrialisation in South Asia: Role of Energy Crises - Bushra Yasmin and Wajeeha Qamar
Impact of Information and Communication Technologies on Pakistan’s Economy and Poverty*
Mohammad Yasin and Asim Manzoor**

Abstract
With only 12,000 telephones for a population of 34 million at the time of independence, Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) have come a long way in Pakistan. Now there are 138 million subscribers of telephone services in the country (PTA 2013). Although some researchers claim that the benefits of enhanced telecommunication connectivity have not been seen across the board, the fact remains that the economic and social benefits of enhanced telecom connectivity and other ICT processes have positively influence the economy of many countries.

During the transition from 2G to 3G, nearly 1.6 million new jobs were added in USA between 2007 and 2011 (Shapiro and Hassett 2012). Another economic study (QUALCOM 2009) indicates that for every 1% increase in a country’s broadband penetration, Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita increases roughly by 10%. PTA (2012) estimates that in Pakistan the share of telecom employment will reach 5% by 2020. Rural areas will have enhanced connectivity because of work being done by the Universal Service Fund (USF) which will significantly improve peoples’ lifestyles and reduce poverty. Reaching out to rural areas will also reduce the digital divide. This chapter briefly traces the history and status of ICTs in Pakistan followed by an in-depth analysis of its impacts on poverty, employment and the country’s overall economy. The role of Universal Service Fund and the Government’s telecom tax regime is also discussed. Finally, concrete recommendations are made for the consideration of policy makers.

* This chapter has been approved as a Working Paper by the referee. It was written before the auction of 3/4G technologies in Pakistan.
** Brig (Retd) Mohammad Yasin is a chartered Engineer in Electronics and is member of various engineering institutions at home and abroad. He coordinates the Study Group on Information Technology and Telecommunications. Currently, he is working at the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) in Pakistan as Senior Advisor Capacity Building. Engr. Asim Manzoor is an emerging Telecom Engineering professional with over ten years of comprehensive management, investigation and engineering experience in diversified project design. He is currently working as Deputy Director (Technical) at Pakistan Telecommunication Authority.
ICTs Journey in Pakistan

In Pakistan, ICTs have come a long way. Till the mid-eighties, the telecommunication sector was the monopoly of the Government and telephone density was less than 1%. A study conducted by PTA (2008) reports that at the time of independence there were only 12,000 telephones in East Pakistan (now Bangladesh) and West Pakistan combined. It was said that if one applied for a telephone connection, s/he was placed on a long waiting list. One’s turn to acquire the installation of the connection at times took years. Booking of long distance calls also took many hours before it matured, while overseas phone calls seldom came through, unless someone was a Very Important Person (VIP). The speech quality was so poor that one had to shout in order to compensate for the line or channel loss. In the mid-60s, one of the authors was working as a communication officer in General Headquarters (Pakistan Army). Every Sunday, he visited the Central Telegraph and Telephone Office in Rawalpindi where he would work with the department staff to adjust speech gains between Rawalpindi city and various stations for which the Army had hired speech channels on permanent basis. It was a very taxing exercise. The Army’s link between East and West Pakistan was a high frequency 10 kilowatt transmitter on both sides. The communication quality and efficiency depended on ionospheric conditions. Confidentiality of the information passed was also a big problem.

In urban areas, for emergencies, the general public used telegrams. One had to fill out a form with the message which was charged according to the number of words. To save money, selection of words was as few as possible, and sometimes the words were so few that the message was hard to understand by the recipient. Telegraph facility was not available in rural areas and people physically travelled with the message, which was a huge investment of time and effort.

Although in 1991, the Government had planned to open up the ICT sector to private investors, the real breakthrough came in 1993, when the Study Group on Information Technology and Telecommunication¹ working in the Prime Minister’s Committee for Research and Analysis wrote to the Prime Minister of Pakistan to liberalise the ICT sector and open it up to private investors. The group recommended that this would establish information and communication highways. The then Prime Minister, Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif approved the proposal. But, on the same day his government was dismissed by President Ghulam Ishaq Khan.

¹ The Study Group on Information and Communication comprises of consultants, scientists, educationists, economists and other stakeholders who meet periodically to discuss and evaluate current developments in the rapidly evolving fields of telecommunication, computers, data processing, networking, mass media, and other issues related to generation, processing, management and use of information. The purpose of the Group and its meetings is to create awareness amongst both the public and private sector of the importance of exploiting useful information resources, address existing difficulties and foresee future developments which might have an impact on the national economy and society at large. The Group also undertakes the preparation of policy and planning recommendations that could subsequently be pursued by relevant agencies.
In 1993, when the Prime Minister’s Committee was dissolved, the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) invited the Study Group on IT and Telecom to work from its platform. Since then, SDPI has been spearheading the Group’s work. In 1994, SDPI gave a proposal to the President of Pakistan, Farooq Laghari, to deregulate the sector and establish a regulatory authority.

In 2001, Pakistan Telecommunication Corporation Limited (PTCL) launched its mobile and data services subsidiaries by the name of Ufone and PakNet respectively. But the senders and receivers both had to pay for calls made from mobile phones. In 2002, the Government introduced a regulation that ‘only the calling party’ would have to pay. A revolution in the mobile telephony followed. Since then, the regulator, PTA, has been playing a vital role in successfully steering the sector. The separation of Ministry of Information Technology from the Ministry of Science and Technology in November 2002 gave further impetus to the IT and Telecom sector.

**The Evolution of Pakistan’s ICT Sector and its Status**

Whereas, there has been a revolutionary increase in mobile teledensity, from about 41% in 2006-07 to about 72% in 2012-13, there has been an insignificant increase in the fixed lines or in wireless local loop (Figure 1). In fact, fixed line teledensity has declined. This means that the future lies in mobile telephony because of its versatility and flexibility. Even the fixed local loop (the last mile from the telephone exchange to the subscriber’s hand set), wireless is replacing fixed lines.

**Figure 1: Teledensity in Pakistan**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Wireless Local Loop</th>
<th>Cellular Mobile</th>
<th>Local Loop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006-07</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-08</td>
<td>40.9</td>
<td>54.7</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-09</td>
<td>(58.0)</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-10</td>
<td>(62.0)</td>
<td>60.4</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-11</td>
<td>(64.1)</td>
<td>64.8</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-12</td>
<td>(68.3)</td>
<td>68.39</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>(71.7)</td>
<td>(75.21)</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PTA 2014b.
Broadband Subscribers
The term ‘broadband’ refers to the wide bandwidth characteristics of a transmission medium and its ability to transport multiple signals and traffic types simultaneously on different types of medium. Broadband in general refers to high-speed internet service having minimum of 256 Kbps (kilo bits per second) data rate. As mentioned earlier, economic studies indicate that for every 1% increase in a country’s broadband internet penetration, GDP per capita increases roughly by 10%. Broadband can provide access to a wide range of resources, services, and products in the field of data transmission, education, health and high speed internet connection.

Figure 2 shows the increasing trend of Pakistan’s broadband users who crossed 3.35 million in January 2014, an increase from 3.02 million in October 2013 (PTA 2014a).

Figure 2: Subscribers using Various Broadband Technologies

Source: Authors’ compilation.
Note: DSL: Digital Subscriber Line; WiMAX: World Interoperability for Microwave Access; EvDO: Evolution Data Optimized or Enhanced Voice-Data Only; HFC: Hybrid Fibre Coaxial and FTTH: Fibre-To-The-Home.

Telecom Contribution to the National Exchequer
The telecom sector has been making significant contributions to the national exchequer (Figure 3) despite the fact that general sales tax has been steadily increasing. The Pakistan Telecom Authority earns handsome profits which it deposits in government funds. An important concession for the general public was made when activation tax was reduced in 2012-13 (PTA 2014b).
Can ICTs Reduce Poverty?

Estimates for 113 countries over a 20-year period show a positive link between telecommunications infrastructure and income, as well as between telecommunications infrastructure and gross domestic product (Torero and von Braun 2006, p. 338).

Poverty is multidimensional. It can include anything from lack of food, health, education, scarcity of resources, lack of access to information (sending and receiving information) to the absence of opportunities for employment. de Silva and Zainudeen (2007, p. 1) write:

*The economic as well as social benefits from such [telecommunications] access can, in theory enable people to graduate from poverty and also contribute more widely to development. Thus, it can be argued that inequality in access to telecom services can lead to limitations in fighting poverty.*

Their work...

*...takes a unique look at telecom access and studies the perceived impacts of direct access to telecom services, that is, telephone ownership at household level at the ‘Bottom of the Pyramid’ in five developing Asian countries. It focuses on the perceived economic impact (positive and negative) of telecom ownership in terms of its potential to increase indirect income generation capacity or save on expenditure or transactions costs. The findings reveal that some telecom users do perceive the economic benefits of direct access to be high (Ibid. p.1).*
The economic impact of ICTs in South Asia have been far reaching. With exponential subscriber growth and substantial fiscal benefits, ICTs have been one of the strongholds of every South Asian country’s economy. Table 1 provides an overview of developments in South Asian region for the years 2005 and 2009:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Regional Telecom Indicators – South Asia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Yasin 2012, p. 4.
Note: *for 2007 and **for 2008.

Pakistan leads in teledensity and comparative subscriber growth among its neighbouring countries during the reported period. Since telecom reforms were at their apex during this era in these countries, investment rose substantially over time. Investment growth has been impressive for Pakistan and Bangladesh as well. Similar is the case with total revenues.

Contributions of the sector, especially, telecom have been substantial in numbers over the past years. The contribution of Indian telecom sector to the growth of India’s economy is immense. It is directly contributing towards the country’s GDP and has a multiplier effect on growth as it goes on connecting people and businesses.

Does Adoption of Emerging ICTs Enhance Employment?
Shapiro and Hassett (2012) show that during the transition from 2G to 3G in 2007, more than 1.58 million new jobs were added in the United States economy from April 2007 to June 2011. Every 10% increase in the adoption added more than 231,000 new jobs in America. Their research found that:

10 percentage point gain in penetration of a new generation of wireless technology in a given quarter leads to 0.07 percentage point gain in employment in the following quarter and results in continuing gains in the subsequent quarters (Ibid. p.1).

According to a study by QUALCOM Incorporated (2009), the free flow of information and communication is paramount to the progress of any society worldwide because it enhances socio-economic development which results in increased employment:

The expansion of 3G [4G] networks, devices and services in countries is enhancing the quality of life and providing expanded economic opportunities, both in the public and private sectors (Ibid. p.1).
The report confirms that 3G [4G] is improving the lives of underserved citizens, bridging the 'digital-divide' as it is able to deliver richer communication services in financial, healthcare and education sectors (Ibid.). Citing from Minges (2003), it indicates that:

*For every one percent increase in a country’s broadband internet penetration, GDP per capita increases roughly by 10 percent (USD) and one percent increase in mobile penetration results in a GDP per capita increase of roughly five percent* (QUALCOM 2009, p.1).

Consequently, the report concludes that ‘Direct investment in communication technology development is strongly correlated with an increase in job creation’ (Ibid. p. 1). However, a study by the Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development [OECD] (2005) showed that ICTs on their own do little to reduce poverty. ICTs can complement the other forms of infrastructure like roads, healthcare centres, educational institutions, electricity, etc. Accordingly ‘access to market data can assist market expansion and reduce transaction costs….and traders can reduce risk of overstocking by using ICTs to confirm supply and demand’ (OECD 2005, p. 18). Emergency warnings through electronic, print and social media can also substantially reduce risks and the combination of rural roads and ICTs can lead to more effective responses to health, education, and travel (Ibid.).

ICTs are important for both the poor and the rich, however, the prime concern of the poor is to earn bread and butter whereas, those who can afford ICTs can further facilitate and ease their lives by using e-commerce, e-banking, online transactions and other e-services. Because of information overload, without ICTs, companies, banks and government institutions work at reduced efficiency levels. Some of them may even stall. This means poor economy, reduced employment / employment opportunities, less development, and difficulties in information processing resulting in increased poverty.

**Economic Benefits of Mobile Telephony for Pakistan**

In 2008, a survey was sponsored by PTA and conducted by Islamabad-based Telecom Engineering and Consulting House (TEACH). Respondents were asked about the impact of mobile telephony on their business, employment related activities, advantages along with its disadvantages. 27% said that with the use of ICT services their sales had increased, 25.5% saved on travel/time, and 34.9% said their incomes had increased (PTA 2008). 44% were able to find jobs, 67% improved their performance at work, 36% were able to obtain additional work and 73% said that mobile telephony facilitated their jobs (Ibid.). The respondents also mentioned advantages and disadvantages of mobile telephony. The findings of survey are given in Table 2 which shows how ICTs contributed towards enhancing employment and reducing poverty in Pakistan:
Table 2: Economic Benefits of Mobile Telephony
(Percentage of Respondents)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Rural</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase in sales</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>27.2</td>
<td>27.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saved time / travel</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>31.8</td>
<td>25.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in income</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>34.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Employment Related Activities
(Percentage of Respondents)
- Find a job / work : 44.2
- Improved performance at work : 67.3
- Obtaining additional work : 36.4
- Facilitated job : 73.4

Other Advantages Mentioned
- Decreased intercity trips and expenditure
- Improved access to doctors / hospitals
- Improved children’s education
- Improved students’ knowledge
- Improved gender empowerment
- Improved social cohesion
- Improved emergency responses

Disadvantages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Disadvantages</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Created unnecessary tension</td>
<td>47.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased expenses</td>
<td>76.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bad effects on health</td>
<td>26.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found dangerous during driving</td>
<td>83.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of theft /snatching of cell phone</td>
<td>77.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Found disturbing at work</td>
<td>63.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receiving calls at inconvenient times</td>
<td>67.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PTA 2008.

ICTs Future Outlook in Pakistan
According to the Planning Commission of Pakistan, as quoted by PTA (2012, p. 65), the population of Pakistan is growing at the rate of over 2%. Seven years from now, the population is estimated to reach 195 million. Currently, about 38% of the population lives in cities. Trend of migrating from rural to urban areas for better prospects continues. The increase in ICT users is related to an increase in population, better educational and health systems. Currently, over 132 million people are users of mobile telephones (PTA 2013).
Impact of Information and Communication Technologies on Pakistan’s Economy and Poverty

Table 3: Population Distribution and Total Market Potential (in millions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Above 65 years</th>
<th>Below 15 years</th>
<th>Extremely poor</th>
<th>Potential Telecom Market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>137.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>152.5</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>21.2</td>
<td>84.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>166.52</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>118.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015 F</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>129.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020 F</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>143.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PTA 2012.

The above statistics show that by 2020, ICT subscribers will stand at about 143 million. These figures show the number of Subscribers Identity Modules (SIMs) that would be in use. Considering the fact that some subscribers own more than one SIM, the actual number of subscribers may be even more than 143 million. This potential ICT market will have a significant impact on the country’s economy. By 2020, other infrastructure, like roads to rural areas, health and educational institutions could further enhance the number of ICT subscribers.

Table 4: ICT Role in Economy – Linking the Future

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Employment (Million)</th>
<th>Share of Telecom Employment (%)</th>
<th>Telecom FDI (USD Millions)</th>
<th>Telecom Revenue (PKR Billions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>71.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>494</td>
<td>144.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>374</td>
<td>314.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015 F</td>
<td>56.71</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>440.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020 F</td>
<td>60.07</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>617.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PTA 2012.

From Table 4, it is obvious that there will be a gradual increase in total employment in Pakistan and so is the case for employment in the telecom sector. By 2020, the share of ICTs in employment will be 5%. Similarly, telecom revenues will touch PKR 617 million. However, foreign direct investment is likely to decrease as indicated because of saturation in the ICT sector. FDI of US$ 459 million in 2015 will be a high jump because of the potential adoption of 3G/4G technologies (PTA 2012).

Contribution of Universal Service Fund (USF) in Reducing Digital Divide

The Universal Service Fund (USF) was established on 12 December 2006 by the Government of Pakistan’s Ministry of Information Technology to spread benefits of the telecom revolution to all corners of Pakistan. According to their website:

---

Editors’ Note: As of 13 August 2014: 1 US$ = PKR 99.35.

January 2010: 1 US$ = PKR 84.40.

Editors’ Note: As of 13 August 2014: 1 US$ = PKR 99.35.
USF promotes the development of telecommunication services in un-served and under-served areas throughout the length and breadth of the country. The fund consists of contributions (1.5% of adjusted revenues) by the telecom operators with no government funding involved. To utilise this fund for achievement of the targets, it was decided to follow a Corporate Model. This led to the establishment of a USF Company under Section 42 of the Companies Ordinance 1984. USF has an independent Board of Directors equally balanced between four members from the government and four from the private sector [industry and consumers] (Universal Service Fund n.d. a).

The structure of USF Company is first of its kind in Pakistan. With the help of USF, telecom operators are now focusing on the rural population as well as the urban with Rural Telecom Projects starting in areas like Turbat, Sibi, Zhob, Kalat, Mastung, Khuzdar, Sukkur, Larkana, Dadu, D.I. Khan, Malakand, D.G Khan and Bahawalpur. It is hoped that these projects will serve 12,000 un-served villages, with 3,800 of these already being provided telecom services. Not only this, these rural telecom projects are also ‘green’ because operators are being given subsidies by USF to power their infrastructure with renewable energy sources. 66 base stations are now actively being run on solar power (Pakistan Observer 2013). The following are some of the other contributions of USF in Pakistan:

Under the Broadband Programme, 260 previously un-served towns now have close to 474,000 USF-funded broadband connections. Subsidy winning service-providers are obliged to provide free Broadband Internet to all higher-secondary schools, libraries and colleges in their areas. So far more than 1,000 such institutions have been covered and around 300 Community Broadband Centres have also been established for those who cannot afford to have their own computers. To meet the need for voice, data, and video in ‘tehsil’ headquarters, optic fibre connectivity is in progress. Of the approximately 400 tehsils, 30% ‘tehsils’ still do not have fibre connectivity. To take broadband Internet to the villages, USF has launched a Programme to establish Universal Tele-Centres (UTCs). These projects aim at introducing and promoting e-services in the country especially where non-availability of computers and computer literacy are the main issues. Finally, USF will set-up telemedicine networks around large cities like Rawalpindi, Karachi and Multan. Through this project, Jinnah Post Graduate Medical Centre, Karachi, Nishtar Medical College, Multan and Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi are being connected with 12 remote sites (USF n.d. b).

Impact on Investment of Enhanced Taxes on ICT Services

With the exception of Sri Lanka, in Pakistan, value added taxes on telecom services are the highest in the South Asia region as shown in Table 5:
Table 5: Regional Countries Comparison of Value Added Taxes GST on Telecom Services 2009-2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Value Added Tax</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>19.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>13% (VAT); 10% service tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Collated by PTA from various country websites.*

For the financial year 2013-14, the Government of Pakistan has increased taxes to 29% on scratch cards. This is step in the wrong direction as it will deter investment in this sector, especially foreign direct investment. ICT companies may not want to invest in underserved and unserved areas, thus slowing down the process of bridging the ‘digital divide’ and poverty reduction. If the Government is genuinely keen to see the positive impacts of ICTs on the country’s economy, it will have to reduce taxes on the establishment of infrastructure and services.

**Recommendations**

Emerging ICTs have made economic borders between nations virtually irrelevant. It is, therefore, essential that the Government of Pakistan create an environment in which the development of ICTs in the country reaches its full potential. To bridge the ‘digital divide’, the unserved and underserved areas in the country must get IT and telecom connectivity. This will bring the benefit of education and healthcare to these areas. The Universal Service Fund can play the required role for this purpose. The Government’s act to withdraw PKR 62 billion⁸ to pay the circular debt would slow down the work of providing IT and telecom connectivity to rural population, thus, sustaining the ‘digital divide’.

The Government’s measures to auction 3G/4G spectrum has picked up momentum and this is a positive sign.⁹ Because of avoidable delays, the country has suffered huge financial losses on this front and been left behind other neighbouring countries in adopting this technology. In addition, it has also suffered a trust tax with foreign investors.

The Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan must ensure that all universities, colleges and high schools get access to internet connectivity. Access to class lectures, data bases and libraries of high ranking international educational institutes must be

---

⁴ Telecom News 2011.
⁵ OECD 2012.
⁶ S.I.R. n.d.
⁷ BMCM 2012.
⁸ Editors’ Note: As of 13 August 2014: 1 US$ = PKR 99.35.
⁹ Editors’ Note: This chapter was submitted for review in January 2014 before the decision about 3G/4G spectrum auction.
facilitated and gradually this should be made a prerequisite for accreditation. Setting up of ICT centres in unserved rural areas must remain a high priority programme.

To cater to the increasing demands of mobile telephony and data transfer, the existing infrastructure needs continued updating and improvements and should be optimally shared. The Pakistan Telecom Authority can play an important role in this respect.

The PTA has had a good track record. However, because of non-existent authority in the past, its effectiveness has significantly suffered. It would do well to institutionalise succession planning, especially at the top level. PTA’s effectiveness is vital for ensuring optimum ICT services, which are vital in this age of globalisation. Political interference in its working must stop and this important regulator must be made fully independent. Other recommendations include the following:

- To ensure uninterrupted mobile telephone services, throughout the country, all base transceivers stations (BTS) should be shifted to solar power.
- To reduce ‘digital divide’ in the country, the Government should review and reduce the value added taxes imposed on telecom services which are currently second highest in the region.
- Development of local content (softwares, applications, portals and websites in local languages) must be given high priority.
- Pakistan’s e-ranking is six steps below Bangladesh and 32 steps below India, because in Pakistan, policies and plans are made that go unmonitored and thus not effectively evaluated. If steps are taken to correct the situation, Pakistan’s progress in ICTs will accelerate.

**Conclusion**

Pakistan has quickly advanced in Information Technology and Telecommunications. With the introduction of ‘calling party pays’ regime, there was a revolutionary expansion in the cellular mobile telephony. According to various studies, adoption of 3G/4G technologies results in significant economic benefits in terms of enhanced employment opportunities, increased GDP and improved quality of life. It is estimated that by 2020, telecom market will reach 143 million subscribers in Pakistan. The potential telecom market will have a significant impact on the economy. Telecom connectivity will be extended to major parts of rural areas. However, it must be acknowledged that ICTs alone can do little to impact the economy and reduce poverty; they can only complement other infrastructure like roads, educational institutions and healthcare centres. If the USF maintains its momentum in rural connectivity, the population of these areas will have improved agriculture, education and health facilities.
References


Renewable Energy Market: Potential Source of Pakistan-India Co-operation*
Aisha Azhar†

Abstract
Given the energy crises in Pakistan, there is a dire need to introduce Renewable Energy Systems (RES) on a large scale in the country. Despite initiatives undertaken by the Government, successful implementation of RES is still very limited. Given the potential progress made by India in developing and implementing RES, Pakistan needs to learn about its successful RES projects’ development and implementation as well as develop renewable energy trade relations with India.

This paper offers policy directions for enhancing information diffusion and strengthening the RE market between the two countries. Some of the policy suggestions include developing a common wind and hydel energy market between India and Pakistan; developing vertical integration with India as developer and Pakistan as retailer for RE related products; importing renewable energy certificates from India in the short run and benchmark the development of RECs market locally as a best practice in the long run; and reducing the trust deficit by strengthening political relations between the two countries.

* This chapter has been approved as an Essay by the referee.
† Dr. Aisha Azhar is a Fulbright Scholar, presently working as an Assistant Professor at the UCP Business School, University of Central Punjab, Pakistan. She has a doctorate in Public Administration and Policy from Florida State University, USA. Her areas of interest include public management, non-profit management, public policy, and sustainability.
**Introduction**

Pakistan’s weak energy sector is causing significant damage to the country’s growth and has had substantial negative impacts on employment, country’s exports, Gross Domestic Product (GDP), and poverty alleviation (Kessides 2013). There are several reasons for the severe shortfall of energy in Pakistan such as lack of strategic prediction of supply and demand; lack of up-gradation of existing plants; inefficient and below-cost recovery tariff structures; and growing circular debt (Ibid.). Another major reason for energy chaos in the country is the focus on traditional sources of energy generation, such as oil and gas, instead of exploiting renewable energy sources, learning opportunities and exchange programmes from neighbouring countries in the region.

Given the energy crises in Pakistan, there is a dire need to introduce Renewable Energy Systems (RES) in the country. Despite initiatives undertaken by the Government, successful implementation of RES is still very limited (Mirza et al. 2009). Fortunately, Pakistan is blessed with a wealth of renewable resources including solar, hydropower, geothermal, wind and biomass (World Bank 2013). With the exception of few solar and wind energy projects, most of the country’s renewable energy potential has not been explored and developed adequately (Ibid.).

This is understandable because despite renewable technology’s increasing importance and deployment, the execution of RES is still an emerging phenomenon worldwide (Fouquet 2013). For a developing country like Pakistan, it is even more challenging to develop and implement new technologies and systems. Seeking support from other neighbouring countries such as India, thus, would be helpful for the successful development and implementation of RES in Pakistan.

India, over the years, has shown phenomenal progress in building solar, wind and biogas plants (Ministry of New and Renewable Technology, n.d.). Policies for sharing successful RES projects across the border, therefore, can play a great role in introduction of environmental friendly renewable technologies in Pakistan.

Most of the barriers in introducing and implementing RES that exist in Pakistan are similar to those in India: less developed markets for inviting foreign investors, weak policy and regulatory frameworks, political instabilities and other institutional and technical issues for accepting new technologies and systems (Xu 2014; Saif 2012). These barriers can be addressed more strategically if renewable energy projects implemented in India, such as development of wind farms or mandatory renewable energy certificates (Kumar and Agarwala 2013), are used as models in Pakistan.

**Overview of Renewable Energy in Pakistan and India: Opportunity for a Policy Innovation Diffusion Framework**

Pakistan has high potential for renewable energy production which has been elaborated in many studies (Sheikh 2010; Sahir and Qureshi 2008; Aziz et al. 2008). Amongst others, wind, solar, and hydel energy resources are considered the most substantial in terms of having the highest potential for electricity generation. Due to its location in the region of high solar irradiance, Pakistan provides the most ideal location for generating
solar energy. Wind energy has also shown strong technical potential, particularly in the southern regions of Balochistan and Sindh. Hydro, being a sustainable energy resource, has been the only resource which has been used and developed most effectively for large-scale power generation (Yazdanei and Rutherford 2010).

While four energy policies were instituted between 1985 till 2002 that stressed the need for developing renewable energy resources, none actually provided a framework for the successful implementation of renewable projects in Pakistan (Yazdanei and Rutherford 2010). The first energy policy formulated in 1985 primarily focused on attracting private investors to the energy sector. The subsequent policies instituted in 1994, 1998, and 2002 were aimed at utilising local resources, particularly renewable energy resources. The Alternative Energy Development Board (AEDB) established in 2003 introduced the Pakistan Renewable Energy Policy (2006) for developing renewable energy with serious attention. This was Pakistan’s first energy policy that focused specifically on the development and promotion of renewable energy projects with a goal of producing 10% of Pakistan’s energy supply mix with RES. The objectives and features of the policy are provided in Table 1.

Table 1: Pakistan Renewable Energy Policy 2006 Objectives and Salient Features

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Increase the deployment of renewable energy technologies (thereby diversifying the energy supply mix and increasing energy security).** | Private investors are invited to submit proposals in the following categories:  
- for selling power to the grid exclusively (Independent Power Producer or IPP projects)  
- for self-use and sale to the utility, if desired (captive power projects)  
- for small-scale standalone projects (isolated grid power projects). |
| **Promote private sector investment in RETs through incentives and by developing renewable energy markets;**  
- develop measures to mobilise financing;  
- facilitate the development of a domestic RET manufacturing industry (thereby lowering costs, improving service, generating employment and improving local technical skills);  
- Increase per capita energy consumption and social welfare, especially in remote and rural areas where poverty can be alleviated and the burden on women collecting biomass fuel can be reduced. | -For all non-IPP projects, Letters of Intent (LOI), Letters of Support (LOS) and Implementation Agreements (IA) with the government are not required.  
- Producers may sell surplus electricity to the grid at a given point in time and draw electricity, as required, at a later point in time (known as net metering and billing). |
- Promote environmental protection and awareness.
- Producers are permitted to inject electricity at one point on the grid and receive an equivalent amount at another location upon paying a wheeling charge (accounting for transmission charges).
- There are no customs or sales taxes on equipment.
- There are no income taxes.
- IPP projects may obtain carbon credits.
- IPPs are protected against resource variability (e.g. variable wind speeds or water flows); this risk is borne by the power purchaser.
- It is mandatory for power distribution utilities to purchase all power offered by renewable energy projects.


This policy generated some interest in developing renewable energy projects for large scale power generation and claimed to provide incentives for manufacturing RE equipment locally and developing energy markets locally and internationally. However, several factors inhibited potential progress in implementing the policy, including lack of competition with conventional power generation; market, financial, and institutional barriers; poor infrastructure and information; lack of access to technology; lack of capacity and training; and lack of social awareness and acceptance (Yazdanei and Rutherford 2010).

The energy breakdown for India’s primary commercial energy shows that about 64% of the total primary energy is generated through fossil fuels, whereas 33% of the total account for traditional biomass (Pillai and Banerjee 2009). It is the only country in the world that has a separate Ministry of New and Renewable Energy (MNRE) (Ibid.). Given increasing energy demand, India has been constantly exploring, developing and implementing renewable technologies. Wind and solar energy are considered the most developed RES in India with 68.9% of renewable energy coming from wind energy, whereas solar energy accounts for 4.59% of the renewable energy installed capacity (Goswami 2013).
Table 2: Status of Current Power Production and Electricity Access and Demand in India and Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specification</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current Power Production (Mega Watt), Installed Capacity</td>
<td>189,620</td>
<td>20,922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of population with electricity access</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Generation (MW)</td>
<td>7,88,355</td>
<td>95,358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity Demand (MW)</td>
<td>8,61,591</td>
<td>1,44,711</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surplus/Deficit</td>
<td>-8.55</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future Demand (Giga watt per Hour (GWH))</td>
<td>2550,000</td>
<td>261,523</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Synthesised from data in Iqbal and Tabish (2012).

According to Alam (2006), regional co-operation between neighbouring countries singularly plays the most significant role in securing environmentally sound and safe energy development (Alam 2006). India has signed several RES related contracts with Nepal and Bhutan for hydel energy projects (Bhutto et al. 2012), and agreements with China, Japan and other countries in East Asia (World Bank 2010 cited in Kher 2012). As far as Pakistan’s case is concerned, most of the contracts with India have been focusing upon traditional technologies and systems for energy generation, such as developing gas pipeline projects (India Energy Forum & Observer Research Foundation 2013). However, given the political tensions between the two countries, large-scale projects like the Iran-Pakistan-India gas pipeline have been negatively affected (Kher 2012). No potential agreements have been signed between the two nations to exploit RES. For renewable technology and systems, Pakistan has, however, signed contracts and memorandum of understanding with several other countries including China, Germany, USA and other countries.

Given that India has made some remarkable progress in the development and implementation of RES, it would be beneficial for Pakistan to learn from the experiences of its neighbouring country. While technology development is critical, more innovation is required at the policy level to facilitate diffusion of ideas across the borders and assist implementation of technology.

Policy innovation diffusion is a contemporary lens for studying public policy innovation that examines the factors that lead governments to adopt something new (McLendon 2003). More clearly, the diffusion of innovation is defined as:

"...the process by which an innovation is communicated through certain channels over time among members of a social system (Rogers 2003, p. 11)."

McLendon (2003, p. 113), further explains that:

"...policy innovation in intrinsically intergovernmental in nature; states (countries) emulate the policy adoption behaviour of their peers."
The regional diffusion model further assumes imitating policy behaviours of a country’s geographically proximate neighbours. Under this diffusion framework, RES ideas and experiences employed in India can float to Pakistan. However, this cannot be done without strengthening the level of coordination between the two countries. The next section identifies some policy directions for strengthening the economic, political, institutional relations for Indo-Pak to support RES diffusion and implementation.

Developing Renewable Energy Market in Pakistan: Avenues of Collaboration with India

Wind Energy Market between India and Pakistan
A common renewable energy market needs to be developed between Pakistan and India to promote the trade of renewable technologies and products (e.g. solar panels, wind turbines, or hydrogen fuel cells) and determine a national and regional tariff structure for importing wind energy products. India and Pakistan can mutually invest in developing wind energy by using the wind power ports in Pakistan such as Jhimpir, Gharo, Keti Bunder and Bin Qasim in Sindh and other ports in Swat which provide good wind conditions and potential platforms for generating wind energy (Hameedi 2012; Hassan 2005; BBC News 2002). In this regard, Pakistan can exploit Indian experience of developing wind energy technology and creating a subsequent wind energy market. As mentioned previously, regional diffusion assumes imitating policy behaviours of neighbouring countries to reduce risks and uncertainties. India, the fifth largest wind mill producer in the world, has been manufacturing low cost wind turbines and has established several large scale wind farms throughout the country (Bhutto et al. 2013). Seeking insights from India’s successful experiences of the development of wind technology and farms, Pakistan could develop linkages with Indian wind energy industry and develop a low-cost wind energy production setup. Developing contracts with Indian wind manufacturers, instead of high-cost oriented European companies, could pave the way for strengthening trade relations between the two countries in addition to cost reductions in wind energy projects.

Several wind energy companies under the Alternative Energy Development Board (AEDB) are setting up their businesses in Pakistan such as Master Wind Energy Limited, Sachal Energy Development Private Limited, Metro Power Co. Private Limited and others. However, many of them have, so far, only been allocated land for a few small-scale projects; given generation licenses by the National Electric Power Regulatory Authority (NEPRA), and received letters of intent from AEDB. And so, with the exception of few like Suntech, China Electric Equipment Group (CEEG), and China Three Gorges Technology, most companies and their wind energy projects have not made sufficient progress. There are several reasons behind this, the most significant of which has been the non-availability of reliable long-term surface wind speed data. Contracting with other countries, such as India in this case requires reliable long-term wind data to develop feasibility studies. Data collection in this regard, also requires standard international procedures. Additionally, early experiences of wind turbine
installations in different parts of Sindh and Balochistan suffered due to low quality turbines and weak maintenance infrastructure (World Energy Council 2000). With strategic partnerships in wind energy resources and locations, India and Pakistan can develop a strong base for wind energy. Gaining insights from collecting standardised data, designing, procuring, manufacturing and installing wind mills may reduce initial installation and learning costs for large-scale projects. Both countries need to set policies to enhance mutual co-operation, exchange technical expertise and utilise manufacturing locations to increase production capacities for managing energy needs. Providing contracting services to Pakistan would enhance India’s wind industry to export its services to neighbouring countries. Such potential partnerships, however, require the development of regional institutions or trade blocs to guide and monitor successful implementation.

**Hydel Development Projects**

Bhutto et al. (2013) citing Bhattacharya and Jana (2009) and Srivastava and Misra (2007) write that India, amongst all South Asian countries, has shown the highest potential in utilising hydropower energy. Moreover, it is ranked fifth in the world in terms of usable hydel potential. The country has a well-developed manufacturing base for small hydropower equipment including turbines, generators and control equipment and has set long-term contracts in providing technical and financial assistance to Nepal and Bhutan for developing their hydropower potential. However, except for the Indus Water Treaty with India, Pakistan has not developed any productive hydel power projects with India. Bhutto et al. (2012), citing the Economic Survey of Pakistan for 2009-2010, write that hydropower makes 6595 MW or 32% of total installed capacity of the country. Given the scope of working with India on hydel energy development, Pakistan can cover its prevailing energy deficit.

**Vertical Integration**

South Asian countries prefer to trade with Europe and North America instead of with each other (Kher 2012). Trade relations are, thus, more competitive rather than complementary. India’s economic dominance and comparative advantage of ‘wide-scale products’ and labour force has resulted in ‘asymmetric trade relations’ with other neighbouring countries in the region (Ibid., p. 8). Energy related firms generally ‘participate in both the generation (upstream) and retail (downstream) markets simultaneously, which is referred to in economic literature as vertical integration’ (Daglish and de Braganca 2011, p. 1). As mentioned earlier, India and Pakistan can sign a joint treaty for producing wind energy. India can exploit the manufacturing base of wind turbines and Pakistan can import low cost wind energy from India. Additionally, Pakistan can use those turbines to produce wind energy at its most valuable wind ports. This type of vertical integration or joint venture/s would expand the production base by benefitting from economies of scale and scope (Ibid.).

**Renewable Energy Certificates (RECs) Trading**

Renewable Energy Certificate System (RECS) is a policy instrument to promote power generation with renewable energy resources. The main idea is to create a voluntary
system where green certificates are traded and allow green energy producers to reach green consumers worldwide. An energy certificate provides evidence of the production of specific quantity of RE along with the methodology of trading the certificate. All renewable sources such as solar, wind, hydro and biomass can be used to generate the energy certificates. The benefits of Green Certificates Systems are: they can be traded across country boundaries; they overcome physical electricity transfer; as a best practice they give incentives to most economical sites; remove the requirement of electricity to be supplied and demanded at the same time, and they can prove compliance with public support schemes (Osterkorn and Lemaire 2009).

In India, RECS was successfully implemented through Perform Achieve and Trade (PAT) mechanism in 2010 (Kumar and Agarwala 2013). The Electricity Act 2003 of India made it compulsory for power distribution companies to obtain a certain percentage of their total energy requirement from renewable sources (Ibid.). Pakistan has also made some advancement towards implementation of RECS. Private distributors import RECs from India and other countries and sell to the distributors and national grid as customers to increase the electricity capacity (see, for example, companies holding REC products on Environmental Experts). However, implementing RECs at this small scale is not beneficial for addressing the issues of excessive power shortages in the country.

RECs are tradable across borders, so it is recommended to develop a market between India and Pakistan for the trade of green certificates. However, one of the constraints identified for trading RECs internationally is lack of a stable legal framework to address obligations and penalties adequately (Osterkorn and Lemaire 2009). Renewable energy institutions, such as AEDB (Pakistan) and MNRET (India) need to design policies for handling obligations and determining feed-in-tariffs and tax incentives for the import and export of RECs.

**Building Trust between India and Pakistan for Trade in Renewable Energy**

India and Pakistan have been locked in political conflicts based on geographic boundaries and conservative perceptions of religion, ethnicity, and caste systems prevailing in two nations since their independence. These conflicts have increased the trust deficit between them. The six decades long conflicts of insurgency in Jammu and Kashmir, Siachen, and the frequent trespassing and violation of national territorial waters have often led to tense relations that have impeded the potential flow of information as a form of diffusion and prospective regional co-operation in almost all fields. Both countries, being the largest economies of South Asia (Kher 2012), have significant potential to carry out RE projects together, but political and geographic disputes hinder these prospects. Examples can be cited from the recent past of energy projects such as the coal and gas pipelines (Iran-Pakistan-India) which resulted in discouraging results due to non-cooperative attitudes from either side (India Energy Forum & Observer Research Foundation 2013). Consequently, both countries have had to pay significantly high price to import gas from other countries like Saudi Arabia (Ibid.). It is possible that ‘once the political trust' and credible ‘commitments to co-operation’ are established between the
governments, ‘technical and commercial problems’ would be ‘relatively simple to resolve’ (Ibid., p.14).

**Strengthening Knowledge Management Infrastructure**

The successful execution of RES is not possible without the active participation of academia and educational institutions. Professional organisations and research institutes need to pay special attention to promoting research and capacity building for handling RE projects, for example case studies on the issues of implementing RE certificates. Research-based academic institutions should get more funding for establishing RES based centres of excellence in collaboration with other universities in both countries. For example, there can be potential collaboration with India for setting up an indigenous industry for the manufacturing of Photovoltaic (PV) cells and rural electrification using PV technology for which free of cost trainings could be provided by India using the Asian and Pacific Centre for Transfer of Technology (APCTT) platform of the United Nations (Green Pakistan 2011). These can have the potential of leading to commercialisation, creating business opportunities and encouraging sustainable and environmental friendly energy generation.

**Improving Policy Implementation**

Policy implementation is about how policies are put into effect by a government (Winter 2006; Howlett and Ramesh 2003). As mentioned earlier, Pakistan’s energy policies instituted between 1985 and 2002 could not function properly because there was no implementation framework suggested (Yanzdanei and Rutherford 2010). Those policies broadly focused upon attracting foreign investment and utilising local resources. However, the reason for less attention to implementation strategies can be attributed to the fact that demand for energy during those early years was not as huge as it is now.

There are several heavily promoted and publicised bilateral or multilateral contracts signed between the governments of Pakistan and India for increasing energy capacity in Pakistan, particularly a power purchase agreement made between the two countries in 2013. Under this agreement, India has offered to provide Pakistan with 1200 megawatt electricity. Initially, Pakistan would import 500 MW from India which would likely be enhanced to 1200 MW at a later stage (Bhutta 2014). According to the Islamabad Chambers of Commerce and Industry (n.d.), it was decided to supply this electricity through the construction of small transmission pipelines in Punjab. For implementing this agreement, the two countries were supposed to construct 45 kilometer 220 KV transmission lines within six months after signing the formal contract. The agreement was set for five years which would be extendable for another five years based upon the success of the project. The progress of this project, to date, is almost zero as the procurement details and techno-commercial and foreign affairs issues still need to be sorted out (Bhutta 2014). After one year of signing the contract, only the route of transmission has been identified, while the expected costs would be known only after a feasibility study has been done, which so far is far from the horizon (Ibid.). Several other issues such as tariff matters and Pakistan’s Foreign Office’s permission to the Water and Power Ministry to fly to India to finalise the details of the agreement are still pending. At
one point in time, Indian authorities tried to cancel the agreement, whereas Pakistan insisted on retaining the agreement given the severe crises of energy in the country.

Contrary to the situation given above, India has successfully implemented its Power Purchase Agreements with other neighbouring countries including Bangladesh, Bhutan, Nepal, and Sri Lanka. Under these agreements, India supplied 250 MW of power to Bangladesh in 2013, while Bhutan, Nepal and Sri Lanka are already importing power from India.

As pointed out earlier, several political, institutional and administrative issues constrain the potential progress for implementing bilateral contracts, even the simplest and most basic of matters such as foreign affairs departments inhibiting regular meetings of key personnel from concerned departments, slow progress in finalising feasibility reports and getting them approved, weak communication mechanisms among technical and bureaucratic departments, and weak governance mechanisms to monitor performance. These factors can be important drivers or impediments in policy implementation (Hill and Hupe 2009).

Pakistan’s federal and provincial governments need to ensure that renewable energy projects proposed by the private sector in the country or from the region are examined critically and, if feasible, should be given a pass or fail status on immediate basis. More practical assignments should be initiated through public-private partnerships to enhance RES performance (Hameedi 2012).

**Conclusion**

Heavy initial investment cost and challenging implementation requirements (Fouquet 2013), have made it difficult to develop a RES economy in Pakistan (Mirza et al. 2009). Moreover, development has been hindered given weak policy mechanisms and inadequate infrastructure.

Given the potential progress of RES in India, Pakistan should develop and strengthen RES-related trade relations with India. Developing a common RE wind market and kick-starting hydelpower projects can be an important start. Similarly, importing Renewable Energy Certificates (RECs) initially from India and later developing them locally or exporting internationally can open up new avenues for investment and exploration. One can only be cautiously optimistic about RECs because the technical facilities and proper infrastructure required for their successful implementation takes a long time.

However, when it comes to Pakistan and India, the most critical element for strengthening regional co-operation on RES related trade is to fill the huge trust deficit and build confidence between two countries. The recent bilateral dialogue, between Prime Ministers of the two countries (Nawaz Sharif-Pakistan and Manmohan Singh-India) in America in 2013 can be taken as a positive step towards repairing broken bridges. Pakistan should take opportunities like this to collaborate with India on trade and energy related projects.
References


Deindustrialisation in Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka: Role of Energy Crises*
Bushra Yasmin and Wajeeha Qamar**

Abstract
Deindustrialisation has long been considered an indicator of economic development and maturity and has been treated as a normal ‘result of industrial dynamism’ (Rowthorn and Ramaswamy 1999, p. 19). However, the declining share of industrial value added in total Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and employment in developing countries is considered ‘premature deindustrialisation’ (Tregenna 2011) due to various socio-economic and political reasons. The energy crisis (power shortages, distribution losses and international oil price volatility etc.) in South Asian countries is expected to play a major role in undermining the growth of its industrial sector.

This chapter is an attempt to identify the role of oil price volatility and energy shortage behind industrial downfall in Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka from 1971-2010. The Johansen Cointegration Technique and Error Correction Model are applied for estimation purposes. Additionally, the Impulse Response Function (IRF) is used to find out the response of a one-time shock on the selected variables. Electricity production, consumption and power distribution losses appeared as major factors in determining the time path of deindustrialisation, whereas oil price volatility yielded a negative and significant effect only for Pakistan. Moreover, as the energy crises emerged as a major threat to the industrial sector of all three countries according to the findings, it is recommended that governments should develop well-integrated plans and seek regional cooperation to tackle the problem jointly.

* This chapter has been approved as a Working Paper by the referee.
** Dr. Bushra Yasmin is an Associate Professor and Chairperson of the Department of Economics at the Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan. Ms Wajeeha Qamar is an M.Phil student at the Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.
Introduction

Development theories show that ‘economic development’ passed through a static traditional agricultural sector with surplus labour towards a dynamic and capital-intensive industrial sector. A well-established industrial base then led economies towards long-run economic growth with a gradual movement towards the more innovative services sector (Galor 2005). The contraction of agricultural and manufacturing sector and the emergence of the services sector have been viewed in literature as a natural outcome of economic development and are associated with rising living standards.1 There is, however, little evidence that shifts in the pattern of expenditures between services and manufacturing can explain the ‘secular’ shift of employment out of manufacturing into services (Baumol and Benhabib 1989; Rowthorn and Wells 1987).2

Rowthorn and Wells (1987) referred to deindustrialisation as a result of ‘productivity growth differences’ and considered it a normal occurrence of ‘industrial dynamism’. Hence, structural transformations in the form of deindustrialisation ensued in developed countries at a much higher level of income per capita/standard of living as compared to developing countries. Developing countries are following two distinct approaches in their development process: ‘pre-mature deindustrialisation’ and ‘services revolution’.

During the 18th and 20th century Industrial Revolution in developed and developing countries respectively, Chenery (1960) and Kaldor (1966) stressed the role of industrialisation as an engine of growth in economic development. But most recently the idea of ‘industrial revolution’ has been replaced by the idea of ‘service revolution’. Kaldor (1966) in a seminal paper provided the rationale for regarding the industrial sector an engine of growth by introducing the concept of dynamic economies of scale of this sector. Additionally, manufacturing sector growth has also been considered a potent source of external balance. But, given the momentous growth of the services sector in developing countries like China and India, this sector too is now being considered an additional engine of economic growth. According to Ghani and Kharas (2010, p.1):

China and India have been recognised for rapid economic growth. . . . China has a global reputation for exporting manufactured goods and India has a reputation for exporting modern services.

However, the experience is not the same for other South Asian countries where the situation is being regarded as ‘pre-mature deindustrialisation’. Deindustrialisation in developing countries is ‘premature’ if it occurs at a lower level of income per capita ‘than the levels at which advanced countries deindustrialised earlier’ (Tregenna 2011, p. 9). Additionally, it is associated with trade and financial liberalisation since open economies

---

1 It is postulated that if services are ‘superior’ goods, then consumers would increase their relative demand for services as per capita income increases. This would in turn cause a decline in output and employment in the manufacturing sector (Saeger 1997, p.583).
have greater competition that leads to contraction of less-competitive industries in particular countries.

Historically, the service sector has been growing at a rapid pace in South Asian countries, e.g. 57.7% in Pakistan; 65% in India; 54% in Bangladesh and 58% in Sri Lanka; nevertheless in developed countries its share is around 75%. It also appears that structural transformation is not going that well in the case of South Asia where industrial sector is lagging behind in the accumulation of benefits from such transformation due to issues like energy crises, and, unstable law and order situation. Admittedly, the South Asian region is rich in energy resources which, however, remain untapped and unexplored. The commercial use of energy resources is drastically increasing due to high population growth.

Trends of either jump toward services sector or a gradual shift away from the industrial sector may also be due to institutional factors like inadequate policy adoption or meagre support from macroeconomic indicators. More specifically, the energy crises along with industrial policies and trade liberalisation in South Asian countries may be accountable for subordinating industrial sector growth. The following section looks at the reasons and causes behind deindustrialisation in the developed and developing world.

**Causes of Deindustrialisation**

**Evidence from the Developed World**

The services sector has been growing in the developed world since the 1970s and economists consider this both a form of ‘restructuring’ and ‘creative destruction’. This transition has been attributed to higher productivity growth in the industrial sector, North-South trade and outsourcing of manufacturing activities to the labour abundant developing countries (Lee and Woplin 2006; Alderson 1999). Alderson (1999) analysed the impact of globalisation on the process of deindustrialisation in selected Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries. By using panel data fixed effect regression technique, he concluded that the fall in manufacturing employment in the developed world was the result of outflow of direct investment and North-South trade. His findings indicated that economic development in these countries had reached a point after which there is a decline in manufacturing employment. However, Rowthorn and Ramaswamy (1999) established that deindustrialisation in advanced economies is the result of the economic development and higher productivity of manufacturing sector as compared to other sectors. The role of North-South trade and problems faced by manufacturing sector in these economies has little contribution towards the process of deindustrialisation.

Nickell, Redding and Swaffield (2008) explained that across OECD countries, difference in the pace of deindustrialisation can be attributed mainly to the differences in productivity across manufacturing, agricultural and services sector. Apart from that, differences in relative prices, technology and factor endowment also play a vital role in determining the pace of deindustrialisation.
Evidence from the Developing World

The phenomenon of deindustrialisation is viewed rather pessimistically in the developing world. It is seen as a process of betrayal by industrial workers and as propaganda to deprive the developing world from its industrial power (Cowie and Heathcott 2003). The Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and World Bank are considered responsible for the low per capita growth of Sub-Saharan Africa since it has not resulted in export competitiveness of the industrial sector due to technology transfer, rather it has caused a decline in performance of the industrial sector as compared to the period before the adoption of the SAP (Noorbakhsh and Paloni 1999).

According to Palma (2005 and 2008), the developing world has been battling the declining share of industrial sector in GDP or employment because of policy shifts faced by most economies. Trade and financial liberalisation has resulted in an inverse relationship between manufacturing employment and income per capita. Dasgupta and Singh (2006) provided linkages between deindustrialisation at low levels of income, jobless growth and development of the informal sector in India. They considered the term ‘premature deindustrialisation’ as negative because of its implications for growth lowering capacity and growth of the industrial sector.

For the Latin American countries, Brady, Kaya and Gereffi (2008) suggested that deindustrialising took place in these countries despite the sheer need of a strong industrial base because of the Southern Common Market (Mercosur) trade agreement, dependency on the United States, inward foreign direct investment inflows, military spending and institutional problems.

As can be seen, the reasons for deindustrialisation in the developed and developing world have followed somewhat different trajectories.

Deindustrialisation and the Electricity Crisis: Evidence from Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka (1971-2010)

The following section will try to see how the growing demands for energy in South Asian countries of Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka could be impacting their economic growth patterns leading to deindustrialisation:

1970s: In the 1970s, Pakistan adopted India’s state-led, heavy manufacturing based industrialisation strategy. Separation of East Pakistan, war with India, oil price shocks and public deficits reduced the country’s manufacturing growth from 7.8% in the 1960s to 2.8% in 1970s (GoP 2012 b). In India, the Industrial Policy Resolution of 1977 focused on small scale industries, labour intensive technologies and creation of buffer stocks for industrial raw materials (GoI 2009). Industrial growth was 6.9% in 1978, but then oil price shock led to a drastic decline of -3.2% in 1979 (World Bank 2012). Sri Lankan economy was facing stagnation until 1977 when it moved towards liberalisation. Limits were imposed on government investment along with increased encouragement of
foreign direct investment (FDI) and decentralisation (Dias 1987). The share of industrial sector to the GDP was 23.8% for the same time period (World Bank 2012).

The performance of power sector in Pakistan was not that meagre; rather the cost of production and demand of electricity were quite low as the total consumption of electricity in the 1970s was 7,739 Gigawatt Hour (GWH) against the generation of 11,373 GWH on average (GoP 2012a). In India, the central Government started power generation and transmission once the Electric Supply Act of 1975 was amended. However, the supply of electric power remained 10% less than the demand (GoI 1979). Central Electricity Board was the sole supplier of electricity in the Sri Lankan region where the installed capacity was 0.522 million kilowatt [Mkw] (US EIA 2010).

1980s: This decade witnessed a reversal of nationalisation policies with a mixed economy and import substitution industrialisation strategy in Pakistan. Expansion in domestic demand led to industrial growth almost equal to that of the 60s. However, the industrial sector growth was unbalanced and inefficient as most of the investment was concentrated in textile and sugar industries and hence the value addition of industrial sector in GDP was 23.2% which was slightly above as compared to the 22.7% of 1970s (World Bank 2012). In India, the industrial policy was modified with gradual loosening of controls, and a greater willingness to import technology and foreign private capital to modernise its manufacturing sector. Public investment in infrastructure and energy production stepped up along with de-licensing and reduction in imports’ control to upgrade industrial technology (Nagaraj 2003). The industrial sector, hence, had a modest average growth rate of 6.1% for the decade indicating positive impact of the policy reforms. The Sri Lankan industrial policy was characterised by incentives for foreign investment including the establishment of Greater Colombo Economic Commission (GCEC) which was assigned the task to establish and operate the Free Investment Zones. By the end of 1988, GCEC assumed the approval of 276 industrial projects (Dias 1987). The growth of industrial sector by the end of the decade was 7.5%, however, on an average it was about 4.5% and the share of industry to GDP rose to 29.6% in that decade (World Bank 2012).

In the power sector, the concept of Integrated Energy Planning and Policy Formulation (IEP) and the institutional structure was introduced in the early 80s in Pakistan. However, IEP lost favour with the international institutions and the task was given to the private sector in the form of Independent Power Plants (IPPs). Instead of adding to additional capacity in public sector, the establishment of IPPs proved to be the first step towards power crisis of subsequent years in Pakistan. The power sector of India grew by 11.3% to meet productive demand of the country as 62% of electricity was consumed by the industrial sector in the second half of the decade (GoI 1989). The Lanka Electric Company (LECO) was established in 1984 for balanced distribution of electricity in Sri Lanka. Hydropower and thermal power remained the only source of power and total electricity generation was 2.459 kilowatt (kW) against the net consumption of 2.054 kW though the capacity rose to 1.0075 kW on average (US EIA 2010).


1990s: The industrial sector performance of Pakistan was disappointing in the 1990s as the growth of large-scale manufacturing reduced to 4.7% in the first half and 2.5% in the second half of the decade from the 8.2% in 1989 (GoP 2012a). The implementation of Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) led to privatisation, liberalisation and deregulation which created an anti-industrialisation bias in the country. The value addition of industrial sector was 24.3% against the 49.4% by the services sector. The industrial sector in India grew at an average rate of 5.7% in the 1990s. Industrial licensing was abolished for most of the industries except those related to security and strategic concerns. Investment in infrastructural development by private sector was encouraged as public sector investment declined (GoI 2009). The decade of 1990s witnessed a successful privatisation programme and substantial FDI in Sri Lanka. The policy of deregulation and liberalisation continued in the 90s, but the share of industry to GDP remained lower at 22.1%. However, the growth of industry was satisfactory at 6.7% (World Bank 2012). The country experienced severe drought and power cuts in 1996, but despite that the country was able to revive at the end of the year owing to the role of institutional set up in economy (United Nations 2004).

Pakistan’s power policy of 1994 was based on cost-plus-return basis with 15-18% internal rate of return along with the repayment of fixed as well as variable cost of production in terms of US dollars irrespective of the efficiency of Pakistan Electric Power Company (PEPCO)/ Water and Power Development Authority (WAPDA) and Karachi Electric Supply Company (KESC) (Munir and Khalid 2012). The power shortfall rose to 17.2% in the whole of India although the total generation capacity was 69,000 megawatts (MW). Thermal potential of the country was high, but most plants were installed only on paper, and hence, the shortfall jumped to 30% (Smith 1993). The Sri Lankan power cuts of 1996 urged the need for reforms in the electricity sector and a Power Sector Reforms Project (PSRP) was approved by the cabinet. It consisted of more generation plants under hydro and thermal sources, independent power producers and a regulatory commission. The total electricity generation rose to 4.6935 kilowatt (kW) against the net consumption of 3.7908 kW (US EIA 2010).

2000 onward: The industrial performance of Pakistan has remained highly volatile as the growth rate of industrial sector was 12.1% in 2005, while it drastically declined to -3.6% in 2009 (GoP 2012a). The first half of the decade was accompanied by sound macroeconomic policies, strengthening domestic demand and suitable financial conditions which encouraged industrial sector growth. But the severe energy shortage, global recession, oil price hike and sharp depreciation of Rupee in terms of US dollar led to the decline of industrial sector growth (Jaleel 2012). In the 2000s, Information Technology revolutionised the Indian economy as the growth rate of industrial sector averaged to 8.1% for the decade. The improved performance was the result of deregulation and liberalisation, 100% FDI in manufacturing activities under the Special Economic Zones and further de-licensing (GoI 2009). The industrial sector of Sri Lanka grew by 5.1% which was slightly below the previous decade. The Sri Lankan economy faced a civil war, cyclones and debt crisis in 2001 and earthquake in 2004 while in general, the oil crisis and global recession in the late 2000s imposed hurdles in the way of
economic development. Despite the crisis, the industrial share in GDP was satisfactory at 28.7%.

In Pakistan, the demand for electricity has been rising enormously e.g. the number of electricity consumers increased from 7.9 million in 1992 to 19.9 million in 2008 along with shortfall which was recorded at 37% as demand for electricity was 11,509 MW against the supply of 7237 MW (Khan 2012). These issues were the direct outcome of poor power policies adopted in 1994 and 2002. The modification of fuel mix between hydro and thermal from 60:40 in 1980 to 30:70 in 2000 raised the cost of generating electricity from 1.03 kWh (kilowatt hour) Pakistani Rupees to 9.58 kW (Munir and Khalid 2012). The Integrated Energy Policy (IEP) of India is again in focus for its effectiveness in the current shortfall of energy sources, enhancing utilisation of existing resources with the development of optimum energy mix. Presently, India has an installed power generation capacity of 205,340 MW of electricity, but it does not meet the total demand. The major source of electricity is coal accounting for 56.65% of total generation, but the shortage faced by the economy has made businesses expensive to operate (GoI 2010). In Sri Lanka, electricity generation and consumption for the decade was 8.428 kilowatt (kW) and 6.958 kW respectively, while the installed capacity was 2.429 million kilowatt (Mkw) on average (US EIA 2010). Electricity Regulatory Authority (ERA) was established and the Ceylon Electricity Board (CEB) owned 75% of installed capacity, while the IPPs owned rest of the 25% (Karunanayake 2007). However, the economy has to convert to alternate power sources to sustain demand as 25% of the population in 2009 was without electricity.
Figure 1 provides the trends in sectoral value added and the energy sector variables in Pakistan. Industrial sector value added has been fluctuating in Pakistan, while the services sector depicts a rising share in value added over the time. On the contrary, the agricultural sector cut short of the industrial sector’s value addition and declined tremendously.

*Source:* Extracted from World Bank (2012).
Figure 2 reflects the growing shortage in electricity from 1971-2010. Significant volatility is observed in electricity demand and supply that reflects the vulnerable performance of the power sector in Pakistan. Growth touched negative digits in later years as is the case for electricity consumption.

Source: Extracted from World Bank (2012).
Note: GELC and GELP- Growth Rate of Electricity Consumption and Production, respectively.
It appears from Figure 3 that India is facing structural transformation where agricultural sector declined over time and services sector replaced the industrial sector’s position in the path of economic development. But this phenomenon is not recent, it started in the 70s and per capita income was quite lower in India as comparison to the time when developed countries were facing deindustrialisation. The de-linking of services sector growth from that of industrial can be verified by the empirical findings carried out in subsequent section of this chapter.
Figure 4 reflects growing shortage of power sources in 2000 and a large variation in the growth of electricity demand and supply in India. In the early years, this problem was not as prominent as in this decade. A tremendous surge towards the service sector may be due to rising issues in power sector that directly hampered industrial sector growth.

Source: Extracted from World Bank (2012).
Note: GELC and GELP- Growth Rate of Electricity Consumption and Production, respectively.
Figure 5: Sectoral Value Added (Sri Lanka)

Source: Extracted from World Bank (2012).
Note: IVAD-Industrial Value Added; AVAD-Agriculture Value Added; SVAD-Services Value Added.

Figure 6: Electricity Production and Consumption Growth (Sri Lanka)

Source: Extracted from World Bank (2012).
Note: GELC and GELP- Growth Rate of Electricity Consumption and Production, respectively.
Comparatively, the figures from Sri Lanka are not as dismal as Pakistan and India. Figure 5 depicts a higher and ever rising trend in value addition of the services sector in overall GDP, while industrial value added remained stagnant. Electricity shortage is not very sharp and declined from initial decade to later years.

Methodology

Model Specification and Data Description

The impact of energy crises on deindustrialisation is empirically estimated for Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka from 1971-2010, by specifying regression equations, for each country, including major hypothetically contributing factors in the deindustrialisation equation. The regression equation used in this study is specified below:

$$IVAD_t = \alpha + \beta_1ELC_t + \beta_2ELP_t + \beta_3ELOSS_t + \beta_4VOP_t + \beta_5GM_t + \beta_6ENM_t + \beta_7SVAD_t + \mu$$

Where,
- $IVAD_t$ = Industrial Sector Value Added in GDP
- $ELC_t$ = Growth rate of Electricity Consumption (kWh)
- $ELP_t$ = Growth rate of Electricity Production (kWh)
- $ELOSS_t$ = Growth rate of Power Transmission and Distribution Loss (kWh)
- $VOP_t$ = Volatility in International Oil Prices
- $GM_t$ = Growth rate of Imports
- $ENM_t$ = Energy Imports as percentage of Energy Use
- $SVAD_t$ = Services Sector Value Added in GDP

Deindustrialisation is measured by industrial value added in GDP. Generally, the total electricity production and consumption, measured in kWh, are expected to have positive relationship with the industrial value added in GDP. However, the disaggregated industrial and domestic use for electricity may yield alternate effect, depending upon the extent to which, power shortage makes the nature of domestic and industrial demand.

---

3 Since the pooling of time dimensional panel data involves various complications, separate regressions were executed for each country. To mention few of these complications: first it introduces substantial amount of unobserved heterogeneity; second, it compresses the information belonging to institutional and structural differences across countries. And most importantly, the pooled series is mostly integrated at level and does not yield cointegrating vectors (Bretung and Pesaran 2005).

4 Trade liberalisation and industrial policy dummies were used in the model as exogenous variables. For trade liberalisation, a value 1 is assigned to the post-trade liberalisation period i.e., 1988, 1990 and 1997 onward for Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka respectively. Similarly, for industrial policy dummy, the value 1 is assigned to the successful industrial plans over given time periods of each country in contrast to the assigned value 0 for pre-trade liberalisation period and unsuccessful industrial policies respectively.
antagonistic. But, the data for our sample was not available in disaggregated form and hence, the hypothetical impact of consumption may be either positive or negative on the industrial value added. The power transmission and distribution losses make the availability of electricity to industrial sector vulnerable and depress production processes. In this regard, the expected sign of electricity loss for all countries is negative.

International oil price volatility is expected to affect domestic industrial value added negatively, while industrial exports and imports are both expected to have positive impact on industrial value added. The reason behind this is the export-led growth hypothesis that has remained a major trade policy concern in developing countries in the last two decades. It is a major source of foreign exchange earnings that not only promote industrial sector directly, but also make imported technology and materials for industrial growth handy. Similarly, heavy reliance of industrial sector on imports, import intensity of industrial production and less competitive export base of South Asian countries signifies the role of industrial imports.

In order to measure the volatility of international oil prices, GARCH variance series was derived using Generalised Autoregressive Conditional Heteroscedasticity (GARCH) technique. Following Aizenman and Marion (1993), the forecasting equation is specified to determine unexpected part as measure of uncertainty for oil prices.

\[ P_t = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 T + \alpha_3 P_{t-1} + \alpha_4 P_{t-2} + \epsilon_t \]  \hspace{1cm} (1)

Where \( P_t \) is the variable under consideration, \( T \) is time trend; \( \alpha_1 \) is an intercept, \( \alpha_2 \) and \( \alpha_4 \) are the autoregressive parameters and \( \epsilon_t \) is the error term. After estimating eq. (1), the GARCH term (\( \sigma^2_t \)) will be regressed on one year lag of error term square and its own lag. Following is the equation for that purpose:

\[ \sigma^2_t = \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 \epsilon^2_{t-1} + \delta_1 \sigma^2_{t-1} \]  \hspace{1cm} (2)

The data on all variables is collected from the World Development Indicators published by World Bank (2012).

**Estimation Technique**

The time series components of variables are usually expected to be non-stationary and are subject to spurious regression parameters. Therefore, the first step is to check the stationarity properties of the series. This study used the Augmented Dickey Fuller test (1979) that serves to identify the order of integration of all variables in the model. The ADF test includes the estimation of following regression:
Deindustrialisation in Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka: Role of Energy Crises

\[ \Delta X_t = \alpha + \beta t + \gamma_i X_{t-1} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \varphi_i \Delta X_{t-1} + \varepsilon_t \]  

(1)

Where \( X_t \) is the variable under consideration, \( \Delta \) is the first difference operator, \( t \) captures the time trend, \( \varepsilon_t \) is the random error term and \( n \) is the maximum lag length. The optimal lag length is determined to ensure that the error term is white noise, while \( \alpha, \beta, \gamma \) and \( \varphi \) are the parameters to be estimated. Non-rejection of the null hypothesis depicts the presence of unit root. Henceforward, the selection of an optimal lag length is essential at the onset of Cointegration analysis because multivariate Cointegration analysis is very sensitive to the lag length selection. This was done with two available criterions, namely Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) and Schwarz Information Criterion (SIC). Afterwards, the study applied Johansen and Juselius (1990) Cointegration Technique for each country to find out the long-run effects of electricity production and consumption and distribution losses, volatile international oil prices, energy imports and the imports and exports on deindustrialisation in selected countries.

This approach proposes two tests namely: Trace test (\( \lambda_{\text{trace}} \)) and Maximum Eigen test (\( \lambda_{\text{max}} \)) to determine the existence and number of cointegrating vectors in the model. The null hypothesis under the trace test is that the number of cointegrating vector is less than or equal to \( r \) where \( r = 0, 1, 2, 3, \ldots \), etc. While in the null hypothesis for Eigen test the existence of \( r \) cointegrating vectors is tested against the alternative of \( r + 1 \) co-integrating vectors. The multivariate co-integration test can be expressed as:

\[ Z_t = K_1 Z_{t-1} + K_2 Z_{t-2} + \ldots + K_{k-1} Z_{t-k} + \mu + \nu_t \]  

(2)

Where, \( Z_t \) (\( ELC_t, ELP_t, ELOSS_t, VOP_t, GX_t, GM_t, ENM_t, SVAD_t \)) i.e., 8 x 1 vector of variables that are integrated of order one [i.e. I (1)], \( \mu \) is a vector of constant and \( \nu_t \) is a vector of normally and independently distributed error term.

The next step is to estimate the Error Correction Model. It is important to point out that the long-run effects should be considered with some caution in that they are not the real measures, but measure the limit to which the behaviour of dependent variable will tend towards, ceteris paribus.\(^5\) The above given equation can be reformulated in a Vector Error Correction Model (VECM) as follows:

\[ \Delta Z_t = \Gamma_1 \Delta Z_{t-1} + \Gamma_2 \Delta Z_{t-2} + \ldots + \Gamma_{k-1} \Delta Z_{t-k-1} + \Pi Z_{t-1} \mu + \mu + \nu_t \]  

(3)

Where, \( \Gamma_1 = (I - A_1 - A_2 - \ldots - A_i), i = 1, 2, 3 \ldots k - 1 \) and \( \Pi = (I - A_1 - A_2 - A_3 \ldots - A_k) \).

\(^5\) All other things being equal or held constant.
The coefficient matrix Π provides information about the long-run relationships among variables in the data. Π can be factored into αβ' where α will include the speed of adjustment to the equilibrium coefficients, while the β' will be the long-run matrix of coefficients. The presence of r cointegrating vectors between the elements of Z implies that Π is of the rank r, (0 < r < 5) (Johansen and Juselius 1990).

Empirical Findings and Interpretation

Test for Order of Integration

The stationary properties of the individual series are examined before proceeding to establish the long-run relationship. The unit root test results reported in Table 1 yields the existence of unit roots at level but stationary at its first order. All variables in the model were integrated of order one i.e., I (1) and allowed to proceed with the Cointegration process.

Table 1: Unit Root Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Sri Lanka</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I (0)</td>
<td>I (1)</td>
<td>I (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IVAD</td>
<td>-3.23</td>
<td>-6.7</td>
<td>-2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELC</td>
<td>-2.23</td>
<td>-4.69</td>
<td>-1.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELP</td>
<td>-2.52</td>
<td>-3.83</td>
<td>1.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELOSS</td>
<td>-2.02</td>
<td>-5.94</td>
<td>-1.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP</td>
<td>-1.11</td>
<td>-8.43</td>
<td>-1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>-2.53</td>
<td>-5.92</td>
<td>-2.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>-3.50</td>
<td>-7.16</td>
<td>-0.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENM</td>
<td>-2.19</td>
<td>-4.94</td>
<td>-1.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SVAD</td>
<td>-2.58</td>
<td>-6.54</td>
<td>-2.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 % critical value</td>
<td>-3.53</td>
<td>-3.53</td>
<td>-3.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The optimal lag length is calculated according to the Schwarz Information Criterion (SIC) and is reported in Table 2:

Table 2: Lag Length Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lag</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Sri Lanka</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>83.71</td>
<td>74.00</td>
<td>78.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>79.53*</td>
<td>69.03*</td>
<td>75.87*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>81.82</td>
<td>70.58</td>
<td>77.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * indicates the lag order selection by Schwarz Information Criteria.

"It is done with the intercept and trend option."
Johansen Cointegration Test

Table 3 reports the findings for co-integration based on Johansen-Juselius co-integration test. The maximal eigenvalue ($\lambda_{\text{max}}$) traces 2 cointegrating vectors for Pakistan and 3 for India and Sri Lanka keeping in view larger number of endogenous variables and suggests a stable long-run relationship among selected variables. The results for one cointegrating vector is reported with the presumption that; first, the 1st cointegrating vector has the highest eigenvalue and is, therefore, the 'most associated with the stationary part of the model'.\(^7\) Second, the results yielded by the first Cointegration vector are consistent with expectations and deem to be more valid.

Table 3: Cointegration Test Results based on Johansen’s Maximum Likelihood Method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Null Hypothesis</th>
<th>Alternative Hypothesis</th>
<th>Eigenvalue Test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r = 0$</td>
<td>$r = 1$</td>
<td>60.83*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r \leq 1$</td>
<td>$r = 2$</td>
<td>54.81*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r \leq 2$</td>
<td>$r = 3$</td>
<td>34.24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * implies that the null hypothesis is rejected at 5 % confidence level.

The short-run dynamics of industrial value added in GDP were estimated following general-to-specific modelling approach. The results for the Error Correction Model for deindustrialisation are reported in Table 4.

\(^7\) See, Johansen and Juselius (1990) for details.
Table 4: Error Correction Results for Deindustrialisation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>ECM based on Johansen Technique (see in parentheses)</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Sri Lanka</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SVAD</td>
<td>-2.41* (0.539)</td>
<td>-0.03 (0.142)</td>
<td>-0.237* (1.19)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELC</td>
<td>-0.179* (0.03)</td>
<td>-0.075* (0.016)</td>
<td>-0.009 (0.006)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELP</td>
<td>0.226* (0.05)</td>
<td>0.103* (0.021)</td>
<td>0.016* (0.007)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELOSS</td>
<td>-0.057* (0.011)</td>
<td>-0.016* (0.004)</td>
<td>-0.005* (0.001)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOP</td>
<td>-0.03* (0.016)</td>
<td>-0.01 (0.008)</td>
<td>0.003 (0.002)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GX</td>
<td>0.011* (0.001)</td>
<td>-0.092 (0.061)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GM</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.045 (0.150)</td>
<td>-0.019 (0.021)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENM</td>
<td>1.66* (0.455)</td>
<td>— (0.05)</td>
<td>0.221* (0.025)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECT</td>
<td>0.016 (0.025)</td>
<td>-0.051* (0.03)</td>
<td>-0.406* (0.064)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Diagnostic Tests

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Autocorrelation LM test</td>
<td>56.94 (0.722)</td>
<td>65.26 (0.433)</td>
<td>71.85 (0.23)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normality Test</td>
<td>2.13 (0.976)</td>
<td>6.79 (0.559)</td>
<td>3.57 (0.89)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 1. * indicates statistical significance at 1% level of significance.
2. p-values in parentheses of diagnostic tests.

The results reported in Table 4 postulate a significant long-run relationship among the variables. The Lagrange Multiplier test for autocorrelation indicates no signs of autocorrelation of the residuals. Normality test, based on χ² statistic, does not reject the null hypothesis of residuals multivariate normality.

The coefficient for electricity supply and demand growth with power loss in distribution and transmission appeared as significantly affecting industrial value added according to expected signs in all three countries. The results yielded a positive relationship between industrial value addition in GDP and electricity production. More specifically, a 1% increase in electricity generation tends to create 0.23%, 0.10% and 0.02% increase in industrial value added for Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka respectively. In contrast, an increase in the electricity use and loss in distribution and transmission bring about negative change in the industrial value added in GDP for all countries.

The power supply in these countries is not only below potential, as the installed capacity is more than its generation, it owes to the inefficiency in distribution system as well.
Thereafter, the shortfall in power supply has made the use of electricity for domestic and industrial purposes both vulnerable and rivalrous. The power crisis causing deindustrialisation in Pakistan is more severe as apparent from the magnitude of coefficients. The case of Sri Lanka is a bit different in this regard as the power crisis there is manageable in contrast to that of India and Pakistan, as justified in overview section and does not pose a serious threat to the industrial sector. Rather, the downfall in industrial sector value added may be due to the rising worth of the services sector value added in total GDP. The services sector in this sense is swapping the industrial sector and deindustrialisation may be regarded as an outcome of the stages of economic development in Sri Lanka. Even in the case of India, the impact of power sector variables is not as large and prominent as in Pakistan. Only electricity distribution loss is affecting the industrial sector a bit more in Pakistan. Particularly, India is characterised as a high productive country in industrial sector with high employment in the informal manufacturing sector and a country moving towards the ‘service revolution’ as also pointed out by Dasgupta and Singh (2006). Albeit, the role of industrial sector cannot be denied for its dynamic economies of scale, strong backward and forward linkages, innovation and technological progress and as a support for balance of payment in South Asian countries (Tregenna 2011), but additionally the services sector can be considered as an engine of growth. A service-led growth in India is already supported by Ghani and Kharas (2010) in this regard. It is pertinent to mention that the findings of this study delink the service sector and industrial sector value added in the case of India.

Comparatively, the services sector value added in GDP appeared as negatively significant for Pakistan and Sri Lanka. More than 1% decline in industrial value added as a result of increase in service sector growth appeared for Pakistan. The resources in Pakistan are being diverted to the services sector at a sharp pace due mainly to power crises, while in Sri Lanka deindustrialisation is not inclined alone to power sector variables. Notwithstanding, it is determined by the ever-rising nature of services sector, on the one hand and by energy imports, on the other.

The volatility in international oil prices appeared as negatively significant only in the case of Pakistan. This identifies the exposure of the country to external shocks and renders the economic condition of Pakistan more vulnerable. Global oil price instability gets transferred to the vulnerable energy and power sector that ultimately hampers industrial sector growth. The power sector largely depends on imported furnace oil that adds to the energy bill and increases the cost of production in industries. Hence, it can be perceived that oil price volatility poses a serious threat to the industrial sector in Pakistan. The conditions of India and Sri Lanka though appeared less vulnerable than Pakistan in this regard according to our findings. The lack of concern for the proper source of fuel for electricity generation has added to the existing shortage. To this end, it has raised the overall cost of electricity generation and created acute power shortages.

Energy imports have significant and positive impact on the industrial sector in Pakistan and Sri Lanka. The rationale of such findings lies in the fact that both countries are relying on imported energy resources to fill the energy shortage. Sri Lanka has better coordination with its neighbouring countries while India and Pakistan, despite dire need,
are not in a position of close harmonisation due to geopolitical differences. Overall, the energy variables along with the services sector’s value added explain the features of deindustrialisation in these countries.

The Error Correction Term (ECT) represents the percentage of correction to any deviation in the long-run equilibrium level of deindustrialisation in a single period and how fast the deviations in the long-run equilibrium will be corrected. For Pakistan, it specifies a divergence from deindustrialisation of its own accord. While for India and Sri Lanka, the error correction terms are negatively significant that postulate the stability and convergence in deindustrialisation phenomena over time. In Sri Lanka, the correction to disequilibrium in industrial value addition is sharper i. e. 0.40% than in India where it will be adjusted by 0.05% each year.

In short, the role of manufacturing sector is critical and leading in the economic development of these countries, but the services sector specifically in India has contributed significantly as well. The services sector has a faster growth rate than the other sectors of the economies and has improved the balance of payment as well. This sector fulfils the requirement of dynamic sectors in Kaldorian sense and hence can be considered as an additional engine of growth. Notwithstanding, the experience and challenges of deindustrialisation in developing countries is quite distinct from that of developed countries.

**Impulse Response Functions**

Finally, the forecast behaviour of deindustrialisation in response to various shocks based on Vector Error Correction Model is presented in Figure 7, 8 and 9 for the three countries respectively. First panel of Figure 7 shows the response of industrial value added in GDP to its own one standard deviation positive shock. After showing a slight decrease in first year after the shock, IVAD becomes almost parallel to equilibrium line and shows no tendency to converge till the end of period selected for Pakistan. The results are well consistent with the fact that deindustrialisation in Pakistan in future largely depends on historical patterns.
A shock to SVAD, ELC, ELP, VOP and GX generate positive response in IVAD. The industrial value added follows a continuously increasing path in the face of shock to international oil price volatility, exports growth and electricity generation. The extent of effect is highest for international oil price volatility. Though industrial value addition increases in response to positive shock to service sector value added and electricity consumption, however, in both of the cases it becomes parallel to equilibrium line instead of following an increasing trend. Hence, the positive shock to the services sector value added can bring about permanent but declining trend till the end of period selected in the industrial sector value addition. The response of IVAD is negative in the face of energy imports and distribution and transmission loss of electricity. The size of the effect of shock is enormous in case of power losses. Either positive or negative, IVAD shows no tendency to converge to equilibrium line; even when shocks to all variables have been neutralised.
In this regard, maintaining favourable power supply and exports growth can be used to enhance the role of industrial sector’s share in GDP as the positive shock to power generation tends to increase the industrial value addition in GDP permanently. The one-time shock to international oil price volatility leads the industrial value added in GDP away from equilibrium.

**Figure 8: Response of Deindustrialisation in India**

Figure 8 displays the responses of industrial value added (IVAD) in India to one-time shock to the selected variables. Figure shows that industrial value added in GDP has a permanent increasing trend to its own shock, electricity consumption and generation. The industrial value added is following a continuously declining path when shock is given to services sector value added and international oil price volatility. One standard deviation positive shocks to ELOSS and GM produce a permanent but parallel decrease and
increase in IVAD respectively. IVAD fluctuates initially in response to shock to exports growth and then becomes parallel to equilibrium line in negative zone.

Figure 9: Response of Deindustrialisation in Sri Lanka

Finally, the Sri Lanka’s case is portrayed in Figure 9 where the industrial value added in response to its own shock emerged as persistent, while the response to the service sector value added in GDP is not far from equilibrium. After showing a slight increase in third year after the shock, the industrial value added becomes almost parallel to equilibrium line and shows no tendency to converge till the end of period selected. A sharp increase in IVAD can be observed in response to positive shock to SVAD. However, the effect of shock starts declining in the second year and follows the same path till the end of fifth year. From the sixth year till the end of period selected IVAD becomes parallel to equilibrium line showing the permanent effect of one-time shock to SVAD on IVAD. Positive shock to international oil price volatility generates a substantial increase in IVAD throughout the period selected, however, a slight increase can be observed in IVAD in the first three years of the shock given to electricity consumption. Effect of positive shock to electricity generation on IVAD is negative. With the passage of time
the effect of shock is reducing, yet IVAD remains in negative zone till the end of sample period. IVAD shows no significant response in face of positive shock to energy import in initial years; however, later it remains in negative zone and shows no tendency to converge to equilibrium line.

Conclusions and Policy Recommendations

The chapter endeavoured to assess the role of electricity demand, supply and distribution losses and international oil price volatility on the emerging scenario of deindustrialisation in Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka from 1971-2010. The declining share of industrial sector’s value has been regarded as a pathological problem, where it stops the economy from achieving its full potential of growth, employment and resource utilisation and a natural outcome of industrial dynamism and a symptom of success. Kaldor (1966; 1967) in his seminal contribution emphasised the spillover effects of industrial development due to its dynamic economies of scale: faster the growth of manufacturing output faster will be the growth of manufacturing productivity.

However, the literature review on deindustrialisation for developing countries focused on the variation in the phases of deindustrialisation comparative to that of developed countries. Tregenna (2011) summarised the reasons for regarding deindustrialisation in developing countries as premature, in the sense that it commenced in developing countries at lower level of income per capita than was generally the case for the developed countries. Secondly, in developing countries, he associated it with policy shifts---in particular trade and financial liberalisation---rather than ‘maturation’ of their economic structure. Competition from China and other low-cost manufacturers in Asia is also being considered as a challenge to the industrial sector in South Asian countries along with lack of technology, skills and market access to compete higher up the value chain with developed countries. This chapter was an attempt to investigate the role of energy crises in shaping the time path of deindustrialisation in selected South Asian countries.

South Asia is rich in energy resources, ranging from renewable such as hydro-electricity and solar power to fossil fuels such as coal and gas. Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka have huge hydropower potential and India’s coal deposits have been contributing in its economic growth for long. But most of the existing resources are yet untapped and unexplored. This study identified power generation and power loss in distribution and transmission as positively/negatively significant in affecting industrial sector share in GDP for all countries, respectively, while international oil price volatility emerged as a threat to Pakistan specifically. The findings suggest vulnerable condition of the industrial sector in Pakistan where the industrial value added in GDP is forecast to diverge from equilibrium in the next 10 years if adequate policy measures are not adopted to overcome the power crises. The case of India and Sri Lanka is different in the sense that the deindustrialisation in these countries is manageable and stable as appeared from the error correction term.

Regarding the findings from this study, deindustrialisation can be turned towards reindustrialisation by tackling power crisis and moving from short-term to long-term solutions. The policy measures that should be taken include:
• A need to prioritise various energy policies by the governments not only for the sake of resolving power crisis, but also to move towards sustained and self-sufficient industrial sector growth with an expanding services sector.
• The short-term solution lies in the improvement of power transmissions and distribution system, proper management, control on power theft by harsh accountability and a convincing regulatory framework.
• The adjustment of governments with the power companies to produce electricity to its full potential and retrieving full cost of electricity from consumers by price rationalisation.
• Adopting energy mix and plan for development of non-conventional, alternative and renewable energy resources including solar, wind and tidal power. India has 12% share of renewable resources in total energy mix of 225, 793 MW. Pakistan can avail ocean energy including thermal power, wave and tidal power, etc.
• Regional cooperation can play an immense role by easing tensions between Pakistan and India. Generally, regional trade is supported on the grounds of lower cost due to economies of scale, greater supply security and reliability with increased diversification of primary energy sources.
References


Tregenna, F. 2011, ‘Manufacturing Productivity, Deindustrialisation and
and World Institute for Development Economics Research, Finland,

Conference on Trade and Development, United Nations, New York and Geneva,

Administration, Department of Energy, USA,

World Bank 2012, ‘World Development Indicators 2012’, The World Bank,
Washington, DC, USA.
Section V

Securing Momentum: Avoiding Water Conflicts

1. Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya: A Precondition for Water Security and Climate Change Adaptation in South Asia - Prakash C. Tiwari and Bhagwati Joshi

2. Conflict and Co-operation Dynamics of Politics in South Asian Water Security - Gopikesh Acharya
Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya: A Precondition for Water Security and Climate Change Adaptation in South Asia*
Prakash C. Tiwari and Bhagwati Joshi**

Abstract
Hindu Kush Himalaya (HKH) comprises headwaters of some of the biggest transboundary river-basins on earth. Water discharge that builds up in Himalayan headwaters sustains nearly 1.65 million people dependent on subsistence food system in South Asia. During recent years, a variety of changes have emerged in traditional resource use structure in response to population growth, increased demand of natural resources, rapid urbanisation and economic globalisation which is exerting sharply accentuated pressure on HKH headwaters through land-use intensification, deforestation, soil erosion and groundwater disruption. Moreover, climate change has stressed the hydrological system of Himalayan headwaters, and consequently regime of water resources is likely to change rapidly, with respect to discharge, volume, availability and access exacerbating the region’s limited capacity to cope with likely decrease in water availability. This may increase the proportion of water and food insecure population in South Asia which includes most marginalised people of world with access to less than 5% of earth’s freshwater. This will also have serious implications for fundamental welfare programmes ranging from poverty alleviation to climate change adaptation, and even for security and peace in South Asia. A regional headwater co-operation framework is, therefore, highly imperative not only for adaptation to long-term impacts of climate change, but also water and energy security in the region.

This chapter shares a regional co-operation framework for integrated transboundary headwater governance in HKH based on detailed study of relevant literature, media reports, interpretation of people’s responses obtained through interviews, and interaction with political leadership, government officials and regional institutions. It was observed that increasing power of some countries and political instability in other states, internal and external security threats, and long standing inter-state conflicts are important reasons for weakening of regional water co-operation. However, there is growing realisation among the scientific community, intellectuals, NGOs, and regional institutions of the importance of building geopolitical resilience for transboundary river-basin governance in HKH. Climate change has provided opportunity to foster regional co-operation and develop geopolitical integration. An effective regional water co-operation framework would facilitate: (a) sharing of hydro-meteorological information for early warning; (b) mitigating and moderating risks of climate change induced disasters; and (c) integrated watershed management in upland river-basins to increase availability of water for drinking and food production. A number of regional institutions working in South Asia could play an effective role in initiating transboundary headwater governance. Furthermore, perspective of regional economic co-operation may help in evolving conducive institutional mechanisms for regional headwater co-operation.

* This chapter has been approved as a Research Report by the referee.
** Dr. Prakash C. Tiwari is a Professor of Geography at Kumaon University, Nainital, Uttarakhand, India. He is a mountain natural resource management and climate change adaptation specialist, and has worked with various institutions in India and abroad. Dr. Bhagwati Joshi is Assistant Professor of Geography at Government Post Graduate College, Rudrapur, Uttarakhand, India. She is an environment and protected area management expert with experience of working in institutions of repute in India, Germany and Canada.
Introduction
The Hindu Kush Himalaya (HKH) extends across the mountainous tracts of Afghanistan, Pakistan, India, Nepal, China, Bhutan, Bangladesh and Myanmar of South and East Asia (ICIMOD 2011). The region encompasses a geographical land surface of nearly 3441719 km² and sustains a population of 210.53 million (Ibid.). HKH constitutes the headwater of some of the largest river systems of the planet that include Amu Darya, Brahmaputra, Ganges, Indus, Irrawaddy, Mekong, Salween, Yangtse, Yellow and Tarim rivers (Figure 1 and Table 1) (Ibid.). These transboundary basins sustain one-fourth of the global population dependent primarily on subsistence agriculture in Pakistan, India, Nepal, Bhutan, China and Bangladesh and constitute some of the poorest and most marginalised people of the world (Srivastava and Misra 2007). The basins of most of these rivers have several common hydrological and socio-economic characteristics, particularly large seasonal variability in water discharge, floods during peak monsoon season, drought in dry months and high population density in their lowlands (Crow and Singh 2000). The HKH mountains have some of earth’s largest glaciers and permafrost outside the polar regions which makes the region the highest water tower of Asia and almost a third pole of the earth (ICIMOD 2011). Constituting the highest continental landmass together with Tibetan plateau, it affects global climate and weather conditions (IPCC 2007).

Methodology
In order to analyse water availability and scope for regional water co-operation among riparian countries, the entire region was divided into principal transboundary river basins which was followed through their integration into major drainage systems. The basin-wise data pertaining to basin area, annual mean discharge, contribution of snow-melt to water discharge, total population of basin and population density and water availability were analysed through the interpretation of secondary information collected from International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD), Kathmandu, and reports published by the United Nation’s Environmental Programme (UNEP). The dependence of regional countries for cross-border supply of freshwater was also determined through the analysis of data collected from various secondary sources.

Past and recent efforts and their follow-ups, impact and contribution; and scope for future transboundary water governance was assessed by comprehensive study of available literature including research publications, project reports and reports published by various national authorities, international agencies, inter-governmental bodies, non-government organisations and media.

A series of discussions were also held with political leadership and government officials across South Asian countries, which formed the basis for appraisal of constraints as well as opportunities for transboundary water co-operation in the region. The potential areas of regional water co-operation in South Asia were identified based on interactions held with scientists, experts and resource managers working with national governments, agencies, international organisations, particularly at the International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD), Kathmandu, Nepal; Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan; G. B. Pant Institute of Himalayan Environment and Development (GBPIHED), Almora, India; and a number universities and institutions across South Asian countries. Besides, informal discussions
were also held with people from various walks of life, and representative of non-
governmental (NGOs) and civil society organisations working in the region to investigate
their perception, problems and priorities related to transboundary water management of
Hindu Kush Himalaya river-basins.

Figure 1: Hindu Kush Himalaya And Tibetan Plateau With Major River Basins

![HKH Map with major river basins](source:ICIMOD(2011)).

Table 1: Himalayan Countries of South Asia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographical Area</th>
<th>About 1.1 Million km²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>03%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source*: ICIMOD (2009).

**The Himalayas**

Himalayan mountains are tectonically active, environmentally sensitive, densely
populated and are socio-economically underdeveloped and marginalised (Figure 2)
(Tiwari and Joshi 2012a; Valdiya and Bartarya 1991). Besides snow and glaciers,
mountain slopes comprising of natural forests and wetlands constitute sources of springs
and headwaters of streams that not only sustain life by providing water for drinking and
food production but also augment water discharge of snow-fed rivers (Bandyopadhyay
and Shama 2002). However, the discharge volumes and availability of water resources in
Himalayan headwaters have been changing fast mainly due to transformation of rural resource use structure and consequent land-use intensification in headwater ecosystems and hydrological disruptions (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a; Rahman 2005). Moreover, climate change is stressing the hydrological systems of river-basins by increase in temperatures and melting of ice, glaciers and snow in the great Himalayan ranges (IPCC 2007). Furthermore, the annual precipitation pattern across the entire Himalayan mountain ranges has changed. Consequently, the amount of annual rainfall and rainy days is declining, and the frequency, intensity and severity of climate induced extreme weather events are showing a consistently increasing trend (Tiwari and Joshi 2012a; ICIMOD 2011; IPCC 2007).

Figure 2: Himalaya: The Headwater of South Asia

- Sharp altitudinal variations
- Steep slopes
- Young mountains
- Weak geological formation
- Tectonically alive domain
- Climate change

- Densely populated
- Severely limited arable land
- Limited livelihood options
- Subsistence economy
- Increased out-migration
- Gender inequality
- Socio-economic exclusiveness
- Rapid urbanisation
- High food deficit
- Globalisation & resource exploitation

Source: Authors’ compilation.

Hydrological changes and resultant diminishing of water resources are likely to exacerbate the limited capacity of the region to respond adequately to projected decrease in availability of water resources for drinking, sanitation and food production (Tiwari and Joshi 2013a). This would expose a large population dependent on subsistence agriculture to water, food and health insecurity both upstream and downstream (UNDP 2006). Figure 3 illustrates the upstream-downstream interlinkages and environmental and socio-economic impacts of hydrological disruptions triggered by global environmental changes (GEC) (ADB 2006). The long-term impacts of these changes would not only deplete and degrade natural resource base and increase the frequency and intensity of climate change induced natural hazards and disasters, but would also increase the vulnerability of some of the poorest and marginalised people of the world with access to less than 5% of planet’s freshwater resources (UN 2006). The increasing water stress, decline in food production and increasing severity of environmental risks will adversely affect the sustainability of a large number of human welfare programmes under implementation ranging from poverty reduction and environmental conservation to sustainable rural development in the entire region (UNEP 2008).
Integrated River-Basin Management

A river-basin being a natural hydrological geographical region, integrated river-basin management has been considered the most scientific and appropriate approach not only for sustainable development of natural resources, but also for improving community livelihood, poverty reduction, food security and disaster risk reduction (Tiwari and Joshi 2012b; Bach et al. 2011; UNEP-PKU 2008; Beek and Meijer 2006; FAO 2007a; FAO 2007b; Biswas 1990). However, the integrated management of transboundary river-basins has so far not been possible due to several geopolitical constraints and other practical reasons (Karki and Vaidya 2010; Drieschova et al. 2008; Dinar 2005). But climate change has provided a unique opportunity to foster regional co-operation for water governance as adaptation to climate would require building resilience in different sectors, particularly, water, hydro-energy, infrastructure, irrigation and regional trade and economic linkages with prime focus on adaptive governance and management of water and energy resources at river-basin level (FAO 2007a, b and 2006; Salman and Uprety 2003).

Transboundary Water Management Issues

Since most of the South Asian countries are densely populated and have developing economies, they are now becoming water-stressed due to consistently increasing and competing demand of water in various sectors. Consequently, most countries in the region face increasing water scarcity (Mirza and Ahmad 2005). Many in the region have very inadequate access to water for drinking and sanitation mainly owing to reduced availability of water (UNEC/WHO Europe 2013; WRI/UNDP/UNEP/World Bank 2005).
India being a fast growing economy and the most heavily populated country of the region, the demand for water in the country has been increasing consistently. It has been estimated that the water demand in India would double and exceed 1.4 trillion m$^3$ by 2050 (World Bank 2006; Karki and Vadiya 2010). Pakistan is the most water-stressed country in South Asia with merely 1000 m$^3$/person/year availability of water (Karki and Vadiya 2010). Countries like Nepal and Bhutan are in a better situation in terms of availability of water resources compared to their neighbouring countries, but they need to improve management of their available water resources to ensure sustainability and adaptive management (UNEP-RRC AP 2001; UNESCO–WWAP 2006). Bangladesh, situated at the mouth of Ganges and Brahmaputra basins, is subject to all sorts of downstream hydrological impacts including seasonal scarcity as well as abundance of water with very high risks of flooding (World Bank 2006). Moreover, subsistence agriculture constitutes the major sectors of economy of all South Asian countries acting as principal stressors on water resources. Furthermore, urban growth in South Asian countries is exceedingly high with rapidly growing industries as well as industrial sectors. Consequently, there is increasing stress on limited water resources (Sheng 2011; Crow and Singh 2000).

According to UNEP (2008), the HKH forms the headwaters of three major river basins which include the Indus Basin, Ganges-Brahmaputra-Meghna Basin (GBM) and Tarim Basin (Table 2).

### Table 2: Principal River Basins of Hindu Kush Himalaya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>River</th>
<th>Annual Mean Discharge (m$^3$/Second)</th>
<th>% of Glacial Melting in River Flow</th>
<th>Basin Area (km$^2$)</th>
<th>Density of Population (Persons/km$^2$)</th>
<th>Population (× 0000)</th>
<th>Water Availability (m$^3$/person/year)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amu Darya</td>
<td>1376</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
<td>534739</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>20855</td>
<td>2081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahmaputra</td>
<td>21261</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>651335</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>118543</td>
<td>5656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ganges</td>
<td>10307</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>1016124</td>
<td>401</td>
<td>407466</td>
<td>932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indus</td>
<td>5533</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1081718</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>178483</td>
<td>978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irrawaddy</td>
<td>8024</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
<td>413710</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>32683</td>
<td>7742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mekong</td>
<td>9001</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>805604</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>57198</td>
<td>4963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salween</td>
<td>1494</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>271914</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5982</td>
<td>7876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarim</td>
<td>1262</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1152448</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>8067</td>
<td>4933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yangtze</td>
<td>18811</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1722193</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>368549</td>
<td>2465</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yellow</td>
<td>1438</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>944970</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>147415</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ICIMOD (2009).

**Indus Basin:** Indus has its source in the Tibetan Plateau in China. Flowing across northwestern India and Pakistan it finally drains into the Arabian Sea (UNEP 2008; Giordano et al. 2002). Indus system is fed by six rivers including Indus, Ravi, Chenab, Jhelum, Beas and Sutlej which is a critical resource for both India and Pakistan.
The Ganges-Brahmaputra-Meghna (GBM): This is the largest catchment covering an area of nearly 1.7 million km². Principal rivers include Ganges, Brahmaputra, Meghna, Mahananda, Teesta, Yamuna and Kosi (ICIMOD 2011; Giordano et al. 2002).

Table 3: Dependence on Cross-border Water Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Basin</th>
<th>% Water Coming from Outside International Borders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>Indus, Tarim</td>
<td>15.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Ganges Brahmaputra, Meghna</td>
<td>91.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>Ganges Brahmaputra, Meghna</td>
<td>00.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Ganges Brahmaputra, Meghna, Indus, Tarim</td>
<td>01.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Ganges Brahmaputra, Meghna, Indus</td>
<td>34.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myanmar</td>
<td>Ganges Brahmaputra, Meghna</td>
<td>16.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Ganges Brahmaputra, Meghna</td>
<td>06.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>Indus, Tarim</td>
<td>76.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ICIMOD (2011); UNEP (2008).

Table 3 clearly indicates that some of the riparian countries are receiving most of their water supplies across international borders. For example, Pakistan and Bangladesh get more than 75% of their total water supply from outside their international borders, mainly from India (Karki and Vadiya 2010). Although only 25% of India’s water comes from outside its international borders, during dry season as much as 75% water in densely populated lower Ganges basin flows down from Nepal (UNEP 2008; Karki and Vadiya 2010). These hydro-relationships between Bangladesh, India, Nepal, and Pakistan with regard to the Indus and the GBM basins are very crucial, and constitute the main source of conflicts and tensions over the sharing of transboundary water resources in the region (Ibid.).

Basis of Regional Co-operation

The principal potential benefits that constitute the basis of regional co-operation in water resources include: (a) evolving amicable mechanism for exchange and sharing hydro-meteorological information for forecasting flood peak rate and developing early warning for hydrological disasters; (b) accumulating run-off and excess water in up-streams for moderating floods in down-streams as well as flash floods in mountains; (c) storing water for ensuring adequate flow and availability of water in dry months and to facilitate inland water navigation for cost effective transportation of goods and material; (e) harnessing water resource potential for generation of hydroelectricity in mountainous regions; and (f) integrated watershed management in up-streams for increasing the quantity and maintaining the quality of water for irrigation and drinking in low-land areas (UNEP 2008; Dinar 2005; WRI/UNDP/UNEP/World Bank 2005; Wolf 1999). A comprehensive framework for integrated river basin management and governance has been illustrated in Figure 4 and the potential areas of transboundary regional water co-operation presented in Table 4.
Table 4: Potential Areas of Water Co-operation in South Asia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Areas of Regional Co-operation</th>
<th>Transboundary Catchment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India, Nepal and Pakistan</td>
<td>- Construction of dams and reservoirs</td>
<td>- Indus, Ganges and its tributaries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Flood mitigation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Irrigation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Hydro-power generation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan and India</td>
<td>- Construction of storage reservoirs</td>
<td>- Mahananda and Teesta Rivers and their tributaries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Mitigation of flood disasters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Generation of hydro-power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh and India</td>
<td>- Construction of dams and reservoirs</td>
<td>- Brahmaputra, Ganges, and Meghna Rivers and their tributaries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Mitigation of flood disasters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Generation of hydro-power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Increasing irrigation potential</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Inter-basin transfer of water in dry months</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Maintaining minimum flow of water</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ICIMOD (2011); UNEP (2008); ESCAP (2003).
Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya

Opportunities for Regional Water Governance Co-operation

River systems do not recognise and respect political and administrative boundaries created by human beings, nations and states. In view of this, regional institutions can play a significant role in bringing South Asian countries at the negotiation table and help in rebuilding and reshaping a framework for fruitful water diplomacy in South Asia. The opportunities and necessities for regional water co-operation for efficient utilisation and sustainable development and governance of water resources among South Asian countries have already been underlined and advocated by South Asian Association for Regional Co-operation (SAARC) (UNEP 2008). The International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) has been working on sustainable development in HKH since 1983, and making significant contribution towards improved regional co-operation for sustainable development by promoting transboundary research and development activities in South Asia (UNEP 2008; Mirza and Ahmad 2005). India and Pakistan signed Indus Treaty back in 1960. However, both countries have differences over interpretation and implementation of the Treaty since the very first day of its execution. Pakistan is dissatisfied with India’s construction of dams in up-stream Indus headwaters. There have been a series of water sharing treaties between India and Nepal, particularly the Indo-Nepal treaties on Kosi (1954), Gandaki (1959), and Mahakali originating in Nepal Himalaya and draining into Ganges system (1996). Indo-Bangladesh Ganges Treaty signed in 1996 is very significant in this context as this makes provision for sharing water of as many as 54 transboundary rivers. However, the implementation of the Treaty could not present a model for sharing of transboundary water resources through bilateral co-operation. India presented a good example of co-operation with Bhutan in water and energy sector. The underlying principle for long-term bilateral co-operation in hydropower development between India and Bhutan is based on mutual advantage and sharing the potential of economies of scale as a result of large transboundary hydro-power projects, using hydro-energy resources for environmental and conservation (Karki and Vaidya 2010; UNEP 2008; Drieschova et al. 2008; Mirza and Ahmad 2005). The establishment of power grid in India and Bhutan have helped to develop the institutional mechanisms and capacity necessary for transboundary trade in electricity between the two countries (Karki and Vaidya 2010).

Some countries in HKH region, particularly India and China have made significant progress in integrating with the global economy but without desired co-operation within the region primarily due to existing international boundary tensions (UNESCO-WWAP 2006). As a result, regional economic co-operation could not develop between China and India despite long standing historical Indo-Tibetan trade relations (Crow and Singh 2000). Besides geo-political complications, there are several other factors, such as lack of integrated transportation and communication systems which have shattered the spirit of regional co-operation in the HKH region (ICIMOD 2011; Karki and Vaidya 2010). This has rendered South Asia the least integrated region in the world due to warming conflicts and acute deficit of mutual co-operation and trust (UNEP 2008; Mirza and Ahmad 2005).

Multilateral co-operation in water needs to be made one of the integral components of overall regional co-operation framework and infrastructure development plan (UNEP 2008). Furthermore, the changing global economic order and growing regional and global
markets also constitute a constant source of motivation for regional co-operation in different sectors including trade, commerce, and other economic sectors alongwith integrated regional sustainable development (Ibid.). The outlook of regional economic co-operation may also stimulate and sensitise South Asian countries for evolving institutional mechanisms for regional co-operation on water and energy governance in HKH region.

**Constraints in Regional Water Governance Co-operation**

Despite a series of opportunities and enabling geographical situation, the conflicts over sharing of water resources and their governance still persists in South Asia. As mentioned, there are a series of ineffective bilateral water sharing agreements between countries. However, there has not been any sincere effort for multilateral water co-operation in the region (Salman and Uprety 2003). The main reasons for increasing cross-border water tensions among different countries include rapid depletion of water sources, increasing water stress in almost all countries, decreasing availability of per capita water and resultant exploitation of both surface and groundwater resources, and high reliance on water coming in from transboundary river systems (UNEP 2008; Mirza and Ahmad 2005; Crow and Singh 2000). The situation is being further complicated due to political transition and instability in some countries creating both intrastate and interstate water conflicts in the region. Moreover, the strong entry of China in the South Asian hydro-political scene has further complicated water-politics in the region. China, emerging as global super power, has financial resources as well as political influence to change the entire hydro-political scenario in the region (Karki and Vaidya 2010). India is particularly involved in geopolitical tensions as well as water conflicts with countries as it shares international boundaries with all other countries in South Asia. Furthermore, India and Pakistan are facing internal security threats, whereas Bangladesh and Nepal are subject to political instability which is making the situation more complex.

**Need for Efficient Water Management System**

The framework of integrated water resource management has been presented in Figure 4. The core components of integrated water resource management strategy are as follows:

**Water Resources Information System**

The Hindu Kush Himalaya is extremely lacking in hydro-meteorological assessment, and hence detailed information on critical meteorological and hydrological parameters is almost absent. It is, therefore, highly imperative to develop a catchment-wise comprehensive hydro-meteorological database using remote sensing, Geographic Information System (GIS) and other emerging scientific tools. The hydro-meteorological information system should include detailed data on land-use, precipitation, temperature, glacial status and dynamics, water discharge, water demand, water utilisation and water stress.
Assessment of Water Availability and Prioritising Water Demand and Utilisation
Assessment of current and projected water availability through the observation of hydrological responses to glacial dynamics, rainfall variability and land-use will be critical for evolving a framework for effective water management. At the same time, water demand for critical sectors, such as drinking, sanitation, irrigation, industries and energy needs to be assessed, and a water allocation mechanism should be evolved based on prioritised demand of water for various sectors.

Risk Management Framework
It has been observed that the maximum proportion of natural hazards and disasters in Hindu Kush Himalaya fall in the category of hydro-meteorological risks. These risks include floods, flash floods, droughts and glacial lake out flow (GLOF). In order to reduce the risks of these hazards and disasters, an ‘Early Warning System’ needs to be developed for each of the transboundary basins of the region to manage the risks of flood and flash flood and glacial lake out flows. Besides, a landslide risk reduction framework should be evolved for the entire region through landslide vulnerability assessment and mapping. The potentials of state of art Remote Sensing (RS), Geographic Information System (GIS), and Global Positioning System (GPS) can best be used to evolve an effective hydro-meteorological risk governance system in Hindu Kush Himalaya. Besides, diversification of rural livelihoods, through implementing sustainable livelihood strategies, would contribute significantly towards strengthening community responses to hydro-meteorological risks.

Integrated Watershed Management
The components of efficient water management as discussed above can be used for evolving an integrated water resource management at the catchment level. An adaptive land-use policy based on comprehensive land-use planning needs to be designed and implemented in entire Hindu Kush Himalaya. The policy should be based on natural, economic and socio-cultural diversity as well as on the conservation and development needs of the region. It should rely on exchange of knowledge and ideas and sharing information among the riparian nations.

Integrated Water Governance: A Policy Perspective
A strong governance structure is critical for advancing sustainable development (UNCSD 2012). In view of this, the effective implementation of an integrated water resource management framework would require a multi-stakeholder governance system involving various actors, agents and interest groups from public and private institutions and also from civil society organisations. In order to attain social, economic, and environmental sustainability through improved governance there has to be a shift from the existing national boundaries to river basin following integrated watershed approach for planning, monitoring, implementation and evaluation of environmental governance process. The integrated river basin approach would not only facilitate enhanced and active local participation but also improve socio-economic sustainability in the region. The integrated water governance framework should have the following components:
Knowledge Construction and Validation
The role of experts and knowledge construction specialists would be very significant in the process of water resource governance. In view of this, research institutions and universities must be a part of the overall water management process as they will not only help in evolving and integrating the various components of integrated water management plan, but also monitor the process of its implementation, impacts and effectiveness. There are a large number of universities and institutions including inter-governmental organisations of excellence in all countries of Hindu Kush Himalaya, and they are producing very high level of knowledge in various aspects of water resources and their management. The state of art and best knowledge created by these institutions needs to be pooled, shared and used for adaptive water governance in the region.

Conceptualisation and Planning
This would require the active involvement and participation of multiple stakeholders from various sectors including development planners, water resource managers, representatives of non-governmental organisations, government agencies and also from knowledge sectors. All these actors will formulate action plans using the knowledge provided by research institutions and universities within Hindu Kush Himalaya as well as from outside the region.

Implementation and Monitoring
This is the most critical phase of the entire process of water governance when the ideas and plans are implemented on the real ground situations. This involves knowledge, actions, financial resources, administration and developing reports with various other stakeholders particularly the people who will be directly and indirectly affected by the implementation of formulated action plan. At this stage, the involvement and active participation of all interest groups, particularly, local communities, non-governmental organisations, representatives of private sector, research institutions and universities, government agencies would be essential.

Role of Regional Institutions in Integrated Water Governance
Institutions play a critical role in environmental governance particularly in ecologically as well as socio-culturally diverse mountain ecosystems, such as Hindu Kush Himalaya. The regional institutions will play a significant role in integrated water governance in the region, particularly through generation and dissemination of critical knowledge, mobilising resources, formulating environmental management plans, evolving climate change adaptation and disaster risk reduction strategies, and implementation of participatory resource management and community livelihood improvement programmes at various levels. The integrated transboundary water management needs to be incorporated as one of the integral components of National Climate Change Adaptation Plans of all countries in Hindu Kush Himalaya. Moreover, all the states and provinces which are part of Hindu Kush Himalaya in India and Pakistan should be considered important stakeholders of the transboundary water governance framework. Regional institutions, such as International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development
Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya

(ICIMOD), Kathmandu, Nepal; South-Asian Association for Regional Co-operation (SAARC); and the Himalayan University Consortium (HUC) based at ICIMOD can play a very crucial role in integrated river basin management in Hindu Kush Himalaya.

**Conclusion**

Climate change has provided the best opportunity to foster regional co-operation in water and energy sectors in Hindu Kush Himalaya. Regional co-operation for transboundary water governance is particularly essential for exchange and sharing hydro-meteorological information. This would not only help in mitigating and moderating flash-floods in mountains and floods in lowlands, but would also ensure adequate flow and availability of water in dry months, facilitate inland water navigation for cost effective transportation of goods and material and to harness water resource potential for generation of hydroelectricity in mountain regions (UNEP 2008).

Integrated transboundary river-basin management would improve the quantity of water available for drinking, sanitation, irrigation, manufacturing and processing sectors and build community resilience to water, food, livelihood, health and energy insecurity in South Asia. Multilateral co-operation is also a pre-requisite for taking advantage of the emerging potentials of economic globalisation and economies of scale. Moreover, this is essential for attaining the post 2015 sustainable development goals in South Asia. In view of this, a spirit of sharing of transboundary rivers has to be fostered considering the impacts of climate change, increasing water scarcity, growing and competing demand, compelling need for interdependence on water resources and mutual economic benefits. It would be imperative to depoliticise water as an issue. This would need strong regional institutional arrangements based on best practices, adaptations, innovations, supported by a multi-stakeholder governance system. Furthermore, a complete and comprehensive package of policies, procedures, and strategies would be necessary to guide sustainable water development and ensure active and transparent participation for all basin stakeholders and partners.

It would also be imperative that all countries develop their own efficient water management system and learn best practices to minimise waste and ensure conservation through integrated watershed management. Bilateral, regional and multilateral co-operation and coordination are essential particularly involving China, and SAARC. All existing water treaties need to be reviewed and reinterpreted in view of the critical challenges as well as the opportunities of global environmental changes. Regional countries and their institutions can also contribute towards integrated water governance through creation and management of emerging knowledge which would play crucial role in transboundary regional co-operation and information exchange among agencies and stakeholders in South Asia.
References


Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya

Sjpu93bMe_T7AblsIHwDQ&usg=AFQjCNF6G1ueOPcph9AttLHtfUqhNXMoFw&sig 2=x5XnIpuRsIvg4HzUtvKqIQ&bvm=bv.72676100,d.ZGU>, accessed 20 June 2014.


Mirza, M.M.Q. and Ahmad, Q.K. (eds.) 2005, Climate Change and Water Resources in South Asia, Taylor and Francis, UK.


Economic Commission for Europe/World Health Organization Regional Office for Europe, Geneva, Switzerland,  


Conflict and Co-operation Dynamics of Politics in South Asian Water Security*
Gopikesh Acharya**

Abstract
Bound by bilateral treaties, most South Asian countries share transboundary rivers (India-Pakistan share the Indus River, India-Bangladesh share Ganges/Brahmaputra, Nepal-India share Koshi/Mahakali/Narayani and Pakistan-Afghanistan share the Kabul River). Water treaties in South Asia are often politicised; thereby obstructing co-operation in shared water resource management. Water security related problems in the region are due to lack of political consensus which eventually deteriorates into security threats. This chapter provides a pragmatic view of conflict and co-operation in shared rivers to uncover issues related to the perspectives and policies about water security. The author finds that South Asian countries are willing to co-operate for water security; but, the political environment has not been productive or enabling. Unjust control/allocation and poorly thought out projects of debated importance need to be readdressed and transformed for regional water security. Best practices from the European Union and the Nile Basin are presented as potential avenues for future study and water sector co-operation in the region.

---

* This chapter has been approved as a Perspective/Argument Essay by the referee.
** Mr. Gopikesh Acharya is a Research Officer at the Nepal Centre for Contemporary Research (NCCR), Lalitpur, Nepal.
Introduction
According to Gleick (1996) and Seckler et al. (1998), 97% of total water in the world is in the oceans which is too salty and therefore undrinkable, while only 3% is fresh and drinkable water. 69% of this total drinkable water is in glaciers and ice caps, 30.7% is ground water and 0.3% is surface water. Out of this 0.3% water available on earth, only 2% is in rivers, 87% in lakes, and 11% in swamps (Gleick 1996). With only 2% of drinkable surface water being in rivers, they are a critical and precious resource. Yet, river waters worldwide are being polluted threatening water security and riparian livelihoods, and South Asian Rivers (SARs) are no exception.

Majority of South Asian countries¹ are connected by the Himalayan Rivers like Kabul, Indus, Brahmaputra, Sutlej, Meghna and Koshi. These rivers are the region’s socio-economic and cultural backbone since it shares a common agrarian and socio-cultural heritage revolving around water. Although the region is water-rich, scarcity of surface and ground water supplies is causing an increasing state of water crisis. South Asian Rivers (SARs) are used as borders which have evolved into sites of political conflict as well as co-operation regarding allocation, rights, and water sector development (Appendix 1: List of Shared Rivers in South Asia). While the region also faces shortage of drinking/irrigation/industrial water, the biggest water-related issue appears to be the violation of international laws about upstream and downstream riparian rights in shared water resources.

Regmi (2007, p. 68) argues that unjust control, allocation, and controversial development projects in shared rivers have been persisting. Lack of mutual understanding is transforming into water security threats. Malhotra (2010) admits that water related problems in SA are due to lack of political consensus among disputing countries.

Though conflict is persistent, shared water resources have been perceived as a ‘modality of coordination and negotiation’ and can ‘contribute to change which can be both positive and negative’ (Janakarajan et al. 2006, p. 93). Mathur (2011) claims that ‘[SA] is mired in disputes over water resources despite possessing three large rivers – the Ganges, Brahmaputra and Indus and their tributaries.’ Similarly, Wolf et al. (2003) opine that water can be a pathway for building assurance, engaging in co-operation and resolving conflict. However, due to global market competition between India and China², SA has been a hot-spot, which has affected water security, and because of politico-economic interests, water as a resource in SA has been treated as a political matter of trade. Both countries have been getting involved in the neighbouring countries’ affairs directly/indirectly to expand their market and influence e.g. the recent triangular relations between India-Pakistan-China, China-Nepal-India and India-Sri Lanka-China. The two countries have heavily invested in water sector development in the region via technology sharing and even funding. However, China’s engagement in water sector development of

¹ South Asia (SA) includes Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Pakistan, the Maldives, Nepal, and Sri Lanka.
² Though China is not a part of the South Asian region, majority of the SARs originate from China-controlled Tibet.
smaller neighbouring countries has been less as compared to India. Thus, inclusion of China for better regional co-operation in SA for overall water security and development has been perceived as a recent need.

**Political Dynamics of Conflict over Shared Water Resources**

Former United States Senator Edmund S. Muskie in March 1966 delivered a speech in the Senate and said, ‘High quality water is more than the dream of the conservationists, more than a political slogan.’ Access to quality water is a natural right. He further said ‘high quality water, in the right quantity at the right place at the right time, is essential to health, recreation, and economic growth.’

Water conflict happens when there are two or more forces dependent on a resource and one of them tries to possess/control it. Consequently, the resource itself becomes a focal point of political interests. Evidently, inequality in merit sharing of the water resource then comes to be the potential factor of conflict. According to Malhotra (2010), Iyers (2003) argues that,

...the problem with water issues is not that water issues complicate political issues (that rarely occurs), but that complicated political issues make the smallest water issues between countries, intractable.

SAAn countries are guided by hard-line, national political interests which hamper regional co-operation. Be it between India-Nepal, India-Bangladesh or India-Pakistan, water conflict has been a controversial issue. Thus, it is important to free water resource from hard-line political interest thereby engaging in co-operation to avoid water insecurity.

According to Ashok Swain, a Professor of Peace and Conflict Research at Uppsala University, Sweden (2013, pers. Comm., 08 October 2013) politics in SA are creating the environment of water conflict rather than co-operation. Politicians, as Swain argues, are ‘mostly responsible for highly securitising the water debate, which leads to zero-sum argument and creates conflicts.’ Yet, there are some cases where politicians have helped to settle the ‘debate from security side to technical side’, which has resulted in agreements, for example, the 1996 Ganges Water Treaty (GWT) between India and Bangladesh. In an interview for this paper, conducted in Nepal in 09 October 2013, Christopher Butler, a Lecturer at University of Minnesota, said that ‘there is not much political co-operation at this point. Each [South Asian] country is determined to fulfil its own interests. The reason behind India’s refusal to consider more than bilateral agreements and conversations is due to national/state level politics.’ The nature of rivers in SA defines national boundaries, but according to Butler ‘all [SA] countries view water as a discrete national concern rather than a regional one.’ For example, Ganges and Brahmaputra are bound with different bilateral treaties between different countries. Why should there be bilateral relations between India-Bangladesh and India-Nepal separately since all three countries share the same rivers and their tributaries? Why is there no regional pact? And why not include China controlled Tibet in the regional pact since a major share of the water in these rivers originates from Tibet? There are ten riparian countries sharing the Nile River under the Nile Basin Initiative (NBIS 2011), why can’t
the same case be applied in the SAn context? It is because SAn countries are still not able to understand their respective neighbours and their legitimate and natural rights. Plus, the political dynamics of conflict and co-operation in SAn water is also shaped by Chinese interests in Tibetan water and India’s future in the same resource. Due to this, there has been a long struggle for water resources amongst Nepal, India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh.

SAn countries have already lost a great deal of time and their people bear daily costs of this ‘non co-operation’, so these countries should not delay genuine push towards regional co-operation. Verghese (1996) argues that main differences that mar regional co-operation in the water sector are based on past criticisms which are more imagined than real, i.e., the problem is political rather than technical. There are so many proposed hydropower projects in Nepal which are contracted between Nepal-India and Nepal-China. But, many of these projects have not been completed because of political power-play and instability in Nepal. During political upheavals in Nepal (such as in 1950, 1980, 1990, 2006), major political parties raised their voice against hydro projects which were to be installed in co-operation either with India or with China. According to Pant (2012), very few projects were initiated by the country independently between 1963-1990, such as Karnali, Arun-3, and Kankai. Ignoring the critical nature of water sector development, political parties evoked peoples’ sentiments turning these projects into issues of nationalism and garnered public support. Most importantly, this happened in the water co-operation between India and Nepal. But, as Pant (2012) argues, ‘whatever they [Nepalese Political Parties] utter sometime against India is a drama to confuse the general public.’ Because, most political parties during their protest for political change in Nepal were sheltered in India and once they were elected, all this was forgotten and fresh negotiations were started, just because, being ‘in government & power, [Nepalese Political Parties] cannot say “no” [to] anything that India proposes’ (Pant 2012).

Use of bottled water and tanker water supply has increased water trading in SA, which has changed the dynamics of water use as well. Business enterprises related to water supply have started conflicts at the local level. According to Behr (2008), RCUM and UNESCO (n.d.), McKenzie and Ray (2005), and Babar and Ahmad (2007), such conflict is visible in Nepal’s capital Kathmandu, Chenai in India and Pakistan’s business hub Karachi and province of Balochistan. Lack of institutional arrangements to settle such local conflicts can lead to national level conflicts.

SAn water conflicts are also a reflection of governmental inefficiency in the region. Each country needs to have separate and independent bodies (for water programme planning/designing) formed of political representatives and people of goodwill and expertise to negotiate water treaties/programmes, and a body of researchers and experts to monitor them. Likewise, countries in SA need transparency and reliable information sharing mechanism since the chances of conflict increases if programme/treaty parameters are corrupt and information is kept secret. Past learnings from negotiations can also pave the way for mutual co-operation. Carius, Dabelko and Wolf (2004, p.62)

---

3 The Indus Basin starts from Tibetan plateau in western China, flows through the Himalayas, Kashmir, India and Pakistan and diminishes into the Arabian Sea (Yaqoob 2011).
argue that transboundary water co-operation, in terms of negotiation and arrangements made, has a long and successful history for sustainable development. So, proper study of conflict and co-operation negotiations and treaties can provide significant input in refining newer agreements. Wolf (2007) claims violence about water resources is not rational techno-economically. For this reason too creating an environment for regional co-operation is inevitable in SA.

Military and Development Dynamics of Conflict over Shared Water Resources

National competition for water resources indicates fears of water insecurity. Kofi Annan once said ‘fierce national competition over water resource has prompted fears that water issues contain the seeds of violent conflict.’ Thus, political willingness is significant in settling conflict thereby preventing future violence. Water conflict at cross-country level happens when information is not shared. As most of the SA water resources are under bilateral treaties, sharing information is important. The hard-liners in each disputing country have vested interests to highly secure water issues. Nevertheless, there are a number of water co-operation cases in SA. Indus Water Treaty between India and Pakistan, GWT (1996) between India and Bangladesh are the model cases. But these agreements/treaties too are highly criticised as they are poorly implemented.

As discussed in the context of SA, conflict in water resource is highly connected either with political or with military goals between several users. Sometimes, water resources are found to be used either as targets or as tools. Water conflict happens when its distribution and use is discriminatory. Such tension in water resource is categorised by Gleick (1993, 1998) as ‘development dispute.’ The energy-hunger China and India want more water resources. As Tibetan plateau is rich in water resource, China has arranged for development of hydropower in Tibet because there is a huge gap in development of its Eastern and Western provinces. According to Jha (2011), ‘China is working towards developing road connectivity with Nepal and other SA countries’ so as to promote ‘cross-border integration of economies.’ Thus, water sector development including hydropower generation in SA is more than likely to be affected by current and future plans of China.

Majority of SA countries (such as Nepal, Bangladesh, Pakistan, Afghanistan) lack techno-economic capacity to tap their natural resources. To exemplify, Nepal has high potentiality for hydropower generation but the country is not techno-economically strong to tap its resource. Developing hydropower sector is significant for economic growth. But, hydropower sector development is often debated with ecological and social aspects. Hydropower needs dams and dams hamper natural flow of water, thus creating conflict among users. This is because a dam can swamp public/private property and land in upstream areas. This is observable in several dams that India has built in Nepal-India borders, e.g. Koshi dam. Likewise, a dam stores water and stops its natural flow which affects downstream domestic water consumption, industrial and irrigation water needs. Sometimes the upstream user of a dam might use more water for hydropower generation in winter, while the downstream user might intend to save water for summer. This situation creates hostility among users. There is a saying ‘Big Dams–Big Problems, No
Dams—No Problems.’ Water sharing agreements among users on an equitable basis is a precondition for stability in managing hydro-political conflicts.

**Regional Co-operation for Sustainable Water Management (SWM): Learning from Best Practices**

SAn countries collectively need to identify water as a unique natural resource and create an environment for regional co-operation. As water resources play a significant role in the ecosystem, hydropower generation, domestic consumption and industrial needs, SAn countries have no alternative but to work together for a win-win situation. Mismanagement in water resource has serious implications for water security and livelihoods. Traditional transboundary water management through bilateral treaties/agreements/arrangements are opposed by experts for they think such agreements were not properly investigated. Some of the major challenges in SAn water security are listed below:

- Rapid population growth and urbanisation (increased demand of freshwater),
- Shifting agricultural priorities,
- Growing public health challenges,
- Increasing use of energy,
- Inadequate co-operation on scientific research to comprehend water flow effects,
- Weak state capacity (lack of human resource and financial footing),
- Competition for markets of water supply services (lack of priority on environment),
- Lack of preparedness to tackle the impacts of global climate change,
- Contending national interests, political disagreements and fragile regional organisations,
- China having no water-sharing agreements with downstream countries,
- Insufficient domestic policy responses,
- Extending service to the unserved and maintaining quality of the service to partially unserved.

Ashok Swain (2013, pers. Comm., 8 October) argues there are positive signs in this sector: ‘a good trend is that smaller [SAn] countries have started negotiating their legitimate rights for shared rivers with India and India has started respecting that.’ The Indian Foreign Policy (IFP) regarding water resources was primarily guided by hard-line politics and blind nationalism. But, as Swain claims ‘[IFP] is not the same as it used to be in 1950/60s.’ Likewise, China’s active role and influence over other small SAn countries has compelled India to be ‘negotiation friendly’ (Ibid.). This is helpful in creating regional co-operation for overall water security and management in the region.

SWM to meet the local/national/international needs is essential. Ways of SWM can differ from basin to basin, from one area to another. SWM is also concerned with effective conflict management mechanism within agreements. Presently, the setting for water resource management is only slightly changed, for resources are bound with treaties and agreements in their respective contexts. But, this does not mean that water conflicts no
The reality is that often bilateral treaties are not implemented in their true spirit. However, as Wolf (2006) argues, wars and violence over the uses of transboundary rivers are not ‘strategically rational, hydrographically effective, or economically viable’, thus, regional co-operation for SWM and water security is essential. The following are important for regional co-operation in water security:

   a) Sharing data related to hydrology and planned projects on shared rivers.
   b) Documentation of past agreements and re-addressing them.
   c) Domestic effort to manage water first, then national efforts for inclusive regional co-operation.
   d) All water is local, but all transboundary water is not local (one size will not fit all).
   e) Donor agencies need to extend integrated policy/technology assistance for SWM.
   f) The country able to tap into its water resources sustainably should share knowledge with its neighbours, especially if the latter is unable to do the same.
   g) Each country in the region needs to accept reasonable compromises (benefits should be shared mutually).
   h) Water programmes should be managed by professionals and not by politicians (after agreements are politically ratified).
   i) Environment-friendly management should be encouraged.
   j) Suitable criteria regarding water quality/allocation in shared programmes should be developed.

The troubled bilateral relations in SA would not end until the standard of equitable sharing is met. Naturally, upper riparian regions need to value the legitimate claims/requirements of downstream riparian areas, and vice versa. Each side needs to have the willingness to settle disputes, create an environment for negotiation, mediation, and conciliation, which fosters SWM of transboundary rivers.

In regional co-operation, each party should get involved and attempt to settle disputes. For example, in case of Kashmir, China-controlled Tibet also needs to be involved for SWM in the region, as the major share of water in Kashmir originates from Tibet. In regional co-operation, past mistakes need to be forgotten, and genuine points of the treaties should be honoured, and the controversial points re-evaluated and re-analysed with true spirit. Cooperative mechanism for water resources in the frontier zones is often politicised; thereby making an issue of compensation and fair share of water. So, building strong monitoring capacity is important to resolve transboundary water conflicts.

The negotiation pattern regarding water in SA is diverse due to criteria and uses. Negotiations are concerned either with right-basis or with need-basis. For example, regarding the negotiation process of the 1960 Indus Water Treaty (IWT), India, an upstream riparian in the Indus River, bargained absolute sovereignty focusing on right-basis, while the downstream riparian, Pakistan, bargained for absolute river integrity and
undisturbed river system focusing on need-basis. The story between India and Nepal is different from that of India-Pakistan. Nepal is focusing on right-basis, while India is focusing on need-basis in the river waters they share. Thus, whatever the country-wise perception is, regional co-operation based on an equitable benefit sharing pattern is important for common good.

**Involvement of third party** in the negotiation and mutual understanding between conflicting parties is also helpful in resolving conflict. Regarding third party involvement, for instance, World Bank intervened in settling the Indus dispute and was successful. Likewise, United Nations (UN) initiated the Mekong Agreement and was successful. Similarly, regarding the understanding of conflicting parties, we can analyse the Indian investment in Nepal and Thai investment in Laos.

Kraemer (2002) writes that ‘Water bodies are now at the centre of water policies, and not water uses or functions,’ and presented a unique concept, ‘...the [Water Framework Directive-WFD] which establishes a cyclical management aimed at continuous improvement of water bodies.’ WFD has been able to define water quality for all types of waters (i.e. rivers, lakes, groundwater, coastal) based on ‘biology, chemistry and morphology.’ Previously, no member states of the European Union were able to combine these three dimensions in their water policy and management. But, as WFD was drafted, all the states adopted it. The WFD could be studied as a potential framework for South Asia.

Another example from which South Asia can effectively learn is the Nile Basin Sustainability Framework. Guided by a ‘shared vision’ (The Nile Basin Initiative 2011), all the Nile riparian states agreed to come under one framework that could fight poverty, increase economic development and regional integration, built trust and confidence and promote regional stability. However, as pointed out in the Framework itself, ‘The NBSF, which is a suite of policies, strategies and guidelines, only functions as a guide.’ A possible South Asian regional co-operation framework following from this could look like this:

---

4 There are ten Nile riparian countries, namely Burundi, DR Congo, Egypt, Ethiopia, Kenya, Rwanda, South Sudan, Sudan, Tanzania and Uganda.
The three water sectors for development in SA would include ‘Drinking Water/Sanitation’, ‘Hydro-energy’, and ‘Irrigation and Flood Management’, implemented by the ‘Operational Mechanism’. The operational mechanism would have a ‘Shared Vision’ of all the countries from SA. Also, the Framework would need China-controlled Tibet to participate as well. While formulating the ‘Policies/Strategies/Guidelines’ there would have to be equal participation and support from diverse stakeholders such as political bodies, technical advisory committees, basin communities and national line agencies/development partners. The policies/strategies/guidelines formulated by the diverse stakeholders would be forwarded to the ‘Framework Secretariat’ that would develop/implement action programmes. The Framework Secretariat would co-operate with ‘Impact Assessment Bodies’ to assess the impacts and provide subsidies to the impacted.
Recommendations
Wolf (2006) opines that bilateral treaties can address problems according to context and environment, because the global principal may not work in a specific place and time. However, observing the context and environment of SAn water security and development, regional co-operation is preferred by a large number of experts and policy makers because, the value of bilateral treaties in terms of inclusion, benefit and information sharing, monitoring, and conflict resolution provisions and their effectiveness is sometimes questioned.

Ashok Swain (2013, pers. Comm., 8 October) argues that international declarations ‘are not useless, but they cannot bring solution to local water issues.’ Each basin in SA is different, so there is no ‘golden principle’ of effective water management except agreement and co-operation according to context and situation. According to Swain, SAn countries need to address water issues either bilaterally or at basin level. While asked about the same issue, Christopher Butler (2013, pers. Comm., 9 October 2013, Nepal) points out that multi-lateral treaties (indicating regional co-operation) are effective rather than bilateral treaties and international declarations as the SARs and water is not confined to national boundaries only. It is because of the nature of the SAn shared rivers and the common cultural-environmental and economic dependency of the countries in the region over shared rivers, regional co-operation is suitable. Kugelman(2006) writes:

*Regional water security is best attained not by changing architecture or philosophy of regional water agreements, but instead by strengthening mechanisms for co-operation and transparency within existing arrangements.*

In regional co-operation, each country has prospects to meet its drinking water demands, hydropower, industrial and irrigation water concerns.

Interdependency of Tibet, Nepal, India and Bangladesh in the Ganges and Brahmaputra basin can lead towards more intensified conflict or violence. Until and unless the concept of regional co-operation is not given importance and implemented, water conflicts can always rear their ugly head in the region. So, policy makers need to concentrate on the following:

1. Developing an all-inclusive regional framework for co-operation similar to the NBSF.
2. Building national political leadership/interest through evidence-based research on water.

Final Thoughts
SAn countries need to engage in regional co-operation for gaining mutual benefits from shared rivers. If these countries built trust and co-operate with each other, several sectors such as safe drinking water, trade and industry, hydropower, irrigation (agriculture), and transportation and navigation would be promoted. Yet, the mechanism of regional co-
operation needs to fill the gap in access, use and affordability of water and sanitation among people in respective countries.

Sometimes, sources of local level conflict in water resources are different users themselves (like tanker water supplier, local users, and bottle water producers). So, distribution of water resources for livelihood security including drinking water needs first priority rather than development and other facilities. The second priority should be given to environmental security.

India is at the centre for conflict and co-operation in terms of SA shared rivers, the possibility of future co-operation is strong because India does not look at shared water concerns with same perspective as it used to do a couple of decades back.

Economic rise of China and its determination for more development success through water sector development to fill development gap of its Eastern and Western provinces has brought changes to the hydro-strategic landscape in SA. The water security situation in the region seems quite complicated, yet, the shifting hydro-hegemonic status of India certainly would create favourable environment for regional co-operation in the region. The differing view is that the more India’s economy struggles, the more complicated it will be to attain a regional working agreement. The reality is that India has troubled relation with its neighbouring countries, and the agreed development programmes in the shared rivers are failing just because of its hydro-hegemonic status, which has stopped Indian economy from booming as expected. Thus, if an environment of regional co-operation is created, and the benefits are mutually shared in an equitable basis, there is high chance of economic boom for all countries in the region.
References


## Appendix 1: Shared Rivers in South Asia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rivers</th>
<th>Riparian Pairs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brahmaputra (and tributaries)</td>
<td>China, India and Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ganges (and tributaries)</td>
<td>China, Nepal, India, and Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meghna (and tributaries)</td>
<td>India and Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koshi (and tributaries)</td>
<td>Nepal and India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gandak (and tributaries)</td>
<td>Nepal and India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghara (and tributaries)</td>
<td>Nepal and India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indus (and tributaries)</td>
<td>China, India and Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sutlej (and tributaries)</td>
<td>China, India and Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kabul</td>
<td>Afghanistan and Pakistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Gleick 1996, pp.817-823.*
CREATING MOMENTUM: TODAY IS TOMORROW

SDPI'S SIXTEENTH SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE

10-12 DECEMBER 2013

ISLAMABAD, PAKISTAN

(Updated 25 August 2014)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:00 am – 11:30 am</td>
<td><strong>Opening Plenary</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Welcome Address:</strong></td>
<td>Ambassador (Retd.) Mr. Shafqat Kakakhel, Chairperson, Board of Governors, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction to the Conference:</strong></td>
<td>Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Executive Director, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Keynote Speaker:</strong></td>
<td>Dr. Hafiz A. Pasha, Former Minister of Finance; Dean, School of Social Sciences, Vice Chairman, Institute of Public Policy, Beaconhouse National University, Lahore, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Plenary Title:</strong></td>
<td>Economy of Tomorrow: A Case Study of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Remarks by the Chief Guest:</strong></td>
<td>Mr. Ahsan Iqbal, Federal Minister for Planning and Development, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Launch of SDC Anthology:</strong></td>
<td>Sustainable Development in South Asia: Shaping the Future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Launch of SDPI’s Annual Report: 2012—2013</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discussion</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30 am – 12 noon</td>
<td><strong>Tea / Coffee</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Tuesday, 10 December 2013**  
**Day One**

### Concurrent Panel A-1  
**12 noon – 2:00 pm**

**Title:** Reforms for Inclusive and Sustainable Economic Growth in Pakistan  
**Chair:** Dr. Nadeem-ul-Haque, Former Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission of Pakistan  
**Special comments by:** Mr. Sherman Robinson, International Food Policy Research Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Panel Organisers and Moderators:** Dr. Vaqar Ahmed and Mr. Muhammad Adnan, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mohsin Khalid, Former President, Islamabad Chamber of Commerce</td>
<td>Energy Crisis and Reforms for Industrial Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Naveed Cheema, Governance Specialist, Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Reform of Public Sector Enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Nadia Tahir, Head, Division of Finance and Business Economics, UCP Business School, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan</td>
<td>Cross-country Macro and Micro Reforms for Inclusive Growth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 pm - 3:00 pm</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Concurrent Panel A-2  
**12 noon – 2:00 pm**

**Title:** Sustainable Livelihoods in Conflict Situations  
**Chair:** Mr. Haider Nizamani, University of British Columbia and Simon Fraser University, Canada  
**Special comments by:** Ms Rachel Slater, Overseas Development Institute (ODI), UK  
**Panel Organisers and Moderators:** Mr. Qasim Shah and Ms Anam Khan, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ms Sony KC, Nepal Center for Contemporary Research, Nepal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(Assessing Livelihood Options in Post-conflict Nepal)*
Mr. Kulasabanathan Romeshun, Centre for Poverty Analysis, Sri Lanka
Mr. Qasim Shah, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan
Dr. Giulia Minoia, Secure Livelihoods Research Consortium, Afghanistan
(Village Behaviour and the Role of Customary Institutions: Developing a Method for Characterizing Village Context)

Discussion
Lunch 2:00 pm – 3:00 pm

Tuesday, 10 December 2013
Day One

Concurrent Panel A-3
12 noon – 2:00 pm

Title: Energy and Water Security in South Asia - Session I
Chair: Mr. Shams ul Mulk, Former Caretaker Chief Minister, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Pakistan
Special comments by: Dr. Dr. Talat Mehmood, Social Science Research Center Berlin (WZB), Germany
Panel Organisers and Moderators: Mr. M. Zeshan and Mr. Safwan Aziz, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Bushra Yasmin, Head of Economics Department, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan</td>
<td>Deindustralisation in South Asia: Role of Energy Crises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Aisha Azhar, Assistant Professor, GIK Institute of Sciences &amp; Technology, Topi, Pakistan</td>
<td>Diffusion and Adoption of Renewable Energy Systems through Regional Co-operation in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Junaid Zahid and Mr. Kashif Majeed Salik, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Prospects of Shale Oil and Gas Production in Pakistan: A Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Fareeha Mahmood, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Regional Co-operation in the Energy Sector: India and Pakistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion
Lunch 2:00 pm – 3:00 pm
**Tuesday, 10 December 2013**

**Day One**

**Concurrent Panel A-4**

12 noon – 2:00 pm

**Title:** Revisiting the Left Movement in South Asia – Examining Sustainable Political, Economic and Social Development in the Region

**Chair:** Barrister Naseem Bajwa, Bajwa and Co. London, UK

**Special comments by:** Ms Kishwer Naheed, Hawwa Women Craft Co-operative, Islamabad, Pakistan

**Panel Organiser and Moderator:** Dr. Nathalène Reynolds, Research Fellow at l’Institut Français de Recherche sur l’Afrique (French Institute of Research on Africa), Kenya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Nathalène Reynolds, l’Institut Français de Recherche sur l’Afrique (French Institute of Research on Africa), Kenya</td>
<td>Revisiting Key Episodes of the Communist Movement in India: Contributions of Rajani Palme Dutt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Raza Naeem, Lahore School of Economics, Lahore, Pakistan</td>
<td>Comrade Manto: Revisiting Saadat Hasan Manto’s Progressive Writings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ahmad Salim, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Pakistan Movement and the Communists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Sanaullah Rustamani, International Islamic University, Pakistan</td>
<td>Revisiting the Progressive Poetry of Shaikh Ayaz</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Lunch**

2:00 pm – 3:00 pm
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concurrent Panel A-5</th>
<th>3:00 pm – 5:00 pm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> Pakistan Vision 2025</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guest of Honour:</strong> Mr. Marc Andre-Franche, United Nations Development Programme, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chair:</strong> Dr. Vaqar Ahmed, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Special Remarks:</strong> Dr. Pervez Tahir, Former Chief Economist, Planning Commission of Pakistan, Lahore; and, Mr. Ali Khizar, Business Recorder, Lahore, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panel Organiser and Moderator:</strong> Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speakers</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Mustopadidja A, Jakarta, Indonesia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Aman Ullah, Planning Commission of Pakistan, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Khaqan Najeeb, Director General, Economic Reforms Unit, Ministry of Finance, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**
Tuesday, 10 December 2013  Day One

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concurrent Panel A-6</th>
<th>3:00 pm – 5:00 pm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> Making Quality Education Accessible: Investing in Today’s Education for Tomorrow</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chair:</strong> Prof. Dr. Samina Amin Qadir, Vice Chancellor, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Special comments by:</strong> Mr. Mosharraf Zaidi, Team leader Alif Ailaan, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panel Organisers and Moderators:</strong> Mr. Fayyaz Yasin and Dr. Sheheryar Toru, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speakers</strong></td>
<td><strong>Titles</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Asaf Niwaz, University of Haripur, Pakistan</td>
<td>Accessible Quality Education in Pakistan: A Dream Yet to Come True</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Abdul R. Channa, The Australian National University, Australia (via Skype)</td>
<td>Girls and Primary Education: Dropout from School or From Imminent Opportunities? The Experience in Sindh, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Nazir Mahmood, Development Consultant, M&amp;E and Education Management, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Education Management: Today and Tomorrow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Shehryar Toru, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Making Quality Education Accessible in Pakistan: Case studies from Khanewal and Vehari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Tahir Dhindsa, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Education for Sustainable Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Discussion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuesday, 10 December 2013</td>
<td>Day One</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concurrent Panel A-7</strong></td>
<td>3:00 pm – 5:00 pm</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Title:** Energy and Water Security in South Asia - Session II  
**Chair:** Dr. Musadiq Malik, Advisor to the Prime Minister for Water and Power, Pakistan  
**Special comments by:** Mr. Faisal Haq Sheheen, Toronto Water Division, Canada  
**Panel Organisers and Moderators:** Mr. M. Zeshan and Mr. Safwan Aziz, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. A.Z.M. Saleh, Unnayan Onneshan, Bangladesh</td>
<td>Indo-Bangla Water Regime: Analysis based on GBM Basin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Prakash Tiwari, Professor of Geography, Kumaon University, India</td>
<td>Regional Co-operation for Integrated Water Governance in Hindu Kush Himalaya: A Precondition for Water Security and Climate Change Adaptation in South Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Gopikesh Acharya, Nepal Center for Contemporary Research, Nepal</td>
<td>Conflict and Co-operation Dynamics of Politics in South Asian Water Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Abrar Kazi, Political Worker, Jamshoro, Pakistan; and Mr. Zulfiqar Halepoto, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan</td>
<td>Revisiting Inter and Intra-State Water Security Paradigms in South Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Arthur Gueneau, International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Climate, Water, Food and Energy Nexus in the Indus Basin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**
Tuesday, 10 December 2013

Concurrent Panel A-8

| Time       | Day        | Title: Future of Food Security in Pakistan
|------------|------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
| 3:00 pm – 5:00 pm | Day One | Guest of Honour: Ms Arfa Khalid, Member National Assembly, Islamabad, Pakistan
| Chair / Special comments by: | Mr. Malik Zahoor Ahmed, Director General North-East Forum for International Solidarity (NEFIS), Islamabad, Pakistan |
| Panel Organisers and Moderators: | Dr. Krishna Pahari, World Food Programme, Islamabad, Pakistan; and, Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan |
| Speakers | Dr. Krishna Pahari, Head, World Food Programme (WFP), Islamabad, Pakistan |
|            | Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan |
|            | Mr. Patrick Evans, Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), Islamabad, Pakistan |
|            | Mr. Qaim Shah, HE International Fund for Agriculture Development (IFAD), Islamabad, Pakistan |
|            | Ms. Lola Castro, World Food Programme (WFP), Islamabad, Pakistan |

Discussion
**Wednesday, 11 December 2013**

**Day Two**

**Concurrent Panel B-1**  
**9:30 am – 11:30 am**

**Title:** Promoting Freedom of Belief and Challenging Religious Discrimination in Pakistan  
**Chair:** Mr. I. A. Rahman, Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, Lahore, Pakistan  
**Special comments by:** Ms Farah Mihlar, Minority Rights Group International, UK; Prof. Dr. Sukhadeo Thorat, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, India; and, Mr. Ahmad Salim, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Panel Organiser and Moderator:** Mr. Ahmad Salim, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Eaisha Tareen, Sociologist and Clinical Psychologist, UK</td>
<td>Islamic Conception of Freedom of Belief - The Case of Apostasy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Humaira Ishfaq, University of Cambridge, UK</td>
<td>Issues of Religious Freedom, Pakistan’s 1973 Constitution and International Laws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Ayesha Salman, Communication Specialist, UK</td>
<td>Rifles or Roses? The Will to Power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Zulfiqar Halepoto, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan</td>
<td>Sindh A Buffer Zone against Religious Discrimination in Pakistan: Case Study of Bhor Bheel - The Untouchable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Tea**  
**11:30 am—12 noon**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title: Gender Equality: A Road to Sustainable Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chair: Ms Mussarat Ahmedzeb, Member National Assembly, Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special comments by: Mr. Haider Nizamani, University of British Columbia and Simon Fraser University, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel Organiser and Moderator: Ms Mome Saleem, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Nathalène Reynolds, l'Institut Français de Recherche sur l'Afrique (French Institute of Research on Africa), Kenya</td>
<td>Gender Equality Possible in the 21st Century? Remedies for the Slow Pace of Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Prakash Tiwari, Professor of Geography, Kumaon University, India; and Dr. Bhagwati Joshi Tiwari, Government Post Graduate College, Nainital, India</td>
<td>Women and Sustainable Mountain Development: Indigenous Women’s Adaptation to Climate Change in Himalaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. A.Z.M. Saleh, Research &amp; Programme Associate, Unnayan Onneshan, Dhaka, Bangladesh</td>
<td>Economic Empowerment of Rural Women in Bangladesh-Enroute to Achieving Sustainable Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Saima Bibi, Department of Forestry &amp; Wildlife Management, University of Haripur, Pakistan</td>
<td>Women as Agents of Change in Litchi Fruit Cultivation, Harvesting and Marketing: A Case Study of Khanpur, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Veena Sikri, South Asia Women’s Network, Delhi, India</td>
<td>Gender Equality and Sustainable Development in South Asia: SWAN (South Asia Women’s Network)’s Roadmap</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30 am—12 noon</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Concurrent Panel B-3

**Title:** Citizen Empowerment Accountability: Demand Side Approach to Improving Service Delivery  
**Chair:** Mr. Paul McCarthy, Consultant, Governance & Civil Society, Indonesia  
**Special comments by:** Mr. Babar Jamal, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Panel Organiser and Moderator:** Mr. Asif Memon, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Faisal Haq Shaheen, Toronto Water Division, Canada</td>
<td>Citizen State Engagement for Service Delivery in South Asia: Community based Experiences in Advocating for Municipal Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Shehryar Toru, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>The Dynamics of Access: Implications of ‘Voice’, ‘Exit’ and Accountability in the Provision of Public Goods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Khaleel Ahmed Tetlay, Rural Support Programme Network, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Mobilising Communities to Demand Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mosharaff Zaidi, Team Leader Alif Ailaan, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Citizen Demands and Political Party Promises on Service Delivery</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Tea**  
11:30 am – 12 noon
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wednesday, 11 December 2013</th>
<th>Day Two</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concurrent Panel B-4</strong></td>
<td>9:30 am – 11:30 am</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> Agriculture Value Chain Development of South Asia: Opportunities and Constraints</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chair:</strong> Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Special comments by:</strong> Dr. Stephen Davies, International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panel Organisers and Moderators:</strong> Mr. Shujaat Ali Khan, USAID, Peshawar and Mr. Jamal Shah, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Sohail Jehangir Malik, Innovative Development Strategies (Pvt.), Ltd., Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Agriculture Value Chain Development of South Asia - The Time to Act is Now: Opportunities and Constraints from Pakistan’s Perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Saleem Ashraf, PhD Scholar, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Linking Agricultural Risk Management with Cotton Value Chain (CVC) in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Grant Vinning, Balochistan Agriculture Project, Quetta, Pakistan</td>
<td>Marketing Organisations in Pakistan: What Value Chain Analyses do not tell about Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Ayesha Gulzar, National Coordinator, The Agribusiness Project, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Using the Value Chain Approach for Agribusiness Development in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Muhammad Zeshan, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Wheat Market in Pakistan: A Post-18th Constitutional Amendment Inquiry</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Tea**  
11:30 am – 12 noon
**Wednesday, 11 December 2013**

**Day Two**

**Concurrent Panel B-5**

12 noon – 2:00 pm

**Title:** UNEP ROAP-SDPI Special Session: Enhancing Sustainable Development in South Asia through Innovations and Partnerships - APFED Showcase Programme

**Chair:** Ambassador (Retd.) Mr. Shafqat Kakakhel, Chairperson, Board of Governors, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan

**Welcome:** Dr. Abid Qaiyum Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan

**Introduction to the APFED Showcase Programme:** Mr. Manesh Lacoul (VIA SKYPE), United Nations Environment Program, ROAP and Dr. Mahmood A. Khwaja, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan

**Discussants/Special comments by:** Dr. Vaqar Ahmed, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan and Mr. Faisal Haq Shaheen, Toronto Water Division, Canada

**Panel Organizers / Moderator:** Mr. Manesh Lacoul, United Nations Environment Program, Bangkok, Thailand; and Dr. Mahmood A. Khwaja, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Chathura Weliwitiya, Chairman, Human Environmental Links Progressive Organization (HELP-O), Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Application of Green Bio-Energy City Concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Khursheed Bhatti, Association for Humanitarian Development, Hyderabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Access to Safe Drinking Water via Nadi Water Filter in Remote Areas, Sindh Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Rabin Kadariya, Programme Officer In Charge, National Trust for Nature Conservation, Nepal</td>
<td>Mentha (Mentha arvensis) Cultivation for Livelihood Enhancement and Biodiversity Conservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Zia ur Rehman Farooqi, National Integrated and Development Association, Besham, Pakistan</td>
<td>Environmental Improvement and Greenhouse Gas Reductions via Use of Fuel-efficient technologies and Reduced Woodcutting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Lunch**

2:00 pm – 3:00 pm
**Wednesday, 11 December 2013**

**Day Two**

**Concurrent Panel B-6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12 noon – 2:00 pm</td>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> CUTFS Anniversary Session: The Future of India-Pakistan Trade and Economic Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Guest of Honour:</strong> Mr. Khurram Dastagir, Minister of State for Privatisation / Chairman, Privatisation Commission, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chair:</strong> H.E. T.C.A. Raghavan, Indian High Commissioner to Pakistan, Islamabad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Panel Organiser:</strong> Mr. Udai Mehta, Associate Director, CUTFS International (Consumer Unity &amp; Trust Society), India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Speakers</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Pradeep Mehta, Secretary General, CUTFS International (Consumer Unity &amp; Trust Society), India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Aqdas Ali Kazmi, Former Joint Chief Economist, Planning of Commission of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Amin Hashwani, Hashwani Group, Karachi, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Shaban Khalid, President, Islamabad Chamber of Commerce and Industries, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Discussion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Summary by the Chair and Vote of Thanks by Mr. Pradeep Mehta, Secretary General, CUTFS International (Consumer Unity &amp; Trust Society), India</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Lunch</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2:00 pm – 3:00 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concurrent Panel B-7</td>
<td>12 noon – 2:00 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> Barriers to Women's Participation in Politics: A Review of Post Elections 2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chair / Special comments by:</strong> Mr. Naeem Mirza, Aurat Foundation, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panel Organiser and Moderator:</strong> Mr. Asif Memon, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speakers</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Babar Jamal, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Case Studies of Women's Political Empowerment and Leadership from Southern Punjab</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Haider Nizamani, Vancouver, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Women in 'Development' and the Anti-politics Machine</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Irina Mosel, Overseas Development Institute (ODI), UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Uzma Zarrin, Aurat Foundation, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Lunch**  2:00 pm – 3:00 pm
**Title:** Role of Information Technology and Telecommunication in Economic Development – Linking the Future

**Chair:** Dr. Ijaz Shafi Gilani, Chairman Gallup, Islamabad, Pakistan

**Special comments by:** Mr. Nooruddin Baqai, Independent Consultant, former Member Telecom, Ministry of IT and Telecom, Islamabad, Pakistan

**Panel Organiser:** Brig (retd.) Mohammad Yasin, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brig (Retd.) Mohammad Yasin, Sustainable Development Policy Institute,</td>
<td>Impact of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) on Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>and Poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Muhammad Saleem, Pakistan Telecommunication Authority, Islamabad,</td>
<td>Financial Inclusion through ICT and its Impact on Pakistan’s Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Parvez Iftikhar, International Consultant on IT and Telecom,</td>
<td>Role of ICTs &amp; Broadband Internet in Economic Development – Linking the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Babar Shahbaz, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Agricultural Development through ICT: The Case Study of Cyber Extension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in the Punjab, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

**Lunch**

2:00 pm – 3:00 pm
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Tariq Rahman, HEC Distinguished National Professor, Lahore, Pakistan</td>
<td>Language Death or Murder?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Pervaish Shaheen, Director, Gandhara Research Project Centre, Manglor, Swat, Pakistan</td>
<td>Preservation of Museum and Artifacts in Swat, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Humaira Ishfaq, University of Cambridge, UK</td>
<td>Women’s Dying Tradition of Creating Folk Heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mian Attique Rahman, Director, Lyallpur Museum, Faisalabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Archaeological Sites and Monuments in Pakistan: Archaeology Today – As Never Needed Before</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion
**Wednesday, 11 December 2013  Day Two**

Concurrent Panel B-10  3:00 pm – 5:00 pm

**Title:** Roundtable Discussion: Governance, Peace and Justice in South Asia (IDRC Fellows only)

**Chair:** Dr. Peter Taylor, Programme Manager, International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Canada

**Special comments by:** Dr. Rita Bowry, International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Canada

**Panel Organiser and Moderator:** Dr. Vaqar Ahmed, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

**Keynote Speaker**

Mr. Paul McCarthy, Consultant – Governance & Civil Society, Indonesia

**IDRC-SDPI Fellows:**

Mr. Amir Mustafa, Preston University, Islamabad Campus, Pakistan

Mr. Bishal Kumar Bhandari, Kathmandu University, Kathmandu, Nepal

Mr. Fayyaz Yaseen, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

Mr. Malik Faisal Moanjaz, Iqra University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Mr. Muhammad Asif, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

Mr. Muhammad Usman, Arid Agriculture University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Mr. Shahzad Khan, The University of Agriculture Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan

Ms Aneesa Rahman, Portfolio Assistant, GIZ, Bangladesh

Ms Arumina Chakraborty, Centre for Studies in Social Sciences, Calcutta, India

Ms Barkha Sharda, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, India

Ms Gulali Jogeizai, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Islamabad, Pakistan

Ms Kausila Timsina, (from Bhutan), Sikkim University, India
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>Titles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ms Ranjini Basu, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, India</td>
<td>Access to Justice: The Challenges and Opportunities Posed by Alternative Modes of Dispute Resolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Saeeda Khan, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wednesday, 11 December 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concurrent Session B-11</td>
<td>3:00 pm – 5:00 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title: Access to Justice: The Challenges and Opportunities Posed by Alternative Modes of Dispute Resolution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chair: Dr. Zarina Salamat, Council Of Social Sciences, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Comments by: Mr. Harris Khalique, Team Leader AAWAZ, Development Alternatives, Inc (DAI), Islamabad, Pakistan; Mr. Muhammad Tehseen, South Asia Partnership Pakistan (SAPP); and Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel Organiser and Moderator: Mr. Asif Memon, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speakers</td>
<td>Titles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Sultan-i-Rome, Associate Professor of History, Government Jahanzeb College, Swat, Pakistan</td>
<td>Actions (in Aid of Civil Power) Regulation, 2011: A Critical Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Waqar Chohan, Assistant Inspector General (Special Branch), Police Service of Pakistan, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Alternate Dispute Resolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Ehtasham Anwar, Additional Deputy Commissioner General (ADCG), Islamabad; and Humphrey Fellow, University of Minnesota, USA</td>
<td>Alternate Dispute Resolution - Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Asif Saeed Memon, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>The Determinants of Opting for Traditional ADR by Citizens: Evidence from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 9:30 am – 11:30 am | Concurrent Panel C-1 – India-Pakistan Dialogue on Climate Change and Energy – Session I  
**Title:** India-Pakistan Dialogue on Climate Change and Energy – Session I  
**Guest of Honour:** Dr. Musadiq Malik, Advisor to the Prime Minister for Water and Power, Pakistan  
**Chair:** Dr. Tariq Banuri, City & Metropolitan Planning, University of Utah, USA  
**Inaugural Speakers:** Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan; Ms Britta Peterson, Heinrich Boll Stiftung, Islamabad, Pakistan; Dr. Axel Harneit-Sievers, Country Director, Heinrich Boll Stiftung (HBS) India; and Mr. Kashif M. Salik, SDPI, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Panel Organisers and Moderators:** Ms Sadia M. Ishfaq and Mr. Kashif Majeed Salik, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Speakers:**  
Ambassador (Retd.) Chandrashekhar Dasgupta, India  
Mr. Chandra Bhushan, Deputy Director General, Centre for Science & Environment, India  
Ambassador (Retd.) Shafqat Kakakhel, Former Acting Executive Director, United Nations Environment Program (UNEP) and Chairperson BoG, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Mr. Ali Touqeer Sheikh, Executive Director, LEAD, Islamabad, Pakistan.  

**Discussion**

**Tea** | 11:30 am-12 noon
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thursday, 12 December 2013</th>
<th>Day Three</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concurrent Panel C-2</td>
<td>9:30 am – 11:30 am</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Title:** MDGs Framework – Thoughts on Post 2015 Development Agenda  
**Chair:** Ms Mariyam Aurangzeb, Member National Assembly, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Special comments by:** Mr. Marc-Andre Franche, United Nations Development Programme, Islamabad, Pakistan; Dr. Avnish Kumar, Public Policy and Governance Area Management Development Institute, India; Dr. Shahid Naeem, Ministry of Planning, Development, and Reforms, Islamabad, Pakistan; and Mr. Nohman Ishtiaq, Economic Consultant, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan |
<p>| <strong>Panel Organisers/Moderators:</strong> Mr. Shakeel Ahmed, United Nations Development Programme and Dr. Vaqar Ahmed, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan |
| <strong>Speaker</strong> |
| Mr. Shakeel Ahmed, Policy Specialist, United Nations Development Programme, Islamabad, Pakistan |
| <strong>Discussion</strong> |
| <strong>Tea</strong> | 11:30 am – 12 noon |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concurrent Session C-3</th>
<th>9:30 am – 11:30 am</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> Institutional Dynamics of Policy Research in South Asia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chair:</strong> Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed, Executive Director, Higher Education Commission, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panel Organiser:</strong> Mr. Arif Naveed, Researcher, Faculty of Education, University of Cambridge, UK; and Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speakers</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Arif Naveed, Researcher, Faculty of Education, University of Cambridge, UK; and, SDPI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Geof Wood, Emeritus Professor, University of Bath, UK; and, SDPI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Mathilde Maitrot, Researcher, University of Bath, UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discussion</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tea</strong></td>
<td>11:30 am – 12 noon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concurrent Session C-4</td>
<td>9:30 am – 11:30 am</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title:</strong> Regional Co-operation for Food Security in South Asia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chair:</strong> Dr. Nagesh Kumar, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific South (UN-ESCAP); and, South-West Asia Office, India</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Panel Organisers:</strong> Dr. Nagesh Kumar, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific South (UN-ESCAP); and, South-West Asia Office, India; and, Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speakers</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Towfiqul Islam Khan, Centre for Policy Dialogue, Dhaka, Bangladesh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Matthew Hammill, Economic Affairs Officer UN-ESCAP, India</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Qasim Shah, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discussion</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tea</strong></td>
<td>11:30 am – 12 noon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speakers</td>
<td>Titles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Chandra Bhushan, Deputy Director General, Centre for Science &amp; Environment, India</td>
<td>Promoting Energy Sustainability: Challenges &amp; Responses in India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Shaukat Hameed Khan, Vice Chancellor (Designate), Sir Syed CASE Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Energy Security and Sustainability in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Muhammad Bilal, Head of CEM, National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
<td>Private-Public Partnership in Renewable Energy Sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Zeenat Niazi, India</td>
<td>Engaging Communities in Renewable Energy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

Lunch | 2:00 pm – 3:00 pm

Title: India-Pakistan Dialogue on Climate Change and Energy – Session II
Chair: Mr. Saeed Khalid, Director, Policy Centre COMSTEC, Islamabad, Pakistan
Panel Organisers: Ms Sadia M. Ishfaq and Mr. Kashif Majeed Malik, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12 noon</td>
<td>Concurrent Session C-6: Title: Regional Connectivity: Transport and Logistic Corridors in South Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 noon</td>
<td>Chair: Dr. Vaqar Ahmed, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 noon</td>
<td>Special comments by: Eng. M. A. Jabbar, Member BoG, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Pakistan; Dr. Dinesh Mohan, Indian Institute of Technology, India; and, Mr. Haroon Sharif, World Bank, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 noon</td>
<td>Panel Organiser: Dr. Nagesh Kumar, UN-ESCAP India; and, Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Speakers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Nagesh Kumar, Chief Economist, UN-ESCAP and Director ESCAP, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Dinesh Mohan, Indian Institute of Technology, India (Climate change, Transport and Negative Feedback)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 pm</td>
<td>Lunch: Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 pm</td>
<td>2:00 pm – 3:00 pm</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Thursday, 12 December 2013**  
**Day Three**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concurrent Session C-7</th>
<th>12 noon – 2:00pm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Title:** Roundtable Discussion Peace and Security: Post 2014 South Asia  
**Moderator:** Mr. Ejaz Haider, Senior Anchor & Senior Analyst, Capital TV, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Panel Organiser:** Ms Sadia Sharif, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
**Speakers**  
Mr. Ejaz Haider, Senior Anchor & Senior Analyst, Capital TV, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Gen.(Retd.) Athar Abbas, Former Director General, Inter Services Public Relations, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Ambassador (Retd.) Mr. Ayaz Wazir, Former Ambassador to Afghanistan, Pakistan  
Mr. Ahmer Bilal Soofi, Former Interim Law Minister; Lawyer, Supreme Court, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Gen (Retd.) Talat Masood, Security and Defense Analyst, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Mr. Afrasiab Khattak, Member National Assembly (KPK), Islamabad, Pakistan  
Dr. Shoab Suddle, Tax Ombudsman and former Inspector General Sindh and Baluchistan, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Ms Veena Sikri, South Asia Women’s Network, Delhi, India  
Ms Farah Mihtar, Minority Rights Group International, UK  
Dr. Ilhan Niaz, Professor of History, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Dr. Avanish Kumar, Management Development Institute, India  
**Discussion**  
**Lunch** | 2:00 pm – 3:00 pm |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thursday, 12 December 2013</th>
<th>Day Three</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concurrent Session C-8</strong></td>
<td><strong>12 noon – 2:00pm</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Title:** Action Research and Organisational Development: Case Study Sharing  
Introduction to OCB and TTI: Dr. Peter Taylor, International Development Research Centre, Canada  
Special comments by: Brig (Retd.) Mohammad Yasin, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Panel Organisers: Ms Mome Saleem, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan; and, Dr. Peter Taylor, International Development Research Centre, Canada  
Speakers: Dr. Peter Taylor, International Development Research Centre, Canada  
Ms Andrea Ordonez, Grupo FARO - Centro de Investigación de Políticas Públicas, Ecuador  
Ms Roshni Alles, Communications and Policy Programme, Centre for Poverty Analysis, Sri Lanka  
Mr. Asif Memon and Ms Mome Saleem, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Discussion | Lunch  
2:00 pm – 3:00 pm |
Thursday, 12 December 2013

Day Three

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3:00 pm – 5:00 pm</td>
<td><strong>Closing Plenary</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**H.U Beg Memorial Lecture**

**Keynote Speaker:** Dr. Adil Najam, Pardee Distinguished Professor of International Relations, Earth and Environment, Boston University, USA; and former Vice Chancellor, Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS), Lahore, Pakistan

**Plenary Title:** South Asia 2060: Envisioning Regional Futures

**Summary of Proceedings:** Dr. Abid Q. Suleri, Executive Director, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Islamabad, Pakistan

**Remarks by Guests of Honour:**
- Mr. Sartaj Aziz, Advisor to the PM on National Security and Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Islamabad, Pakistan
- Mr. Mohammad Ishaq Dar, Federal Minister for Finance, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad, Pakistan

**Vote of Thanks:** Ambassador (Retd.) Mr. Shafqat Kakakhel, Chairperson, Board of Governors, Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad, Pakistan

**SDPI Lifetime Achievement Award:**
- Ms Uzma T. Haroon, Senior Coordinator, SDC Unit, SDPI
- Mr. Muhammad Husain, Driver, Admin Unit, SDPI

**High Tea / Coffee**
“Creating Momentum: Today is Tomorrow”
Co-Editor: Sarah S. Aneel

This evidence-based anthology comprising of 16 thematic chapters is unique because it has something to offer people from all walks of life. South Asian Policy Makers, especially those within Ministries of Trade and Commerce, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministries of Water, Power and IT, will find the book useful as it addresses the interface between economic and political agendas in building peace through regional cooperation on water and energy problems of South Asia and bilaterally as a whole. It also extends the discussion to include challenges and instruments that other dyads and regions have experienced and are employing to build peace. Local Government Officials can look at the more meso and micro realities that impact their economies, especially in terms of basic services delivery to citizens from Pakistan, India, Nepal and Bangladesh. For Policy Practitioners in Pakistan, this book seeks to break from the common rhetoric and focuses the debate on what is possible economically and what is necessary politically to move discussions forward about education and languages. For University Researchers, this book provides a tool box of examples that university lecturers on literature, gender studies, religion and climate change can incorporate into curriculum to broaden the scope of studies for students to more than just what is covered by Euro and Amero centric studies. Last but not least, South-based Students will gain a sense of what realities exist across the South and what has/has not worked for various regions - again, building capacity and directing a sense of vision as to what models are working and which ones need refinement.